What Enhances and Limits Women's Substantive Representation?

- a study of a South African township

Anne Hjort-Sørensen

Department of Political Science
Faculty of Social Sciences

UNIVERSITY OF OSLO

May 2015

II

What Limits and Enhances Women's Substantive Representation? A Single Case Study in South Africa.

Titel: What Enhances and Limits Women's Substantive Representation? -a study of a South African township

Word Count: 35 519

Anne Hjort-Sørensen

IV

Abstract

This thesis' aim was to find what limits and enhances women's substantive representation in a South African township: Township X.

Black South African women are socially and economically more marginalised than black South African men. The African National Congress (ANC) has been aware of this problem since before the end of apartheid. In paper, this is a problem that is recognised, and it is also an issue taken into account by several policies aiming to address this problem. Women have been represented in politics for a long time, but despite this, there has not been a significant change to women's socioeconomic situation. Because of this, I argue that there is a need to study substantive representation which is," acting in the interest of the represented in a manner responsive to them" (Pitkin 1967:209).

Seven points derived from Olle Törnquist's book from 2013 "Assessing Dynamics of Democratisation: Transformative Politics, New Institutions, and the Case of Indonesia" were used as a guiding framework to choose the different themes that were more closely looked into. These points were also used in the final analysis.

Acknowledgements

First I must express how interesting this process has been for me. My interest in women-related questions has increased as a result of my work on this thesis. Going to South Africa for fieldwork was extremely rewarding both personally and academically.

First and foremost I have to thank NIBR for taking me on board on their research project. Secondly, I would like to thank my supervisors, Olle Törnquist and Berit Aasen, for all the help and guidance they have given me throughout this process.

I am also grateful to all of the informants who were willing to take time off for the interviews. I also would like to thank our research assistant, Nomaswazi, because she did such a great job helping us setting up the interviews.

All the moral support my friends and family have given me have been very appreciated, and made the process even more enjoyable. Special thanks to Sashi and Unnur who were always there to help me out, or to discuss anything in relation to my thesis.

Anne Hjort-Sørensen

Oslo, May 2015

Table of Contents

X

List of Abbreviations

ANC	African National Congress
ANCWL	African National Congress Women's League
BEC	Branch Executive Committee
GEAR	Growth, Employment and Redistribution Plan
HRBA	Human Rights Based Approaches
NGO	Non-governmental organisation
MEC	Mayoral Executive Committee
MP	Member of Parliament
NC	National Conference
NEC	National Executive Committee
POWA	People Opposing Women Abuse
PR	Proportional Representation
RDP	Reconstruction and Development Programme
REC	Regional Executive Committee
WDS	Women's Development Strategy for the City of Johannesburg
WF	Women's Forum

1 Introduction

This thesis concerns the substantive representation of women in a South African township. The data collected is information collected through interviews with local political actors on different themes relating to the research question. The township will be referred to as Township X, for securing the interviewee's anonymity. The aim is to find out what limits and enhances women's substantive representation as substantive representation is believed to improve women's socioeconomic situation and thereby create more equality between men and women. To reach this aim the research question reads: *What limits and enhances women's substantive representation in Township X?*

South Africa stands out as a special historical case in that it underwent a peaceful transition to democracy after years of segregation between the ruling white minority and the black majority. A history of oppression, humiliation, and exploitation by the minority could have ended in a bloodbath and even genocide, some have argued, had it not been for the special turn of events and the leadership carrying out the transition promoting peace and cooperation and thereby avoiding violence. The massive hope for a new South Africa without discrimination was shared by an entire world. But why did the country not live up the hopeful expectations? Looking into women's substantive representation may only provide a microscopic explanation among many in a very complicated picture, but nevertheless, the state of representation affects development and the future of South Africa.

1.1 Women's Socioeconomic Status

Women in South Africa have historically encountered different, and perhaps, more difficulties than men. Generally speaking women have been seen as distinct from men in socioeconomic matters due to their socially constructed roles (ANC 2012:2), not only in South Africa, but in the whole world.

Before exploring the research question, it is necessary to contextualise the problem by looking into the socioeconomic status of women in South Africa today. Women's socioeconomic situation, in particular black women's, can be traced back to apartheid's effect on the entire

South African society. When I refer to women from here on out, I refer to black women as the case study in question is a black township.

"Black women's lives provide a clear picture of the brutality of Apartheid, as the statutory controls that implement the system often affect women more harshly than men" (Poinsette1985:93).

A couple of brief examples of Poinsette's statement can be clarifying and illustrating. Firstly, the largest employment sector for women during apartheid was the domestic sector where women worked as servants, and sometimes even slaves for white families. This was the sector with the worst pay and no guarantee for protection from exploitation. There was neither a minimum wage nor any formal regulations for the conditions they were working under (Sideris 1998:83). Secondly, the migrant labour system also made the situation for women difficult. Influx control legislation made it almost impossible for women to leave the rural areas in search for jobs with higher wages (UNOG: 4). The real overall effects were dire working conditions, economic difficulties and a major loss of independence.

Today's problems are not only attributable to the post-apartheid legacy. An example of this is a recent study which shows that black South African women are less likely to gain employment compared to white and mixed-raced women. The reason for this was found to be attitudes among black men that believed women's place were in the kitchen (Mahlwele 2012:46).

The situation for women in South Africa today is still a lot different than men's. Women still dominate the informal employment sector which means lower wages, more insecure working conditions, and as a result, more difficulties encountered on a daily basis. Exacerbating these problems is the fact that women are usually the heads of the households when it comes to caretaking and providing for family members. Women are also the group with the heaviest reliance on public services such as housing and food, which makes them more vulnerable when compared to other groups (Gray and Mare 2002:1). In such a situation it is difficult to escape poverty as the financial situation offers limited opportunities and alternatives.

1.2 African National Congress' Commitment to the Cause

Because of its role as the dominant party in South Africa after the transition to democracy, the ANC's stance on the issue of women is essential. In 2012, ANC published a 33 page long gender paper which examines the progress of the party's commitment to a non-sexist society within ANC and within its stated agenda for transformation (ANC 2012:2). ANC admits to setbacks in the organisation's own gender practices which are exemplified by the fact that female representation in ANC is at its lowest ever (ANC 2012:3), and not close to their aim of gender parity within its own structures (ANC 2012:3). ANC's recognition of a fair redistribution of resources and power between men and women as a precondition for gender equality (ANC 2012:5) seems promising, and at the same time ANC points out that patriarchy is an integral part of the obstacle to achieve this (ANC 2012:6).

This extensive gender paper was also written with propositions to enhance gender equality in ANC policies. Searching for this, what one finds on the topic of representation, is merely an acknowledgement of the African National Congress Women's League's (ANCWL) achievement on the 50/50 quota for women within ANC structures (ANC 2012:3).

1.3 The Empirical Puzzle and Research Question

Given the socioeconomic situation discussed and ANC's documented commitment to gender equality mentioned above, substantive representation by women for women is central, in that female representatives could put forward issues directly related to improving women's socioeconomic situation which ANC also recognizes as important for equality in the new South Africa.

Women have been represented in South African politics for a long time, but this has not substantially altered women's socioeconomic position. This is the major backdrop for the research question itself.   In the new and democratic South Africa everyone was supposed to enjoy equal access to socioeconomic and political rights (Nkambule 2012:170). The efforts made by the South African governments for the past twenty years to achieve this, has not lead to any significant altering change in women's socioeconomic situation. This is rather puzzling considering ANC's commitment to the issue on paper, and the constitution's provisions and recognitions of a transformative agenda for all (appendix 1). Despite this, the South African

government is not afraid of stating that the South African constitution is very progressive and democratic (Parliament of the Republic of South Africa 2015). It thus becomes interesting and necessary to assess the situation for the most central component of a democracy; the representative. As Hassim states: "Changing these inequalities in social and economic power will require more than political representation; it also requires that those elected into power will pursue redistributional policies" (Hassim 2003b:507). Why is this not happening? This leads to the research question:

What limits and enhances women's substantive representation in Township X?

1.4 Outline of the Thesis

This thesis' aim is to provide explanations for what limits and enhances women's substantive representation in Township X, South Africa. Using general theory and existing literature on five different topics, I will contextualize with relation to South Africa and make use of an analytical framework for the final analysis of the data collected.

The second chapter gives a brief, but necessary, historical background of ANC and the women's movement in South Africa. A comprehensive outline of the local government structures will follow, describing the role of the different political institutions one can find in the case studied.

The third chapter is the theory chapter. It starts off by explaining forms of representation and elaborating on the term "substantive representation" which is a part of the research question itself. After this, the framework which will be used in the analysis will be presented.

Chapter four is divided into five topics. Theory and existing literature on each topic motivates the relevance for South Africa. Relevant existing literature on South Africa will then be discussed and provide possible explanations for what limits and enhance women's substantive representation in the local case.

In chapter five the local context of the case in question will be presented as well as choice of method and possible obstacles concerning it. The research process itself will also be discussed.

The presentation of the data collected together with the analysis will be in chapter six divided into three areas, and in chapter seven, the conclusions of the research question will be presented.

2 Background

According to Goetz's framework for women's political effectiveness, one has to consider the political system, civil society, and the state (Goetz 2003: 29-78). To narrow my focus to more accurately fit the research question and to structure the background chapter, I have chosen to take these three dimensions as a point of departure for the contextualisation.

When discussing *the political system* I will focus on women in relation to ANC historically, due to the dominating role the party has had, and still has in South Africa as well as in Township X.

Moving on to *civil society,* the role of the South African women's movement before and during the negotiations for democracy will be addressed.

The initial contextualisation of ANC and the women's movement provides the necessary historical backdrop for better understanding the current situation in South Africa.

Last but not least, the *state* will be examined, here outlining the local government structures. The local government structures are fundamental if one wants to understand and look into the substantive representation of women in a local context.

2.1 Political System

2.1.1 ANC

The African National Congress was founded in 1912 and their primary aim from the beginning was to defend the rights and freedoms of South Africans (ANC 2015). Eventually ANC developed into a mass-based party with a great deal of membership involvement in the ANC-led activities against apartheid. The party was banned in 1960, and had to operate in exile using different methods than before. The ban resulted in a more concentrated elite at the top of the organisation and less mass based involvement from the grassroot level (Darracq 2008: 591). A resurgence of grassroot-level activity came about in the 1980s when the United Democratic Front was established as an umbrella-organisation joining together different civil

society organisations (Seekings 1992: 93). This shows that South African people's political involvement never stalled despite that the dominant party was in exile. When ANC was unbanned in 1990, the construction of local ANC-branches started and the recruitment of new members resulted in a count of almost 300 000 members (Darracq 2008:593). ANC has acquired a peculiar and symbolically charged role as the organisation has maintained its legitimacy throughout the years of the anti-apartheid struggle, the negotiating years and in the new democratic South Africa. Today, ANC stands alone as the predominant political party in South Africa enjoying great influence on all levels of society.

2.1.2 Women's Role in ANC

Women's position in South African political parties has not been equal to men's position. Women have always held a subordinate place within the political parties and as members (Hassim 2003a:90), including in ANC, although ANC has been the party with the highest degree of internal debate about representation and culture regarding women (Hassim 2003a:91).

Despite being sometimes subjected to a hostile environment, the most stable and constant interest women have fought for in relation to formal political institutions has been inclusion in the political arena (Hassim 2006a:351).The basis for the informal inclusion of women in the party was at first "motherism" which was also the base on which women made further feminist claims (Gasa 2007:249). The premise for the initial inclusion was in fact their socially constructed roles as" mothers of the nation" which the women made work to their benefit. Women did not enjoy full formal membership in the ANC until 1943 (Suttner 2012:723), but they did participate actively in the party before gaining formal membership (Gasa 2007:145). Because of this, one must not confuse the situation for women to be of total exclusion since in practice they did participate to some extent. All in all, this informal participation does not affect the bottom line of the argument which is that the nature of women's presence within ANC has not been on equal terms with men's.

2.2 Civil Society

2.2.1 Women's Struggle during Apartheid.

Women, as well as men, were very much involved in the anti-apartheid struggle. Women usually mobilised around specific issues that were considered of particular concern for them, as well as matters that affected women as a group directly. The fact that ANCWL was inaugurated in 1943 (MacKinnon 2004:235) as well as the establishment of the Federation for South African Women in 1953, illustrates this point. Both organisations were from the onset very active in the mobilisation around specific topics.

Protests were carried out regarding matters like the prohibition of home-brewed beer. This issue mobilised a lot of women because this law would severely affect their income and threaten their personal finances (MacKinnon 2004:235). The years 1955 and 1956 witnessed large protests against the extension of pass laws to women, with large numbers of women being arrested for protesting (Beck 2000:140-141).

The Federation for South African Women acted as an umbrella organisation for women's organisations ranging from white women's organisations to trade unions. This organisation worked *both* for national liberation *and* gender equality simultaneously (Hassim 2006b:30). This shows that the liberation struggle was indeed something to be carried out with equality between men and women in mind, and as a goal. There was evidently a focus on process, which today would make advocates for Human Rights based approaches very content. The reason for this focus on process was that gender equality was, at least from the Federation's point of view, intrinsic in a true liberation for all South Africans. The Federation was aware of the unfair gender structures in South African society, and was not afraid to address problems that were not a direct product of apartheid, but products of patriarchal norms and laws.

Also worth mentioning is that the party activity of ANC opened up a space for women, hence ANC and party politics have been very central for female activists. If not formal members of political parties, a lot of the women's activism was connected to them (Goetz 1998:246). There was a space for women that was actively being used, and there seemed to be a clear awareness among these women and their organisations that the process and struggle for democracy and democracy itself, once achieved, could alter both patriarchal norms and practices in favour of an equal society.

8

2.2.2 Negotiations for a new South Africa

It was not a given that gender issues were to be automatically included in the first negotiations for democracy. It was a gradual process that eventually led to the gender issue being accepted as part of the negotiations. First a Gender Advisory Board was put in place to consider the "gender impact" of negotiated agreements, but this board did not initially include women board members. However, after some struggle, a gender quota was installed in the negotiation process (Seidman 1999:294).

During the negotiations there were some indications that "women's issues" and loyalties were not the number one priority for the women included in the negotiation process. Loyalties often leaned more towards political parties, than towards women as a group. Mtinso argues that there are no common women's interests that can be represented in Parliament, and continues by claiming that the presence of women does not necessarily presuppose a gender transformation agenda (Mtintso 2003:571). This was not the case during negotiations, and quite contrary, Seidman argues that the gender activists developed a collective definition of gender interests during the moment of consolidation of the new democratic state of South Africa, and that these interests have been built into the new institutions which will affect politics (Seidman1999 :289). Reading the literature on this topic there seems to be a clear consensus that women thought the place for transformation towards a more gender equal society was the state (Hassim 2003b:505, Seidman 2003:542).

There is little doubt that women did have a common interest of non-sexism which clearly affected the legal provisions in the new constitution, although some South African leaders wanted to preserve patriarchal structures and worked actively against the women's wishes (Beck 2000:214). In the end, these leaders did not manage to overrule the women completely, as demonstrated by a prohibition on gender discrimination clearly spelt out in the constitution. (appendix 1) The final constitution of 1996 was seen, and still is seen, as being a very progressive constitution in relation to gender issues. In section nine it reads: "The state may not unfairly discriminate directly or indirectly against anyone on one or more grounds, including race, gender, sex, pregnancy, marital status, ethnic or social origin, colour, sexual orientation, age, disability, religion, conscience, belief, culture, language and birth" (appendix 1).

2.3 The Local Government Structure in South Africa

Being able to contextualize the data in this thesis requires deeper insight into the local government political structure of the township in question. Starting first at the lowest political level and then moving up, the basic structures and functions of the election system, the ward committees and the ward councillors, ANCWL, Women's Forum and the Municipal Council in Johannesburg, will be outlined.

In short, the local government system in South Africa consists of different types of municipalities with their own councils. Further, the municipalities are subdivided into wards, with each having a ward committee led by a ward councillor. These have been established in accordance to the Municipal Structures Act of 1998 and the Municipal Systems Act of 2000. (MSA 1998 and MSA 2000).

2.3.1 Local Elections

The case in this study falls under the category of Metropolitan council (Category A) which entails that the electorate has two votes in the local elections which are held every fifth year, with the next one coming up in 2016. When the electorate votes for their ward councillor, the first-past-the-post electoral system is being used. In this system the voter simply marks off on the voting card which councillor candidate they prefer, and the candidate who receives the majority of the votes wins the seat (Gallagher 2011:184). The candidates elected by the first-past-the-post-system are the ward councillors and make up half of the seats in the municipal council. The other half is made up by the proportional representation councillors (PR councillors). For the election of the PR councillors voters use their second vote to vote for a party list, and the municipal council seats are allocated proportionally according the number of votes received by the different parties (Gallagher 2011:185).

In this thesis, the ward councillors are the main focus, but it will be necessary to look at the relationships between the PR councillors and the ward councillors. A first-past-the-post system might also have consequences for the way in which the candidates conduct their election campaigns; which groups they target and what they focus upon.

2.3.2 Ward Councillors and Ward Committees

The ward councillor is supposed to communicate the ward's needs to the municipal council which have legislative and executive power over certain areas ranging from water and sanitation to child care facilities. Ward councillors have to sign a code of conduct which, amongst many obligations, states that the ward councillors have to report back to their communities at least four times a year (City of Johannesburg, 2015a). Reporting back to the community is usually done by calling public meetings. Public meetings are meetings the whole community is invited to, and work as a platform for reporting back to the local level, but also a platform for the people of the community to put forward issues (Mohamed 2009:213).

Ward committees shall represent the voice of the community as each of the ten ward committee members are responsible for a sector and communicating this sector's needs to the ward councillor in the monthly ward committee meetings. For the ward committee members to communicate with their sectors, sub-committees are set up. The ward committee sectors reflect the different departments at the municipal level, hence the sectors are:

*Finance and economic development (business, labour and development forums)

*Community development 1, covering sports, culture, libraries and theatre

* Community development 2, overseeing recreation, parks and the Johannesburg Zoo

*Development planning

*Housing

* Health and social development, focusing on youth, women, children and people with disabilities

*Health and social development, covering faith-based organisations, community-based organisations and non-governmental organisations

*Transport

* Public safety

* Infrastructure and the environment. (City of Johannesburg, 2015c)

To become a ward committee member two people need to nominate the candidate for a specific sector. The ward committees serve five years, and sitting ward committee members can be re-elected (City of Johannesburg, 2015b).

In sum, the communication of the community's needs is articulated and put forward through the sub-committees which are set up according to sector by the ward committee member. The ward committee members is supposed to take the articulated needs of his or her sector to the monthly ward committee meetings from where the councillor takes the issues forward to the municipal council.

2.3.3 ANCWL

The basic unit structure and basic unit for activity of ANCWL are the different local branches which every ANCWL member belongs to, and any South African woman ANC member that has turned 18 can join. It is supposed to be meetings at this level every month. The purpose of the branch's activities is to discuss and formulate policy. Apart from these requirements, nothing else is stated on the required or expected day-to-day activities of the branch. Reading the objectives for the organisation in the ANCWL Constitution, no concrete activities are mentioned, but some topics are mentioned and worth noting, such as: promoting women's development, emancipating women in ANC and government structures, promoting women's participation in politics and society, dismantling the patriarchal system, and campaigning against violence towards women (ANCWL Constitution 2008).

Every two years the Branch Executive Committee (BEC) is elected. The BEC shall consist of at least the Chairperson, Deputy Chairperson, Secretary, Deputy Secretary and Treasurer. The BEC shall report its work to the Regional Executive Committee (REC) and the branch in the branch meetings. Branches can be grouped together in zones for coordination and administrative functions, but these zones do not carry any decision-making powers.

The branches are grouped under provincial regions which are to hold annual meetings with delegates from the different branches. The regions also have an executive committee whose members are elected every third year. Above this level, the Provincial Conference is held every four years. The Provincial Conference develops and carries out the policies and programmes of the ANCWL and of the ANC, and implements the decisions of the National Conference (NC) and of the National Executive Committee (NEC) of the ANCWL.

The NC is the highest level of ANCWL, and this is where policy is decided upon. 90 per cent of the delegates attending the NC come from ANCWL branches across the country. The NC is also where the election for the five year office of the National Executive Committee (NEC) takes place. The NEC consists of the President, Deputy President, Secretary General, Deputy Secretary General, and Treasurer General. The nominations are made by any province (ANCWL Constitution 2008).

2.3.4 Women's Forums

A space for women to gather and articulate their interests are the women's forums. A women's forum is a space set up by local social workers from the Department of Social Development mainly as a space for women to come together to try and build their cooperatives and access support (NIBR2013a:7). This has not worked entirely according to the plan, but nevertheless the women's forum functions as a non-political space where women come together to organise and discuss.

2.3.5 City Council

Two hundred and sixty councillors make up the city council in Johannesburg. 130 of the councillors are representing their respective wards, and the remaining 130 PR councillors represent their respective parties and the city as a whole. ANC is the biggest party represented with a majority of 153 seats (Independent Electoral Commission 2011). The Council is where decision on policies, Integrated Development Plans, budgets and service charges are made (City of Johannesburg 2015e).The council has an executive mayor with its own mayoral executive committee (MEC) which regularly has to report to the council. The mayoral executive committee members have responsibility for one portfolio each which are either transport, economic development, environment and infrastructure services, finance, development planning, housing, health and social development, public safety, corporate and shared services or community development (City of Johannesburg 2015d). This portfolio structure mirrors the different sectors in the ward committees. The council also consists of the Speaker and the Chief Whip.

3 Theory

3.1 How to Define Representation?

To be able to fully grasp the concept of representation, which is of the utmost importance in this thesis and also an integral part of the research question, a distinction between different forms of representation must be presented.

In "The Concept of Representation" from 1967, Hanna Pitkin makes useful distinctions between different forms of representation as she divides representation into formal, symbolic, descriptive, and substantive.

Formal representation refers to the accountability and authorization between the represented and the representative. This form of representation revolves around two questions; who has authorised the representative's position and what is the state of the representatives responsiveness to the people he or she is ought to represent (SEP 2011)?

Symbolic representation concerns the extent the representative symbolically represents the people he or she is to represent. People's acceptance and the degree of legitimation of the representative are the important factors here. Nelson Mandela represents South Africans in a symbolic way due to people's acceptance of him. Symbolic representation is more about people's perceptions than the representative's actual function (Schwindt-Bayer and Mishler 2002:3).

Descriptive representation is the degree to which the representative "stand for" who is being represented. The idea is that the representatives should reflect the people being represented. In this case women represent women. This form of representation does not guarantee responsiveness or accountability between the representative and the represented on account of being alike whether it comes to gender, race or occupation (SEP 2011).

Substantive representation on the other hand, is different. Pitkin herself defines it as," acting in the interest of the represented in a manner responsive to them" (Pitkin 1967:209). This will be the definition behind the term "substantive representation" throughout this thesis.

Substantive representation is thus about "acting for someone", rather than "standing for someone" as descriptive representation implies (Runciman 2009:15).

Substantive representation implies thus acting for someone by putting forward ideas, issues, and interest the represented deem important. For example: A labour union can exercise substantive representation in a negotiating process by putting forward demands already agreed upon by its members. A lawyer can be substantive representative to his or her client by being responsive to the client's wishes and acting on these wishes in a legal procedure. Since representatives of any kind are not static objects, there are differences to the degree which substantive representation is expressed. Also worth noting, substantive representation does not imply only one representative. Acting in the interest of someone can be done by independent and not independent organisations, committees and other groups in society on different arenas, not just the political. A newspaper might as well substantively represent a certain group fronting certain issues, and thereby having this group's voices heard.

The aim is not to assess whether or not substantive representation is present, what causes it or what obstructs it, but look at what limits and enhances it. This allows for taking into account the fact there is different degrees of substantive representation. Since the interviewees in this thesis are mainly ward councillors, ward committee members and representatives from the ANCWL, the focus will be substantive representation of women in these institutions. All interviewees are members of the ANC, so ANC as a political institution will also be considered as a place for substantive representation of women.

Substantive representation in this case also concerns how women are able to put forward their interest in a manner which does make the representatives responsive to them. This must be kept in mind throughout the reading of this thesis. As the definition of substantive representation is; "acting in the interest of the represented in a manner responsive to them" (Pitkin 1967:209), what I am looking at is thus not how these interests are implemented as policies and regulations, but rather how these interests, ideas and issues are expressed and put forward. The focus of this thesis concerns the input side of democracy and not the concrete results and assessment of the effectiveness of the representation all together which constitutes the output side of representation.

3.2 Framework for the Discussions and the Final Analysis.

The theoretical framework used in this thesis has been developed over many years by Olle Törnquist with input from, and corporation with, many scholars such as Thomas Carothers, Patrick Heller, Elin Selboe, and David Beetham (Törnquist 2013:xii). Törnquist's extensive and fruitful studies of Indonesia, and his colleagues' studies of other areas, have resulted in a comprehensive theoretical framework based on the methodological and analytical lessons learnt. It is therefore a useful tool for analysing substantive democratisation, not just in Indonesia, but in other countries encountering difficulties in the democratic consolidation process (Törnquist 2013:113). In this case the framework is being used for looking at representation in particular.

Using this as a backdrop, seven points will be the starting point in choosing the themes in the literary discussion to create a structure in the complex web of scholar's possible explanations surrounding the issue of substantive representation of women in South Africa. Constituting each of the seven points listed are general and more specific theories about democratisation. According to Törnquist, it is possible to use just certain aspects of the extensive framework one can find in his latest book; "Assessing Dynamics of Democratisation Transformative Politics, New Institutions, and the Case of Indonesia" from 2013 (Törnquist 2013:113). This is being done here due to time constraints, but also the nature of the local context which is being studied. All points will be discussed, but the literature and existing research on the topic of women's representation in South Africa may present us with information leaning more towards certain dimensions than others.

This framework will enable me to get insight and analyse the data without losing focus on political science in the process.

Some of the questions that are developed may be interpreted as being more anthropological or sociological than merely political, but this theoretical tool will place the answers in a political science context especially focused on representation. This will ensure that the data collected will be directly linked to the theory being used in this research. All seven points in the framework are more or less interrelated but are nevertheless suitable for using in the analysis.

For the purpose of this study, this well-developed general framework for assessing democracy is being used to look at representation of women in particular. The seven dimensions are used to find out what limits and enhances women's substantive representation in this single-case study:

1. Actor's position on democracy.

The local political actors providing data for this thesis will have to be analysed according to how they relate to the formal institutions. The general idea is that there are rules of the game concerning these institutions, but no guarantee for these rules working as intended. The main argument here is that political actors do not follow the rules of the game and hence substantive representation of women may be affected. If the formal procedures are not followed, this may create opportunities and limitations for women who wish to enjoy substantive representation. In this case, the main actors that will be looked upon are ANC, ANCWL, the representatives in local government and the different local civil society institutions. The actors have an effect on the institutions and the institutions may have an effect on actor's behaviour. It will be necessary to see if the actors produce, consume, abuse or evade the institutions of democracy (Törnquist 2013:51).

2. Political inclusion of women.

It is important women should not be excluded from politics. This issue then concerns which women are excluded and included in politics (Törnquist: 56-57). This relates to citizenship rights which by no means are universal for all at all times. It is important to examine who's voice is represented in local politics and why.

3. Building legitimacy and authority

 Building power to gain political legitimacy and authority is a question of how one can transform economic, social, cultural and coercive capital to what Bourdieu calls "symbolic capital" which will lead to political power (Törnquist 2013:57). The issue to be touched upon here is how women, and which women, succeed in transforming the capacities they carry into substantive representation of their interests. Since the focus of this thesis is the local political

actors, identifying the interviewees' backgrounds is crucial. The interviewees who occupy formal political positions, but also other powerful local actors' backgrounds, have to be taken into account. Asking all of the interviewees about their backgrounds will provide useful data on how the women transformed their capital and thus gained power.

4. Organisation and Mobilisation

The main argument here concerns the character and quality of the organisation of women, whether it is mobilisation from below at the grassroot level and thus leading to integration in politics, or from above by incorporation in politics (Törnquist 2013:59). Yet again, one must look at how the different actors relate to one another. It will, for example, be relevant to look at whether clientelism and patronage are being used as a method to mobilise and organise, and the relationship between the women's movement and formal politics at the local level. The central aim here is to find out what strategies are being used to organise and mobilise women, and the resulting outcomes of these strategies for the substantive representation of women. The underlying hypothesis is that the organisation and mobilisation of women is not working, and that this can affect substantive representation of women.

5. Politicisation and agenda-setting

A possible obstacle for substantive representation of women may be the lack of ability to politicise issues to be put on the public affairs agenda. The capacity to make issues that some deem to be of public concern more visible may fall outside the political agenda due to factors such as lack of agreement on which issues should be put forward, or simply technocratisation of previously public matters. This relates back to building legitimacy, but here the core of the inquiry concerns who considers what to be of public affairs and to what extent these issues have been placed on the agenda (Törnquist 2013:59). A specific issue which in some countries has been politicised is the issue of domestic violence which has traditionally been seen as a private matter. Turning this into a political matter would be an example of politicising an issue some deem to be of public concern. Politicising what may be defined as public matters of some groups onto the political agenda may prove to be a difficult task, and may limit women's substantive representation. Put differently, if women are not able to having their voices heard and thereby not having certain issues put onto the political agenda; this will be a limiting factor for substantive representation of women.

6. Participation and representation

The main reason for including this point, according to Törnquist, is the extensive evidence on poor standards of popular representation and dominance of powerful elites in the Global South (Törnquist 2013:60). If there is poor substantive representation of women's interest, this may in turn affect whom women turn to with their problems and how they go about it. Perhaps women turn to informal channels of influencing the government or even turn to NGOs outside of the formal political system. The focus is women's own capacity to develop forms of representation and how they go about it in their own organisations by, for example, campaigning for issues. On a more general level this can tell us something about the trust in participatory democracy as well as the stronghold of the formal institutions in this township. If people have a negative view of the politicians this may weaken the foundations of the political system itself and challenge its legitimacy. This issue relates to the heart of this thesis, but is also at the heart of democratisation more generally. The central question to expand on is where women go with their problems and how they go about it (Törnquist 2013:65-67).

7. Strategy

This point is not so much about the general state of the women's movement, but more clear cut on how the existing women's movement has a strategy for substantive representation and if this strategy works. Which policies do they focus upon, who are their allies and what is the general strategy to reach their policy aims (Törnquist 2013:72)? Taking into account the diversity in the South African women's movement, I will have to narrow my focus to include the ANCWL mostly. Although ANCWL is a part of a political party, the League's strong positions and relationship with civil society makes them a valuable source of information. Has ANC failed to reach their policy aims regarding gender? Is there anything wrong with their strategy for achieving their aim? Some of the answers found might explain what limits the substantive representation of women.

The Choice of Themes to be Studied

These seven points guides what topics can be further looked into when attempting to explain what enhances and limits women's substantive representation in this single-case study.

Politicisation and agenda setting , as well as *political inclusion of women* is thought to be related to the topic of people's view on quotas and the question if there is a common gender interest or not. This is the first theme which will be explored.

Which women are included by the quota may affect people's views on it, but this will possibly also give insight into what the actors opinions on descriptive representation are in relation to substantive representation of women. What is politicised and put on the public affairs agenda depends on the political inclusion of women, more specifically, which women are included. This again hinges on what is perceived to be common women's interests by whom. Substantive representation of women depends on what is being politicised by whom.

Gaining insight into *actors position on democracy*, ANC in Township X is particularly necessary to look at, since ANC is the dominant party. The way ANC use the institutions of democracy, both formally and informally, may affect women's substantive representation.

Exploring the state of *participation and representation* in the township, looking closely at the local government institutions and their working is crucial for understanding where women go with their problems and why. The nature of the local government institutions may limit or enhance participation and representation of women, and thus their substantive representation.

Using the theory of *strategy*, finding out what the ANCWL's strategy is for enhancing substantive representation needs to be addressed, as well as ANCWL relation to other women's organisations. *Organisation and mobilisation* of women, is also relevant in relation to women's substantive representation. Due to this, choosing to look into the women's movement seems only natural.

How women build *legitimacy and authority* will be looked at in the context of patriarchy in the township in question. Patriarchy seems likely to have an effect on women's ability to build legitimacy and authority, hence substantively representing women may be limited if this proves difficult.

The themes chosen are then: The existence of common women's interests and views on quotas, ANC party structures, the nature of the local government, women's movement and the issue of patriarchy.

These themes chosen for further theory-examination in relation to the research question, covers what Goetz points out which needs to be considered when looking at women's political effectiveness; the political system, civil society, and the state.

In this next section, the general theories and literature of the five major relevant themes are outlined, with a following contextualisation looking at South Africa in particular. Drawing on the previous findings and literature on South Africa, possible explanations for what limits and enhances women's substantive representation in Township X will be found.

4 Theory and Existing Literature

4.1 May Descriptive Representation Lead to Substantive Representation?

4.1.1 General Theory and Literature

Quotas

The topic of women's quotas is a good entry point in looking for what limits and enhances substantive representation of women in Township X. Quotas offer a way into politics for women. Additionally, the discussion on women's quotas is closely related to the debate on descriptive and substantive representation with regards to the effect of quotas.

A women's quota is either a number or proportion of seats or places on a party list that has been set aside for women (Stokes 2005:77). The main idea behind installing quotas is to make sure women are included in politics (Dahlerup 2007:78), and is tied to the main argument for quotas which is that the state of politics with low female representation is undemocratic due to the favouring of men. Installing the quota will then help correcting an unjust situation. The main counterargument rests on the assumption that quotas are not necessary, because the current political situation does offer equal opportunities for men and women (Stokes 2005:79), and installing women's quotas will result in discrimination towards men (Dahlerup 2007: 75). The main arguments focus on equality of opportunity, with gender being the only variable. Dahlerup mentions another argument for quotas that does not exclude the equal opportunities-argument, which is that different interests and experiences need to be included in politics (Dahlerup 2007:74). This argument rests on an assumption that women, as a group, have different and common interests and experiences compared to men, and that this needs to be articulated in politics.

International research shows positive experiences of gender quotas as a rise in female representatives increases government expenditure on welfare (Chen 2010:13), and evidence from India shows that gender quotas do influence policy outcomes (Pande and Ford 2011:1).

This latter argument leads to the connection between descriptive and substantive representation. Women's quotas can only guarantee the descriptive representation of women, but substantive representation of women implies women as a group have certain interests they want represented. If one of the reasons for this thesis is to view women as a group that should be substantively represented, the link between descriptive and substantive representation needs to be elaborated upon.

A common women's interests?

One cannot completely ignore that women might have different experiences and interests compared to men, but by definition, securing descriptive representation of women by the use of quotas will not guarantee this being translated into women's political demands by women representatives. Quotas will only guarantee descriptive representation as there is no mechanism entailing that the women elected would have to act in a manner responsive to women as a group.

Contesting this logic is the "Theory of the Politics of Presence" by Phillips (1995), which suggests that women are the best political advocates for women's interest on the grounds of distinct interest women have due to their experiences of sexual harassment and violence, their unequal socioeconomic situation and in their relation to child-bearing. Because of these common interests and experiences there are gains to be made for women through increased political inclusion. Worth noting, Pitkin's definition of substantive representation, "acting in the interest of the interest of the represented in a manner responsive to them" (Pitkin 1967:209), does not exclude men as possible advocates for women's interests. Descriptive representation on the other hand, entails that only women represent women.

The evidence on the theory of presence, and thus also the impact of quotas for women are mixed (Wängnerud 2009:51).

These findings suggest that there may still exist common interests regarding women's issues however it may be defined by the representatives and the represented. While researchers have found that women and men have different priorities when it comes to policies and women often feel an obligation to represent women, individual actors who work for women's issues have been found to be important regardless of the proportion of female representatives (Celis et al 2008:102). This means that these priorities and obligations by women are not directly

translated into substantive representation, but individual preferences matter if descriptive representation shall lead to substantive representation. One cannot assume that the lack of individual actors working for women's issues is the only factor that limits substantive representation of women. If women do feel an obligation to represent women and have distinct interests, there might be other variables that keep them from exercising substantive representation. Therefore, in studying substantive representation it is important to specify "women's interests" and "gender equality" and not assume anything.

If representatives are not responsive to women as a constituency this will severely limit the substantive representation of women in Township X, although one must keep in mind there is not just one arena for exercising the substantive representation of women (Celis et al 2008:99). This means that the focus should not only be on female representatives in Johannesburg city council and ward committee members, but also representatives for the women's organisations including the ANCWL.

4.1.2 The Context of South Africa

Quotas

The quota system in ANC is important to look into because descriptive representation was from the onset assumed to bring about more substantive representation (Hassim 2003b:506).

The idea that women acted as a rather unified constituency entered politics in South Africa in the beginning of the 1990s. As mentioned in the background chapter , the main issue women's organisations were working for was political inclusion by representation, and as a consequence the issue of installing gender quotas was high up on the women's organisations agenda (Hassim 2003a:84). ANC installed a 30 per cent quota of women on their party lists from the 1994 national elections. In 2006, a gender quota of 50 per cent was adopted by ANC for local elections. The 50 per cent quota of women on ANC party lists were extended to national elections in 2009 (Quotaproject 2014). The quota system is very much contingent upon the proportional representation electoral system (PR system) since the party determines whom will be on the party lists, and the electorate votes for the entire party and not just a representative (Gallagher 2011:185).

The PR system has proven an efficient system to increase the number of elected female representatives in many countries (United Nations 2005:15) including in South Africa, where the number of female political representatives rose as a consequence of the instalment of the quota. (Southern African Development Community 2013:32)

Corresponding well with the aim of more socioeconomic equality for all, the gender quota was put in place in the ANC to strategically address this issue. Descriptive representation of women was from the onset supposed to promote gendered redistribution of economic as well as social power (Hassim 2003b:506).

Heller points out that a consolidated representative democracy should not be confused with effective citizenship since a democratic system does not mean a democratic society (Heller 2009:125). Goetz agrees, and points to two obstacles in explaining why descriptive representation does not lead to substantive representation for women by the use of quotas. The first is that one cannot assume that all women have a common interest in working for gender equity. The second is that there is an institutionalised resistance to gender equity in the state apparatus (Goetz 1998:241).

Addressing Goetz's former point, it seems questionable at first glance considering the information presented in the background chapter which showed that women in South Africa early on mobilised around specific issues that were of particular concern to them. The development of the socioeconomic situation has not transformed women's position in society, and there are certain issues like service provision problems that affect women directly as a group. Hence, it is difficult to find reasons that will explain a shift or divergence in women's interests in relation to socioeconomic matters, and thus finding a reason why some women would not still have a common interest in working for issues which affect them as a group. The women's movement also believed a transformation could happen from within the state. If scholars like Goetz are now saying women do not have common interests, but during negotiations and the aftermath of apartheid no one seemed to think in these lines, something must have happened. There is therefore a need to explore the existing literature on whether there is a common gender interest between women in South Africa or not.

Is There a Common Women's Interest?

Mtintso, a former ANC activist and MP, argues in the same lines as Goetz when she claims there is no universal women's interest that can be represented in parliament (Mtintso 2003:569). At the same time, in her study of female MPs, she states that the majority of them prioritised addressing "practical" gender needs (Mtintso 2003:573). According to Mtintso practical gender interests are about getting a kitchen and strategic gender interests are about getting out of it (Mtintso 2003:572). At the same time at the local level, according to information collected from Temba, a town located in Gauteng, people expected their local female councillor to be responsible for addressing women's needs regardless of their party affiliations (Mbatha 2003:197). Further, a study of female councillors in two councils, one in the Gauteng province, the other partly in Gauteng, finds that most female representative's policy goal in office was to strive for women's economic independence, and they also believed they could make a difference (Mbatha 2003:208).

Not a Common Women's Interest?

Goetz argues the representative's agenda-setting is contingent upon what the women representatives themselves deem to be important (Goetz 1998:252). In other words, women enhance substantive representation on account of their own interests in it. This points to representation by women for women is merely descriptive, as the responsiveness and accountability is not connected to women as a constituency. Working for change in certain legislative matters that affected women directly is said to be the work of feminist MPs who were committed to the gender cause (Hassim 2003a:96-97) and not all the female MPs in parliament. Another indication of the lack of common women's interest, which also supports Goetz's argument, was the failure of the multi-party Women's Group in the South African parliament to become a strong force for women's interests. Hassim explains how the group's weakness indicated a shallowness of common interest between women from the different parties (Hassim 2003a:97).

The literature is a bit unclear and conflicting when it comes to the real effect of quotas on the representation of women in South Africa. There seems to be indications of common women's interests that would potentially bring about substantive representation via the quota system, but the absence of any vertical accountability mechanisms between women as a constituency and the female representatives cannot guarantee this being followed through. It may very

much depend on the degree of personal commitment to women's interest by the representatives, how they define women's interests, but also perhaps what people expect from their representatives.

Dismissing the effect of the quota system due to accountability problems is problematic. If there was no quota, the positive experiences described above, would probably not be identified. Although it is quite clear one must not assume descriptive representation will automatically lead to substantive representation, the quota may in practice have a real impact on substantive representation if the representative is concerned with women's issues. The presence of quotas may not enhance representative's substantive representation directly as much is dependent on the representative's own interests, but the absence of quotas might limit representation of women all together which is not preferable as women should have numerical equal representation to men regardless of their viewpoint on women's issues.

4.2 Party Structures

4.2.1 General Theory and Literature

By definition, a political party is "an organisation of people sharing political beliefs or ideology and focused on getting into parliament and government (Stokes 2005:97)." The importance of political parties lies is their ability to aggregate different interests and linking citizens to government (Manning 2005:707). Aggregation of women's interests represented by representatives in political parties is thus the main access point many women have to the government via the vote. The interest aggregation and political linkage makes political parties one of the main arenas where substantive representation of women can take place. It is therefore important to see how party structures may enhance or limit women's substantive representation.

Party-member's autonomy

Characteristics of parties can affect policy outcomes. Party characteristics also account for how much influence individual members and representatives in the party have on policy. The degree to which a party is centralised determines the autonomy of the members vis–a-vis the party leadership. Put in a simpler way; the more power the party leadership has, the less

power individual members in the party have to make decisions. In more decentralised parties there are several arenas for making decisions which gives the members of the party more influence in the party's policies (Kreppel 2008:137). The power a party leadership has over candidate selection, such as constructing a party list, influences the autonomy representatives have if their goal is to get re-elected. This is an indirect way a party leadership has of exercising control, since being able to decide the selection of representatives on a party list has direct implications for the freedoms of the candidates. For example, if one wants to be re-elected as a representative, approval from the central leadership is necessary so one can be put on the party list. Party centralisation concentrates decision-making powers to a central leadership and away from lower party organs. Authority flows from the top down and not bottom up.

Accountability and Intra-party Democracy

Within very centralised and hierarchical party structures there is little intra party democracy, and as a consequence, the party leadership does not have adequate accountability to its membership base. Ware's argument for intra-party democracy, which has been supported by scholars like Teorell (Teorell 1999:367) states; "party democracy would provide a 'voice' mechanism to complement the 'exit' alternative already available to voter, an alternative that by itself does not function effectively under oligopoly (Ware 1979:78)." More party democracy would make party leadership more responsive to the wishes of party members, but also the electorate. In this case, substantive representation of women is more likely since the voices of the party members would have to be taken into account by the central leadership and this would also give women more autonomy to challenge and put forward demands in their own party.

Civil Society and Political Parties

Teorell concludes that intra party democracy is important because it provides a vertical linkage between different deliberating spheres (Teorell 1999:363). Put differently, civil society voices are being heard and these articulated interests connect with the government. The linkage between the deliberative spheres in the society, where interests are being deliberated and articulated would have to be taken into account by political parties and hence increase accountability. A very much centralised political party would not need this linkage

28

to civil society to get re-elected because it would not be dependent upon any group's approval.

Although women and men are more or less equally represented as members of a party, further up in the party hierarchy more men are represented than women (Stokes 2005:96). The proportion of women in a party does not guarantee an equal share in a party's decision-making. Implications of a very hierarchical and centralised structure in a political party may limit women's representation all together and the missing link with the citizenry and interest groups may further limit women's substantive representation on the local government level. The substantive representation of any group in political parties may not be compatible with a centralised party structure. Substantive representation of women in politics at the local level may suffer if decision-making powers are limited.

4.2.2 The Context of South Africa - ANC

The political party structures of ANC have changed after the unbanning of the party in 1990, and the end of apartheid. Goetz explains numerous factors as barriers to the substantive representation of women. One of them is institutionalised resistance to gender equity in the state apparatus (Goetz 1998:241). Thus I want to look into the internal workings of the ANC party structure, as ANC is the dominant party in South Africa, but also in where the case study takes place. Regardless of women being responsive or not to women's interests, whether practical or strategic, if there is a resistance to gender equity informally embedded in the government structures, there will be further problems of enhancing women's substantive representation, as women's voices will not adequately be heard.

Goetz is not alone when she points out institutionalised resistance to gender equality in the state apparatus as an obstacle for substantive representation. Hassim mentions two factors that limit women's political effectiveness, which are: the rules and procedures of institutionalised engagement within which parties operate and over which women have had little influence, and secondly, the dominance of a single party, albeit one sympathetic to notions of gender equality, within the electoral system and within civil society (Hassim 2003a:83).

Reviewing Hassim's former point of institutionalised engagement, the PR system is yet again worth mentioning.

Quite naturally, due to the PR system, people vote first and foremost on ANC, and women's first allegiance will naturally then be to the party. Some are worried, especially women's organisations, that women representatives are only paying allegiance to ANC, and not to women more generally as a group that has certain socioeconomic difficulties (Mtintso 2003:574-575). Looking at the ANC's Gender Paper from 2012 there should be little to worry about (ANC 2012). The situation in practice is quite different, and ANC's own recognition of stagnating gender practices within the party indicates that action does not necessarily follow rhetoric within the party's own structures (ANC 2012:3). It thus becomes easier to understand the concern of those who worry about where women in ANC place their allegiance. If female politicians rely on the willingness of the party leadership to place them on the party list, it is important to be accepted, and hence raising questions the leadership finds uncomfortable or irrelevant may threaten their position or curb their advancement in the party. This problem increases in highly centralist parties (Goetz 2003:51), which ANC can be characterized as (Lotshwao 2009:1).

The State of the Debate

Walsh argues that factors such as the collapse of the women's movement, and civil society-state relations cannot account for the decrease in substantive representation of women after 1998, because these factors remained constant over time, and what really happened was linked to an ANC centralisation (Walsh 2012:130). In fact, she proposes that the way ANC used the PR system, the quota for women and its electoral dominance, made it possible for women to exercise substantive representation. ANC leadership used this actively to facilitate debate which the female MPs took active part in to advance women's interests. ANC also used the PR system, the quota for women and the electoral dominance to later strengthen the leadership's position in the party, and as a consequence, limiting diverse voices within ANC and limiting the space for open and efficient debate (Walsh 2012:120). Before this limitation of space happened, in the last period of the first democratic parliament, important legislation that affected women as a group passed through parliament and was enabled by the linkages between civil society and ANC, including heavy lobbying by the female and even male MPs (Hassim 2003a:102). Lodge also exemplifies the power of the ANC in promoting women's rights, when he explains that the extension of abortion rights was partly possible due to ANC allowing lobbyists to help shape the legislation (Lodge 2003:174).

30

The two examples mentioned above correspond to Walsh's analysis, and show that there was formerly a space for debate and activism within the ANC-led parliament for advancement of women's interests, and hence substantive representation of women. This space seems now to have become narrower due to ANC centralisation with the effect of limiting internal party debate and collaboration between civil society and the party to promote women's interests. The link between civil society and the government did not rest on any accountability between the two due to the centralised party structures.

More deliberate action by the leadership to curtail internal dissent and controversial voices has probably been used. The ANC's Deployment Committee are able to, and has been accused of, moving politicians around answering to the wishes of the ANC leadership (Hassim 2003a:98), a good way to silence critics.

The findings and arguments mentioned above all fit well with Norris' findings which show that in parties with a formal-centralised structure, gender equity is dependent upon of the leaders of the party (Norris 1993:326). The arguments also correspond well with the theory already presented on the implications of centralised structures in political parties. In South Africa there is also heavy centralisation of power around the presidency (Hassim 2003a:99). If one wants power within the ANC, the gender cause may not be the issue that will make one advance in the party as there is no guarantee of support from the central leadership.

Dominance of a Single Party

In assessing Hassim's second point; the dominance of a single party, albeit one sympathetic to notions of gender equality, within the electoral system and within civil society, the problem is a bit clearer in light of Walsh's analysis. At the same time as ANC was able to facilitate a good environment for women's substantive representation and then later close this environment, there was little challenge to their hegemonic position and also their lead on women's issues. In Goetz framework for women's political effectiveness, she identifies party fragmentation as a possibility to increase the quality of representation as other parties may want to attract voters based on the gender cause (Goetz 2003:56). Logically, when there is no competition for votes over a specific topic there is less incentive to demonstrate commitment to it. Township X is ANC dominated, therefore, one can assume there is little competition for representing women's interests there.

The literature points in a clear direction showing that centralised structures make it difficult to advance women's interests. But as Goetz mentions, if the PR system is combined with single-member ward-based systems they can counteract the allegiance to the party leadership (Goetz 2003:60). People at the local level have two votes in local elections; one for their preferred ward-councillor in a first-past the post system, and another vote for their party of preference. It is therefore important to assess if women make use of the first-past- the post system to voice women's concerns and compete for women's votes, since this route to representation is not dependent on ANC's central leadership approval.

4.3 Local Government.

4.3.1 General Theory and Literature

The normative primary role and advantage for local government is the role as the allocator of resources (Watt 2006:4). This is because local government is the level of government which is closest to people. This is where people's preferences are articulated, hence it is assumed that resource allocation can most effectively be done here to suit people's preferences and tastes (Watt 2006:8). According to Oats; "- it will always be more efficient (or at least as efficient) for local government to provide the levels of output for their respective jurisdictions than for central government to provide any specified and uniform level of output across all jurisdictions" (Oats 1972 :35).

Local government should be the perfect arena for state-citizens interactions considering it is the level of government which is closest to people. Local government is then also supposedly a positive thing for women's substantive representation since this level of state is the one closest to them and has the potential to be the most effective place for engaging with the state (Beall 2005:4).

Törnquist points to the often very autonomous relations between the state and people (Törnquist 2009:5) as a problem for democracy. People need to have more influence in politics so marginalised groups do not fall through and are unable to voice their demands. Chandhoke calls for a constant fine tuning of the procedures for representation so the

representatives are always compelled to represent the constituents and their wishes (Chandhoke 2009:33).

How the local governmental structures work is thus important to look at, because resource allocation and taste preferences of women as a group are supposed to happen at this level. Since the local political representatives are supposed to represent these preferences, one has to look at the relationship between these representatives and women, but also how the representatives interact with each other.

4.3.2 Local Government in the Context of South Africa

A lot has been written on the subject of local government in South Africa, and there seems to be a consensus on that the lowest level of government is not working like it should in bringing people closer to the government.

Economic Policies

In an article from 2005, Beall points to a problem in how policies addressing women's interests are conflicting with neo-liberalism which has characterised decentralisation policies from the late 1990s in South Africa (Beall 2005:5). Neo-liberalism is defined in many ways, but common amongst most of the definitions are the limiting of the state to mostly protect private property rights and commercial liberty (Thorsen and Lie 2009:14).

The Reconstruction and Development Programme (RDP) was the foundation for South African development after apartheid, but in 1996, the government shifted to a more marked-oriented national development programme; the Growth, Employment and Redistribution (GEAR) plan. The former programme focused more on local level community participation and influence at the local government level, but this space for participation narrowed as ANC shifted to GEAR for better service delivery efficiency with the result of the state viewing local government more as a level for service delivery and not so much as a place for community participation any more (Heller 2009:134).

The main issue at stake here is that as more issues are depoliticised, in other words delegated to the market, the room to promote transformative policies for women narrows. Women's substantive representation suffers because issues that are deemed by some to be of public concern might have been delegated to the market.

State Capacity and Resources

In close relation to the problem Beall points to, Goetz highlights the importance of state capacity to implement social and economic policies that promote gender equality (Goetz 1998:241). She stresses that state capacity is more important than the presence of women in decision making bodies, (Goetz 1998:241) and that one should not overestimate politicians' power over the economy (Goetz 1998:253). Countering this argument, Schuler states that women's involvement in the formulation, implementation and enforcement of laws regarding employment is necessary in effective implementation. At the same time she sees the problem of insufficient state capacity (Schuler 1986).

These two quite similar arguments point at the economic system as being an obstacle, but Schuler's argument also supports the idea of the importance of women's substantive representation in policy formulation and hence women's lack of influence may, together with lack of resources, constitute a problem for policies affecting women as a group. As women's socioeconomic situation is still worse compared to men's, the economic policies of the post-apartheid state are directly linked to this problem in that GEAR has not managed to change women's socioeconomic situation for the better. Applying private sector principles to a country with large social and economic inequalities has limited the access to socio-economic rights (Miraftab 2006:196). If this statement is true, this affects participation at the local level and thereby also substantive representation of women.

Ward Councillors

Little research has been conducted on the institutional, political and cultural conditions under which female councillors at the local government level work (Mbatha 2003:188-189). The quality and extent of women's representation has had a tendency to be neglected by political parties and gender activists at this level of government. It is therefore necessary to look into the situation in Township X. As previously mentioned, research done by Mbatha shows that in Temba voters do expect women councillors to be responsible for addressing women's needs (Mbatha 2003:197). Whether a ward councillor is male or female may then have an effect of who approaches the councillor with their issues.

The role assigned to the ward councillor leaves him or her with a lot room to enhance participation (Mohamed 2009:226). Women in Township X may then be dependent on the

good will of the present ward councillor in having their interests heard and then later communicated by the councillor to the city council. The role of the councillor is critical for the way ward committees function as they are responsible for communicating communities inputs to the city council (Smith 2008:56). Smith's study of ward committees, published in 2008, found that the ward councillor was central in determining the effectiveness of the ward committees and this was dependent on his or hers motivation and relationship with the committee members (Smith 2008: 55). Both Mohamed's and Smith's studies shows that the way the ward councillor exercises his or her role is important for the communication of women's needs to the city council.

Ward Committees

The background chapter provides this part of the discussion with the necessary backdrop. Looking closer at the actual nature of the local level institutions; the ward level, the regional level and the city level, it might be possible to identify possible explanations for what limits and enhances women's substantive representation.

Drawing on the previous more general discussion on neoliberal economic policies limiting the space for participation, there still remains opportunities to effectively engage with the government for women as a group. One of these arenas is the ward committees which function is described in the background chapter. Gray and Mare seems to have a more positive outlook than other scholars on women's representation in local government institutions as they argue increased women's representation in local political structures will change attitudes towards women being involved in public life and thereby expand women's opportunities (Gray and Mare 2002:1). Their recommendation is therefore ensuring women's active participation at the ward level (Gray and Mare 2002:16) so that women's voices, especially when it comes to service delivery, are heard (Gray and Mare 2002:1-2). Their arguments are in the lines of the idea that descriptive representation will lead to substantive representation.

Following this, ward committees in Township X are sector-based and women used to be a sector which was represented in the ward committees. This indicates a strong commitment and a realisation of women as a group with special interests that should be communicated to the ward councillor and hence taken further up in the political system. In one ward studied, the women's sector included organisations such as women clubs and branches of political

parties (Mohamed 2009:209). The crucial finding of Mohamed's study from 2009 is that the organised women's groups of the women's sector represented in the ward committee were not active in the informal settlements (Mohamed 2009:209). This is a major obstacle if substantive representation of women is a goal, as a vast number of women in the informal settlements, those worst off in socioeconomic matters, are not able to communicate their interests to the ward councillor and are thus not represented at this level of government. The study also found that people in informal settlements found it more fruitful to attend regional meetings and ward public meetings (Mohamed 2009:236).

If Township X is graced with responsive and motivated ward councillors and ward committee members, this might not be enough to enhance women's substantive representation as a lot of evidence suggests that ward committees simply do not work due to problems ranging from lack of committee members interest to the councillors lack of influence in the city council (Smith 2008:11-18). Another issue worth noting is that the sector representatives did not seem to have enough contact with their respective sectors they were meant to represent (Mohamed 2009:209).

The nature of local government as more of a governmental level for service delivery as a result of the neoliberal turn of economic policies from 1996, the way the wards councillors exercises their role, and the representation of marginalised women in the sector-organised ward committees may all have limiting or enhancing effects on women's substantive representation.

4.4 Women's Movement

4.4.1 General Theory and Literature

Social movements are "actors and organisations seeking to alter power deficits and to affect social transformations through the state by mobilising regular citizens for sustained political action" (Amenta et al. 2010:288). The relationship between the social movement and the state is inherently important when looking at social movement's ability to represent a group in a substantive manner.

A women's movement is "women organising on the basis of their identities as women and setting up exclusively women's organisations. These organisations take up whatever issues

their members consider important" (Serote et al 2000:162). Women's movements and organisations are thus a different site where women's substantive representation can take place since "acting in the interest of the represented in a manner responsive to them" (Pitkin 1967:209), are not confined to individual representatives. Substantive representation does not only happen in the legislature and women's social movements may provide an even more effective site for substantive representation of women. This is because "group perspective is a collective product of social groups, developed through intra-group interaction (Weldon 2002:1153)." A social movement can provide a group's perspective on matters important to them and social movements can thus provide more substantive representation than what individual legislators can claim to do alone. It is therefore important to consider the women's movement at the local level, but also the relationship between the movement and individual representatives.

There are different social movement theories that enable us to understand the relative success or failure of social movements. Political opportunity structure theory provides four elements that can be used in analysing social movement's relationship to the state which are:

1   the relative openness or closure of the institutionalised political system;

2   the stability or instability of that broad set of elite alignments that typically undergird a polity;

3   the presence or absence of elite allies

4   the state's capacity and propensity for repression (McAdam 1996:27).

Changes of these elements will impact the change of state-social movement relationships. "Political opportunity structures influence the choice of protest strategies and the impact of social movements on their environment" (Kitschelt 1986:58). For example, if the political system changes and becomes more closed, this will affect how social movements work and where they turn to. Social movement's access points to the state will most likely become fewer, hence the political opportunity structure has changed.

There is a dilemma on how much a social movement should collaborate with the state. Some avoid the state altogether, some aim at capturing state power, and some want to engage with the state. To reach the movement's aim, different strategies are being used.

Turning to the women's movement, it has been argued that the women's movement should not be coterminous with the state. This is because this will limit the movement's ability to criticise government (Weldon 2002:1161).

Nationalist social movements, like the anti-apartheid movement in South Africa, carry within them a range of different social movements that represent different social groups in society. In most cases, national movements change shape at independence reducing them to state ideology and at the same time demobilising the different social movements within it (Sachikonye 1995:14). Although the women's movement can be a site for substantive representation of women as a group, according to the theory being presented here, it is important to consider the movement's relationship to the state, by looking at elite allies, resources, and entry points. It is also important to look at the movement's relationship to individual representatives in local government.

4.4.2 The Women's Movement in the Context of South Africa

According to Heller, one cannot only blame the economic system in that subordinate groups, like marginalised women, may have problems in shaping public policy. One has to look at possible problems in the democratic process itself (Heller 2009:124).

South Africa does not have a weak civil society per se, but marginalised groups may find it difficult to engage with the state as the places one can connect with the state are rather limited locally as well as ANC has a lot of power over the agenda-setting and channels of influence (Heller 2009:132-133).

Following the previous discussion on how a massive depoliticisation of previously perceived public concerns happened in the late 90s as a shift from RDP to GEAR took place, one cannot exclude economic policies as having an impact on civil society- state relations. As this privatisation took place, a parallel change in civil society also happened. Non-governmental organisations (NGOs) lost some autonomy since they were dependent on the new ANC-led government for grants, and many of the NGOs started acting merely as an instrument for the state.

As a consequence, civil society in South Africa is divided between those organisations which engage and collaborate with the state, and those organisations which do not engage with the

state. Before ANC rose to power, the ways which civil society engaged with the state was different. The state has developed a stricter and more direct control over civil society through a range of mechanisms like freezing out critics, and strategic list nominations (Heller 2009:140). Ashton argues there has been an intentional marginalisation of civil society voices, of those who do not support the political status-quo (Ashton 2010). This situation may have an effect upon whose voices are being heard in the representation of women.

For most women in South Africa, a women's movement implies a coming together of women's organisations in some form, be it formal alliances or loose ad-hoc alliances around specific issues (Serote et al. 2000:162). This means that the women's movement today is not a homogeneous entity.

After apartheid, the women's movement took a different shape compared to what is described in the background chapter. After democracy was installed as a political system, most of the top leaders that were active in the women's movement moved to positions in the state bureaucracy (Hassim 2006:182). The work for equality between men and women could now happen from within the state, and gender activists now inside the state apparatus continued fighting for women's issues.

Women have undoubtedly benefitted from this inclusionary strategy in several ways, as the state's promise of gender equality was institutionalized into procedures and rules in the state (Hassim 2003b:507-509), but this, what Hassim refers to as "inclusionary feminism", has also had consequences that were not foreseen. One of these consequences being the depoliticisation of women's interests as the mainstreaming of gender in the state has become very technical (Hassim 2006b:191). What is meant by gender mainstreaming is the consideration for gender equality in the formulation of all policies (De Waal 2005:121). One of the best examples of the institutionalisation of gender equality efforts by the state is the South African Commission on Gender Equality which was established in 1996 (Seidman 2003:541). This organisation is to promote, protect, monitor and evaluate gender equality (Commission for Gender Equality 2015). An article by Seidman from 2003, explains how the efforts and resources spent on mobilising support for the commission made commissioners avoid controversy, and hence created a conflict between those who wanted to create a feminist project within the state and those who wanted to mobilise support for women's issues in a broader context. In other words, a conflict between representation and mobilisation of women occurred (Seidman 2003:561). Also worth noting is the lack of accountability to women as a

larger constituency due to the fact that commissioners in the Gender Commission are not elected representatives (Seidman 2003:551). What happened to the women's movement after apartheid is still debated, but many formerly independent women's organisations joined the ANCWL (Connell 1998: 197). The broad popular women's movement dissolved, and one of the obstacles for a re-emergence of a broad popular women's movement is said to be the lack of interest from the ANCWL for collaboration with groups not under their reign (Connell 1998:203).

Individual political representatives are not the only source for women's substantive representation. It is often in larger forums common interests are articulated (Celis et al. 2008:103). According to the ANCWL constitution, the branches of the ANCWL are where the members should discuss and formulate policy (ANCWL 2008). This indicates that the ANCWL is an organisation where substantive representation is possible. At the same time as being a forum for discussing and agreeing upon policies, the ANCWL is closely connected to the ANC government and have thus, according to Heller's line of thought, a good access point to the state. How the ANCWL engages with the party is then necessary to look into, since ANC control and depoliticisation has been mentioned as obstacles for substantive representation.

In an article from December 2014, a political editor of a South African newspaper lashed out towards the ANCWL, arguing for their inability to promote women's interests, and not doing enough to dismantle patriarchy in their own party: "For two decades now, the league has held women back in the name of respecting ANC traditions and processes", and "disbanding the league would free female ANC members to compete on the same level as their male counterparts "(Mataboge 2014). The basis for the article was the failure of the ANCWL to put up women candidates for the position of president, deputy president, and secretary general. On the same topic of failing to nominate female candidates to top positions Evans states :" The ANC Women's League will not break rank with the ANC, nor will it put its gender transformation imperatives above the ANC's needs" (Evans 2013).

These statements are not entirely new accusations, and keeping in mind Heller and Hassim's arguments, respectively the ANC control and depoliticisation of women's issue in the state, the critique seems plausible.

40

Disbanding the ANCWL may be a very drastic move, but what many scholars call for is a united pressure from women outside of the state (Mtintso 2003:578, Hassim 2014:100, Hassim 2003b:524, Connell 1998:205). This will improve accountability and make women less dependent on the dominant party's preferences. For the feminist policymakers, Seidman stresses the importance for feminist ideas outside the state (Seidman 2003:561.562). It is not only women outside the political system that will necessarily benefit from an independent voice outside the state, but also women currently holding political positions whom may find it difficult to fight for women's issues from within the state alone, without any support from strong allies in civil society. Hassim suggests that substantive representation at the local level in South Africa is dependent on a well organised and policy-articulate women's movement at the local level (Hassim 2014:95). It will thus be interesting to see how the ANCWL and other women's organisations function and work together in Township X, and come to a conclusion on whether or not the arguments discussed here are relevant.

4.5 Patriarchy

4.5.1 General Theory and Literature

The subordinate status of women vis-à-vis men is a universal phenomenon, though with a difference in nature and extent of subordination across countries (Bari 2005:5).

In Veronica Beechey's article "On Patriarchy" from 1979, she discusses different theories on patriarchy and mentions that on the most general level, the term "patriarchy" refers to a system in which men dominate women (Beechey 1979:66). The concept of patriarchy itself is very undertheorised (Kandiyoti 1988:274) and carries different meanings to different people. Drawing on Beechey's broad and general definition, one can, for the purpose of this thesis, extract that men also dominate women in the political field.

Finding out what limits and enhances women's substantive representation and informal exclusion of women are worth looking into. So far, the arguments in this thesis have been concentrated on more formal structural barriers. The main argument in this discussion is that women are excluded from exercising substantive representation due to a culture of patriarchy also informally embedded in the political representational sphere.

In a conference in 2011 arranged by Africa Contact, Gendernet and the Danish Institute for Human Rights, the 50 participants from Egypt, Zimbabwe, and Tunisia discussed how to strengthen women's political participation in the world. On the topic of how to support women's voices in politics, patriarchy was a theme that was discussed, and it was stressed that looking at formal political rights was not enough (DIPD 2011).

This line of thinking about men and women is not something new. Women's formal exclusion from politics has been the case for most of modern democracy's history. An example would be the women's right to vote which is relatively new seeing it from a historical context. This exclusion comes from a view that women solely belong to the private domain due to their role as wives and mothers, whereas the public domain, which was and is still to some degree seen as a separate place, was where the men could thrive (Bari 2005:3).

In theory, women and men can now act on equal terms in the public sphere as most formal barriers to women's political participation have been lifted, but the private-public dichotomy is still at play in that women's legitimate place is perceived by many as being the home, and men are more associated with the public domain. Hence men dominating politics has been a direct effect of the former formal exclusion of women in politics, and can still be said to be an effect of this view of sphere belonging to men. An example of this problem is the gendered role associations which have been found to have practical impact on women exercising substantive representation because domestic responsibilities leaves less time for political work and sometimes are not compatible with being a full time politician at all (Bari 2005:5)

Turning to Sub-Saharan African countries, Yoon's extensive study of African countries from 2004 found that the higher degree of patriarchy in a country, the lower the women's legislative representation (Yoon 2004:447). In other words, being represented by a woman at all is dependent on the level of male domination in a Sub- Saharan African country. It is also argued that role expectations regarding gender discourage women from entering politics in the first place and gives them a lower percentage of the votes (Gordon 1996:113). A study from Pakistan reveals how female local representatives all shared the same experience meeting resistance from men on the basis of their gender. The women from the different parties got together when they realised many of their obstacles for performing more effectively stemmed from their gender identity as women (Bari 2005:8).

42

There is reason to also believe that women in South Africa, including Township X, meet the same types of resistance as discussed in the previous paragraphs. It is also reasonable to believe that these experiences can affect the substantive representation of women as women representatives may meet informal obstacles in performing their political tasks.

4.5.2 Informal Exclusion of Women in South Africa

What may limit women's substantive representation are different forms of exclusion due to patriarchy in the South African society.

As previously mentioned, the term "patriarchy" carries different meanings to different people. ANC uses the term patriarchy and defines it in its 2012 Gender Paper: "Patriarchy is an ideological construct of a system encompassing ideologies, beliefs, values and practices underpinning the organization and structure of society – resulting in unequal power relations between women and men. The subjugation and subordination of women in all spheres of life beginning with the family is impacted upon by patriarchal attitudes. It is a historical and widespread phenomenon, continuously reinforced by social practices and institutions, including education, work, religion, culture, the arts and the media and has come to be seen as "natural, God-given or part of the tradition and culture" (ANC 2012:5).

ANC's acknowledgement of attitudes having an impact on the subordination of women, and that patriarchy thrives on the economic-political system, is important since patriarchy then becomes an officially recognised problem by the dominant political party in South Africa. ANC also calls for a new shift in thinking about gender equality as a norm (ANC 2012:6).

Writing on South Africa, Bentley argues that the retention of patriarchy underlies the ongoing marginalisation of women and that legal provisions for the protection of the basic rights of women are undermined by patriarchy (Bentley 2004:248-249). She further suggests that a possible way of redressing the economic power imbalances would be to facilitate women's participation in decision making especially concerning development policies, but at the same time taking into account the unequal power relations so that women's voices are not muted (Bentley 2004:259). Bentley makes an important point here, because it is crucial to find out how these power relations work if one is to take them into account to avoid women's voices losing out despite being formally represented. In her concluding remarks, Bentley stresses that those who are in power are responsible for leading the way in changing people's attitudes

(Bentley 2004:259). It then becomes even more interesting to find out what happens in the decision-making forums when it comes to patriarchal attitudes towards women which can limit their substantive representation.

Expected gender roles and time constraint problems

At the national level, a study by Britton from 1997, found that female members of parliament would not stand for re-elections due to high levels of stress caused by cultural constraints on their participation (Britton 1997). Mtintso's research done by the end of the first parliament found that female members of parliament had overcome some of the stress due cultural constraints on their participation (Mtintso 1999:53). This latter point is important because it shows that initial cultural constraints on women's participation are not impossible to overcome.

Turning to local councils, Mbatha identifies four conditions for women's ability to articulate women's interests in decision making, one of the four being cultural norms and expectations of women's roles (Mbatha 2003:201). Mbatha finds that the few women council members continue to live in families where there exists a belief that women's primary work should be the in the home. Household responsibilities can be a constraint on the time that can be spent on council work as the women have the primary responsibility in the home. Due to this, questions about women's ability to bear council duties in addition to having responsibilities at home, have been questioned, and arguments surrounding this contributes to marginalising women (Mbatha 2003 : 201-202). The view that women should be, and in fact are very much tied to household responsibilities, corresponds well with ANC's definition of patriarchy, especially that "the subjugation and subordination of women in all spheres of life beginning with the family is impacted upon by patriarchal attitudes" (ANC 2012:5). Women's ability to represent is questioned due to patriarchal social relations that feed into patriarchal attitudes and ultimately how people perceive and judge women differently to men in politics.

Lack of trust and informal exclusion

Maharaj and Maharaj find that women are discriminated against on the basis of gender and are side-lined and marginalised when they occupy formal positions of power in councils (Maharaj and Maharaj 2004:263). Maharaj and Maharaj identify a number of factors which are causing low levels of participation by women in local government structures in Durban.

44

These causes relate to patriarchal norms and practices in South Africa; a lack of support from the women's family due to cultural prejudices against women, but also lack of women's own self confidence was identified as reasons for the low levels of female participation. Men feeling threatened when women put their issues forward were also emotions expressed by the male interviewees in the study (Maharaj and Maharaj 2004:266). Interviewing men revealed a lack of understanding by some of them around gender issues, and a lack of trust in women as decision-makers (Maharaj and Maharaj 2004:267). All in all, the study shows that it was a male-dominated environment which neither was very welcoming to women nor to gender issues. "The male mind-set of superiority and the right to dominate, stems from the patriarchal structures of the state and traditional cultures" (Maharaj and Maharaj 2004:268).

Izike and Uzodike claims that Zulu men oppose action towards gender equity because they believe their culture does not allow for women to be equal to men, and also active in politics. Data from their research shows that women in politics are still ridiculed and their roles as mothers and wives are questioned as being compatible with being involved politics and they conclude that patriarchal ideology creates expectations on what it is to be a good Zulu women in KwaZulu-Natal and undermines these women's political authority (Isike and Uzodike 2011:228-233).

Although Gray and Mare argue that the representation of women in municipal structures is a vital step towards gender equality (Gray and Mare 2002:5), the transformative function of this in substantive representation can be questioned as patriarchal norms are still at play and seem to be a constraining force on women getting their voices heard when they are formally represented. Fraser argues also that despite the absence of formal exclusion, power inequalities can affect deliberation (Fraser 1997:79).

These studies identify the limiting effects patriarchy can have on women's substantive representation.

5   Methodological Considerations

5.1 Case Study as Design

The thesis is a part of a larger research project by the Norwegian Institute for Urban and Regional Research titled: "Self-help or Social Transformation? The Role of Women in Local Governance in Kerala and South-Africa." Their main research question is to what extent does women's political participation in different forms of local civil society organizations and in local government enhance a substantive democracy where women have the ability to exercise their rights and voice their demands? The institute uses three analytical levels in their research project: Single-case studies, comparisons of the effects of institutional design in the single-cases, and a larger comparison between the prerequisites for women's substantive representation in Kerala and South Africa. My contribution to the project will be at the first level since I am doing a single-case study. The research question and choice of research design required me to travel to South Africa for the collection of the data. Since other people were involved in the research I did not conduct the fieldwork all by myself. The research team consisted of me, another master student on the same project with a different research question, my supervisor from the institute and a research assistant.

Gerring's definition of a case study is: "The intensive study of a single case where the purpose of that study is – at least in part- to shed light on a larger class of cases (a population)" (Gerring 2007:20).

There are different categories of case studies and according to Levy's typology, this case study is a theory-guided case study because it is "structured by a well-developed conceptual framework that focuses attention on some theoretically specified aspects of reality and neglects others" (Levy 2008:4) . Using Törnquist's framework for structuring the literary discussion and the analysis of the data, the case study aims at explaining a single case which makes it an ideographic case study as opposed to a hypothesis-generating case study which aim is to generalise beyond the data collected (Levy 2008:5). The single-case study in this thesis is a township, focusing on the local government and political actors within it.

The assumption is that the single case studied in this thesis is a typical and representative case in that the framework and theory being used is thought to apply here (Gerring 2007:89). The aim is not to weaken or strengthen the framework since the theoretical framework merely is being used to steer the research, and illuminate certain aspects that may explain what enhances and limits substantive representation of women in Township X.

An issue worth noting in a case study like this, is the more that case interpretations are guided by theory, the more explicit their underlying analytic assumptions and normative biases exists (Levy 2008:5).

In this case, I am aware there is a normative bias for possible explanations to the research question, but considering the depth and magnitude of previous work on the topic of substantial democracy leading to the theoretical framework and the applicability to different contexts argued for in the theory chapter, the bias is firmly empirically grounded. In addition, semi-structured interviews leave room for answers which might diverge from the assumptions derived from the framework.

There are advantages and disadvantages in doing singe-case study research as opposed to cross-case studies with larger N-samples. The external validity of the findings are weaker opposed to a study using a larger N-sample (Gerring 2007:43). In this case, quite few people are interviewed. However, this type of research with a small number of units will provide the study with a more in-depth information than a larger study with several more interview subjects would be able to produce (Gerring 2007:48-50). In other words, a case study like the one conducted in this thesis will have stronger internal validity as the researcher is able to dig deeper revealing insight that might otherwise have been overlooked. In this case one can argue that some of the themes analysed, such as the internal workings of ANC, may carry some external validity as the case in question is an ANC dominated area and can thus be representative of the party ANC. But first and foremost the study is ideographic and not hypothesis-generating.

Gerring discusses the benefit of discovering causal mechanisms by choosing a case study as research method (Gerring 2007:43-48). To find out what leads to an effect, a case study using interviews with different kinds of questions may give more accurate answers than a quantitative study. In other words, identifying the mechanisms that cause the effect is possible with a smaller sample. By only looking if there is an effect and to what extent this effect

occurs, as a large N-study would do, a case study will be able to locate what directly contributes to the effect.

The availability of data determines the research design. Since little research of women's substantive representation on the local level in South Africa has been done, there is close to no data to be collected elsewhere to shed light on the situation of what enhances and limits substantive representation of women. As the framework guides what literature is to be discussed, the conclusions from the literature discussion provide the possible explanations for what limits and enhances women's substantive representation. This will be the basis for the interview guide which will be used for the collection of the data. If there was more statistics and former research available, the framework might have been specified more accurately to fit previous findings on the topic. Gerring also mentions the importance of the state of the field (Gerring 2007:62-63). In this field, little research has been conducted so the task at hand is to build on the existing literature regarding what might answer the research question and then conduct a case study based on it.

5.2 The Singe Case

The township is a black township located outside Johannesburg in South Africa. It is a very densely populated township with over a 100 000 inhabitants divided into several wards. There have been a lot of improvements done by the government since the 1990s in relation to service delivery such as building of houses, and water and sanitation developments (NIBR 2013b:25). The township has at this point some clinics, a few community centres, high schools, primary schools, and a police and fire station. There are different kinds of shops and services available, including large supermarkets and gas stations. Some areas of the township looks more developed than others with higher quality housing and roads.

Despite these improvements there are huge socioeconomic problems. The unemployment rate is around 50 per cent, only about 15 per cent get their income from formal employment alone. About 20 per cent get all their income from informal work, and many are dependent on grants from the government (COPAC 2011). As a result, food insecurity is prevalent. The illiteracy rate is also high (NIBR 2013b:26), which can make advancements in the job market difficult for many. Like the introduction of this thesis illustrated, women are the group who are most gravely affected by problems like this. This also applies to this township.

ANC is by far the biggest political party in this township. All the ward councillors interviewed in this thesis are ANC representatives, and the party has a heavy presence in the community as well as being one of the largest ANC-branch in South Africa (NIBR 2013a:6). The ANCWL is very active in the area as well, and both ANCWL and the ANC councillors are very much involved in community development work.

Most of the local government initiatives and NGOs are clustered in, or connected to community centres which work as natural meeting point for the inhabitants. Most of the councillors' offices are all located in the community centre structures. ANCWL meetings are also held in these community centres, as well as public meetings. The localisations of these meeting-points are not ideal as they were not always easily accessible for all the people living in the township.

The township is a very typical township, but little research has been done in here, especially in comparison to more famous townships like Soweto. The little former research done here, and the fact it represents very typical features of South African townships, makes this township a very interesting case.

External reliability, according to Bryman, is the degree to which study can be replicated (Bryman 2004:273), is difficult in this case since the interviewees and the township is not named due to anonymity reasons. The external validity, which concerns the degree of which the findings can be generalised to other settings (Bryman 2004:273), can be said to be somewhat good despite the external reliability issue. This is because Township X is a very typical and average township with local government structures similar to other townships in South Africa, and thus it is likely some of the findings may be applicable in other contexts.

5.3 Choosing the Type of Interview

Since I wanted to see if the findings from the literary discussion are possible explanations for what enhances and limits substantive representation of women, it would be most fruitful to use semi-structured interviews so I could somewhat guide the conversation in the interview setting.

An unstructured interview is more like an open conversation and will not necessarily contribute to consistent data that can be compared across the different interviews conducted

(Leech 2002:665). An unstructured interview would not be fruitful to attain the answers I need for this research question, as this type of interviewing is not very structured around specific questions, but functions more like a conversation with little direction (Bryman 2004:321).

 Relying on a structured interview, which has a strict set of questions to be asked, would not generate the answers that would be most fruitful to the research either, since the study is not about testing a hypothesis, but rather gaining insight using theory as a guide with possible explanations drawn from it. Answers gathered from a structured interview, either confirming or disproving my assumptions will not give access to alternative possible explanations to my research question. Leech states that structured interviews have tendency to backfire as we assume we are familiar with an area but end up asking the wrong questions (Leech 2002:665).

Semi-structured interviews are the middle ground between unstructured and structured interviews. Semi-structured interviews often include open-ended questions which allow the interviewee to speak about what they deem important and not be completely restricted by the researcher's assumptions (Berry 2002:681). This facilitates for gaining new insight into the case with the theoretical framework not directing too much of the interview. All questions will be covered as the interview guide will steer the interview onto the right track, but at the same time allow for some flexibility (Bryman 2004:321-323), but not too much of it.

5.4 Thoughts and Considerations on Developing the Interview Guide and Conducting the Interviews

Berry reminds us that interviewers must always keep in mind that there is no guarantee or obligation on the part of the interviewee to tell the truth (Berry 2002:680). This is not to question people's intentions or spirits, but can be a reminder that people affiliated with, for example, an organisation or political party may be biased due to an allegiance, and may thus paint a very rosy picture which may not actually depict the whole truth.

The interviewee may also have an interest in presenting the interviewer with an inaccurate picture of someone else. One of Berry's suggestions for solving this problem is to let the interviewee critique his or her own case (Berry 2002:680). An illustration of this problem would be speaking to a high ranking woman in the ANCWL that is totally convinced

everything they do is working perfectly well, and then ask why some people are not agreeing with her.

Berry also points to a problem with open-ended questioning which is that the interviewees may for different reasons exaggerate, downplay, or overrate someone's role and impact (Berry 2002:680). To avoid, this I consider some of Berry's recommendations to circumvent it. One of Barry's recommendations is to ask about subjects that do not relate to the interviewee's role which he or she might feel a need to justify by using exaggeration (Berry 2002:681). Being biased may not only be because the interviewees want to depict themselves in a certain way. It may just be because it is easier to talk about oneself and overlook other aspects they might know something about (Andersen 2006:294). The challenge is to not let the interviewees trail off on their personal merits when asking about their background and work.

Avoiding inquiries regarding the degree and extent of something is also important. This is not a part of my research question as I am asking what limits and enhances substantive representation of women and not to what extent.

Being biased comes not only from personal preferences but also how one remembers events. Research on people's psychology shows that the interviewees' memory is most reliable when one asks about events that are not specific in nature, but are quite common and well understood (Andersen 2006: 292). Avoiding this problem more general questions are asked without referring to specific cases. An alternative is asking for examples the interviewees say they remember well, and follow up on this.

It is not up to me to assess people's reliability, but since politics can be a touchy subject and internal rivalry between and within parties are most likely existent, there is a need to formulate the questions in a way that will minimize or avoid these matters. Avoiding confrontational questions and statements during the interview is done in this case to reduce this problem. Wolvier makes an important point regarding dilemmas surrounding conflicts of interest when she mentions it is up to the judgement of the interviewer to know when conflicts are a serious part of the story and important for the data collected (Wolvier 2002:677). As I am not an experienced interviewer, and am in no position to make judgements about political conflicts in South Africa, I had to be clear about what I wanted to study and not let gossip or allegations voiced during the interviews have any effect on the interviews conducted. It is

moreover not ethically responsible to use what others have said in an interview-setting to confront someone else later with a statement. The interview guide has not been significantly altered after gaining new insight as the theory I am using was solely the basis for my interviews.

Interviewing people who are a part of a political elite may pose some challenges in their way of communicating information on sensitive data. The interviewee might be used to giving the "right" answers, and steering the interview. There is a risk of the interviewer losing control over the flow of the interview (Andersen 2006:282). Because of this there is a need for the interviewer to be more active and take control over the situation. As I am an inexperienced interviewer, in situations like these, it was important for me to be less flexible by sticking more to the interview guide and rather use more follow up questions. Being aware that open-ended questions give more room for elusive answers, avoiding these questions when a situation like this occurred proved necessary.

Clarifying is essential in getting the answers that one needs (Andersen 2006:290). It is important to make sure the interviewee and I have the same points of reference. If this is not the case the answers will not correspond well to the questions which will affect the final analysis of the data. Making sure there was a common understanding on what central concepts meant, like for example the term "patriarchy" was an essential segment to each interview.

There are ethical dimensions in the conduct of the interviews. I am a white young female student from a foreign country. The interviewee's preconception of me and my knowledge of South Africa may have impacted the interviews. The task at hand was thus to act neutral and polite, as well as making sure the interviewees were well informed about the research and my role prior to the interview. Interviews will inevitably cause tensions between the interviewer and the interviewees different roles (Andersen 2006:287). Making sure to minimize this issue, it is valuable to be very aware of this during the interview. Wolvier stresses openness as being important in conducting interviews. Being honest about your personal interest in the topic and not take a stance on a subject is important (Wolvier 2002:677). My personal beliefs should not matter to my role as a researcher. Pure interest and theory is guiding my role, and making people aware of this, was important in helping avoiding possible tensions.

5.5 The Research Process and Conducting the Interviews.

Random sampling is central to most statistical analysis, but there is a consensus that random selection will often generate biases in small-N research, and that analysing a small number of cases requires a careful, theory-guided selection of non-random cases (Gerring, 2007: 87–88).

Answering the research question, the population of interest was local political actors. I decided on three groups of interview subjects: ward councillors, ward committee members, and members of ANCWL. The reason for selecting these three groups was mainly to cover the city level, the local level, and civil society-politics relations. The city level was covered by the ward councillors due to their task of connecting the community to the city. The local level was covered by the ward committee members, but also the ward councillor. Lastly the civil society-politics relations were covered by including the ANCWL. The selection is relevant since all of these groups are interconnected by their workings and the relationship between them could provide more insight into what enhances and limits women's substantive representation in Township X. Additional information was provided by interviewing local administration representatives.

These political actors were assumed to have first-hand knowledge about the local community and political situation due to their roles. Choosing to interview these people made the limited time I had in South Africa to collect data more efficient in that fewer interviews were required to gather the information necessary for the analysis. The aim was to get interviews with three representatives from each group. This aim was reached. Some of the interviewees were both members of the ANCWL as well as ward committee members.

Three different interview guides were made to fit the different groups. The majority of the questions were the same, but some were added or removed depending on the relevance. The interview guides build on the different conclusions from the literature discussion. My supervisors gave me useful advice on the structure of the interview guide as well as the wording of some of the questions.

Arriving in South Africa, the first step was to locate these key informants which turned out to be a tricky task. The ward councillors' contact details were available online, but the ward

committee members' were not. Representatives from the ANCWL were also hard to locate because no names of the representatives were registered anywhere available to us.

After a few days the research team hired a research assistant from the University of Withwatersrand to help set up the appointments. This research assistant proved to be a vital asset for the research project as she was experiences with doing similar jobs before and was effective in making appointments. Most importantly she spoke the local languages and had extensive knowledge of the South African culture. This was most likely a decisive factor in getting the interviews, but also it gave the research team more credibility as foreign researchers. The presence of the research assistant during most of the interviews was also helpful since she could sometimes help clarify certain words by translating them into the interviewee's first language.

The solution to the problem of finding contact details was solved by contacting the few we could get a hold of and ask them for other people's contact details, the so called snowball method. Although the snowball method is not considered to be the best method for finding interviewees, it was the only viable option available in this case. Little research has been conducted in this township before, and by using the snowball method and eventually getting a better overview over the different local political actors, this may help pave way for researchers coming in later.

The majority of the interviews were conducted with two or three interviewers interviewing the informant, with the research assistant present. In most cases one interviewer took the lead with the other interviewers adding questions by the end of each interview. Each interviewee got an information letter prior to the interview informing them about the project and the research. All had to sign a research consent form before the interview could commence. The consent form also stated the interviewee's anonymity would be ensured at all times. After each interview, the interview was discussed informally and transcribed within twenty-four hours without any names being used. It was good to be more than one interviewer present because if anything was unclear after the interview we could consult each other. As Bryman points out, this enhances internal reliability in that the research team agrees upon what they see and hear (Bryman 2004:273). In the last interviews I noticed the answers stated to become gradually more similar and comparable to the earlier interviews. This indicated to me that the data collected earlier was reliable, and the number of interviewees was sufficient in answering the research question.

54

It did not take long before encountering the different obstacles previously discussed. A couple of the interviewees seemed very biased towards ANC in that there was in the beginning no critique of the party whatsoever, but after a while asking other types of questions, they started to contradict the immaculate image of ANC they had previously presented. Two interviewees clearly bragged about what they had done for the community completely trailing off the subject of inquiry, but as soon as I realised, I was prepared to cut them off and redirect the interview by sticking more to my interview guide and asking for more specific answers to my questions.

Intentionally downplaying someone else's role might have happened more than I realised during the interviews but I had no chance to check if this was the case. Only once, a councillor deliberately bad-mouthed another councillor using the councillor's name. The interviewees might have downplayed someone else's role since there often seemed to be a blame game at play. Using the recommendation from Barry in making someone critique his or her own case had to be used whenever someone just put the blame on someone else.

Some interviewees were very wary about our intentions despite reading though the information form and the consent form prior to the interview. Two people suggested they could sign the research consent form after the interview. Two people were concerned we were recording during the interview although we clearly told them in the beginning we would not, as well as ensuring them of their anonymity. Some interviewees were more outspoken, and even said that other interview subjects might have been lying to us because they were scared of the repercussions if they said anything wrong. Due to all this, there is reason to believe that intrigues, allegiances and the general nature of local politics in Township X made people not be entirely truthful. Avoiding gossip during the interviews was not an easy task, but acting neutral, open and showing genuine interest in what people were telling was most effective in making people talk more freely. Clarifying certain words was done in the beginning of each interview by asking how the interviewees understood different terms.

The choice of not using a tape recorder probably also made people talk more openly, since they knew that what they said was more confidential when nothing was taped. No tape recorder was also a particularly constructive choice bearing in mind some interviewees were hesitant to sign the consent form, and anxious about their anonymity. I am also convinced the absence of a tape recorder made the interview-setting more relaxed.

Getting home and processing the interviews was an elaborate process which started with a run trough of all the interviews by me, and later with the research team. To organise the data I made a matrix placing the three different groups of interviewees in the left margin, and the different themes with the accompanying points from Törnquist's theoretical framework at the top. This enabled me to get an overview over the frequency of similar answers, but also divergences that stood out. This organising of the data also made it possible to compare the different groups and extract useful information about the relationship between them I otherwise might have overlooked. In addition a separate column was added to the matrix, aiding me in keeping in mind own observations relevant to the answers, such as setting, impressions, and body-language.

6   Analysis

In the upcoming sections, each theme from the theory chapter will be covered in the analysis. To make the structure more dense and the different themes more connected, the theme "Women's Movement" is under Party Structures and "Patriarchy" will be discussed under "Local Government".

The possible explanatory factors for what enhances and limits women's substantive representation, derived from the theory chapter, will be discussed in relation to the data presented. Also included are Törnquist's points which guided the choice of topics and will also be a part of the analysis in how they relate to and explain the findings.

The first topic of the analysis is a bit different than the rest, as it includes an aim to establish that there are common women's interests to be represented.

6.1   May Descriptive Representation Lead to Substantive Representation?

"We realised women can do stuff" (interview 1).

The reason for choosing this topic in light of Törnquist's framework was the topic of the political inclusion of women in politics, in which women are represented at the local level, and who consider what to be of public concern and what is politicised onto the public affair agenda.

To gain more insight into if there is a common gender interest, it was important to clarify what the different groups meant by the term gender equality.

Gender equality

According to the South African constitution, equality includes the full and equal enjoyment of all rights and freedoms (appendix 1). This fits well with what the interviewees thought of as gender equality, namely; equal opportunities. Being able to equally enjoy freedom and rights, equal opportunities are necessary. Apart from this, equal opportunities between women and men was also mentioned by local administrators, and people spoken to outside the formal interview setting, for being a precondition for gender equality. Grievances concerning more opportunities was a common feature in all talks formal or informal surrounding the general state of society, in Johannesburg. The lack of equal opportunities for the poorest communities was expressed as an underlying cause for issues like crime and illiteracy.

The interviewees' definition of gender equality was almost always the same, with them clearly stating that gender equality was about equal opportunities for women and men. Worth noting is that the definition of equal opportunities ranged from women being numerically equally represented to men in government structures, to the opportunities women now have to do men's jobs, like ploughing and driving big trucks.

The lack of women in ward committees, or descriptive representation of women, if you will, was also seen as a problem of inequality between men and women (interview 12). This interviewee also emphasised the importance of quotas for gender equality, without even being asked about the view on the women's quota by the interviewer. Descriptive representation of women in government was also mentioned by representatives from the ANCWL as being about gender equality, and the continuation of representation of women in all sectors was said to be important for further gender equality (interview 6).

ANC's famous Freedom Charter of the ANC from 1955 mentions equality and opportunities twice in the same sentence (ANC 1955). This implies that the connection between equal opportunities and gender equality has been integral in ANC rhetoric for a long time. Combined with South Africans' experience of inequality during apartheid, it is not surprising that equal opportunities were central to the definition of gender equality.

In addition, all the interviewees had been involved in politics since before the end of apartheid. Women interviewees were eager to tell about the change that had happened in relation to men after the end of apartheid. It is very likely women have felt a great change in their political career due to increased opportunities for them in a previously very male-

dominated environment. The fact that some mentioned the opportunities women now had to do men's jobs can be interpreted as an illustration of the power balances between men and women which has changed.

Having women numerically represented in government structures has opened up a lot of doors for women, and it is thus quite natural that descriptive representation of women was mentioned as important for gender equality. In ANC's Gender Paper form 2012 the only reference to equal opportunities for men and women to be represented in politics is a reference to ANCWL's achievement on the 50/50 quota for women within ANC structures (ANC 2012:3). The rhetoric of the ANC in this paper does not go beyond descriptive representation of women, and this may have an effect on the importance people place on descriptive representation as being the same as equal opportunities.

 Having equal opportunities was seen as a positive outcome and result of ANC policies, and focusing on the political opportunities, descriptive representation of women was assumed to bring about more gender equality. The experiences some of these actors had may also have an effect on their answers. As showed in the background chapter, women pushed for legal provisions in the constitution, and women activists within the state fought for women's issues in a substantive manner. These positive experiences, not too long ago, might linger in people's memory as a proof of descriptive representation of women having a great impact.

In itself, the descriptive representation of women is a step forward for gender equality, but looking at substantive representation requires more than that women are just given equal opportunities to be a part of the political system.

The idea of descriptive representation being linked to gender equality was also evident when talking about the quotas for women in the ANC.

Views on quotas – connection between descriptive and substantive representation

The issue at stake is not to assess the effect of quotas, but exploring how the connection between the descriptive and substantive representation of women is viewed by the interviewees in this single case study.

All the councillors were very positive in regards to the quotas for women. Keeping in mind that all the people that were interviewed were members of the ANC, and opposing official party policies was not very likely, I expected the reasons the interviewees put forward for supporting the quota was far more valuable to look into.

One councillor stated the quota was important for empowering women due to the element of cultural tradition being a constraint on women's political inclusion (interview 12). Illustrating this, a different view on the quota was uttered by a ward committee member as she stated: "Women that take power sometimes show disrespect to the men at home." Women in politics might, according to her, let their political work affect their marriages (interview 10). A man working with economic development was officially for the quota on account of being an ANC member, but said his personal opinion was that the quota was "imposed on us", and that, "it should be a gradual change". His main opinion when asked again was that he supported the quota, but he though it should be a gradual change as "they" were not ready yet (interview 8).

This corresponds well with other viewpoints expressed in some of the other interviews on the topic of cultural constraints on women's substantive representation Nevertheless, these examples illustrate how cultural constraints and some viewpoints corresponds well with the main argument for the quota in that it will help correct an unjust situation, since a political situation without a women's quota does not offer equal opportunities between men and women for political inclusion (Stokes 2005:79). This is because of statements like "women are not ready yet", and the issue of perhaps showing disrespect to men at home, are attitudes which work against women's involvement in politics.

Another councillor made it clear that the quota for women was good because it enabled women to reach higher positions in the political power hierarchy. At the same time this councillor only focused on the descriptive side of women's representation in that the only thing important was that there was women represented in government, and that this was a proof the quota was working (interview 1).

Following this, the most common view on the effect of quotas for women, was that descriptive representation would lead to substantive representation. Goetz highlights that descriptive representation does not lead to substantive representation since one cannot assume that all women have a common interest in working for women's issues. (Goetz 1998:241).

60

This may be questioned in Township X because of how the interviewees viewed women representatives, including themselves:

When asked about the view on the quota for women, one ward committee member said; "Women will be open to other women" (interview 4). She also mentioned that women are scared to talk to men, and because of this, there was a need for more women representatives. She also pointed out the situation for women had improved in the ANC after the quota was installed, since women now did not just have to listen to men (interview 4).

A chairperson of the ANCWL explicitly supported the quota due to power imbalances between men and women in politics, and said, without the question being asked, that women's situation would be better with female councillors, and it would also be easier for the ANCWL to put forward issues if there was a female councillor (interview 6). To exemplify further, two interviewees mentioned that the issue of domestic violence would be addressed more if there was a woman councillor (interview 6 and 4).

These answers may indicate that women find it easier to talk to other women, and this may in itself make substantive representation of women by women councillors easier. This is because if you have access to women's opinions, because they come to you, it becomes easier to be responsive to them. Dahlerup mentions that different experiences and interests need to be included in politics (Dahlerup 2007:74). In this case it seems like the presence of women councillors and other women representatives are assumed to bring in different interests into politics, such as domestic violence, so the constituents finds it easier to approach their representatives. If women also are scared to talk to men, and at the same time scared of not being heard and understood, the reason for wanting female ward councillors and supporting the quota in general, becomes evident.

Supporting this, Mbatha's research, found that people expected their local female councillor to be responsible for addressing women's needs regardless of their party affiliations (Mbatha 2003:197), and also that most female representative's policy goal in office was to strive for women's economic independence, and they also believed they could make a difference (Mbatha 2003:208).

Corresponding well with Mbatha's previous findings was the topic of who the ANC-interviewees felt they represented. The answer was usually "all women", referring to all women in the community. When the interviewees pointed out they represented all women one has to keep in mind the stronghold ANC and ANCWL has in Township X, and thus how many people are affiliated with them although not being formal members of the party. At the same time the fact that ANCWL operates by being very present in the development of the community may shape how members of the ANCWL perceive their political role as to whom their organisation is to represent. In Township X they did seem to represent all women.

Despite the consensus on descriptive representation not automatically leading to substantive representation, in some instances women representatives did exercise substantive representation because they were women. This is a claim which can be defended due to two women representatives explicitly exemplifying this. One councillor said that one woman came to her with an issue concerning domestic violence, because this woman's male ward councillor was not responsive to her. She came to her because she was a woman, and would therefore understand and be responsive (interview 11). A chairperson of the ANCWL said that their recent campaign on women's safety, after a horrible rape and murder of a young girl in the community, did not enjoy any involvement from the ward councillor: "*We* are campaigning now, not the ward councillor" She also mentioned that in her opinion, the ward councillor was responsible for women's issues, but that domestic violence and rape was not taken seriously by him (interview 4). The result of this was that ANCWL took on the task to make a women's safety campaign, and as a consequence, substantively represent women on the issue of domestic violence. This happened even though the male councillor had the opportunity and freedom to lead the campaign or getting involved in it. Representing women's interests here was done by the ANCWL.

One cannot exclude the idea that what is expected of the different representatives, being the individual ward councillors or ANCWL, have an effect on how they operate. If it is common for the ANCWL to take on issues that have affected women as a group in the community, the councillor may find his role in it redundant and keep a certain distance regardless of the councillor's gender. What people expect from the local institutions may affect how the councillor acts in situations like the ones described above. And although a woman chose to talk to a female ward councillor, after being rejected by her own, this does not necessarily imply that the male ward councillor did not make a valid judgement based on this woman's

interests, or that this choice of rejecting her was due to his lack of understanding for this woman's concerns. The point here is that there are sometimes valid expectations that women will represent women best, and this is expressed in the wish for more female councillors. This does not prove Goetz argument wrong, but shows that in Township X expectations, role understandings and personal commitment can have a positive impact and enhance women's substantive representation.

Are there common women's interests or not?

For further clarification, it was crucial to grasp what the interviewees defined as women's interests if I was to analyse if there actually were common women's interests to be represented in a substantive manner. The lack of common women's interests may limit women's substantive representation. If there are no common interests to represent, the basis for the research question evaporates since "acting in the interest of the represented in a manner responsive to them" (Pitkin 1967:209), or substantive representation, if you may, presupposes that there is an interest of the represented that ought to be represented, in this case; women's interests.

The overall picture after conducting the fieldwork supported the claim that there are certain women's issues agreed upon by most of the local actors in Township X. As mentioned in the theory chapter, women early on mobilized around specific issues which were of particular concern to them. This accounts for Township X today, since women in Township X were politically active in mobilising around certain issues ranging from community work to political debates in the local ANCWL branch.

Women's issues were more or less defined in the same way. Unemployment and domestic violence was, by only two exceptions, mentioned by the interviewees as women's issues. Worth mentioning is that unemployment also affects men, and is a great concern for both men and women. But as the background chapter showed, women are mostly affected by this, and there seemed to be an awareness of this in Township X. Several interviewees emphasised the importance of providing jobs to women as their experience was that women spend their money in a more sensible way, by supporting several family members.

Issues such as problems with service delivery and unemployment, were according to one councillor, women's issues that also came up in public meetings (interview 12). In one ward,

they actually had a dedicated sector committee outside of the formal structure of the ward committee, consisting of ten women that worked solely on identifying women's issues. The women's issues identified mirrored the women's interests that were identified through the other interviews. The main concerns identified by the women in this committee were also issues like domestic abuse and unemployment (interview 12). This further supports the idea that there are common gender interests in Township X.

The information collected during the interviews correspond well with what the ANC in its 2012 Gender Paper also defines as women's interests (ANCC 2012), as well as what some of the theory says about the issue. Unemployment and domestic violence were the recurring themes which there seemed to be a common understanding about. This was expressed by all of the groups interviewed, including both women and men.

Because of this, The Theory of Political Presence may carry some weight in Township X due to the common understanding amongst people of the problems facing women as a group. To recap, according to this theory, women are the best advocates for fronting women's issues due to the distinct interests women have because of their experiences which are different than men's. Asking about domestic violence as an issue, as a common reply was that men did not necessarily care about this issue, and that female councillors would be more approachable in some instances and be better at understanding. Some interviewees also said the issue of domestic violence was something that was a topic the ANCWL was in charge of (interview 8 and 9). This relates back to Mbatha's findings which shows that women expect their female councillor to be responsible for addressing women's needs regardless of party affiliations (Mbatha 2003:197). There is an underlying assumption here that these prospective female councillors share a common understanding of women's needs with the women wanting to be substantively represented. This assumption is supported with the common understanding and awareness of what constituted women's needs and issues found in Township X.

Since Goetz argues that the representative's agenda-setting is contingent upon what the women representatives themselves deem to be important (Goetz 1998:252), this does not mean that women's interests in general will not be represented as ANCWL is very present in Township X. In ANCWL, interest articulation is happening at a high concrete level, and these interests are represented by the local ANCWL-branch as a whole in a seemingly responsive manner. What individual councillors themselves deem to be important may affect whom they listen to, and in this case, Goetz points becomes more valid.

64

All this indicates that women may benefit from more political inclusion as the Theory of Political Presence suggests. If the situation in South Africa today one in which the issue of domestic violence is being allocated mainly to the ANCWL and not taken seriously by male representatives, this affects the agenda-setting locally and nationally, and makes more political inclusion of women by installing them in political positions necessary. This is because although there is a common understanding of women's issues between men and women representatives in Township X, this does not guarantee it will be placed on the public affairs agenda. More political inclusion of women by the appointment of more women councillors, will, according to most of the interviewees, contribute to substantive representation, and experiences from Township X show that in some instances this will work.

A lack of common women's interests does not seem to be what limits substantive representation at the local level. Indications from this analysis show that there is a will to substantively represent women by the common women's interests identified by the female representatives themselves whether they were presenting the ANCWL's point of view or their own personal opinion. The articulated and agreed upon women's issues may rather enhance the substantive representation of women as it is relatively easy to grasp what women as a group want, and thus it will be easier for whomever is to represent women's issues, whether it be an organisation or an individual.

The data in relation to the overreaching theoretical framework.

Although many of the interviewees' pointed to the lack of women councillors being the main obstacle for putting forward the women's issues identified, the lack of political inclusion of women due to few female ward councillors cannot be said to be the main explanatory factor for the lack of substantive representation of women in Township X. Firstly, this is because women are very much included in many other spheres of the local government. Secondly, the definition of substantive representation used in this thesis does not presuppose that only women should substantively represent women. And thirdly, the institution of the ward councillor is not the only place where the responsive representation of women's interests happens.

What Törnquist problematizes, is not only the extent of formal inclusion of a group in politics, but also the issue of who is being included. My impression from interviewing and talking to female administration officers, ward committee members, members of ANCWL , and ward councillors, was that these women were all very much concerned, aware and engaged in dealing with women's issues. To exemplify, two women were elected ANCWL chairpersons in their branches, as well as being ward committee members. There are little indications found in the data that show the women representatives are not concerned with the same women's issues as the women they are said to represent.

What limits women's substantive representation seems neither to be the extent of political inclusion of women, besides the opinion some had that women councillors can do a better job working for women's issues, nor the type of women included in politics.

Turning to politicisation, the data collected may contain some explanatory findings for what limits substantive representation of women in Township X.

Politicisation

Escalating larger issues, such as women's unemployment and domestic violence, seemed difficult for women. Smaller, yet important issues, like getting equipment for different development projects was well articulated, and often successively fought for by the women's forums and ANCWL. For example, they managed to agree upon what they needed and put this issue forward to the administration which provided them with what they asked for, which was sewing machines. In ANWCL and the women's forums there were clear articulated interests based on discussions and community involvement. These organisations were actors representing women in a manner much responsive to them. If the limitation to women's substantive representation is neither the lack of a common gender interest, nor the wrong type of women being included in politics, the problem seems to be that there is a missing link to the public affairs agenda, and a difficulty in politicising the larger women's issues articulated and agreed upon. ANCWL and the women's forums seemed stagnant due the inability to escalate and politicise the broader issues such as women's unemployment and domestic violence. It seems difficult to enhance and increase women's substantive representation.

For finding out why escalating and politicising some important women's issues are difficult, the relationship between ANCWL and ANC must be looked into, but also the relationship between women and the councillor. I will come back to this in the sections on the ANC and local political institutions. But for now, there is reason to believe there are common women's interests, and a certain promising degree of will to substantively represent these interests by women representatives in Township X.

6.2 Party Structures

"We need a female president!" (interview 6)

Do actors produce, consume, evade or abuse the institutions of democracy?

Substantive representation of women may be limited if party centralization, and lack of intra-party democracy, affects the political democratic institutions at the local level.

Considering the vote being the main access point many women have to political parties, as well as interest aggregation and the linkage between state and citizens happening here, it is important to study the nature of ANC in the context of Township X.

ANCWL also is a part of this local ANC-structure, and finding out what strategies they are using, as well as ways of organising and mobilising women here, might provide some explanations as to what limits and enhances women's substantive representation.

With common gender interests being identified in the previous section, and the problem of politicising certain matters like domestic violence, looking at the nature of the dominant party in this case study appears even more necessary.

Autonomy of the ANC Representatives

ANC is a centralist party, but how this affects the institutions at the local government level and substantive representation of women, is not clear from just reading the theory chapter, since the theory mainly revolves around the national party structures. The theory was nevertheless useful in gaining information about the effects of ANC on women's substantive representation in Township X.

It was difficult to see how intra-party democracy affected the substantive representation of women directly, as the intra-party democracy and the nomination process for ward councillors was not studied in detail. Because of this it was also difficult to find out if ANC abuses, produces, consumes or evades the party as an institution for democracy. However, what can be said after conducting the interviews is that all the councillors had been involved in ANC for a long time before being elected into their current positions: "I have good political credentials" (interview 12). "I was an ANC Youth League leader" (interview 1). Yet one cannot rule out that the lack of intra-party democracy did not have any impact on the nomination of ward councillors. What we do know is that political experience and knowledge of the community, is a pre-condition for the attainment of political positions for both women and men in Township X. Information collected showed that ANCWL push for female representatives for the next local election. This can be viewed in light of the decrease of women representatives in the last local election (News24 2012), and the ANC's own recognition of stagnating practices within their own party (ANC 2012:3).

Accountability and Intra-party Democracy

For the voters, there was an exit alternative available. If the voter was not content with the councillor, he or she could vote for another candidate in the next election. The voice mechanism, which intra-party democracy provides, might not be at play in ANC in Township X. However, since the ward councillors are voted in by the community, and are completely dependent on support from the community to win the mandate, I propose a voice mechanism was at play with the interaction and connection between the ward councillors and the constituents. This is because the constituents could influence their own ward councillor. "I serve the community" (interview 1). The interaction with the electorate happened formally, by public meeting, but also informally, as it was normal to show up at the councillors' office to talk to him or her directly (interview 1 and 11). The nature of the councillors' role did not

seem first and foremost to be about defending ANC policies, but to do the best job for the community as a whole. The political role serving ANC is to a larger extent represented by the PR-councillors who are proportionally selected according to a party list. "Their role is more political (opposed to ward councillors), and they make sure their political role is served well" (interview 11).

Some councillors also pointed out that their role was almost non-political since they represented the community before the party in city council meetings, although one interviewee hinted that bigger parties had an advantage (interview 1), and another interviewee said; "we are not independent councillors" (interview 12), referring to ANC. The councillors' reasons for running to become ward councillors was the well-being of people in general, and seemingly a genuine interest in developing the community: "The community should get what they need" (interview 11) "You have to know the community" (interview 1). These statements must be seen in relation to what the interviewees explained as their motivation for getting involved in politics which was usually their interest of the well-being of their own community.

Because of this, the councillors' assessment of their own roles as being to a large degree non-political, supports the idea that these councillors were not too constrained by the centralised party structures of ANC when exercising their roles.

For the ward councillor, he or she has a high degree of accountability to the electorate, which in Township X may work as a kind of substitute for the voice mechanism found in parties with intra-party democracy. The councillors did not seem too involved or concerned by central leadership's stronghold on the party, but placed their allegiance to the whole community: "We need to be in office and serve the people" (interview 12). "I did not know I would be a mother to those who did not have a mother. I thought it would be more political, but it is more about the social world" (interview 11) "I do it for everybody (represents), the whole community" (interview 1). These statements were consistent and fitted well with the official role of the ward councillor as a mediator to the city council on behalf of the community.

Although the ANC ward councillors did interact a lot with the community, not all the groups interviewed were pleased about the situation for women vis-à-vis ANC. This view was put forward especially by the ANCWL.

Civil Society, Women's Movement and ANC

My focus in this section is ANCWL. Although ANCWL is not an independent civil society organisation, its domination and position in deliberating spheres, the organisations well-articulated interests and its involvement with ANC, makes them the most important arena for fronting and articulating women's interests in Township X. As a chairperson of ANCWL puts it: "I feel I represent all women and not just ANC women" (interview 6).

According to Teorell, intra-party democracy is important for connecting civil society voices to the government (Teorell 1999:363). Civil society voices from different deliberating spheres may not be heard and taken into account by the government, because the government is not dependent on any specific group to get re-elected.

Disaggregating this situation to Township X explains why there may be problems with the substantive representation of women. Despite formal rules are being followed, this does not imply that actors, in this case ANC ward councillors, are following the informal rules of the game. There are institutions of democracy in Township X such as public meetings, women's forums and ANCWL, which the ANC ward councillor may choose to evade or use due to their freedom in exercising their role which I will discuss later. As a consequence, the vertical linkage between civil society and government can be affected. Since this is a strong claim to make, the basis for this observation needs to be exemplified by the data: Interview 3, with ANCWL, provides good examples for this claim: "We (the ANCWL) ask the councillor to come and see what we are doing, but he never comes" "ANC is not doing much for us now". "We expressed the problems clearly then to the ANC, but ANC never responded" (interview 3).

From the same ward, an ANCWL member confirmed this when I asked if the councillor attended ANCWL meetings: "He is invited, but he does not come". This woman believed the reason he did not attend was simply because he did not want to (interview 10). When telling about the ANCWL policy conference in 2014, one interviewee said there was only one male representative from the ANC there to show support (interview 6). When I asked if the men in ANC were just not interested, she laughed and said; "no" (interview 6). When speaking about the relationship with the councillor, an ANCWL secretary claimed that domestic violence and

rape was not taken seriously by the male ward councillor (interview 4), despite this being one of the main issues ANCWL is fighting against. In an interview with a ward committee member, but also a member of the ANCWL, the interviewee clearly said that ANC and ANCWL were fighting for different causes. ANCWL according to her, was fighting against domestic violence and unemployment amongst women (interview 9).

These findings depict a somewhat disengagement between women in ANCWL and ANC in general, on a national level, as well as in Township X. The situation in some wards in Township X might be due to a current hostile climate for collaboration with the sitting ward councillor, which may be due to other factors. Some of the harsh statements may still be interpreted as a general frustration to not having their issues being put forward by the councillor, but stating this, one must keep in mind ANCWL often worked through their own organisation and had different strategies for representing women's issues in a responsive way. This may be due to a wish of using more reliable ways to front their issues, as opposed to being reliant on the more often fluctuating relationship with the individual ward councillors.

The party as a whole, does not seem in danger of losing its position in Township X if councillors are not listening to ANCWL. The councillors' allegiance seemed mainly to be, quite naturally, to the whole community.

Since there is a need to see this problem from both sides, and not just put blame on councillors for perhaps evading some institutions, the women's movement and ANCWL own *strategies* and ways of *mobilising and organising* must be looked into.

Women's Mobilisation, Organisation and Strategies

The reason for including this point by Törnquist was that the strategy being used to organise and mobilise women might not be working and thus limiting substantive representation.

The strategy being used to organise and mobilise women in ANCWL was said to usually happen from going from door to door talking to women, and also arranging open meetings. The outcome of such strategies, were the women joining the ANCWL and becoming more or less active members. In ANCWL the members were educated on their rights, but also the ANCWL functions. Additionally, the members could receive training on speaking up (interview 6). There are indications that the practical organisation and mobilisation of women in Township X was working when looking at ANCWL at the local level.

Törnquist's point of *strategies* focuses upon how the existing women's movement has a strategy for substantive representation, and if this strategy works. Which policies do they focus upon, who are their allies, and what is the general strategy to reach their policy aims (Törnquist 2013:72)?

In looking for ANCWL's strategy for substantive representation, no official strategy was found. This does not exclude that ANCWL can be a place that substantively represent women's interests. For furthering their aims and goals and thus be responsive to women, their allies seemed to be ad hoc: Engaging with the administration to get what they needed for community work, taking issues further up in their own ANCWL-system and organising events and protests, were often being done, all depending on the context in which they needed to escalate issues. The councillor did not always function as an ally, and as the theory of political opportunity structure suggests, the presence or absence of elite allies affects a movement's relationship with the state, and hence in different instances, with different allies being available, different strategies were being used.

The dominant role ANCWL plays in the representation of women in Township X might be obstructing for women's substantive representation. In the theory chapter the main problem identified was the lack of pressure from a women's movement outside the government. Scholars call for a united pressure from women outside the state (Mtintso 2003:578, Hassim 2014:100, Connell 1998:205). This seemed unlikely to happen in Township X as ANCWL was by far the most dominant organisation for fronting women's interests. Other independent organisations were active outside ANCWL but these concentrated on more specific issues, and as a collective force of several women's interests, ANCWL was basically standing alone as a political actor.

Other women's organisations often collaborated with ANCWL and according to one interviewee many women's organisations tried to cooperate with ANCWL, but not all of them were accepted by ANCWL (interview 6). This indicates the stronghold ANCWL has in Township X, as many organisations see the benefit of cooperating with ANCWL. According to the same interviewee the ANCWL do not feel any significant pressure from outside by other organisations. The pressure they encounter comes mostly from individuals (interview 6). This again indicates the strength of ANCWL and supports Heller's argument which states that marginalised groups might find it difficult to engage with the state as the places one can connect with the state are rather limited locally as well as ANC has a lot of power over the

72

agenda-setting and channels of influence (Heller 2009:132-133). Connell mentions one obstacle for the re-emergence of the broad popular women's movement in South Africa: The lack of interest from the ANCWL for collaboration with groups not under their reign (Connell 1998:203). The collaboration between ANCWL and other women's organisations was usually a product of solving community issues. For example, the collaboration with POWA (People Opposing Women Abuse), is more likely to be a product to solve a concrete problem and concern for both ANCWL and POWA and not a question of power relations between them. There was no broad political strategy which aimed at including other women's organisations to reach ANCWL' policy aims, as the collaboration seemed mainly about solving practical community issues.

Even if ANCWL substantively represents women, this might not be sufficient for women in Township X. With little interaction between ANC ward councillors and ANCWL in Township X, substantive representation of women through ANCWL has little effect on the ward councillor who is in the position to get these women's voices heard in the city council, in other words, substantively represent women. Coupled with ANCWL's dominance on women's issues and their lack of strategy for broader political engagement with women's organisations outside ANCWL, women's substantive representation is limited.

 Goetz argues that the representative's agenda-setting is contingent upon what the representatives themselves deem to be important (Goetz 1998:252). Substantive representation of women via civil society, to ANC, can be obstructed by party representatives not using the democratic institutions appropriately for the enhancement of women's voices. And as Teorell's theory suggests, ANC 's powerful position in Township X is not threatened by discontent from civil society, including ANCWL. Women's organisation and mobilisation, as well as their different strategies for enhancing women's substantive representation did not seem sufficient enough to break this pattern.

The Dominance of a Single Party

Hassim mentions the problem of a dominant party for the substantive representation of women in South Africa (Hassim 2003a:83). This accounts for Township X as well, as there is no real effective political contender to ANCWL or ANC when it comes to substantively representing women. This situation supports the status quo.

Mtintso argues that some are worried that members of ANCWL place their allegiance more to ANC than to women in general. In Township X, this can be contradicted considering the previous statements containing relatively harsh critiques of members of the ANC's take on women's issues. Additionally, all the female interviewees explicitly pointed out they felt they represented all women in the community.

However, Goetz mentions that allegiance to the party can be counteracted by the use of the-first-past-the-post system since the candidates are not dependent on central party leadership's approval (Goetz 2003:60). There was no indication that these first-past-the-post election campaigns were actively being used to front women's issues to gain women's votes. Worth mentioning, is that many general issues concerning development and service delivery concerns all voters. Because of this, one cannot assume that women will automatically vote for councillors fronting specific women's issues. Seeing this in relation to the theory, Goetz theory suggesting party-fragmentation may make competition over women's votes a reality (Goetz 2003:56), the dominance of ANC and ANCWL stronghold does not facilitate this. This may have an effect on the willingness of ANC as a political party to actively front women's issues, as it is not at this point really necessary to do so to win an election.

The State of the Debate

Walsh's example illustrates ANC's power in facilitating debate within their own party, and collaboration with civil society (Walsh 2012:120). She problematized the centralist structures as having a lot of power over the state of debate and work on women's issues in the party, and thus also substantive representation of women within the ANC. How ANC choses to use their party as a democratic institution will affect substantive representation of women.

The existence of resistance to gender equality informally embedded in the state, as Goetz points to as a problem (Goetz 1998:241), is difficult to prove. What can be said is that ANCWL does facilitate a space for debate on women's issues in Township X. ANC's lack of commitment from the national level to actively facilitate debate on women's issues at the local level, is indicated by the absence of knowledge about the ANC Gender Paper from 2012, by all the interviewees. This was extremely puzzling in many ways. The paper is presented as a blueprint from ANC central leadership on the topic of women's issues, but it is not even heard of at the local level. ANC's blueprint on gender equality appears not to have been sufficiently communicated from the central level to the representatives in Township X.

Relevant to this, is Norris' finding of gender equality being dependent on the leaders of the parties with formal centralised party structures (Norris 1993:326). The state of ANC's general commitment to gender equality appears bleak when seeing the failed, or perhaps, non-existent attempt at communicating the Gender Paper down to local actors. This indicates that the organisation and mobilisation of women in Township X, especially in relation to ANCWL, is functioning in a very bottom up manner with little top down initiative and collaboration from the state to the grassroot-level.

When asked about the state of debate on women's issues within the party in general, the answers I got were very much confirming that the environment for debate on women's issues, much facilitated by the ANC due to its centralised structures, was not sufficient for substantively representing women in the party as a whole. The general situation explained to me also reflected the situation on the local level in Township X in that the ANCWL operated more next to, and not in combination and collaboration with the other ANC members:

"Since we got the new government the equality issue has been shelved" (interview 11). When inquiring more about this, the problem pointed to by this particular ward councillor, was the lack of transparency on what the government was doing in relation to women's issues, and that women in the party were there for men (interview 11). This interviewee was very outspoken compared to some of the other interviewees, and the above-mentioned data confirmed a lot that had been stated in the other interviews.

When directly asked about the environment of debate, one interviewee said that in ANC conferences, it is the ANCWL that makes sure women's issues are discussed, and when asked about what would happen if the ANCWL was to disappear, the interviewee did not see this as a problem since there would still be women in the party defending women's interests (interview 1). This answer depicts the situation for women in Township X, when women in ANC alone are often perceived to be responsible for promoting and fighting for women's issues in their own party. As a consequence, debates on women's issues were confined to ANCWL. This view was quite prevalent by local ANC representatives in Township X. Hence, how ANC chooses to use their party affects women's substantive representation in the entire party. This limits the substantive representation of women since male actors are ruled out to promote women's interests. As Pitkin's definition of substantive democracy shows, exercising substantive representation of women is not confined to women alone.

The information attained on ANCWL in Township X is fighting for different things than ANC as a whole, such as domestic violence, also put limits to women's substantive representation within the party. "Men are so… In ANC our men are a lot difficult. They don't listen much to women "(interview 4). This interviewee also said there would not be emancipation of women in the ANC without the ANCWL, because the latter "makes noise". These examples illustrate a lot of frustration expressed by some of the interviewees on the relation between ANCWL and ANC as a whole.

There was a lot of discontent uttered by many of the interviewees on the relationship between the ANC and ANCWL, as well as on the relationship between ANCWL and the ANC ward councillors. I consider this data to be very reliable as there was reluctance throughout the interviews to bad-mouth the party and the councillors, yet a lot of strong opinions on these matters came up. The beginning of the interviews often started off by painting a rosy picture of the situation, but as frustration came to surface, different opinions were soon expressed.

Seeing the Findings in Light of the Framework

The nature of ANC in Township X seems to be that in ANCWL, women's interests are agreed upon and articulated, but the evasion of this democratic institution by other members of the ANC can limit women's substantive representation, as the party does not allow for these articulated women's issues to be aggregated and actively represented by the whole party. This is very much connected with the problem women have of politicising certain issues, which have been discussed in the previous section as a limitation for women's substantive representation.

The political actors do follow the rules of the game, at least formally, but making a link between civil society group demands and ANC is not happening in Township X, which shows that some actors evade the institution where substantive democracy of women could flourish within their own party: the ANCWL.

 Looking at if women's own strategies for substantive representation if sufficient, and if their organisation and mobilisation of women were good for the purpose of enhancing substantive representation, the findings were somewhat mixed. Women did mobilise and organise in ANCWL, and there seemed to be a lot of involvement by the community. When becoming a member of ANCWL one received rights training and training in speaking up.

The strategy for substantive representation took different forms according to the different opportunity structures being available in the current contexts. The strategy for women's organisations outside ANCWL did not seem to take on a very much of a political role, apart from wanting to collaborate with ANCWL on certain issue.

There seemed to be a general lack of strategy from both ANCWL and other women's organisations on how to enhance substantive representation of women. This must be seen in light of the immediate and severe issues like poverty being a main concern for many and dealing with these problems in a concrete manner is something the ANCWL is prioritizing taking on the function as a local NGO in many instances.

6.3 Local Government

"You must find out what the community wants" (interview 12).

Participation and representation, according to Törnquist's theory, concerns where women go with their problems and how they go about it. This section focuses mostly on the effects of formal institutions in Township X, more specifically, on how these institutions limit or enhance the substantive representation of women.

Local government is the level of government closest to people, and how the local government institutions function when it comes to the participation and representation of women, will thus directly affect the substantive representation of women.

If women are experiencing the effects of patriarchy in these political institutions, this may also limit women's substantive representation as women's ability to build legitimacy and authority might be obstructed.

Looking at if women's tastes and preferences are being adequately communicated and represented at this level, one has to consider the points discussed in the theory chapter, which will be done in turn below.

Economic Policies and Public Meetings

Speaking to the ward councillors, the topic of service delivery always came up, also in reference to women's issues. One councillor said that the topic of service delivery is a topic many women bring up in public meetings. Later in the interview, the interviewee explained people's anger and frustration, and how constituents came to him and asked "where the money went" if for example a project failed to be implemented (interview 12).

The public meetings are one of the main arenas for citizens' participation, and where communication between people and ward councillor happens. The topics on the agenda in these meetings concern service delivery. This may show the content of participation, or the agenda in the participation sphere if you will, has changed after the shift to GEAR. The public meetings are forums where the councillors set the agenda, report back and get feedback and input from the community. "You must find out what the community wants" (interview 12). "When we have an allocated budget we have to prioritize" (interview 12).

Considering women's issues, previously identified, these issues are not only about service delivery, and thus public meetings, being one of the main forms of community participation, may limit women's substantive representation. Several findings support this claim. When speaking about issues being raised in public meetings, one councillor said the issue of domestic violence was not easy to talk about in this setting (interview 12). At the public meetings there are only individuals raising issues, and acting collectively as a group is not allowed according to many of the interviewees. "I am not allowed to represent ANCWL in public meetings". "You can only represent yourself at the individual level in these meetings" (interview 4). Logically, this makes putting forward sensitive issues like domestic violence unlikely. This rule of only representing oneself in public meetings, can limit women's substantive representation as women cannot act collectively and thus with greater force in this local sphere of participation, which in turn can limit the councillors' opportunity to act in the interest of the represented in a manner responsive to them. If the councillor does not get input from women on sensitive matters, he or she will not know what to represent. It is likely some women's issues are not put forward in these public meetings, and women turn elsewhere with these issues, like domestic violence.

Patriarchy- Building Legitimacy and Authority

The reason for including this point by Törnquist was that patriarchy was believed to have an effect on women's ability to build legitimacy and authority, which in turn would have an effect on substantive representation of women.

The data collected also showed that women, compared to men, did not speak up a lot. Asking about reasons for women not speaking up, the replies were quite similar: "They are still afraid of the men" (interview 4). "It is always men who come to the forefront". (interview 6). "More men than women are talking at these public meetings because the women are scared to talk" (interview 4). Women do have an opportunity in these public meetings to participate, but other factors, perhaps such as cultural constraints may prevent them from speaking.

The women I interviewed were all very outspoken women, who carried great responsibilities and had plenty of experience doing community work and political work. If these interviewees statements were based on the interviewee comparing the general outspokenness of women to themselves, it is not strange they said that women do not speak up. At the same time they were all able to recognise a change with women being more at the forefront in the community, which shows that these statements concerning women's ability to speak up were based on reflection around the issue. One must also keep in mind that public meetings are large events gathering thousands of people, and men and women alike may find it difficult to speak up here.

My perception, despite one councillor saying women speak up too much in public meetings (interview 12), is that there are still issues of women not daring to speak up, but this is slowly changing for the better. Nevertheless, if women are scared of raising their voices in forums like public meetings, this will limit substantive representation of women. This is because many women's individual interests may correspond to the common interests of women, but will not be articulated, and as a consequence, will not be heard and thereby not represented by the councillor at the city level. As Bentley suggests, one must take into account the different unequal power relations so that women's voices are not muted (Bentley 2004:259).

With only individuals being allowed to put forward issues, and not representatives who could exercise substantive representation of their respective groups, the functioning of these public meetings do not necessarily support the enhancement of women's interests. Coupled with the difficulty many women feel to speak up, the problem increases.

Nevertheless, these statements relate to what was discussed in the theory chapter on patriarchy. There is reason to believe that patriarchy was still very prevalent in Township X and this problem as seen above, might have affected women's ability to speak up. The reason for believing patriarchy is still prevalent is information gathered during the interviews as well as the ANC Gender Paper explicitly stating there is a problem of patriarchy in South Africa (ANC 2012:6).

As mentioned in the theory chapter, time constraints on women's ability to be full-time politicians are seen as a result of different role-expectations for men and women due to patriarchal norms and practices. This was a recurrent theme in the interviews and different role expectations were expressed in statements like: "I have no problem with time because I am not working every day and I am also with my children" (interview 6). This indicates a possible problem if this women was employed full-time. Due to her not working every day, she said she did not experience any time constraints.

To exemplify further, a councillor when asked directly about the time constraint some women face answered: "I realise it is a time constraint because of women's responsibilities, I feel men don't help, and it is cruel" (interview 1). A member of the ANCWL explained how time constraints women experienced was a real problem for women in the organisation, as she explained that women were perceived to spend time with their husbands and kids. According to her, ANCWL as an organisation only cares about results and not the time constraint many women face. But she also added it was a problem since many of the ANCWL-members have husbands and kids (interview 10). She followed up by saying women did not get support for their political role from their men at home, because men could not take care of children (interview 10), and she also pointed out that women who have power often disrespected the men at home by attending meetings until late (interview 10).

Another interviewee said the time constraints depended on the person and the culture (interview 4). As some experienced real time constraints and had examples to show, the fact that all different kinds of women were very much engaged in ANCWL challenges the magnitude of women's time constraints in Township X. Since this is a qualitative paper, it is difficult to assess the extent of women's time constraints.

Many argued there were no different role expectations between women and men in politics. According to these interviewees, it was at home where the difference became apparent. This

does not contradict the argument that women, due household responsibilities, might experience time constraints when being involved in politics.

Which women who manage to build legitimacy and authority may be dependent on her specific situation in relation to role expectations and time constraints. Patriarchy can thus be said to be something that limits women's substantive representation as women's expected roles do not necessarily go well in combination with full time political work.

The women interviewed had managed to build their legitimacy and authority due to a long career in ANC and a great knowledge of the community. A strong female leader was said to be a person who people came to if they were not sure where to go. Personal networks seemed crucial for getting legitimacy and authority in the community and hence women whom already had this, managed to turn this into political power by running to become, for example, ward committee members.

Harassment and Ridicule

Harassment and ridicule of women by men was something I expected to find a lot of considering the literature. No women said they had experienced this, but they knew it was going on and had seen it happen to other women. This must be seen in light of the fact that the women interviewed have already built legitimacy and authority and turned this into political legitimacy. These women had proved themselves to be worthy of their positon often long before attaining it, and as a consequence might have enjoyed the political community's respect including men's respect for a long time.

Women who have not managed to build their legitimacy and authority might be more exposed to harassment and ridicule in public forums like public meetings, and the fear of perhaps having to experience this, may make some women keep quiet.

Perhaps as a consequence of this, women turn elsewhere with some issues. One example of not using the local governmental institutions is that ANCWL usually talked about taking the local matters and concerns further up in their own ANCWL- system, and rarely mentioned going to the councillor to get matters reach the city level. When asked about what would make women's voices heard, an ANCWL representative expressed how this was a topic thoroughly discussed, but still it was difficult because there was certain people they did not have access to (interview 3). This again indicates the importance of personal network. There

was also no mention by the ANCWL of the importance of public meetings in representing women's issues.

Neo-liberalism's Impact

The argument that some concerns have been delegated to the market and some issues cannot be dealt with through politics, does not carry much weight in relation to the substantive representation of women, according to the representatives themselves. They all felt that all issues could be dealt with through politics. The troubles expressed had more to do with the administration not doing their job in implementation and that the justice system treated women unfairly: "It's a problem with implementation" (interview 11). Answering the question: "Are there any issues you can't do anything about?" the answer was; "Yes, the justice system" (interview 4). These answers must be seen in light of other findings. The freedom the politicians had in exercising their role and doing their job might contribute to the feeling of being able to deal with many issues, as well as finding new ways of dealing with issues which might have been delegated to the market. Although neo-liberalism might have depoliticised some issues, this does not mean that the representatives interviewed had not found other ways of dealing with depoliticised issues. As the representative's role often revolved directly around community development, already available resources could be used avoiding the formal political procedures. One example is a councillor who set up sponsorship deals with local businesses to support poor families in the area (interview 11). Depoliticisation as a result of neo-liberalism was not found to have any direct effects on the substantive representation of women. However, the massive focus on service delivery in public meetings, as previously discussed, might have taken up so much space, narrowing the space for putting forward issues like domestic violence.

Resources and State Capacity

All interviewees said that the general lack of resources was a problem. "There are always financial constraints. "We cannot address all challenges at once" (interview 12). When Goetz stresses that state capacity is more important for implementing social and economic policies to promote gender equality than the presence of women in decision making bodies, (Goetz 1998:241) she might be mistaken in relation to Township X. This relates to what she stresses in the same article; the problem of a lack of a necessary connection between women in

politics and the representation of their interests (Goetz 1998: 243). Building on this, although public meetings are not decision-making forums, the presence of women, and their interests being articulated here, is crucial for the responsive representation of women at the city level. If the local government is there for better resource allocation by interaction with citizens (Watt 2006:89), it is essential women are a part of this interest articulation so the basis for gender equality and women's issues does not end up as a top down initiative from a centralist state.

It is difficult to imagine how more state capacity or resources to the local government would make the need for substantive representation of women any less. Looking at the state of domestic violence in Township X, which needs to be articulated and expressed as an immediate and serious problem, waiting for an automatic effect with more resources and greater state capacity eradicating this problem, seems little plausible and realistic. For politicising issues such as domestic violence, this needs to be promoted as a serious issue by using the local government institutions for participation. Women's substantive representation in combination with more resources is naturally likely to improve the situation for women. The allocation of resources to disadvantaged group with their voices being heard in the process reflects the general theories and arguments for a local government.

So where can women's issues like domestic violence be articulated and represented? The remaining bit of this theme will address the ward committees and ward councillors.

Ward Councillors

The working of the political institution of the ward councillor also affects women's participation and representation at the local level, since this is the person who is supposed to aggregate the communities' interests to the city level. The councillor is therefore an important actor whom can represent women's interest in a manner responsive to them.

Like Mohamed found (Mohamed 2009:226), the data collected showed that the ward councillors have a lot of room to enhance citizen participation. This will be illustrated later in the text. It is very much up to the individual ward councillor whom to communicate with, and what to bring further up in the system. Put differently, it is up to the ward councillor how informal participation and representation of women's interests occurs. He or she is to a large

extent responsible for the agenda-setting, hence politicisation. He or she does this differently depending on how he or she uses the institutions of democracy.

The councillors own motivation for enhancing participation at the local level through ward committees is thus critical for the substantive representation of women, as seen in the theory chapter. The councillor's relationship with the ward committees also determines the effectiveness of ward committees, hence also the substantive representation of women (Smith 2008:55). This is because women as a group, are represented in one of the ten portfolios covered by the ward committee members.

Next I will use two wards as examples. The purpose is not to put any blame on the ward councillors, but rather to illustrate how the formal political freedom the ward councillor enjoys, may affect the substantive representation of women.

Ward 1

One councillor, when asked: "If there is a problem, how do you go about it?" answered: "I consult the community in public meetings, then take it to city meetings" (interview 1). There was no mention of the ward committees as a place for participation and representation of the different sector's interests, although one ward committee member said she helped the councillor set the agenda for these quarterly meetings (interview 4).

The division of the ward committees into sections with respective sub-committees are supposed to cover and represent several areas of the community. If the ward councillor mostly gets input from the public meetings four times a year, monthly participation and representation from the different sectors in the ward committees, by including women under social development, will have a disadvantage.

There would further be a biased representation of interests if women already don't speak up much in public meetings. Checking with ward committee members belonging to the same ward as this councillor, the findings were strengthened: One ward committee member said that if there was an issue the ward councillor *wanted* to speak about, he would take a sector's monthly report to the city council (interview 9). A female ward committee member belonging to the same ward, when asked if it would be better with a female councillor, simply answered: "Men in higher positions use their position to neglect women". When speaking about the same topic, another female ward committee member, also belonging to the same ward, said

84

that: "A woman councillor would listen more to domestic problems" (interview 4). On top of this, the councillor did not manage to identify women's issues (interview 1). Since the councillor's freedom in exercising his or her role is relevant for interest representation and participation, this councillor's lack of knowledge on women's issues might limit the substantive representation of women. Since the councillor gets most input from the public meetings, ANCWL does not come to him directly to put forward issues on behalf of many, and the lack of interaction with the ward committees, women's chances for substantive representation by the ward councillor in the city council, are slim. The freedom a ward councillor enjoys will in this instance limit women's substantive representation by limiting women's participation and representation.

Ward 2

A very different example from another ward also illustrates how the ward councillor's freedom and individual motivation can affect, and in this case, enhance women's substantive representation by facilitating participation and representation. The importance of women being represented in all spheres was mentioned by the councillor several times during the interview. This councillor did mention ward committees, and showed to a women's committee consisting of ten women which came in addition to the ward committee. He also had a lot of knowledge of what this committee did. The interaction with ANCWL was consistent with meetings between them and the councillor being held every Tuesday (interview 12). This councillor also emphasised that it was important to be open so women would feel they could come to him with issues like domestic violence (interview 12). When speaking to a female ward committee member from the same ward, the relationship between the ward committee and councillor seemed to be one of a lot of interaction and feedback going both ways (interview 10).

What might place limitations on women's substantive representation in this ward, was the state of the ward committee, as the councillor explained problems of lack of commitment by the ward committee members (interview 12). The problem of ward committee members' commitment was confirmed by a senior social worker working in the same ward. She claimed that ward committee members are supposed to work with the social workers, but they don't do it. Moreover, monthly reports were supposed to be given, but this was not happening (interview 5). In other words, women's representation and participation in ward committees may also be haltered on account of the functioning of the ward committees, and not just the

councillor. This corresponds well with what a lot of evidence suggests which is that ward committees simply do not work due to a lack of committee members interest (Smith 2008: 11-18). What must be added is that ward committee members only work part-time and are not paid to do a full time job.

Further supporting the claim that participation and representation is very much up to the individual councillors in Township X, is the degree of the importance of the councillor's network, which may affect whom he or she chooses to interact with, and what issues are being fought for: "I used my network and contacts to rebuild burnt down shacks. The official procedure was too slow, so I asked the private sector to do it instead as a donation to the families". "It helps with personal connections to get implementation, although it is not allowed. It's patronage" (interview 11). "Sometimes I take chances and just do it" (interview 1). In all the interviews the importance of personal network was expressed in one way or the other. Knowing the community and having good credentials from ANC has previously been identified as important for attaining political positions. This indicates that the representatives interviewed will have an extensive network in the local community. Combined with the pressure the councillor feels from the community due to being the main access point many have to the city council, and the also identified wish for developing the community by the councillor, using personal network for benefitting the community does not seem like a strange strategy. Additionally, using personal contacts did not seem to be a sensitive matter, or frowned upon, as this information presented itself without any major inquiries by the interviewer.

Getting things done and representing issues, often happened informally, often due to the official procedures taking a long time. This further limits the participation and thus substantive representation of women in some instances, as formal channels of participation of women is not considered or used.

Ward Committees

Ward committees, as explained in the background chapter, were established to communicate the needs of the community to the ward councillor, thereby supposed to have a participatory function for citizens (City of Johannesburg 2015c).

There was a relatively high presence of women in most ward committees. In one ward, four out of nine ward committee members were women. This must be seen in relation to ANC's focus on gender parity.

But has there been a change in attitudes towards women since they have been represented in the ward committees like Gray and Mare positively suggests?

"Women now have more power than men. Now women encourage each other. Men respect women now" (interview 10). It looks as if the presence of women has changed men's attitudes towards them for the better in the setting of the ward committees. Still, these statements must be seen in connection with the interviewees' position in Township X. Since all the interviewees interviewed had a good knowledge of the community and were nominated and elected to their current positions, this shows that basically these women from the beginning enjoyed respect and status in the community. It is therefore difficult to see the source of women's attained respect. It might be the presence of women in ward committees has made men become more accustomed to working with women and this has influenced women's stand vis-a-vis men in this setting. It also might be the background and respect these women enjoyed in general which is the underlying factor for these statements above. Nevertheless, women's presence is important in ward committees, since women's descriptive representation in ward committees are a precondition for substantive representation of women.

Since descriptive representation may not lead to substantive representation, women representatives' understanding of their own role and portfolio is important for the enhancement of women's substantive representation in this forum.

Using one example: One female ward committee member responsible for infrastructure answered as to if there were any issues which especially affected women, was: "Yes, but nothing in infrastructure" (interview 9). Somewhat revealing of how some people think, a city administrator said: "Many ask, why women have to be included in for example infrastructure" (interview 13). Explaining further the importance of taking women into account when it comes to infrastructure she said:" Many places are dark without lights, and that can be a hotspot for crime" (interview 13). The Women's Development Strategy of Johannesburg (WDS) also emphasises on the importance of infrastructure for women's safety (WDS 2014:21). WDS was made after consulting over 1600 women in Johannesburg. This shows,

that in ward committees it is often very much up to how the individual ward committee members view their role and portfolio, and how they relate their job to women's issues.

What was very surprising, and further supports the claim that it is very much up to the individual to substantively represent women, was the degree of freedom ward committee members had in exercising their role when it came to working with the administration without engaging the ward councillor: "The water is not always working, so I negotiate with the department and ask for them to come and make a project" (interview 9). In this case the councillor is completely redundant. "For example, if there is a lack of resources I go straight to the Department of Health" (Interview 10). This reflects back to how the ward councillor works, by using personal network and alternatives rather than the formal political channel via the city for getting things done. This way of working does not include the participatory function and deliberating sphere the ward committees are supposed to work as. However, this does not exclude that the ward committee members that were not deliberating or consulting with their sub-committees.

With the disappearance of the women's sector and the relocation of "women" into one of the two portfolios for health and social development, it is likely the substantive representation of women has suffered. Since we could not get a hold of ward committee members responsible for this sector, it is difficult to analyse the impact of such a change. On the other hand, all three female ward committee members interviewed were also active members of ANCWL. This may have been positive for the substantive representation of women, as ANCWL members might be more aware of their role, and perhaps feel an obligation to represent women in their political work.

 It is unclear how the responsive representation of women will happen in relation to the ward committee members apart from it being much up to the individual representative. However one rule is that sub-committees should be selected according different zones in the ward. Still, this is the only selection criteria for the ward committee members choosing their own sub-committees (interview 9 and 10). Because of this, one cannot exclude Mohamed's findings of a lack of inclusion of the informal settlements in Township X (Mohamed 2009:209). Moreover, in the case of sub-committees, it appears that much is up to the individual ward committee member whose interests are to be represented and presented to the ward councillor, since they are in the position to communicate with whomever they want. There is no guarantee that the most disadvantaged women will be substantively represented.
88

Considering the current situation, the institution of the ward committee is not an institution which guarantees the participation and promotion of women's interests, and thus also women's substantive representation.

Neither ANCWL representatives, women active in the women's forums, administration officers, nor individuals mentioned the importance of sub-committees or ward committees in relation to substantive representation of women. It seems they all turn elsewhere when trying to have their interests substantively represented. Many of them turn to civil society institutions.

7 Concluding Remarks

In this thesis I have explored possible reasons for what may enhance and limit women's substantive representation in Township. The topics of interest were chosen based on Törnquist's seven points in what might explain the quality of representation. The study found several factors which can limit or enhance women's substantive representation in Township X.

First I looked at the state of *women's exclusion* in politics, as well as *politicisation* of women's issues in relation to women's descriptive and substantive representation.

Exploring the reasons for what enhanced and limited women's substantive representation, it was important to first establish if there was a common women's interest to be represented and how the interviewees interpreted the term "gender equality".

All the interviewees identified similar issues that affected women in particular, and women's unemployment and domestic violence were the recurrent themes identified by the interviewees as women's issues. This shows that in Township X there was well articulated women's interest which is essential for women's substantive representation. " Acting in the interest of the represented in a manner responsive to them" (Pitkin 1967:209), presupposes that there is in this case women's interest which are to be represented in a responsive manner. This enhances women's substantive representation because it is easier for those who are to represent to identify and grasp the interests of women as a group and they are thus able to represent these interests in a manner responsive to women.

It was also evident that the women in politics shared the same views on what constituted women's interests, and considering especially the female representatives awareness around women's issues as well as engagement and involvement in ANCWL, there is little reason to believe that the wrong type of women were included in politics in Township X, and this being a limiting factor to women's substantive representation.

The number of women in politics did not seem to be a limiting factor for women's substantive representation either, as women were very much included, and keeping in mind that men can also substantively represent women.

Tapping into the issue of women's quotas, the problem expressed was that they needed more female representatives to fight for women's issues, and the common view was that descriptive representation would lead to substantive representation. In several instances descriptive representation led to more substantive representation, and considering the common view of what constitutes women's interests, expectations to what female representatives would do for women as well as the argument of women being culturally constrained due to patriarchy, women might benefit from more political inclusion. Still, there is no guarantee that the substantive representation of women will prosper with more women included as women were already to a great extent represented in the local government sphere in Township X. The problem identified was rather having these already identified and agreed upon women's issues politicised onto the public affairs agenda.

The second topic explored was based on how ANC in Township X operated and how this might have had a limiting or enhancing impact on women's substantive representation. In other words: *ANC's position on democracy*. How ANC abuses, produces, consumes or evades the party as an institution for democracy was hard to see in relation to intra-party democracy and the nomination process, as this was not studied in detail. What was found was that the possible straining factors that representatives might feel from a centralist party were not expressed. The interviewees placed their allegiance first and foremost with the electorate in their wards, and their positions were attained due to great knowledge of the community and a long career in ANC. This also reflects the roles ward councillors and ward committee members are supposed to exercise in their positions as being mediators for the community to the higher political levels. As the interviewees did not seem too constrained by the ANC's central leadership in exercising their day to day business, this is something that can enhance women's substantive representation

The dominance of ANC can also have limiting effects on the substantive representation of women since there is no political competition for representing women's issues. In other words, there is no need for ANC to actively work on women's issues since avoiding this topic does not challenge ANC's domination in Township X.

Another limiting factor for substantive representation of women was also found to be the local relations between the ANC ward councillors and ANCWL, but also expressed, the general lack of collaboration with ANCWL and ANC. Here one can say that the ward councillor and the party in general has the opportunity to evade the institution of ANCWL or other women's

organisations. This puts limitations on representing women's issues in a responsive way, and this correlates to the problem identified earlier with the difficulty of politicising certain women's interests onto the public affairs agenda.

Thirdly, by looking more closely at the *mobilisation and organisation* of women, or women's *strategy* as possible limitations for women's substantive representation, I found some answers to the research question as well. If ANCWL was to do something about the inability to politicise their articulated women's issues, their strategy for doing so was not sufficient. There was a lack of pressure from women outside the government and ANCWL was not acting as a collective force working for more collaboration with other women's organisations to put pressure on the local government to have their broader and more general issues heard. The strategies mostly revolved around solving immediate community issues, and different strategies were being used to have their issues represented or acted upon in a responsive manner. The organisation and mobilisation of women was working in practice at the local level, but since this mobilisation remained at a local level and was not done in a more comprehensive way to challenge the depoliticisation of their issues, the mobilisation and organisation strategies were insufficient for enhancing substantive representation beyond ANCWL alone. Stating this, one must not forget that ANCWL was an organisation substantively representing women's issues within their own local structures in Township X. ANCWL as an organisation was actively representing women's issues in a responsive manner.

Fourth, looking at *participation* and *representation* in the local governmental structures, answers to the research question were found. One of the most important spheres for political participation, the public meetings, was not a place where women could act as a collective force to enhance their substantive representation as this forum was mainly a place where individuals could speak up concerning the main topic which was service delivery.

Depoliticisation of previously perceived pubic issues and the local government mainly taking on issues of service delivery, was not expressed as a concern for not being able to deal with certain issues. Changes in the political landscape makes people turn to different places to solve issues, and as expressed by the freedom ward councillors and ward committee members have in exercising their roles, dealing directly with administration was a strategy that was often being used circumventing the political channel. Due to this, the participation and representation of women as a group was negatively affected, as women did not have a say in

92

many of the decisions being made. The councillor and the ward committee members freedom in exercising their roles did not guarantee women's political input and hence women's substantive representation. Evading the participatory institutions of democracy to solve community issues limits the substantive representation of women. This again contributes to a difficulty in politicising certain issues and limits the space in which one can do so.

Fifth, women having problems *building authority* and *legitimacy* and turn these into political power was found to the result of patriarchal attitudes in Township X. Not daring to speak up due to cultural constraints, which were a problem in the public meeting but also elsewhere, patriarchy reinforced limitations for substantive representation by participation. Harassment and ridicule of women in political meetings was prevalent according to the interviewees, but never experienced by them personally, perhaps as they had built their legitimacy and authority years back and hence had always enjoyed respect.

Time constraints on women due to their perceived gender roles were also identified as a problem for participation and hence had a limiting effect on the substantive representation of women. Building legitimacy and authority to enhance women's substantive representation was still difficult for some women in Township X, but many women had gained respect and were listened to. The state of the women's personal network seemed to be a decisive factor in gaining authority and respect also outside the formal political spheres.

Several factors have been identified as being limiting and enhancing factors for women's representation in Township X. Working for women's substantive representation will require more commitment from all political actors in South Africa, not just on paper, but in action too. The focus on women's representation by ANC should include substantive representation of women as women's descriptive representation has not altered women's socioeconomic situation substantially for the past twenty years. As ANC puts it : "The inclusion of women in the formal institutions of the state, and inclusion of the term "gender equality" in policy documents, has not led to the redistribution of resources and power in ways that change the structural forces on which women's oppression rests" (ANC 2012:8). Looking into substantive representation have provided some answers to the problem of not representing women in a manner responsive to them, in Township X, but also what may help ease the problem by identifying factors which enhance women's substantive representation.

Bibliography

.

Amenta, Edwin, et al. "The political consequences of social movements." *Annual Review of Sociology* 36 (2010): 287-307

ANC "ANC Gender Paper Policy 2012." (2012) Available at: http://www.anc.org.za/docs/discus/2012/gendery.pdf

ANC, "The Freedom Charter." (1955) Available at: http://www.anc.org.za/show.php?id=72

ANC, "A brief history of the African National Congress." (2015) Available at: http://www.anc.org.za/show.php?id=206

ANCWL, "African National Congress Women's League Constitution 2008." Available at: http://www.anc.org.za/show.php?id=213

Andersen, Svein S. "Aktiv informantintervjuing." *Norsk statsvitenskapelig tidsskrift* 22.3 (2006): 278-298

Ashton, Glenn "NGO Influence of the Wane?" in The South African Civil Society Information Service (2010) Available at: http://sacsis.org.za/site/article/555.1

Bari, Farzana. "Women's political participation: Issues and Challenges." *United Nations Division for the Advancement of Women Expert Group Meeting: Enhancing Participation of Women in Development through an Enabling Environment for Achieving Gender Equality and the Advancement of Women. Bangkok*. (2005).

Beall, Jo. "Decentralizing government and decentering gender: lessons from local government reform in South Africa." *Politics & Society* 33.2 (2005): 253-276

Beck, Roger B. *The History of South Africa*. Greenwood Press (2000)

Beechey, Veronica. "On patriarchy." *Feminist Review* 3.1 (1979): 66-82

Bentley, Kristina. "Women's human rights & the feminisation of poverty in South Africa." *Review of African Political Economy* 31.100 (2004): 247-261.

Berry, Jeffrey M. "Validity and reliability issues in elite interviewing." *Political Science & Politics* 35.04 (2002): 679-682

Britton, Hannah. "Preliminary report of participation: Challenges and strategies." *Unpublished report.* Syracuse University (1997)

Bryman, Alan. *Social research methods*. Oxford University Press (2004)

Celis, Karen, et al. "Rethinking women's substantive representation." *Representation* 44.2 (2008): 99-110

Chandhoke, Neera. "What Is the Relationship Between Participation and Representation?" *Rethinking popular representation* (2009): 25-35

Chen, Li-Ju. "Do gender quotas influence women's representation and policies." *The European Journal of Comparative Economics* 7.1 (2010): 13-60

City of Johannesburg. "Code of Conduct for councillors.", (2015a) Available at: http://www.joburg.org.za/index.php?option=com_content&id=1548&Itemid=131

City of Johannesburg. "Nominations for ward committees.", (2015b) Available at: http://www.joburg.org.za/index2.php?option=com_content&do_pdf=1&id=3042

City of Johannesburg. "Ward committee nominations open." (2015c) Available at: http://www.joburg.org.za/index.php?option=com_content&id=1548&Itemid=131

City of Johannesburg "Office of the Executive Mayor." (2015d) Available at: http://www.joburg.org.za/index.php?option=com_content&view=article&id=731%3Aexecuti ve-mayor&catid=85&Itemid=131&limitstart=1

City of Johannesburg. "Council." (2015e) Available at: http://www.joburg.org.za/index.php?option=com_content&task=view&id=739&limitstart=1

Commission for Gender Equality (2015) Available at: http://cge.org.za/

Connell, Dan. "Strategies for change: women & politics in Eritrea & South Africa." *Review of African Political Economy* 25.76 (1998): 189-206

The Constitution of South Africa (1996) Available at:
http://www.gov.za/documents/constitution/constitution-republic-south-africa-1996-1

COPAC (Coperative and Policy Alternative Centre) *Cooperating for transformation: Cooperative case studies from Amathole District, Eastern Cape.* (2011) Johannesburg: COPAC

Dahlerup, Drude. "Electoral gender quotas: Between equality of opportunity and equality of result." *Representation* 43.2 (2007): 73-92

Darracq, Vincent. "The African National Congress (ANC) organization at the grassroots." *African Affairs* 107.429 (2008): 589-609

De Waal, Martha. "Globalising the women's movement agenda in South Africa." *Agenda* 19.64 (2005): 117-126

DIPD (Danish Institute for Parties and Democracy) December 14th 2011. Available at:
http://dipd.dk/2011/12/women-in-politics-the-elephant-of-patriarchy/

Evans, Sarah. "What would it take for the ANCWL to choose a women president?" Mail and Guardian 8th October 2013. Available at: http://mg.co.za/article/2013-10-08-00-what-would-the-anc-womens-league-need-for-a-woman-president

Fraser, Nancy. *Justice interrupts: Critical reflections on the" postsocialist" condition.* New York: Routledge, (1997)

Gasa, Nomboniso, ed. *Women in South African History: They Remove Boulders and Cross Rivers.* HSRC Press, (2007)

Gallagher, Michael. "Elections and referendums." Comparative Politics (2011): 181

Gerring, John. *Case Study Research. Principles and Practices.* Cambridge: Cambridge

University Press (2007)

Goetz, Anne Marie. "Women in politics & gender equity in policy: South Africa & Uganda." *Review of African Political Economy* 25.76 (1998): 241-262

Goetz, Anne Marie. "Women's political effectiveness: A conceptual framework." *No shortcuts to Power: African women in Politics and Policy Making.* Zed Books, (2003)

Gordon, April A. *Transforming capitalism and patriarchy: Gender and development in Africa*. Lynne Rienner Publishers (1996)

Gray, Alison, and Charmaine Maré. "The promise of women's equality: The transformation of local government in South Africa." No. 3. *Local Government Working Paper Series*, (2002)

Hassim, Shireen, eds. *No shortcuts to power: African women in politics and policy making.* Vol. 3. Zed Books, (2003a)

Hassim, Shireen. "The gender pact and democratic consolidation: Institutionalizing gender equality in the South African state." *Feminist Studies* (2003b): 505-528

Hassim, Shireen. "Voices, hierarchies and spaces: reconfiguring the women's movement in democratic South Africa." *Politikon: South African Journal of Political Studies 32.2* (2005): 175-193

Hassim, Shireen. "The challenges of inclusion and transformation: The women's movement in democratic South Africa." *Voices of protest: Social movements in post-apartheid South Africa*. Scottsville: University of KwaZulu-Natal Press, (2006a)

Hassim, Shireen. *Women's organizations and democracy in South Africa: contesting authority*. Univ of Wisconsin Press, (2006b)

Hassim, Shireen. "Persistent Inequalities: A Comparative View of Indian and South African Experiences of Local Government Quotas for Women." *Politikon* 41.1 (2014): 85-102

Heller, Patrick. "Democratic Deepening in India and South Africa." *Journal of Asian and African studies* 44.1 (2009): 123-149

Independent Electoral Commission (2011). Available at: http://www.elections.org.za/content/LGEPublicReports/197/Seat%20Calculation%20Detail/GP/JHB.pdf

Isike, Christopher, and Ufo Okeke Uzodike. "Marginalising women in politics: Recent trends in KwaZulu-Natal." *Development Southern Africa* 28.2 (2011): 225-240

Kandiyoti, Deniz. "Bargaining with patriarchy." *Gender & society* 2.3 (1988): 274-290

Kitschelt, Herbert P. "Political opportunity structures and political protest: Anti-nuclear movements in four democracies." *British journal of political science* 16.01 (1986): 57-85

Kreppel, Amie. "Legislatures." *Comparative politics* (2008): 159-188

Leech, Beth L. "Asking questions: techniques for semistructured interviews." *Political Science & Politics* 35.04 (2002): 665-668

Levy, Jack S. "Case studies: Types, designs, and logics of inference." *Conflict Management and Peace Science* 25.1 (2008): 1-18

Lodge, Tom. *Politics in South Africa: From Mandela to Mbeki.* New Africa Books, (2003)

Lotshwao, Kebapetse. "The Lack of Internal Party Democracy in the African National Congress: A Threat to the Consolidation of Democracy in South Africa." *Journal of Southern African Studies* 35.4 (2009): 901-914

MacKinnon, Aran S. *The making of South Africa: culture and politics*. Prentice Hall (2004)

Maharaj, Nuthan, and Brij Maharaj. "Engendering local government in post-apartheid South Africa–Experiences of female councillors in Durban (1996–2000)." *GeoJournal* 61.3 (2004): 263-272

Mahewele, Casment. *Factors associated with women unemployment in South Africa.* Lambert Academic Publishing, (2012)

Manning, Carrie. "Assessing African party systems after the third wave." *Party Politics* 11.6 (2005): 707-727

Mataboge, Manaledi. "The ANCWL is an Obstacle to Gender Equality" Mail and Guardian 14th December 2014. Available at: http://mg.co.za/article/2014-12-18-the-ancwl-is-an-obstacle-to-gender-equality

Mbatha, Likhapha. "Democratising Local Government: Problems and opportunities in the advancement of gender equality in South Africa." *No Shortcuts to Power: African women in politics and policy making* (2003): 196

McAdam, Doug. "Conceptual origins, current problems, future directions." *Comparative perspectives on social movements: Political opportunities, mobilizing structures, and cultural framings* (1996): 23-40

Miraftab, Faranak. "Feminist praxis, citizenship and informal politics: reflections on South Africa's anti-eviction campaign." *International Feminist Journal of Politics* 8.2 (2006): 194-218

Mtintso, Thenjiwe. "The contribution of women parliamentarians to gender equality." Diss. University of the Witwatersrand, (1999)

Mtintso, Thenjiwe. "Representivity: false sisterhood or universal women's interests? the South African experience." *Feminist Studies* (2003): 569-579

Mohamed, Eddin Elzein Mohamed. "The Participation of Informal Settlement Communities in City-level Policy-making in Johannesburg." Ph. D thesis, University of Witwatersrand, Johannesburg (2009)

MSA (Municipal Structures Act) (1998). Available at: http://www.saflii.org/za/legis/consol_reg/lgmsa117o1998rangnr972868.pdf

MSA (Municipal Systems Act) (2000). Available at: http://www.saflii.org/za/legis/consol_act/lgmsa2000384/

News 24 "Fewer women in local government – Zuma." 6th July 2012. Available at: http://www.news24.com/SouthAfrica/Politics/Fewer-women-in-local-government-Zuma-20120706

NIBR (Norwegian Institute for Urban and Regional Research) internal unpublished document, no title, NIBR. (2013a)

NIBR (Norwegian Institute for Urban and Regional Research) *"Working Paper: South Africa"* internal unpublished document, NIBR (2013b)

100

Nkambule, Sipho Jonathan. "Citizenship A Tool Of Social Inclusion And Exclusion In Post-Apartheid South Africa." *Jurnalul Practicilor Comunitare Pozitive* 2 (2012): 170-185

Norris, Pippa in "Gender and Party Politics.", eds. Lovenduski, Joni and Norris, Pippa. SAGE Publication Limited (1993)

Norris, Pippa. "Breaking the barriers: Positive discrimination policies for women." *Has Liberalism Failed Women* (2001): 89-110

Oates, Wallace E. *Fiscal federalism* (1972)

OHCHR (Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights) "FAQ on a Human Rights-Based Approach to Development Coorporation." United Nations, New York and Geneva (2006) Available at: http://www.ohchr.org/Documents/Publications/FAQen.pdf

Pande, Rohini, and Deanna Ford. "Gender quotas and female leadership." (2011) Available at: https://openknowledge.worldbank.org/handle/10986/9120

Parliament of the Republic of South Africa. "Our Constitution" (2015) Available at: http://www.parliament.gov.za/live/content.php?Category_ID=11

Phillips, Anne. *The politics of presence*. Oxford University Press, (1995)

Pitkin, Hanna Fenichel. *The concept of representation.* Univ of California Press, (1967).

Poinsette, Cheryl L. "Black Women Under Apartheid: An Introduction." *Harv. Women's LJ* 8 (1985): 93

Quotaproject. Global database of Quotas of Women (2014) Available at: http://www.quotaproject.org/uid/countryview.cfm?CountryCode=ZA

Runciman, David. "Hobbes's theory of representation: anti-democratic or proto-democratic?" *I. Shapiro et al* (2009): 15-34

Sachikonye, Lloyd M. *Democracy, civil society, and the state: social movements in southern Africa*. Sapes Books, (1995)

Schuler, Margaret, "Conceptualizing and Exploring Issues and Strategies", in Schuler, M. (Ed.), *Empowerment and the Law: Strategies of Third World Women*, OEF International, Washington, DC, (1987) pp. 13-38

Schwindt-Bayer, Leslie A. and William Mishler "An Integrated Model of Women's Representation.", *Journal of Politics* (2005) 67(2): 407-28

Seekings, Jeremy. "'Trailing behind the masses': the United Democratic Front and township politics in the Pretoria-Witwatersrand-Vaal region, 1983–84."*Journal of Southern African Studies* 18.1 (1992): 93-114

Seidman, Gay W. "Gendered Citizenship. South Africa's Democratic Transition and the Construction of a Gendered State." *Gender & Society* 13.3 (1999): 287-307

Seidman, Gay W. "Institutional dilemmas: representation versus mobilization in the South African Gender Commission." *Feminist Studies* (2003): 541-563

SEP (Stanford Encyclopaedia for Philosophy) "Political Representation."(2011) Available at : http://plato.stanford.edu/entries/political-representation/

Serote, Pethu., A. Mager, and Debbie Budlender. *Gender and Development in South Africa in the 1990s.* (2001)

Sideris, Tina. "Women and Apartheid: collective trauma and social reconstruction." *The Way Supplement* 93 (1998): 80-92

Smith, Terence. "The Role of Ward Committees in enhancing Participatory Local Governance and Development in South Africa–Evidence from Six Ward Committee Case Studies." The Community Law Center (2008). Available at : http://elitepdf.com/page/the-role-of-ward-committees-in-enhancing.html

Southern African Development Community (SADC) (2013) "SADC Gender Monitor 2013." Available at:
http://www.sadc.int/files/1413/7701/1684/SADC_Gender_Monitor_english_FINAL.pdf

Suttner, Raymond. "The African National Congress centenary: a long and difficult journey." *International Affairs* 88.4 (2012): 719-738

Stokes, Wendy. *Women in contemporary politics.* Polity, 2005

Teorell, Jan. "A deliberative defence of intra-party democracy." *Party politics* 5.3 (1999): 363-382

Thorsen, Dag Einar, and Amund Lie. "What is neoliberalism." Oslo, University of Oslo, Department of Political Science, Manuscript (2006): 1-21. Available at: http://folk.uio.no/daget/neoliberalism.pdf

Törnquist, Olle. "Introduction: The problem is representation! Towards an analytical framework." *Rethinking popular representation* (2009): 1-24

Törnquist, Olle. *Assessing Dynamics of Democratisation: Transformative Politics, New Institutions, and the Case of Indonesia.* Palgrave Macmillan, (2013)

United Nations. "Equal Participation of Women and Men in Decision-Making Processes, with Particular Emphasis on Political Participation and Leadership." (2005) Report available at: http://www.un.org/womenwatch/daw/egm/eql-men/FinalReport.pdf

UNOG (United Nations office at Geneva) "Women under apartheid." Available at: http://www.unog.ch/80256EDD006B8954/(httpAssets)/FCE445CF05811208C1256F500048 D292/$file/sa_women_under_apartheid.pdf

Walsh, Denise. "Party centralization and debate conditions in South Africa." *The impact of gender quotas* (2012): 119-35

Wängnerud, Lena. "Women in parliaments: Descriptive and substantive representation." *Annual Review of Political Science* 12 (2009): 51-69

Ware, Alan. *The logic of party democracy*. Macmillan, (1979)

Watt, Peter A. "Principles and theories of local government." *Economic affairs* 26.1 (2006): 4-10

WDS (Women's Development Strategy for the City of Johannesburg) (2014) Available at: http://www.joburg.org.za/images/stories/2013/April/women%20development%20strategy%2 0elec%20%20brochure_1.pdf

Weldon, S. Laurel. "Beyond bodies: Institutional sources of representation for women in democratic policymaking." *The Journal of Politics* 64.04 (2002): 1153-1174

Woliver, Laura R. "Ethical dilemmas in personal interviewing." *Political Science & Politics* 35.04 (2002): 677-678

World Bank. "Social protection sector strategy : from safety net to springboard." Washington, D.C. : The World Bank (2001) Available at :http://documents.worldbank.org/curated/en/2001/01/828354/social-protection-sector-strategy-safety-net-springboard

Yoon, Mi Yung. "Explaining Women's Legislative Representation in Sub-Saharan Africa." *Legislative Studies Quarterly* 29.3 (2004): 447-468

Appendix 1 – Bill of Rights

Constitution of the Republic of South Africa.

Chapter 2: Bill of Rights. Section 9.

Equality

1. Everyone is equal before the law and has the right to equal protection and benefit of the law.

2. Equality includes the full and equal enjoyment of all rights and freedoms. To promote the achievement of equality, legislative and other measures designed to protect or advancepersons, or categories of persons, disadvantaged by unfair discrimination may be taken.

3. The state may not unfairly discriminate directly or indirectly against anyone on one or more grounds, including race, gender, sex, pregnancy, marital status, ethnic or social origin, colour, sexual orientation, age, disability, religion, conscience, belief, culture, language and birth.

4. *1No person may unfairly discriminate directly or indirectly against anyone on one or more grounds in terms of subsection (3). National legislation must be enacted to prevent or prohibit unfair discrimination.

5. Discrimination on one or more of the grounds listed in subsection (3) is unfair unless it is established that the discrimination is fair

Available at: http://www.gov.za/documents/constitution/chapter-2-bill-rights#9

Appendix 2 – Letter to the Interviewees

Information letter given to the interviewees

To whom it may concern

Norwegian Institute of Urban and Regional Research has a joint research project with the University of Witwatersrand, Johannesburg and the Centre for Development Studies, Trivandrum, Kerala, India, called: **Self-help or social transformation? The role of women in local governance in Kerala and South Africa.** The project is funded by the Norwegian Research Council.

A research team from Norwegian Institute of Urban and Regional Research (NIBR), senior researcher Berit Aasen, and two students, visit Johannesburg during the period 27 Jan to 13 February 2015.

The fieldwork focus on two topics:

1 – Women participating in local government positions, recruitment to positions and participation in local government

2 – Women's strategies for accessing resources for economic participation, and governments programmes addressing women's economic empowerment

The work includes setting up interviews and participating in interviews in Johannesburg, Midrand/Region A and Ivory Park.

We would very much welcome the opportunity to conduct an interview with you on these topics,

Oslo, 23 January 2015

Berit Aasen, senior researcher, Norwegian Institute of Urban and Regional Research (NIBR)

Email: berit.aasen@nibr.no

Appendix 3 – Interview Guide

Condensed interview guide, covering all groups interviewed

Occupation/Position

How did you get here?

What made you interested in politics/this organisation?

What were your expectations before entering?

Tasks in your position?

What cases working on? Any particular projects, programmes or campaigns?

What guides the women's related work? Any particular framework?

What is gender equity to you?

What issues on the agenda now?

What are the most important women's issues to you?

If a problem/issue. Strategy? How go about it? Whom? Alliances?

Relation to ANCWL and city level (in relation to programmes/projects)

Local Government   *Experiences with the local government on women's issues*

Your role at the local level.

Enough resources?

Enough influence?

Any issues that politics/ your position are not able to do anything about? Fell constraints on political work?

Ward Committees:

Feel a change in attitudes towards women since represented at ward level? What kind of change?

Who is rep in the women's sector? And how is women rep in other sectors? (PR)

Thoughts on female councillor's role in to fronting women's issues

Ward councillor's responsiveness to women's interests?

Do the wards committees work as an arena to put forward interests?

If so why? If not, why?

Familiar with Women's Development Strategy Johannesburg?

Familiar with ANC gender paper from 2012.

What is done to get more women into politics?

What do you think would be the best strategy to get more women into politics?

ANC internal workings   *Talk about your role in the party*

Thoughts on role in the party, representing women as a constituency.

What is your view of the party? How has ANC helped you?

Reflections on allegiance to party, women within the party, South African women?

The strategy to engage the ANC if there was women's issues you wanted to put forward?

Where do you meet encouragement and resistance if promoting women's issues within the party?

Who else is at the forefront in putting forward women's issues?

Thoughts on degree of influence in the party

Particular policy field. Examples.

Civil Society/ANCWL

Training for women.

How corporate with women organisation outside ANCWL Examples?

How do organisations outside the ANCWL try to corporate with you?

How could women's organisations best reach you and corporate with you?

Feel pressure from outside. From women's organisations etc?

How would people best reach you? What people do reach you?

Thoughts on future of the ANCWL. Future plans?

Quota/common gender interest?   *What are women's interest to you?*

What are women's needs? – Feeling obligated to rep it cause woman?

Do you follow up on women's needs and feel you represent it?

Rep by first past the post or PR? Focussed more of mobilising support from women if first-past- the – post?

What do you feel about the quota for women and why?

What is done to recruit women into politics at this level of politics?

Exclusion of women   *Obstacles in carrying out political role*

Meaning of patriarchy.

What are women's issues? Put forward, what happens? Issues you have worked on.

How do they see their role as women as opposed to men's role?

Do their role as women conflicting with political work?

Time constraint a problem?

Feel lack of support for political work due to role as women?/Support from family and friends?

Self-confidence. Training.

Harassment, ridicule? Receive support from where/whom?

Better representation of women. Your view.