Voices in local democracy

Political participation, democracy and development in Khayelitsha, Cape Town

Maria Munthe

Thesis submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the Degree of Master of Philosophy in Culture, Environment and Sustainability

Centre for Development and the Environment

University of Oslo

Blindern, Norway

04.02.2015

Table of Contents

Abstract

This thesis discusses political participation, democracy and development in Khayelitsha in Cape Town. It looks at the channels for participation and how participation relates to issues of democracy and development. The channels for participation are formal channels, such as addressing the ward councillor or ward committee, participate in the making of the IDP plan, and litigation. Civil society channels include civil society organisations and protest. With regards to democracy issues, there is criticism towards involvement in decision-making and development planning. Through activism, organisations of civil society are able to address inequalities though pressuring the government, and litigation. There has been an increase in protests in Africa, and the government is less responsive to this. SANCO is an organisation which is important in Khayelitsha, but retain control towards the ward councillor and other organisations. In Khayelitsha there are issues of poverty and inequality, but also agency and an everyday life. There could be some issues hindering political equality. Some connections between the issues of political participation, democracy and development are social justice, endogenous development, freedom and social sustainability. In the thesis I argue the value of "bottom up" approaches, and that it is important to include the voices of the community.

Acknowledgements

There are many I would like to thank for their help and cooperation. Thank you to all the participants of the thesis. Thank you to my supervisors, Kenneth Bo Nielssen and Desmond McNeill. The work with this thesis was delayed because of personal reasons, and I would like to give a special thanks to student advisors at SUM, Monica Bothner and Anne-Line Sandåker, who made it possible to finish writing at a later time.

In Khayelitsha Mpho Lekau was very helpful with the project, thank you! Thank you to my classmates at SUM for the friendly environment, and to my friends for their encouragement. Especially I wish to thank Philile Mbokazi who was living in Cape Town at the time of my fieldwork, who made me feel welcome and at home. Thank you to my siblings, and a big thank you to my Mum who is always encouraging and supporting!

Fredrikstad, February 2015

Maria Munthe

List of abbreviations

ANC	African National Congress
ANCYL	African National Congress Youth League
AMCU	Association of Mineworkers and Construction Union
CBO	Community Based Organisation
COP	Conference of the Parties
CSS	Community Satisfaction Survey
DA	Democratic Alliance
EA	Environmental Activism
FBW	Free Basic Water
GDP	Gross National Product
HDI	Human Development Index
IDP	Integrated Development Plan
ILO	International Labour Organisation
LGBTI	Lesbian Gay Bisexual Transgender and Intersex
MEC	Member of Executive Council
NA	National Assembly
NCOP	National Council of Province
NUM	National Union of Mineworkers
RSA	Republic of South Africa
RDP	Reconstruction and Development Programme
SABC	South African Broad Casting
SAHRC	South African Human Rights Commission
SANCO	South African National Civics Organisation
SJC	Social Justice Coalition

UA	Urban Agriculture
UN	United Nations
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme

1. Introduction

Few places are inequalities so stark as in South Africa, and in Cape Town inequalities are evident. At the foot of the Table mountain luxury villas are climbing up the hillside, while on the other side of the mountain, a few miles outside of the "city bowl", shacks are crowding the side of the highway on the way to the airport. Khayelitsha is reputed to be the largest township in Cape Town, and is stretching over a vast area. It was established in the mid-eighties under apartheid as part of the segregation policy (City of Cape Town 2010:1).

This thesis will deal with political participation in the township in Khayelitsha, in order to find out what shapes policymaking in the area, and how the poor are integrated in South African democracy. Since transition in 1994 much has happened, every citizen has the right to vote, and there should be no discrimination on the basis of race. However, a large proportion of the population are still poor, predominantly the black population. I want to look at what democracy has meant in terms of development, and whether the political rights granted to South Africans have meant a substantial change in policymaking. My main research question will be:

How can people participate in local politics in Khayelitsha, and how is such participation relating to issues of democracy and development?

Sub questions:
What are the channels for political participation?
How is political participation relating to democracy?
How is political participation relating to development?
What are the connections between political participation, democracy and development?

Banik asks *what characterizes the relationship between democracy and development?* (Banik 2010:83). Through this project I wish to understand more

about the relationship between democracy and development in the South African context. By looking at political participation I would like to gain insight into the workings of local politics and the democratic aspects of the interrelationship between people and politics. I want to look at what the links are between the ground level of individuals to higher levels of political influence. Are there ways for the poor to influence their living conditions, for example with regards to water, social services or housing? This in turn can give indications of how democratic processes are influencing development issues in Cape Town.

1.1 Rationale for chioce of topic

There is a living civil society and a conducive political environment in South Africa that could be a good base for such democratization, however the politics of post-apartheid and the socio-economic conditions have turned out to be complex and contradictory, making it difficult in practice (Stokke and Oldfield 2004:132). Although South Africans have been granted a number of socio-economic rights it has proven difficult to translate this into actual socio-economic empowerment. While the constitution for example grants all citizens right to adequate housing, it is not an easy task to bring these rights from formality into building houses for marginalized groups (Stokke and Oldfield 2004:132-133).

The UNDP report *Deepening democracy in a fragmented world* states that it is important to understand the links between political institutions and social and economic outcomes, and that these links are not fully understood. The report says that human development only can be promoted in a country when there are governance systems that are fully accountable to all people, and where people are able to participate in debates and decisions that can shape their lives (UNDP 2002:3).

> *Democratic governance is valuable in its own right. But it can also advance human development,(…) First, enjoying political freedoms and participating in the decisions that shape one's life are fundamental in*

human rights: they are part of human development in their own right (UNDP 2002:3).

I will focus this study on political participation because it is an important aspect of substantial democracy. Political participation is important for understanding democracy and development because it touches on both issues. Vital for the democratic system, and also important for how development is being carried out. Who participates in democracy also determines who are instrumental in deciding on key policies for further development of a country. Democracies who lack channels for inclusion of large groups of society will also exclude these groups from having a voice in the issues of development. In a country like South Africa, where there has been a rapid transition and there is a high level of inequality and social exclusion, at the same time as having challenges within development in for examples tackling poverty, political participation can play an important role in creating channels of inclusion that will give more people influence in development. Therefore I think it can be important to find out about how the poor participate in democracy in Cape Town, and to what extent they have an influence.

The South African transition to democracy in 1994 is a part of the third global wave of democratization, beginning in the mid-seventies. This wave has been important for Sub-Saharan Africa and has meant great changes in politics in that region (Haynes 2002:80-81, 84). It can therefore be important to look at what has happened in South Africa since apartheid within democratization and development. The South African transition has been celebrated as a successful transition, but it can be worth looking closer at how the democratic system is working, especially with regards to development issues. The South African government has in an effort to tackle imbalances left from the legacy of apartheid, emphasized what it calls "developmental local government" (Nel 2004:23). To achieve this goal local authorities are expected to cooperate with communities to improve social and economic conditions in the area of their jurisdiction. The Local Government Systems Act is one of the acts promoting the

principle of popular participation in local governance and local-level development in a direct way. According to this, municipalities are obliged to create mechanisms for public participation and participatory governance (Nel 2004:29,31-32). Given the emphasis on this by the government in can be interesting to see how it is working in practice and to what extent the community is participating in local politics.

In Khayelitsha shacks are stretching for miles, and people are constantly moving in from rural places searching for a better life. In this local democracy can play an important role in finding solutions but it poses a challenge in how to communicate and bring issues to attention. In this thesis I wish to find out how local democracy in Khayelitsha is working to answer to the urban challenges of poverty, and whether people's voices are being heard. How is the government working to promote development under these difficult circumstances and what can we learn from organisation of local democracy in responding to urban poverty?

1.2 Structure of the thesis

The context chapter will present background for the topic, the electoral system in South Africa, the emphasis on developmental local government, and about Cape Town and Khayelitsha. In the methodology chapter I will present the course of the work with the thesis, including reasons for research design, collecting and analyzing data. The following chapter about the theoretical approach, will look at theories of participatory democracy and participation and development, and link the concepts. In chapter 5 I will present channels for political participation in Khayelitsha, and chapter 6 will discuss political participation in Khayelitsha in relation to democracy. Chapter 7 discusses such political participation in relation to development, and finally I will compare the concepts and discuss in the final chapter.

Although voting is an important part of political participation, I will not discuss this subject separately, since I focused my thesis on other channels. This is because I wished to explore political participation beyond voting, and South Africa is a country with a free and fair election process (Seekings 2009:134). There is a discussion about whether democracy furthers or hinders development (Sen 1999, Banik 2010) however, because of space constraints I will not include this discussion. I will write from the starting point that democracy is a universal value (Sen 1999:16), and discuss the relationship between democracy and development in relation to political participation and the context of South Africa.

2. Context

Khayelitsha is an example of the inequality and social division that is evident in South Africa. While the GDP of the country is level with Poland, Chile and Mexico for example, South Africa scores far lower on the HDI (Human Development Index). Other countries with similar GDP rank far better in the HDI, where South Africa is level with Mongolia, Gabon and Bolivia (Butler 2009:85). A reason for this is that the GDP data do not take into account the extreme inequality that persists in the country (Butler 2009:86). South Africa is currently ranked as the most unequal country in the world according to the World Bank GINI coefficient index. They have the highest GINI coefficient with 65.0, on a scale where 0 is complete equality and 100 is complete inequality (World Bank 2015).

Levels of unemployment are exceptionally high, which is a key determinant of poverty in South Africa. This is a result of the opening up of the economy after 1989, a conservative fiscal policy as well as tariff reductions after 1997, gains in productivity and a growth in capital intensive export industries. Unemployment grew in the first decade after the introduction of democracy from 17 per cent in 1995 to about 28 per cent in 2003 on conservative measures. As unemployment grew, inequality deepened correspondingly with it. In addition incomes from work have declined, as growth in profit largely is exceeding growth in wages (Butler 2009:87).

Another reason for the country's low HDI rank is unequal access to public services. Services such as public education, water, sanitation, transport and health would contribute to a healthy and educated population and could also compensate for inequalities in the labour market. Availability to services has increased since 1994, but it can be difficult for poor households to pay the charges required to access them. (Butler 2009:87).

South Africa has moved towards formal democracy at the national, provincial and municipal levels, but experiences of South Africans in everyday life, and the various organisations that represent them reflect how the unequal legacy of the apartheid past in complex ways are being reinvented in the post-apartheid present. Rostron means that privatization of services threatens to become the new apartheid for the very poor, as an instrument of exclusion. Not just from a better life, but from the very basics (Stokke and Oldfield 2004:134-135).

The tendencies in the direction of privatization of public services call into question the efforts from the state in committing to substantial democratization and socio-economic rights (Stokke and Oldfield 2004:136). Through movements and organisations people are trying to enable their political capacity to use political rights and institutions, among other things to stop the privatization of basic services (Stokke and Oldfield 2004:134).

2.1 The electoral system

South Africa is a representative democracy with elections at national, provincial and local levels. At the national level there are two legislative bodies to be elected, the National Assembly (NA) and the National Council of Province (NCOP). Elections are held every five years. There are 400 members in the NA, out of which 200 are elected on national lists and 200 on provincial lists (in proportion with the population of each of the provinces) (Butler 2009: 139-140). The NA also elects the president, who is the head of the executive branch of government. Local authorities have elections on different cycles than the provincial and national levels. Elections in unicities such as Durban and Cape Town have been contested, and can produce surprising results. A criticism towards the electoral system is that it is influenced by excessive centralization of party control, and that this does not provide enough interaction between representatives and citizens (Butler 2009:140).

The electorate in South Africa has been connected to parties to a great extent, but anti-apartheid campaigning has created political networks across class and ethnicity. Until recently analysis of voter behavior was influenced by assumptions about ethnic identity and social structure. In recent years there has been scientifically reliable data available on public opinion through *Afrobarometer*. Two trends are especially important: 1) levels of identification with political parties have declined. This means that a larger number of voters may increasingly use party performance to inform their choice in election. 2) people are becoming generally more alienated from the party political system. There is a fall in participation in elections, and although close to 70 per cent of votes in 2004 went to the ANC, this was only about 40 per cent of the eligible electorate as a whole. The confidence of people in state institutions improved in the first decade of democracy, but since then there has been a marked decline. This could be because of political scandal, and the government's inability to bring results on electoral and implicit political promises (Butler 2009:140-142).

The City Council is the legislative body governing Cape Town, and is responsible for among other things making and implementing the IDP (Integrated Development Plan), the budget and by-laws, laws especially for Cape Town. The City's Council is consistent of 221 councilors, where half are ward councilors, and the other half are elected according to the political strength of their party (City of Cape Town 2014). Cape Town is divided into wards (City of Cape Town 2015) and in a municipality there are two ways of being elected as a councilor. A ward councilor represent an area, or ward, and can represent a political party, a local organisation or be an independent candidate. The candidate who recieve the most votes in a particular ward becomes elected as the ward councilor, according to a "first past the post" electoral system. The ward councilors are more directly accountable to the communities, since they have been elected directly by the wards (Local Government Action 2015)

2.2 Urbanization and participatory democracy

South Africa is, like many other countries, trying to manage an urbanization process that is demanding services and land in urban areas. The urbanization is growing at a fast pace, due to fewer possibilities in rural areas, a decrease in household size and immigration to urban areas from neighbouring states. An important initiative to tackle the challenges in urban development, service delivery and poverty alleviation has been to place new emphasis on the local level of government as the key agent of development of the state (Butler 2009:102). Government has decided that municipalitites will be the central agent for integrated development, and will be responsible for stimulating economic development and coordinating the whole set of public services. However, it has proven difficult for the municipal government to deliver on this heavy responsibility (Butler 2009:103).

Cities in South Africa are still quite segregated, where white suburbs are preserved because of income inequality instead of enforced division. Townships established during apartheid house most black people, at considerable distance from white suburbs and city centres. However townships are also marked by hospitality and represent close networks of moral relationships, where mutual obligations are strong (Butler 2009:176-177).

The South African transition to democracy in 1994 remains one of the most significant and dramatic political and social transition in modern time. The government led by the ANC (African National Congress) is now trying to correct the extensive and deep-rooted imbalances left from decades of apartheid policies. The government resolved to make both grass-root participation and delivery stronger by emphasizing considerably "developmental local government" (Nel 2004:23). The government states that:

> *The central responsibility of municipalities (is) to work together with local communities to find responsible ways to meet their needs and improve the quality of their lives* (RSA, 1998a:17 in Nel 2004:23).

To be able to reach the goal of "developmental local government", local authorities are expected to cooperate with communities to make sure the economic and social environment is conducive for creating opportunities for employment. Therefore the implicit tie between participatory governance and development is a key subject in policy and planning in South Africa. Both the South African Constitution and supporting legislation enshrines the notion of participatory governance. They ensure the rights for each citizen to be able to participate in democratic decision-making processes, especially at the local level of government. Even though these rights pose difficulties practically, this is part of efforts to decentralize power to the lowest levels of government and to increase the responsibilities of local government to fulfill its mandate of local development through encouraging community participation (Nel 2004:23-24).

2.2.1 The Local Systems Government Act

The act that most clearly states the principle of local level governance and development, with regards to popular participation is the Local Systems Government Act. It specifies the responsibility of local municipalities in involving the community, to promote development and to provide services in a financially sustainable way. It says it is the community's right to *"contribute to the decision-making process of the municipality"* (Nel 2004:32) and that municipal administration should create working relationships with the local people and give them accurate information (Nel 2004:32). The Act states that it is local government's obligation to:

> *create conditions for the local community to participate in the affairs of the municipality including reviews of development plans, performance management, budget, strategic divisions and, significantly, to build community capacity to enable them to participate in municipal affairs* (Nel 2004:32).

When it comes to service delivery, municipalities have to make sure all inhabitants have access to a minimum of basic services. This means the South

African government have committed to a participatory way of governance on the local level and connect this with development. Therefore the Local Systems Governments Act provides a clear mandate for participatory governance in local government affairs and development issues (Nel 2004:32).

2.3 Cape Town and Khayelitsha

The 2011 Census in South Africa collected information about Khayelitsha defined by the Health District borders. Khayelitsha Health District covers circa 43 700 square km, and in 2011 there was a population of 391 748 according to the census data (City of Cape Town 2013). However the population is reported to be higher, according to Thomas (2010:81) there are 780 000 people in Khayelitsha and Joel Bregman from the Social Justice Coalition meant there are around a quarter of a million inhabitants (Interview Bregman 2011).

The census says there are 118 806 households in the district and the average household size is 3,3 persons per household. Some of the results of the census show that 74 per cent of households have a monthly income of 3200 Rand or less (1 Rand= 6,8 NOK/ 100 Rand =8,7 USD)(XE Currency Converter 2015). Within this group almost 19 per cent of households report to have no income at all, and 30 per cent have a monthly income of between 1R to 1600R When it comes to housing, 55 per cent live in informal settlements. The demographics show that 99 per cent of the population in Khayelitsha are black African (City of Cape Town 2013).

Cape Town is a very politically fractious and ethnically diverse city in comparison to other South African cities. The social, political and economic divisions of the population date back to a long history of the European colonization period and several decades of apartheid rule. There are 48 per cent colored people, 32 per cent black people and 19 per cent white people in the city. The city is also specifically competitive in electoral politics, and the ANC and the

DA (Democratic Alliance) have several times since 1994 changed places in local government. In the 2006 elections none of the parties won a clear majority of the votes and thereby mandate. The need to bridge fragmentation and divisions represent a constant theme in Cape Town politics (Briggs 2008:261). The city often works under vision statements such as "the city that works for all" or "one city, one future". Compared to statements from other cities such as Johannesburg's "a world-class African city", this is a quite different approach (Briggs 2008:262).

The social and political divisions in Cape Town are also reflected in spatial divisions. To the west and south-west are high-priced waterfront communities, to the north prosperous and expanding suburbs, and the poor largely black and colored townships and informal settlements on the flats of the southeast. The DA tend to be supported mainly by the more affluent white communities, and some working class and poor colored ones, while the ANC for the most part by the working class and poor black communities. Wilkinson means that Cape Town represents an extreme version of the opportunities and tensions after apartheid. The city is trying to achieve both inclusive democracy and economic revitalization, and wish to reconcile "pro-growth" and "pro-poor" strategies. He writes there has not been established a broad based coalition willing and able to join together the two agendas, and political actors such as social movement activists have not been sufficiently incorporated into wider coalitions with resources to govern (Briggs 2008:262-263).

All municipalities in South Africa are since the Local Government Transition Act from 1996 required to make and implement an Integrated Development Plan that encompasses infrastructure planning, transport, land use and economic development (Nel 2004:30). This is supposed to be a framework for local governments to understand the dynamics in their area, to develop a vision for the area, and make strategies for realizing and financing the vision cooperating with other stakeholders (Briggs 2008:263). Cape Town makes a new IDP every 5

years and a new one was issued in 2012 (City of Cape Town 2012). Wilkinson means there is little evidence that the IDP has been able to change service delivery and coordinate public investment according to what was hoped for. Cape Town is also affected by drug gangs and informal "survivalist" networks in poor areas. In addition to this, violence and crime, often in homes and neighborhoods, work as obstacles for engaging positively to improve community life by collective action (Briggs 2008:263-264).

3. Methodology

In this chapter I will give an account of the course of working with the thesis including fieldwork and analysing data. Some of the things a methodology chapter should contain is describing the data you have studied, the methods you have used to collect the data, and the reasons why the research developed in the direction it did. Silverman writes that there are different approaches in writing about methods, and argues that rather than a formal methodology chapter written in the passive voice, it could be more lively to write a methodological discussion where you explain the course of the decisions you made (Silverman 2013:352,354-355).

Here you should write about the history of your research, including how you dealt with difficulties along the way, it would therefore be more of a chapter of natural history. This can include the personal context of the research topic and reasons for the research design as well as how the research developed through trial and error and methodological lessons learned during research (Silverman 2013:255-256). Here I will follow an approach of natural history of research, explaining the choices I made and describing both what went according to plan and the challenges I encountered.

3.1 Context for choice of topic

I decided to write about political participation in Khayelitsha because I was interested in the situation for the poor in South Africa. In my bachelor degree in development studies, I went one semester abroad to Durban in South Africa. While I was there I became aware of the great differences between rich and poor, and I got to see a township in Durban which involved informal settlement housing. During the stay I also went to Cape Town where I went to Khayelitsha, and it made an impression om me. As we drove through the township I saw street

after street of informal settlements and it seemed to go on forever. It was a rainy day and I started to wonder how it must be to live there, and I was puzzled by the extreme differences there seemed to be in this country.

In this master degree in the course Development and Environment, I wrote about the relationship between democracy and development in South Africa in the exam essay. As part of the course, I read a chapter from *Poverty and Elusive Development* by Dan Banik (2010) about democracy and development and this was partly the inspiration for the essay. By interviewing people in Khayelitsha I hoped to get a better understanding of the problems of poverty and inequality, and if political participation could give people a voice in issues they care about.

3.2 Reasons for research design

I chose to use a qualitative research design for this project, and wanted to use open-ended, in-depth interviews. This is because I wanted to interview people in a way were they could talk more freely, and it would give me the opportunity to ask follow up questions and find out more about a certain subject. In quantitative research this is more difficult, because the interview would follow a questionnaire, and it could be more difficult to find out what is important to the person I am interviewing. I also wanted to be able to talk to people for a longer time, so that it would be possible to go deeper into each subject and hopefully get a good understanding of the topic.

According to Brockington and Sullivan qualitative research

> *seeks to understand the world through interacting with, empathising with and interpreting the actions and perceptions of its actors. Qualitative methods are used to explore the meanings of people's worlds (…)* (Brockington and Sullivan in Scheyvens and Storey 2010:57).

I thought that qualitative research would be a good way to look closer at how things are working in terms of political participation. As Brockington and

Sullivan writes qualitative methods can be used to explore the meanings of people's worlds, and I wished to understand more about people's opinions about local democracy and how they see the reality they live in. I wanted to see the issue from different angles, and I hoped that this would help me to get a better insight into the subject.

In Norway I contacted two professors at the University of Oslo, before fieldwork, Marianne Millstein and Kristian Stokke. Marianne Millstein has written a doctorate dissertation about political participation in Cape Town, but in Delf, a different part of the city. She explained how the city is divided into wards, and that each ward has a ward councillor. Further that there had not been so much research on ward councillors, and I thought it would be interesting to talk to one of them. She also informed me about the Social Justice Coalition as an organisation that I could interview (Millstein 2011).

Kristian Stokke is a co-author of *Politicising Democracy. The New Local Politics of Democratisation* (2004), and he was also a lecturer in the course Linkages between Politics and Society in Developing countries, which also inspired me to write about political participation in my thesis. He explained that there are three channels for political participation, formal channels, civil society channels, and informal channels (Stokke 2011). I decided to focus the thesis on formal and civil society channels of political participation, as I thought getting an insight into informal channels could be difficult because of time constraints.

I made two interview guides, one for the local people and one for professionals. To do the interviews I decided to take notes instead of using a tape recorder, because of experience from fieldwork in my bachelor degree in Development Studies. In the first year of the bachelor we went on fieldwork to Zambia, where we worked on a group project about food security. When doing the interviews we experienced that when we used a tape recorder it seemed like the interviewees became more cautious, and also that we paid more attention when we were taking notes without the tape recorder, so that it was easier to make a summary later.

3.3 Case study research

Case study is the study of the particularity and complexity of a single case, coming to understand its activity within important circumstances (Stake 1995: xi).

Case studies can be classified into three groups: intrinsic case study, instrumental case study and collective case study. In an intrinsic case study, one is interested in a case, not to learn more about a specific problem, but because one wants to learn more about that particular case. In an instrumental case study, on the other hand, one starts out with a need for general understanding of an issue, and selects a case to get insight into that issue. Collective case study is also an instrumental study, but involves several cases (Stake 1995:3). Stake writes that there is not a clear line between intrinsic and instrumental case study, because researchers often have several interests (Berg 2004:256). Therefore a kind of *zone of combined purpose separates them* (Stake 1994:237 in Berg 2004:256). In relation to this case I started out with a topic, democracy and development, and chose the case of South Africa and then more closely Khayelitsha to look into that topic. Therefore this case falls into the category of instrumental case study as a way of gaining insight into an issue.

In triangulation, researchers make use of multiple and different sources, methods, investigators, and theories to provide corroborating evidence (Creswell 2013:251).

By corroborating evidence from different sources, it can shed light on a theme or perspective (Creswell 2013:251). Triangulation can be compared to celestial navigation, where star positions are used to locate a ships' position at sea. By using one star to locate this position, the ship will be in an imaginary circle on the earth's surface estimated by calculations. By using another star, you find another circle and it is possible to determine the ships position more closely, from where they overlap. Adding more stars, the location would be more accurate, and you can mark in the middle of the intersections, where the ship is likely to be. In case study, you are not looking for a location but a meaning, however it is the same

approach. From one observation you can assume there is one meaning, but with more observations you have the possibility to revise this interpretation (Stake 1995:109-110).

In working with this thesis, I have used different sources related to the issue from different angles. I have talked to local people, NGO's and a ward councillor and they have different viewpoints to the issue of political participation. In addition I have collected documents and newspapers, as another source of information. By going on fieldwork to Khayelitsha, I have also made observations that can serve as a source. I hope this has contributed to triangulation of the case.

> *(…) single cases are not as strong a base for generalizing to a population of cases as other research designs. But people can learn much that is general from single cases* (Stake 1995:85).

You can learn from them because people are familiar with other cases, and when they add this case it makes a slightly new group to generalize from, it is a new opportunity to modify old generalizations (Stake 1995: 85). Berg writes that for many the question of generalizability in case studies is not even a question to ask. This is because there is a clear scientific value in examining a single category of group, individual or event, simply in order to increase understanding of that group, individual or event. In relation to a more positivist orientation, where people are concerned about generalizing to similar types of groups, individuals or events, case study research is still beneficial and to some extent generalizable (Berg 2004:259).

Case studies should also be able to provide understanding about similar cases, when they well done. For example, in a study about drug dealing, one explanation about why a gang-member is involved in drug dealing does not explain why everyone involved in this do what they do. However, it does suggest an explanation for why some other gang-members could be involved in drug dealing. If one accepts the idea that human behaviour is predictable, which is a

precondition for behaviour science research, then it is not distant to accept the scientific value of case studies (Berg 2004:259-260).

3.4 Collecting data

My fieldwork took place in the autumn of 2011 from 15. October to 15. December. When I first arrived in Cape Town I began with searching on the internet and getting organised. Initially I encountered some challenges. I went to the Civic Centre, an administrational centre for the municipality, the City of Cape Town. I hoped I could ask some questions about Khayelitsha and governance there. At the Civic Centre I was sent to different places, and when I got to the right person she could not give me any information. A contact I had been given at the University of Cape Town did not answer my e-mail. I also contacted an organisation that deals with democracy issues centrally in Cape Town, I got an answer but it seemed difficult to get an interview.

South Africa is country that has a high crime rate, and safety issues should also be considered. Some areas in the townships near Cape Town are not recommended to move around in (Interview Millstein 2011). I had hoped that I could get to know a guide through one of these contacts, that could help me with interviews in Khayelitsha, and that knew the area. In the beginning of fieldwork while finding information on the internet I found out that there was going to be an IDP (Integrated Development Plan) meeting in Khayelitsha, as the City of Cape Town was in the process of developing the IDP. This I wished to attend, however at the time, not having a guide and not knowing which areas were safe and not, I refrained from going.

After this I went to a government information office in Long Street and luckily received some information, such as contact information for some of the ward councillors. In the office however I got the advice not to go to Khayelitsha, and if I was going to do interviews there, only go there for the interviews and then go straight back. All though since I felt like I was not getting any further in the

centre of Cape Town, and had not got a guide I decided to change my strategy. I decided to go to Khayelitsha and work from there, I thought it would be better to focus on people and organisations there.

The bed and breakfast was run by Thope and Mpho Lekau, who were mother and daughter. This was also the house of Thope and Mpho, and Mpho's daughter Palisa. It was a brick house with two rooms for guests and a courtyard with greenery. It was bright and had a peaceful atmosphere which created a contrast to the warnings I had gotten. Mpho was very helpful, and followed me to places, and in a way became the local guide I had hoped to find. It was true that I could not move around too much on my own, and when I started contacting people, Mpho followed me to an internet café, where I could write mails from. It was a different world and I had to get used to not being able to go where I wanted. She followed me to the seminar described below, and two of the interviewes, as well as to the government office in site B to be able to get in touch with one of the ward councillors. She suggested one of the organisations I could interview and went with me to the interview where she explained in isiXhosa what the thesis was about and was present during the interview.

In Khayelitsha I went to a seminar held by the Social Justice Coalition, an organisation working for safety and security in Khayelitsha, that I would also interview later. This organisation Marianne Millstein had told me about. The seminar was about how Cape Town can become a more inclusive city, and there was a panel with different speakers. The seminar was held in a conference hall at Lookout Hill, a relatively new place where you can look at the view of Khayelitsha. There is a restaurant and workshops of arts and crafts, and even a tourist office. The hall was full, and people seemed to be interested in the seminar.

I interviewed Abalimi Bhezekhaya, a community organisation that has training, grow plants for sale and give out plants to small scale farming projects. This can be in people's own gardens, and they use land in schools, municipal land and land

under power lines where people cannot build houses. The organisation works in Philippi and Nyanga, in addition to Khayelitsha (Interview Stofile 2011.) I talked to Lesiwe Stofile who was one of the leaders of the centre in Khayelitsha. She also showed me around in the garden.

Then I interviewed SANCO Local, a local division of SANCO (South African National Civic Organisation). I interviewed two representatives of SANCO Local, Dalisile Mfazwe, who was secretary of SANCO Khayelitsha and Gladwell Mtotywa, who was the safety and security responsible. This is a community based organisation (CBO), and they have street committees and block committees where people can address different problems in the community (Interview Mfazwe and Mtotywa 2011).

Another organisation I interviewed was the Social Justice Coalition, who arranged the seminar I went to. There I talked to Joel Bregman, at the office of the SJC. The SJC was started in 2008, as a response to the xenophobia crisis, and then moved on to work with other social issues in Khayelitsha. They are focusing on issues of justice, sanitation, safety and security, and they work towards the government to achieve their goals (Interview Bregman 2011). I was able to interview one of the volunteers as well, who lived in one of the informal settlements. I wanted the political side of the issue to be represented and made an appointment to interview a ward councillor, councillor Monde Nqulwana. Ward councillors are the representatives at the lowest level of government, and people can contact them directly with concerns (Interview Nqulwana 2011).

One of the difficulties I encountered was to find interviewees that would represent local people in Khayelitsha. I asked Mpho if she could put me in contact with people I could interview, and she said it was possible, however I would have to pay for the interviews, and also other students who had come to do research there had interviewed the same people. I was a bit hesitant to whether I wanted to accept this offer, because I was not sure if it was ethically correct to

pay for interviews, and since other students had interviewed the same people, it made me unsure if this would be independent.

I decided I wanted to find interviewees on my own, but security issues made this more difficult, because I could not walk around or move around too much on my own. Apart from one interview I had been followed to all interviews, and the seminar, and I was a bit unsure if I felt safe taking the taxis to places in Khayelitsha I did not know. Although there was a friendly atmosphere and people were very helpful, I had gotten warnings and I had to take them seriously.

In the end I decided to try to go to some of the public places that I already knew to find respondents. I interviewed people in Site B and Site C, but unfortunately most of these interviews were too short. I have three interviews with local people, and one of them is with Mpho from the B&B. Altogether I have seven interviews, and I will use the shorter interviews as additional information. For document review I collected two local newspapers from Khayelitsha, as well as two newsletters and a brochure during fieldwork. I have also used the Integrated Development Plan for the review which was finished after I returned. While I was in Cape Town I tried to take in impressions and made observations, and also kept a field diary.

In Khayelitsha there were a myriad of shacks along the streets and the characteristic taxis going in different directions. There were shops in between and the central places were Site B and Cite C. Most of Khayelitsha is named by letters during apartheid, such as Section A, B and C. In Site B were the government offices were the interview with councillor Monde Nqulwana was. Close to the Here was also a marketplace, library and a shopping mall, the only in Khayelitsha. Here I interviewed Thembeke Mcosana who worked in the library. In Cite C the taxi rank into central Cape Town was situated, and here was a market as well. Close to the B&B there was an informal settlement the TR section and while interviewing one of the residents I was able to visit one of the houses, a small house in corrugated iron. Near the B&B I interviewed

Christopher Kibiti who worked there with renting out car hangars. The final interview with local people was with Mpho Lekau who was running the B&B.

3.5 Analysing data

In case study the there are several ways of analysis. Stake describes categorical aggregation where the researcher looks for multiple instances from the data, to see if issue-relevant meanings emerge. In direct interpretation, however, the researcher looks closer at a single instance without searching for other instances. This is a process of pulling the data apart and putting them back together to find new meanings. The researcher can also look for correspondences between two or more categories, and establish patterns (Creswell 2013:199).

Another way of anlysis in qualitative research is interpretive analysis which I used in analysing the data in this thesis. In interpretive analysis the data analysis is divided into steps, and is not meant as a fixed recipe, but as a way to make clearer the process of immersing oneself in and interpreting the data (Blanche and Kelly 2002:140). In **step 1**, you start out with familiarisation an immersion, and read the text many times over. You make notes and do brainstorming, and get to know your text well, so that you know what is to be found where. In **step 2** you start inducing themes where you look at the material and try to find out what organising principles naturally underlie the material. Here you can use the language of the interviewees to label the categories, instead of making categories from outside concepts. In **step 3** you mark sections to be relevant to one or more of your themes. This step is connected with step 2, and they can blend into each other because the themes you are using can change in the process of coding (Blanche and Kelly 2002:141-143).

Step 4 is about elaboration. Here you look closer at the themes you have found, and compare extracts under each theme. You see your data in a new light, after it has been regrouped into categories. At this point you might go back and revise

you coding system. You should keep coding, elaborating and recoding until you find a purposeful way of organising the data, and you do not find new insights that are significant. **Step 5** is interpretation and checking. In this step you put together your interpretation and write a written account of what you studied. You go through the interpretation and see what could be improved (Blanche and Kelly 2002:144).

Analysing the interview data I followed these steps, starting out with reading through the data, marking out sections that were important and writing notes. I tried to organise the data in different ways, and wrote down possible categories until I found categories that were purposeful. I categorised by sentence, placing segments of text into categories. Regarding documents and observations I read through the documents and took notes from relevant sections and articles and noted down the observations I made. I compared them to the interview data, and used categorical aggregation to find common points and several instances of data.

3.6 Methodogical and ethical considerations

Of methodological lessons I learned in the process of doing research for the thesis, I first of all could have stayed for longer doing fieldwork, I could have been in Cape Town longer and it would have made it easier to find interviewees, as this was one of the challenges. I have been considering whether I should have used a tape recorder instead of taking notes, but I felt that people I interviewed spoke quite freely and were relaxed and I am not sure if it would have been the same with a recorder. Drawing on experience from previous fieldwork I also felt people were more open, and maybe they would have been more reluctant in giving information if I had used a recorder. Therefore I am content with the method I chose, but primarily I could have stayed longer to have more time to contact people and conduct interviews.

Making ethical decisions in research is about deciding on a course not from the point of successful research, but from the point of doing just research, and taking

the needs and concerns of the participants into account. Here it is important that the participants' safety, dignity and privacy is ensured (Scheyvens, Nowak and Scheyvens 2010:140). The fieldwork took place in a township in Cape Town and it is important to show consideration for the people living in the area. According to Scheyvens, Scheyvens and Murray some of the considerations when doing research among marginalized groups are to respect the knowledge, skills and experience of the people in the study. To remember that these groups are active subjects rather than passive objects of research, and that the questions in the study should be of interest and concern to the people in question (Scheyvens, Scheyvens and Murray 2010:182). In working with this thesis I have been careful in respecting the knowledge, skills and experience of the participants in for example designing the study, and making the interview guide. When it comes to questions of anonymity, because the topic of the thesis is not generally a sensitive subject, I have decided to include the identities of participants.

4. Theoretical approach

This chapter will contain theory of democracy and development which are connected to political participation. First I will discuss issues of democracy and participation, including participatory democracy, definitions of political participation and participatory development planning. Second I will discuss aspects of development and participation which are theories of another development, human development and the capability approach, and further political equality and sustainable development. Because of space constraints I will not discuss democracy and development as individual theoretical concepts, but in relation to participation, however I will write a quick clarification of these concepts at the beginning of each section.

4.1 Participatory democracy

The etymological meaning of democracy is "rule by the people" (Banik 2010:89), and Beetham defines democracy as the *mode of decision-making about collectively binding rules and policies over which the people exercise control* (Banik 2010:89-90). Theories of democratization can be understood as moving on a continuum, from minimalist to maximalist standpoints (Grugel 2002:4). A broader definition, or substantive democratisation, would be the *introduction and extension of citizenship rights and the creation of a democratic state* (Grugel 2002:5).

4.1.1 About participatory democracy

Participatory democracy is grounded on the belief of the importance of activism and freedom, and that alternation in government and voting rights are not enough to guarantee the presence of democracy. Pateman (1970) argues the theories of participatory democracy contest the myth that liberal democracy is the only

"classical" theory of democracy. According to Macpherson (1977) demands for participatory democracy originated in Europe from the "New Left" and student movements, and also from workers movements. It emerged as a critique of how "actually existing democracies" were working and was revolving around state-society relations, the functioning of the state and how citizenship is affected by economic production (Grugel 2002:23).

According to Keane (1988), within participatory democracy, the state must change from paternalism and begin to include social organisations to actively participate in decision-making. A problem with participatory democracy is that there can be challenges in applying it to larger communities, for example the nation state. Macpherson argues that although this is true, a greater difficulty are hindrances in present society, and reaching the changes that are necessary for this form of democracy. Of these he describes a change in citizenship regarding a consciousness of exercising and developing capacities, which will create a greater sense of community. Second it means a reduction in social and economical inequality, because such an inequality requires a non-participatory system in order to keep the society collected. This understanding of democracy is maximalist in believing that equality and searching for the common good is within reach. Judge (1999) argues moving towards more participatory systems of governance would mean constructing participatory forms of local governance, decentralization of power as well as increasing representation in society (Grugel 2002:23-24).

4.1.2 Defining participation

Concepts are often used interchangeably, such as citizen participation, public participation and political participation. In this thesis I will use *political participation* as an analytical concept, but I will presume that these concepts have similar meanings, and I will discuss them in this respect. Brynard argues that *citizen participation* emphasizes the person in relation to the state, while *public*

participation is a wider concept including more sides of participation (Brynard 1996:134). However, I have found they are discussed under similar pretext in literature, and for the purpose of this thesis and the discussion on the theoretical topic I will deal with them as one concept regarding citizens in a society participating in the democratic processes in this society.

Theron writes that public participation is a concept along with other key concepts in development growth industry that is not easily tied down to a definition or a single statement. This in itself is positive as definitions should not be blueprints to follow statically, but should evolve as they are in use especially those related to grass-root action. Public participation is an elusive term that works as an umbrella concept, and has become an integral part of all development strategy. However this does not mean that policy makers, development strategists and the public agrees on what public participation is and in what way it should be implemented (Theron 2009:115).

The centrality of decentralization and participation of ordinary people in their own development has been emphasized during decades as an article of faith. However, in much of local development experience with the concept of citizen participation has been at a rather unclear and ideological level. The conception and operalisation have not been matched by sound theoretical underpinnings and practical analytical methods. Participation has therefore sometimes been reduced to a kind of feel-good slogan to convince local audiences that local government has understood the need to involve people in activities of development (Mogale 2003:223).

According to Kumar the meaning of public participation is different depending on the context it is applied to. This adds to the confusion that exists in the debate on public participation. On one hand the Economic Commission of Latin America regards participation as "contributions" by the public to programs, but

without any "involvement" in decision-making processes. Cohen and Uphoff on the other hand regard public participation as including "involving" the people in the course of decision-making processes. Rahman writes that defining public participation should be in connection with the experience that is the practical reality and context, and that a definition should not be cast in stone. The International Labor Organisation (ILO) has through their Participatory Organisations of the Rural Poor program found a definition of public participation based on a grass roots approach in assessments of international strategies. This says that public participation is a collective effort by the people concerned to pool together their resources in order to achieve objectives set for themselves. It is viewed as an active process where participants take initiatives on background of their own thinking and over which they can exercise control (Theron 2009:115).

The present developmental local government in South Africa is built on recognition of the linkages between development, service delivery and citizen participation. Citizen participation can be defined as the *organized effort to increase control over resources and regulative institutions by groups and movements, especially those excluded from such control* (Mogale 2003:220). Participation is mandated in four major senses: 1) as voters in order to ensure democratic accountability, 2) as citizens who can contribute to policy processes through a variety of stakeholder organisations, 3) as consumers and end users who can expect "value for money" and affordable services, 4) and as organized partners engaged in resource mobilization for developmental objectives (Mogale 2003:219-220).

While the first definitions debate on the degree of involvement in the decision-making process, the definition from the ILO stresses the collective effort from the people concerned and that their ideas are at the basis of action. The definition of citizen participation following is more focused on the control of resources and

that there should be a transfer of control to people. It gives four different aspects of participation, which shows voting is not the only way of citizen participation, but only one of several. The definition on community development from the UN Department of Economic and Social Affairs states the linkage between public participation and development is:

> *The process by which the efforts of the people themselves are united with those of governmental authorities to improve the economic, social and cultural conditions of communities, to integrate these communities into the life of the nation, and to enable them to contribute fully to national progress* (Theron 2009:115).

They describe two parts of this process. One is the participation of the people in efforts to improve their level of living, with as much reliance as possible on their own initiative. The other is to provide technical and other services to encourage initiative, self-help and mutual help and also to make these more effective (Theron 2009:115). This definition is really about community development, but adds a dimension to participation, as participation here is a tool to community development. It is a way to influence your living situation and to contribute in national processes towards development. This is important because it shows that the two are linked together, and that participation has a function beyond the value in itself, which is that it can be a way for people to influence decisions regarding their own lives. This is linked to Mogale's definition about increasing control of resources and institutions, because a larger degree of control by citizens will give them power to influence decisions and development. In this thesis I will use political participation in the sense of involvement in decision-making processes, which will give an influence in the use of resources and institutions who allocate these, as well as enhancing community development.

4.1.3 Participatory development planning

This section could also be placed under theory about participation and development, however because of the relation to participatory democracy in South Africa, I have included it here. Participatory development planning has its

theoretical foundations in the writings of development planning theorists such as Mumford (1968), Faludi (1986) and Habermas (1996). They emphasized the importance of concepts such as collaboration, diversity, integration and communication. Within development planning both locally, nationally and internationally this concept has been in transition over the past century. It has moved from technocratic and old-fashioned blueprint models to more integrated and comprehensive models who promote integration and inclusion, and welcomes diversity. The evolvement of the recent development planning in South Africa with local development objectives and IDPs (Integrated Development Plans) is in line with these trends (Mogale 2003:220).

In South Africa after apartheid, integrated development planning has been introduced to redress the divisions enhanced and created by the apartheid state and to ensure integration. During apartheid development planning was about creating "separateness of races" in a geographical and social way and to uphold these divisions, also by force if necessary. The framework of IDP is a part of the democratic reform, and aims to bring people together in terms of space, economically and socially, particularly at the local level (Mogale 2003:220).

In accordance with IDPs and current trends in development planning there has gradually been a theoretical ascendancy of systems thinking and procedural rationalism, and a move into development planning as more of an interconnected and organic system of processes. This means that development planning is currently viewed as complex, and dealing with a complicated whole of interconnected parts. It consists of people and societies from different backgrounds that are interacting, and should be dealt with holistically in order to achieve desired objectives. In South Africa finding new ways of moving forward as a united entity is something that is important (Mogale 2003:220-221).

A condition for this to be achieved is an understanding of differences in backgrounds, such as religious, ethnic, socio-economic, racial or political. One way of reaching this is through communication, or as Healy describes

"communicative rationality". In communicative rationality there should be found alternative ways to uncover new "knowledges". By creating an environment that makes space for sharing of knowledge, it can be possible for groups and individuals to come together and find solutions to problems and communicate over different issues (Mogale 2003:221).

However, communication and participation will not be able to achieve the goals in question unless it also shows an understanding of power relations between the actors in the decision-making processes. When communication is an important part of participatory local government, issues of power relations between the actors in local decision-making should also be in focus. This is because such relations can have implications for how the local development agenda is worked out, possibly in less accordance with the problems poor and marginalized groups face. The idea of communication, debate and argument, and thereby integrated development planning, is here taken to include citizen participation in resolving societal problems. The theoretical notion of citizen participation does include different segments of society, also from the marginal groupings, to be involved in local decision-making. Therefore local government actors should be compelled to include all voices from the community. By seeking, recognizing and including them in the general rhetoric of planning, actors in local government can learn from experiences that are generally unheard and unacknowledged (Mogale 2003:221).

4.2 Participation and development

Development can be defined as *moving from an unfavourable situation to a better situation* (Smukkestad 2005:11, own translation), while development in a context of humanity and society could mean *a societal change which contributes to bettering people's situation* (Smukkestad 2005:11, own translation).

4.2.1 Another development

"Another development" originated in the 1970's and is a reaction to theories of modernisation and dependency which are the most important paradigms in development theory. These are both promoting systems such as capitalism or socialism and their goal is industrialisation. Another development criticises sides of industrial society which are negative such as pollution. From the perspective of developing countries these systems are bringing some problems with them, regarding development initiatives. The main problems are 1) a consentration of political and economic power which is promoting the elites' interests more that the larger population. 2) Economism, meaning that narrow economic principals are dominating development work, and 3) mechanisms of exclusion through a lack of voting rights and not representing purchasing power (Smukkestad 2005:143-144).

Another development is a theory, to the extent it is a theory, which focuses on the content of the process of development, and is normative because it proposes how development should be. The central of the theory are people, the local community and civil society. Ideas within another development advocates some main principles (Smukkestad 2005:145). These are:

1) Orientation towards needs: Development should begin from meeting human material, and non-material needs. For millions of people this is not possible because of not having financial means. Orientation towards needs can be interpreted in different ways. One way is withdrawal from the market and for example a focus on subsistence farming instead of commercial farming in order to meet the basic needs of millions of small-scale farmers. Another interpretation is as an extension of the basic needs ideas discussed in the 1970's and the focus on human needs which have been advocated by the UNDP.

2) Endogenous development: Each community should be the starting point of development, the local community should decide the visions and values

that development should be grounded in. Part of this is sovereignty over own resources, based on the *territorial principle* where the geographical region is the focus and the goal is subsistence in this region. Each community does not have to be part of the functional logic of external systems, the *functional system*, which modernism is based on. Endogenous development can facilitate ethnic groups who are living in or used to live in an area to be drivers of development, which can give back control to indigenous peoples and other marginalised groups.

3) Own forces and self-reliance: Development should be based on people's own forces and self-reliance, and not on external dependence, such as development aid and international trade. This does not necessarily mean autarky (complete subsistence), but can involve collective self-reliance, like-minded countries who cooperate economically and engage in symmetrical trade between them.

4) Ecological balance: There should also be an ecological balance or sustainable development, where development in the community and the local ecological system should be interrelated. From this the term development should be seen in relation to the local environment and resources and does not have a universal meaning.

5) Ultra democratic development: a possibility for all people to be part of decision-making processes and self-determination. This would include all levels from the local community to the global level (Smukkestad 2005:146-148).

The last point is here especially related to political participation. In Africa Bade Onimode and Fante Cheru have been part of an alternative movement where they proposed a change in the development politics in Africa, and meant this should be based on African society and culture, and in India Vandana Shiva has been an advocate for this view (Smukkestad 2005:149).

4.2.2 Human development and the capability approach

The idea of political participation is part of a human development and capability approach to development as well. This is a people-centered approach and focuses on peoples freedom. The Nobel laureate and philosopher Amartya Sen is one of the leading voices of this approach, and he has developed the philosophical basis for the human development approach. This philosophy is also the foundation for the Human Development Report, being issued once a year by the UNDP. In this report other measures than simply economical ones are at the basis for determining a country's development. The reports are meant to give an assessment of quality of life, and be a tool for advocacy. By looking at the state of a population from a people-centered perspective, it can be possible to bring awareness to certain issues, and bring them to the agenda for political debate. The report was initiated by Mahub ul Haq, a Pakistani economist who wished to see the world's social and economic progress assessed in a different way (Alkire and Deneulin 2009:23-24).

The principle of participation and empowerment is one of the major aspects of human development. This is described as processes in which people act as agents, individually or as groups. It relates to the freedom to make decisions in issues that affect their lives, the freedom to hold others accountable to their promises and the freedom to influence development in communities. Capability refers to the freedom to enjoy different functionings. It is a set of functionings reflecting a person's ability to lead one life of another. Social arrangements should aim to expand a person's capabilities seen as the freedom to promote or achieve what they value doing or being (Alkire and Deneulin 2009:29-30,37). Sen differentiates between the notion of *functionings* and the notion of *capabilities,* where fuctionings represent actions that people do or achieve, while capabilities represent freedoms to be and to do (St. Clair 2006:334).

One of the central concepts of the capability approach is *agency*. Agency refers to: *the ability to pursue and realize goals one values and has reason to value*, while an agent is *someone who acts and brings about change* (Alkire and Deneulin 2009:37). The opposite of someone with agency is someone who is forced oppressed or passive. Agency does not just involve individual action, but also what can be achieved as a group, collectivity or political community. It can involve reaching one's own goals, or acting on behalf of or in solidarity with others. In line with the agency perspective development processes should foster participation, public debate and democratic practice (Alkire and Deneulin 2009:37).

4.2.3 Political participation and political equality

In accordance with the capability and agency approach people are active subjects of their own destiny. Sen writes that the process of development ultimately rests on *the ability of people to help themselves and to influence the world* (Sen 1999 in Deneulin 2009:185-186). In today's world this ability is especially expressed through political participation and democratic decision-making (Deneulin 2009:186). Dahl defines democratic decision-making through five criteria. 1) Democracy requires effective participation. This means all members should have equal possibility to make their opinion known to others about how a policy should be, before a policy is adopted. 2) Democracy is based on voting equality. When it is time to reach a decision, all members should have the possibility to vote, and all votes should be counted equally. 3) It rests on "enlightened understanding". Within reasonable limits, all members should have an equal opportunity to learn about alternative policies and what their likely outcomes would be. 4) All members should have the possibility to decide the agenda and change it. 5) Democratic decision-making should include all adults, which means all (or most) adult residents should have the rights as citizens that the five criteria imply (Deneulin 2009:186-187).

At the core of democratic decision-making lies the idea of political equality. If one of the criteria above is violated it leads to political inequality and a disruption in the democratic process. A democratic government would aim to reach as many of these criteria as possible, supported by the necessary institutions needed to reach them. Even if free and fair elections are fundamental, they do not live up to democratic principles if they are not followed by other fundamental civil and political rights. Other elements that are vital to democratic decision-making is respect for legal entitlements, the right to free expression, the right to associate freely and hold public debates, and the right to organize protests or political movements (Deneulin 2009:187-188).

Often there is an assumption in democratic theory that by respecting the principle of "one person, one vote", and the civil and political rights, one will have met the requirements for political equality and the goal of a functioning democracy. However, these do not secure equal participation in decision-making processes for all citizens. Political equality is not determined by political conditions only, but also economical and social ones. An important part of the human development perspective is to see past the political boundaries, and also underscore how economical and social conditions are influencing the functioning of democratic political institutions. Sen and Dreze write that social conditions can range from educational levels and political traditions, to the workings of social inequalities and popular organisations (Deneulin 2009:199).

The right to vote can for example be influenced by how well informed people are of the different parties and their cases, as well as their educational level which can inhibit them from understanding a political program or debates in a newspaper. People can also vote out of reasons such as protection for a family on a clientelistic basis, influenced by poverty or inequality. This means that political equality can be undermined by social and economic inequality and results in that decisions made favor those that are already in a privileged social and economical situation. This in turn deepens social and political inequality and finally political

inequality itself. A way to come to terms with this cycle is to enhance the capability of the marginalized for self-assertion, by creating incentives to organize in political action that will gain political power to counteract the power of the privileged (Deneulin 2009:200-201).

4.2.4 Sustainable development

The idea of human development and the capability approach is linked with the idea of sustainable development. First proposed in the 1987 Brundtland Commission Report *Our Common Future* sustainable development was described as *development that meets the needs of the present without compromising the ability of future generations to meet their own needs* (Deneulin 2009:67). As part of the principles of human development it can entail different aspects such as economic sustainability or environmental sustainability. It can also involve social sustainability which is how social groups and institutions are involved in and support development initiatives over time (Alkire and Deneulin 2009:30). In the definition of sustainable development the rapport explains the first part of the definition entails meeting needs, especially the basic needs of the poor, and this should be prioritized. The rapport covers meeting needs such as "social justice" which encompasses both social justice within generations and between generations. This should happen both nationally and globally, which means that social justice within generations should be reached both at a national basis and at a global basis (Langhelle 2006:229,235).

4.3 Participatory democracy, participatory development

Vandana Shiva writes about the idea Earth Democracy, which is both an ancient worldview as well as a political movement for peace, justice and sustainability. Chief Seattle said in 1848 that "all things are connected" (Shiva 2005:1) and Earth Democracy constitutes the awareness of those connections, and the rights

and responsibilities which derives from them. Different movements are defending the planet as commons instead of private property on a local and global level. One of these movements is the one started by tribal women in the state of Kerala in India, which were victorious against the Coca-Cola Company, one of the largest companies in the world. Such movements are at the heart of Earth democracy (Shiva 2005:1-4).

Shiva argues that Earth Democracy is based on self-organizing capacities, identities, diversity and multiplicity. It addresses the global in everyday life and reality, and by making change locally, this creates change globally. Economy, politics and culture are not isolated concepts, and the emergence of living economies, living democracies and living culture is an integrated process (Shiva 2005:4-5). Living democracy is grounded in *the democracy of all life and the democracy of everyday life* (Shiva 2005:10). Living democracy makes it possible to influence decisions regarding our food, water, education and health care, and it is like tree, growing from the bottom up. Within Earth Democracy, local democracy is the foundation, and local communities have the authority on decisions of natural resources, the environment and livelihood of people. Inclusion, diversity and ecological and social responsibility, should be the organising principles in this democracy (Shiva 2005:10).

Banik argues that a hindrance to development efforts has been the implementation of anti-poverty programs, which have been to a great extent "top-down" approaches. This is based on experts who try to define what the needs are for disadvantaged groups, while often being far-removed from the problems the poor meet. There is not as much emphasis on "bottom up" approaches, where the poor are part of formulating the issues they face. Because of this combined with a lack of alignment between program goals and implementation realities, many efforts at reducing poverty in developing countries have been ineffective (Banik 2010:113). According to Amartya Sen,

democratic political rights are important not only for the fulfilment of pressing economic needs, but they are also crucial for the formulation of such needs (Sen in Banik 2010:121).

Democracy is not just the role of a saviour, but can be part of eradicating poverty. This can happen through institutionalizing certain rights, the performance of democratic institutions between elections and the presence of a competitive political party system. The political system should articulate and collect the political and economic needs of the poor effectively and regularly (Banik 2010:121).

5.   Channels for political participation

There are different channels for political participation in Khayelitsha. Of formal channels in you can address your local ward councillor, or ward committee, and participate in the making of the Integrated Development Plan which is written every five years. There is also the possibility of litigation, which can involve civil society as complainants in a case. Civil society channels include civil society organisations which can pressure government on different issues, and inform them about important subjects, and protests in response to problems people were facing. Because the organisations I interviewed identified themselves with different terms, will use the term civil society organisations as an overarching term.

5.1 Ward councillor and ward committee

Monde Nqulwana was the ward councillor in ward 89 in Khayelitsha, and the interview took place in the municipal offices in Site B. He explained the ward councillor is the lowest government representative and is representing local government, and the only one working on the ground with a political mandate. He is responsible for looking after the ward on government services especially, water and sanitation, electricity and cleaning. About political participation he claims he works together with people on how to develop the area. He means it is not always right for the government to make decisions, but that they must collect information from the public. According to Nqulwana ward councillors are connected with the development of the IDP in the way that the IDP begins and ends with the ward councillor. They talk to the community about what they want to see in the next five years and report this back to the municipality. He said the ward councillor is also responsible monitoring the budget process, informed by community needs (Interview Nqulwana 2011).

Nqulwana said that people come directly to the councillors with problems, and they think this is positive. There are also ward committees that assist the councillor. The ward committees have representatives from different sectors such as education, youth, sport, and business. Within these sectors they bring up issues with their representatives, and they bring them to the ward committee were they can be given to the councillors. In addition they are required to have a meeting with the community four times a year, but they have decided to have a monthly meeting instead, because they think four times a year is not enough (Interview Nqulwana 2011).

In ward 89 there are around 22 000 inhabitants and more that 70 per cent of these live in informal settlements. There is no elementary school or clinic in the ward, only a high school, therefore children have to go to another ward for elementary school. Problems like this the ward councillor discusses with the respective departments such as the department of education, and they become a coordinating structure between the communities and the government, however Nqulwana means this goes beyond their responsibility (Interview Nqulwana 2011).

The councillor means people are not participating as much as they would hope, and this is because their expectations have not been fulfilled from voting for the ANC. They vote for a party and expect delivery, but they do not see the services they would like to see. There are 13 538 registered voters in ward 89, but only 8000 of them voted, which is a turnout of 60-70 per cent. He said a challenge for the future is that people will not vote for the ANC simply because they are the liberation party, they must provide services otherwise people will not vote for them, and there should be measurable implementation (Interview Nqulwana 2011).

5.2 Integrated Development Plan

The Integrated Development Plan (IDP) is a strategic developmental five year plan which identifies development priorities(City of Cape Town 2014[1]). In developing the IDP the government hold meetings and collects information from inhabitants of Cape Town who contribute to the plan (IDP Cape Town 2012-17:15). The Integrated Development Plan is mandated by the Municipal Systems Act and other legislation, to provide the strategic framework to inform the planning and budgeting of a municipality. According to the plan Some IDP's have been made without enough investigation into the wishes of the people of Cape Town. This IDP however has been produced with detailed input from the inhabitants of the city. It says that the administration wanted to create a more inclusive society by working to achieve greater economic freedom for all people in Cape Town (IDP Cape Town 2012-17:14-15). They explain they have an expansive view of development as *the building of a total environment that allows individuals to reach their full potential* (IDP Cape Town 2012-17:14).

The plan is based on five pillars which are: the opportunity city, the safe city, the caring city, the inclusive city and the well-run city. These are strategic focus areas meant to create effective implementation and measurement of outcomes. These areas will work together and be helpful in reaching the goals of the administration, and assist in addressing the inequalities of the past. They will help in fulfilling the constitutional mandate of the local government in being the drivers of economic and social development. The IDP has been developed with participation from different levels of government such as mayoral committee members, subcouncils and councillors. The development has also involved a public participation process which was the most extensive ever undertaken in the city. Here people were able to give their input through public meetings, websites, newspaper inserts, information brochures and social media (IDP Cape Town 2012-17:14-15).

The introduction presents the main sources of information that were collected in a public needs analysis process, and used to develop the IDP. These are the Community Satisfaction Survey (CSS), the C3 notification system and the 2011 IDP public engagement process. The Community Satisfaction Survey has been carried out every year since 2007, and involves 3000 respondents from eight health districts (stratified sampling) in order to reflect the diversity in the city. The respondents are selected randomly and take part in an in-depth 40 minute interview, and this survey is scientifically defensible (IDP Cape Town 2012-17:31).

The C3 notification system is based on information taken from complaints about City services, which have been received by telephone or SMS. This system gives a useful indication of important issues, is not of scientific standard. The IDP public engagement process is undertaken at subcouncil level and in Cape Town there are 24 subcouncils and within them 111 wards. I 2011 the process was directed primarily at gathering information from poorer communities, and the process involved nine mayoral meetings, six subcouncil meetings, one meeting with the City of Cape Town's strategic partners and a meeting with internal staff (IDP Cape Town 2012-17:31).

Of the five strategic focus areas, the inclusive city is the one most related to political participation. The plan describes an inclusive city as *one in which everyone has a stake in the future and enjoys a sense of belonging* (IDP Cape Town 2012-2017:109). It says that a key priority is to build a shared community across different social, cultural and economic groups in Cape Town. They further write that for this to be achieved all residents should feel acknowledged, heard and valued (IDP Cape Town 2012-2017:110). One of the objectives under this goal is to *ensure responsiveness by creating an environment where citizens can be communicated with and responded to* (IDP Cape Town 2012-2017:111).

5.3 Litigation

Some issues have been taken to court. In Makhaza, Khayelitsha, the government had built toilets without walls, saying that they had an agreement with the community that they would cover them up. The Human Rights Commission took this case to court and the government was obligated to build the toilets properly. Many problems are things that the government has an obligation to sort out according to the constitution (Interview Bregman 2011). The South African Constitution says that everyone has the right to equality, human dignity, life, health care, food, water, and a healthy environment (The South African Constitution 1996). The Social Justice Coalition is concerned about the situation in Khayelitsha regarding sanitation issues as well and SABC writes that the SJC are threatening to take the City of Cape Town to court over poor sanitation in the township. This is following an audit of the City's janitorial services for communal flush toilets, where 500 toilets were inspected and the result was not satisfying (SABC 2014).

Another legal case has been the Khayelitsha Police Inquiry, which was a Commision of Inquiry into allegations of inefficiency of the police and a breakdown in the relations between the community and the police in Khayelitsha. In the opening speech of the beginning of the inquiry hearings Advocate Ncumisa Mayosi stated that the inquiry was appointed after complaints from civil society organisations to the Premier of the Western Cape. The organisations had held more than a hundred demonstrations and other forms of protest against continued failure of the police of Khayelitsha and other parts of the criminal justice system. Mayosi further explained that the Commission wished to look into testimonies from the daily experiences of members of the community in their meetings with the South African police and the criminal justice system. These testimonies point to that the community's constitutional rights have been overstepped (Social Justice Coalition 2014). The Social Justice Coalition was one of the main complainants of the inquiry (Presence 2014).

This conflict between the community and the police is reflected in a newspaper article from local newspaper Vukani. The article says that Mandela Park residents have had metal gates stolen by scrap collectors and called for the neighbourhood watch to be reinstated. They say there has been thefts since Harare police cancelled the neighbourhood watch four months earlier. The police say the watch has not been formally disbanded, but that it had stopped since there had been complaints that community members had been beaten up by watch members. There was a community meeting to deal with the issue, however there a murder had taken place, and watch members had been arrested on murder charges (Cawe 2011:7).

5.4 Civil society organisations

5.4.1 The Social Justice Coalition

The Social Justice Coalition is an activist movement (Social Justice Coalition 2011) working for rights and better conditions for people in Khayelitsha, where I interviewed senior researcher Joel Bregman. The SJC was started in 2008 as a response to the xenophobia crisis and later moved on to work with other social issues solely in Khayelitsha. Initially they held meetings with the communities to hear which were the most important issues for people, and out of that they decided to focus on sanitation, safety and security and justice as main areas (Interview Bregman 2011).

The issue of sanitation is important for example because women were in danger of being raped while walking out to the bush or an unsafe toilet. Bregman says there are about ¾ of a million people in Khayelitsha or that it could be closer to a million, but that the numbers are not clear. He says they have inadequate facilities and want clean and safe sanitation. They also work for a quality justice system and policing for a safer community. They have workshops and take testimonies

from people so that they get their information through people that live there (Interview Bregman 2011).

Bregman says they put pressure on government to achieve their goals. About sanitation it is mainly the City of Cape Town they communicate with, while housing issues are addressed to national government. Other issues that he means are a problem in the area is education and transport. In Cape Town there are new buses running mainly in the center of town, but Bregman means they should rather in Khayelitsha were it is needed. He says complaints to government do not always go through. They do not have enough capacity and there are many phone calls needed to change something. Departments are not always coordinated and there are ten government departments dealing with sanitation. This means that if someone from the sewage department comes to fix a problem with sewage and a water pipe breaks, they have to call a different department to fix that (Interview Bregman 2011).

5.4.2 Abalimi Bezekhaya

Abalimi Bezekhaya, is an urban agriculture (UA) and environmental action (EA) association working in Khyelitsha and Nyanga and surrounding areas of the Cape Flats (Abalimi Bezekhaya 2014), and here I interviewed Lesiwe Stofile. The center in Khyelitsha is a farming center where they have training, grow plants for sale and to give out plants to small-scale farming. The training takes four days and cost 30 rand, and after training they follow up and give advice. The organisation use land in schools, municipal land and also land under power lines where people cannot build houses. The Abalimi Bezekhaya was started in 1986. They started with home gardens, and seeds and soil were delivered directly to the homes (Interview Stofile 2011).

They have established a market in Khyelitsha for vegetables and sell to richer areas and suburbs such as Constantia. Locally people are not able to buy the crops, so they cannot sell them in Khyelitsha, but for four years they have been

selling to the suburbs. The head office is in Phillippi, and that is where they do the packing. They deliver vegetables on Wednesdays, and have quality control on Tuesdays. Rziwe says civil society organisations work together with the government. They give the budget to the government, and also give advice to them. They push for having people in government that are willing to be practical and work on grass root level, because often they will just be in offices and not be available to people. She thinks they should give support to civil society organisations because they do not always have enough funds or people to work for them. She thinks the organisation is playing a big role because they are creating jobs, training people and teach people to care for the environment, so they are actually helping the government. She means the government listens to them, for example the government has workshops and there they can present their ideas (Interview Stofile 2011).

5.4.3 SANCO Khayelitsha

At the SANCO Khayelitsha in Site B, I interviewed Dalisile Mfazwe, and Gladwell Mtotywa, the safety and security responsible in SANCO Khyelitsha. SANCO (South African National Civic Organisation) is a community based organisation (CBO) that deal with social issues and work for the poorest sections of society. It was launched in 1992 in Eastern Cape, in the village of Uithanag. It started as a collection of CBOs dealing with different issues such as backyard dwellers, and combined their interests in one organisation. They check on and work with social issues irrespective of race, national background, religion or political party. Their slogan and main objective is "people centered and driven development" (Interview Mfazwe and Mtotywa 2011).

They work on different levels where the lowest are the street committees, then the block committees, then the branch executive. The areas are divided into branches, and there are from 3-6 branches in each ward. Since 2008 the structure was changed from local to zonal on the local level. After zonal level is the regional

level, then the provincial level and then the national level. The leader of the organisation on the national level is Ruth Bengo. The SANCO strive to have a 50/50 gender policy in the organisation. There are 29 branches in Khyelitsha in good standing (Mfazwe and Mtotywa 2011). Mfazwe says when the organisation was founded they did a check on all the parties and by election time decided to vote with the ANC. This can be changed in national congress, and they will keep a check on the ANC to see if they are still on the right track. If they do not agree with their politics they will sit with them in a roundtable conference and tell them. If necessary they will revolt against them (Mfazwe Mtotywa 2011).

5.5 Protests

The local newspaper City Vision Khayelitsha had the heading "S-Section in flames" on the front page 01.12.2011 (City Vision Khayelitsha 01.12.2011:1). The article is about residents from the S-Section who were protesting, wanting the MEC of Human Settlements, Bonginkosi Madikizela and the City of Cape Town to address their housing problems. In the protest hundreds of unhappy residents set the area on flames by burning tyres in the street and they barricaded Puma road. When the police arrived they started to sing protest songs, and some started to throw stones. The police responded by shooting rubber bullets and using stun grenades, and they also used a water cannon to disperse the crowd. The police arrested six people for inciting public violence. Some of the residents told the newspaper that they are tired of the government's promises and that they want new houses and toilets (City Vision Khayelitsha 2011:1). They said that:

> *The area is filthy, children are always sick, people can't just walk around or they will get robbed. The only time the government recognises us is election time, all the other times, they ignore us* (City Vision Khayelitsha 2011:1).

Councillor Luvuyo Hebe said he was in the process of debating the problems of the residents (City Vision Khayelitsha 2011:1). Another local newsapaper,

Vukani, wrote about a protest which took place in Gugulethu. All though this was not in Khayelitsha, it could be relevant because the paper is read in Khayelitsha, and similar problems occur in there. Informal settlement residents from Barcelona, Kanana and Europe settlements protested after their shacks were demolished. They marched to Fezeka Municipal Office in Gugulethu. They claimed the shacks were demolished without prior warning and therefore leaving people homeless. Councillor Mzwakhe Nqavashe says he did not know about this and means as the councillor he should have been informed so he could notify residents (Vukani 17.11.2011: p. 9 /continuing p. 16).

The residents concern is that it will be a repeat of what happened the year before, when ten legitimate structures were mistakenly destroyed, and later there was given permission to rebuild. The councillor says they had agreed that if the Land Invasion Unit needed to demolish structures they should consult with the street committee first but they did not do that and this is why the residents are angry. Mr Nqavashe had stopped people from throwing stones and burning tyres and told them they are going to have a meeting with the sub-council to discuss the way forward. The city's mayoral committee, Ernest Sonnenberg, said only vacant or illegally extended shacks were demolished, and means residents were given notice (Vukani 2011:9,16).

6.   Political participation and democracy

In this chapter I will discuss channels for participation in relation to theory about participation and democracy. I will begin by discussing involvement in decision-making processes through addressing the ward councillor and ward committee. Then I will look at development planning and participating in the making of the IDP plan. I will continue with discussing activism through social movements and protest, which is linked with the following section about litigation and addressing challenges. Finally, I will debate the role of SANCO and communication with other actors.

6.1 Involvement in decision-making prosesses

Part of political participation is involvement in decision-making processes. As noted earlier according to Councillor Monde Nqulwana he works together with people on developing the area, and people come directly to councillors with problems. The ward committee have representatives for different sectors which communicate issues to the councillor (Interview Nqulwana 2011). This points to the possibility for people to be able to participate and communicate concerns. However he also states that people are not participating as much as they would hope because they are disappointed with the delivery of the ANC (Interview Nqulwana 2011).

There were different opinions among the interviewees about the ward councillors. Kibiti was positive and said the ward councillors are easy to address, and they are living within the community. People can talk to them, and then they can communicate the concerns to the parliament, and it is easier for them to reach the parliament that for ordinary people. He meant they are good representatives, and issues you can bring to them are for example problems with sanitation, water and electricity (Interview Kibiti 2011).

On the other side Lekau mean that it is not easy to contact the local councillor, because she is not always available. The councillors say they are busy, but people do not believe that. People who live close to the local councillor says she is always at home and not in the office or in meetings where she says she is (Interview Lekau). Mcosana thinks the system of the ward councillors is a good idea, but that it depends a lot on the character of the councillor, some are easy to address, while others do not care about the grass roots level and the needs of people (Interview Mcosana 2011).

Stofile at Abalimi Bezekhaya means that people cannot change much by saying their opinion about problems in the community, because people are tired of politics and they do not care about political talk. She means the politicians know what the problems are, but they are often working just for themselves. There is a lot of talk, for example about the constitution. She thinks civil society organisations can reach where the government cannot, because the government is slow. Often they claim they are busy, when they are not, by saying they have other appointments. However since no one has spoken to them, they know this is not true. Also, people are the problem because they have lost trust in politicians (Interview Stofile 2011).

Bregman from the SJC said some councillors are doing good work, while some are working to their own advantage. They have had meetings with councillors who have showed up an hour too late, and seemed not to be so interested (Interview Bregman 2011). One of the volunteers at SJC, Luthando Tokota, says talking to the ward councilors is not difficult, but they often answer a question with another question instead of giving answers. In the RR section he says there is no basic sanitation, and since 1994 they have been using a bucket system. Nothing has changed and the politicians are not doing anything. People get sick with tuberculosis and diarrhea, and risk getting robbed going to the toilet. Even though they have told this to the government nothing has happened (Interview Tokota 2011).

Millstein discusses the N2 Gateway housing project and argues that there was limited space for participation in this project. According to the project participation by the community would be organized through ward councilors and ward committees. Divisive party politics made inclusion into spaces for participation more difficult, and there were racial conflicts about the allocation policy of houses at a city level. Communities involved in protests explained that they had not been consulted about issues related to the project by councilors, city officials or others working with the project. Councilors of other parties than the ANC meant that information was being held by ANC political control, and that they had not received any information about the project, leaving them to feel excluded from the process. A committee established for inclusion in the project, was organized by one of the councilors belonging to the ANC, and the private contractor, in the councilors ward, leaving out other councilors and community organisations from other locations in Delft (Millstein 2008:289).

The article concerning a protest about shacks demolition in Gugulethu, also mentions the lack of communication. The councillor, Mzwakhe Nqavashe, says he received complaints about the demolition of fourteen shacks (Mpeshe 2011:9). As he said he had not been informed of the demolition this indicates a lack of information to the councillor about the events. (Mpeshe 2011:9). In a context of party politics, this could be related to the fact that the government in Cape Town is DA, while Khayelitsha and Gugulethu are areas where people mostly support the ANC.

A lack of space for participation is described by Bregman. He means the problems with the local democratic system is that there is a lack of communication, and no room for voices from the community. People are frustrated that their voices are not being heard. During campaigns politicians are very active and visiting the area, and until the next election they are quiet. He says there is a one sided dialogue, and that people are not allowed to interact (Interview Bregman 2011).

In Lekau's opinion, to make the system better there should be officials that are better qualified to do their jobs. She says many officials do not do their job properly because they do not know what they are doing. If they would get people that are better qualified, it would be easier to solve the problems. She means people are not allowed to participate, and say what they mean. Since the politicians claim they know what they are doing, they do not want to hear from the community (Interview Lekau 2011).

In a letter to the newspaper Vukani, Bonkeka Ngedle writes about the responsibility of the ward councillors to take action by delivering on the needs of communities. She says casting their votes is not the end of participation in municipalities, people should also hold them to their promises. She means some people will not be voting because they are disappointed by empty promises in the past years. However she thinks it is important to vote because it is the most powerful weapon to eliminate those who are not delivering services to the communities (Ngedle 2011:2).

Ward councillors should be given duties to fulfil, and ward committees should give a report on what they have done each year. She also means the public should contribute with suggestions because they can lead to success in service delivery. She says issues such as potholes, open toilets and water shortages should be addressed. Municipalities should work together with ward councillors to bring change to the communities, and community organisations must be involved in local government matters (Ngedle 2011:2).

Piper and Nadvi criticize the workings of ward committees in two cases from the province of Kwa-Zulu Natal in South Africa. In Msunduzi between 2001 and 2006 they found that the ward committees were operating poorly. This was because the ward committees depended very much on the ward councillor who lead them, regarding how often they meet, what they discuss and the information passed on to the council. The councillors were often not up to the task, for example by not knowing their responsibilities. This resulted in that less than 50

per cent of the committees had meetings regularly, and the operations of the committees varied with the ward councillor, in how inclusive it was (Piper and Nadvi 2010:219-220).

There is described a lack of space for participation and councillors who are not taking responsibility, therefore a criticism towards involvement in decision-making processes through the channel of communicating to the ward councillor. As Mcosana and Bregman expressed there can be differences between the councillors, some are easier to communicate to that others. This is described by Piper and Nadvi as well, relating to ward committees and the influence of the leadership of the ward councillor. When communication with a councillor is not good, this would influence the capabilities of people to be able to participate.

6.2 Participation and development planning

The IDP consultation process would indicate that people are able to participate in the planning of the city. The IDP states they held community meetings and interviewed 3000 people in the CSS. They have prioritized involving poorer communities and claims they have carried out the most extensive participation process ever undertaken in Cape Town (IDP 2012:17). Unfortunately, I was not able to attend the meeting held in Khayelitsha, so I do not have enough information to be able to assess this process. The ward councillor explained he played an important role in the IDP, sayning that the IDP process begins and ends with the councillor (Interview Nqulwana 2011).

In eThekwini (Durban, own remark) the public consultation processes of the first draft IDP in 2001 and 2002 was participatory and needs driven, with workshops where 450 people participated representing all areas of the city, and all sectors of civil society, unions, traditional leaders and spheres of government. However since then there was a downturn in public participation, and a lot of energy has gone into developing technical systems in the municipality. There is a trend of

growing managerialism and a loss of interest in public participation from the city elite (Piper and Nadvi 2010:229-230).

Two years after 1994 the redistributive RDP program was abandoned and a more market-driven development vision was adapted. Local government has become more centralized, and the ANC has reduced the quality and scope of processes of participation which were part of the RDP, and these processes have been managerialized. He writes that the IDP has been privatized and outsourced, and that using consultants has pushed community structures out. He means the spaces where citizens can influence local democracy have been hollowed out (Heller 2013:56).

There is here a conflict between the information from the IDP and in part the councillor, and the literature on the subject. Interviewees have expressed that they are not content with spaces for participation, such as Bregman who meant there is no room for voices from the community (Interview Bregman 2011). However, Kibiti means the problem is not the channels for participation but that the problem is at the top. He says the structure is there and the channels work, and you can talk to the councillors (Interview Kibiti 2011). According to Lekau you can influence decisions in the community by being involved with the local councillor and attend meetings called by the councillor. In this way you can know what is happening and your voice can be heard, you can be part of decision-making. You can also attend meetings called by the local municipality, not all can attend but some people do (Interview Lekau 2011). In my additional information Asikho explains that there are local government meetings, but that most people do not attend, because people do not think they are telling the truth and they will not do what they say (Interview Asikho 2011).

While some people mean the government do not listen to the community, and that there is a lack of trust in politicians and government meetings, others mean you can be part of decision-making, or that the channels are working, but that the problem is higher up in the system. It is difficult to judge in this matter, but on

the basis that there was a meeting at the time of my fieldwork, meanings from the interviews, and the IDP's described process of participation I will not argue that political participation and public consultation are not present. However, people have lost trust in politicians, and mean the dialogue can be one-sided, and the problem could also be higher in the political system.

6.3 Activism and adressing inequality

In participatory democracy, important aspects are activism, and including social organisations in decision-making and reducing inequality (Grugel 2002:23-24). Social movements have a history in South Africa in playing an important role since the fight against apartheid, and a broad coalition of civil society organisations were in the front of the anti-apartheid movement (Heller 2013:53). During apartheid the ambition of the state was to organize and control the whole social community, and in this time many organisations were started often in neighbourhoods and shantytowns. People were excluded from formal institutions and from citizenship, and organized in townships and communities because other channels of organisation and participation were closed to them (Grugel 2002:108).

After the end of apartheid there was a new wave of social movements, especially after the beginning of the second term in office of the ANC. Many of the organisations such as the Treatment Action Campaign and the Anti-Eviction Campaign have re-constituted a vibrant and oppositional civil society, and have been visible and enduring struggles. This emerging new set of movements have started in relation to the high levels of poverty and inequality in South Africa (Ballard 2005:83).

The SJC is an organisation working to address inequality. Joel Bregman says that it can be easier for an organisation to put pressure on government that for a single person. If someone calls about for example a broken toilet it is supposed to take 48 hours until it is fixed, but rather it takes a week. However in working for

better sanitation they have seen slight improvements. They have had meetings with the mayor, where the City has acknowledged the problem of sanitation for the first time (Interview Bregman 2011). Volunteer at SJC Luthando Tokota also meant organisations can put pressure on government and mentioned Treatment Action Campaign, Equal Education and Free Gender as organisations that are doing important work (Interview Tokota 2011). SJC holds series of seminars called the Irene Grootboom Lectures, and they held one which I attended, in Khayelitsha. Here they discussed the future for Cape Town, and asked questions such as how Cape Town can become a more inclusive city and what the visions are for the city in twenty years (Irene Grootboom Lectures 2011).

Protests is another civil society channel which can have influence in political issues, and is an important part of democracy. When I was in South Africa there was a protest about housing in Khayelitsha, and one of the interviews was delayed because of that. When I went there I saw the rests of burnt tyres in the street. Bregman said when complaints are not heard by government it leads to frustration boiling over. People have been on waiting lists for houses for twenty years, and they will not vote when things do not change, and they are frustrated about the housing policy. If you earn below a certain amount you can apply for housing. The waiting list is infamous, and there is corruption connected with this, where people bribe those in positions to move up on the list (Interview Bregman 2011).

People have also found other alternatives, as GroundUp reports about problems with a housing project in Khayelitsha. There has been allegations of corruption in relation to project, and residents are concerned they might not get their houses, or that problems with the houses that have been built will not be repaired. The residents have formed a monitoring group consisting of ten people, which have been elected by the community, who will look into what is going on with the housing project. Leo Mbobi who is a resident in the SST section where projects are located, says that in South Africa when people want services they demand them and protest by burning tyres. In a community meeting they decided against

this and wanted to take a different approach. They then appointed a monitoring group, who had the mandate of finding out why the housing project was delayed, and why the condition of the houses that are ready is not good. The monitoring group have compiled the information and delivered it to the Department of Human Settlements and the City of Cape Town (Gontsana 2014).

A new tendency on the African continent is an increase in civil protest, however these people's movements has been given little attention in the news, especially those happening south of Sahara. While the protests that happened in North Africa were impressive, fewer people were aware of tens of millions in Nigeria engaging in a nation wide protest, or the people's movement in Malawi and the change of power in the country. Johnstad asks what is good news from Africa? Is it economic growth or that the share or poor is "down" to 48 per cent. She thinks these new movements are the good news, the fact that millions of people are in movement, using non-violent methods, marching in the streets with demands to their leaders (Johnstad 2013:5-6).

In Marikana in 2012, the police opened fire against striking mineworkers, killed 34 and wounded 78 people. This was a shock for the nation and something like this had not happened since the ANC took over power in 1994. The strike was a result of anger and frustration against the privately owned mining company Lonmin, as well as the workers union NUM (National Union of Mineworkers). The strike was supported by the competing, but smaller union AMCU (Association of Mineworkers and Construction Union). Although Lonmin accepted that mineworkers joined the AMCU, they were not allowed to be part of wage negotiations, which led to rivalry between the two unions. The Lonmin mine has high revenue, but little of this goes to the workers. Their wages are low, and they live in shacks near the mines, even though they are contributors to the building of palaces. South Africa is founded on mining, and both in the colonial era and during apartheid, cheap African labour was at the core of this. This is still

the case, and the ANC has become directly connected with the mining industry, through high ranking people in the party (Gibson 2013:94-96).

The NUM has a role in the administration of labour force, and has become increasingly bureaucratic with more contact with the leadership and less with the members of the union. The top representatives of the union is paid by the Lonmin company, and receives an office and extra benefits, which creates a basis for corruption. This situation means that the uprising among the workers in Marikana was equally directed at the NUM (Gibson 2013:96).

According to Vandana Shiva, local democracy should be the foundation, and local communities should be able to make decisions regarding natural resources, environment and livelihoods (Shiva 2005:10). The new social movements in South Africa and the increasing tendency of protests in Africa as well as in South Africa, is sign that people want change. Local movements can have the power to create change (Shiva 2005:4), and this is possible for the movements and protests in South Africa. In the following section I will look closer at litigation as a channel for participation.

6.4 Litigation and challenges

Litigation is a formal channel, however civil society organisation can address issues through this channel. Litigation can be a way for securing compensation in a situation where the injury is to a large number of people and can give legitimacy to previously marginalized groups. It can also be about bringing attention and mobilization to a cause (Simpson and Waldman 2010:89-90). Marcia Greenberger, former co-president of the National Women's Law Centre in the USA, states:

> *A concrete case could provide a way of highlighting the importance of a legal principle in the context of a real set of facts and actual people affected by the outcome (…)*(Hershcoff and Hollander 2000:96 in Simpson and Waldman 2010:89).

The SJC was one of five complainants in the commission inquiry on policing in Khayelitsha including Treatment Action Campaign, Equal Education, Ndifuna Ukwazi and Triangle Project (SJC 2014). Lekau says the police are not doing enough, and that people report cases but that the police are not attending to the cases (Interview Lekau 2011). If people call the police they do not come, or it takes long before they come (Interview Nosicelo 2011).

The report from the inquiry published in August 2014, establishes that Khayelitsha is a particularly difficult area to police, because of poor infrastructure, high levels of poverty and high crime rates. However, the report has shown that there are inefficiencies in policing in Khayelitsha. The findings show that guidelines for patrolling informal settlements are not in place, and that many cases are not investigated properly or not investigated at all. During investigations information is rarely given to complainants or affected family members. Crime investigation is moving towards a crisis point, and the reasons for this includes very few detectives working on a high number of cases, and unexperienced and under-trained detectives. Crime scene management does often fail to follow protocols, and management is ineffective at the three police stations in Khayelitsha. Furthermore, the report states that the SAPC do not have strategies to respond to two urgent policing challenges in Khayelitsha, youth gangs, and attacks on members of the community believed to be criminals. (Khayelitsha Commission Report 2014:xxiv).

The commission concluded that there is a breakdown in relations between the SAPS and the community in Khayelitsha, although not an irreversible one. The causes for this are, among other things, the difficult history of Khayelitsha, and the still existing poverty. The common perception is that the police do not respond on time to calls for assistance and do not investigate cases thoroughly or at all. Members of the public are often not treated with respect by the police, and complaints towards police officers are often dismissed after a short period of time, even when the allegations are serious and include injuries to a community resident. Vulnerable groups such as foreign nationals and LGBTI groups have

reported especially high levels of disrespectful behaviour from the SAPS (Khayelitsha Commission Report 2014:xxv).

Ayanda Nyoka, the project leader of Inclusive Economies at the Institute for Justice and Reconciliation, means that because of the broad and thorough consultations that were carried out, it is likely that the report will be taken seriously by the different stakeholders. According to the South Africa Reconciliation Barometer, a majority of South Africans feel politically disempowered. The Barometer shows that 51,6% means that there is no possibility to make public officials listen to concerns from the public. She writes that although the democratic institutions have been created to international standards, there is a lack of political accountability which influences public confidence. Such a commission gives a voice to ordinary citizens, and this helps in a broader effort at creating a living democracy. However she also questions whether the commission findings will contribute to changes for the inhabitants of Khayelitsha which are lasting and meaningful (Nyoko 2014).

In Makhaza, Khayelitsha, in the case of 1316 unenclosed toilets erected in 2009, the Cape Town High Court ruled that in constructing the toilets, the City of Cape Town had lost the perspective of the constitutional rights and the poor. Judge Nathan Erasmus declared in the judgement that the provision of these toilets were unlawful and breaking the constitutional right to dignity. The court ruled The City of Cape Town to cover all the toilets, which were part of the Silvertown upgrade projects. The city of Cape Town was taken to court by the African National Congress Youth League (ANCYL), after a complaint to the South African Human Rights Commission (SAHRC) on behalf of community members. After investigating the matter the SAHRC concluded the City had violated section 10 of the constitution, the fundamental right to dignity, and also section 26 by not implementing the housing project in a reasonable manner (Mail and Guardian 2011).

The report from the SAHRC referred to the Grootboom case (SAHRC 2010: section 5.11-5.14, 5.16), and stated it was ground-breaking in terms of the justice of socio-economic rights in South Africa (SAHRC 2010: section 5.11). This case was about Irene Grootboom and a group of others who had been forcefully removed from land they had moved to. They moved there because of poor conditions on the land they were living, while waiting in a queue for low-cost housing. The land they were evicted from was in addition allocated for this purpose (Constitutional Court of South Africa 2000: section 3, 4). The court ordered that their constitutional rights had been violated, in terms of no provision of housing for people without a roof over their heads, living in unbearable conditions, and without access to land, as well as those in a situation of crisis (Constitutional Court of South Africa 2000: section 99). This case was the first case where the Constitutional Court judged that the state had not fulfilled its obligations and compelled the state to act on socio-economic grounds (Joubert 2008).

This inquiry into policing in Khayelitsha shows that social movements are able to through litigation address concerns in the community. The allegations were by the commission found rightful, and a series of recommendations were made (Khayelitsha Commission Report 2014:xxv-xxvii). The case have been reported in the media, and brought attention to the issue which furthers debate. The joint effort of the complainant organisations have been able to hold the state accountable for inefficiencies and poor treatment. As Nyoko writes, in giving a voice to ordinary citizens, this furthers democracy. In Makhaza, toilet walls were constructed, but the Khayeltisha police inquiry must also transform into real change in the SAPS and the relationship between the people and the police.

6.5 SANCO, communication and power relations

Within participatory development planning, communication, and an understanding of power relations is of importance (Mogale 2003:221). Of the

civil society organisations that were leading the anti-apartheid movement, the main element were known as *civics*. These were neighbourhood organisations which were originally efforts of self-provisioning in black township communities, who became powerful in the resistance against the apartheid state in the 1980's. They led several protests and boycotts which were important in bringing the apartheid government to negotiations. The *civics* organisational structure was built by street and area committees which answered to popular assemblies and therefore pointed to participatory democracy. Because of the strength of the *civics*, South Africa is the only country where the democratic transition involved grassroots organisations. The South African National Civic Organisation is an umbrella organisation for the *civics*, and played an important role in the creation of urban policy, such as the Local Government Transition Act which places local government as an independent part of government (Heller 2013:53).

SANCO Local in Khayelitsha have block committees and street committees, where the block committee members are elected by the branch, and the street committee members are elected by the block committee. The street and block committee have meetings weekly, and each Sunday there is a general meeting where representatives of the committees and the central office in Khayelitsha discuss problems and challenges. Mtotywa and Mfazwe explained that they collect information and communicate this to the ward councillor, regarding issues such as unemployment, or the need for recreation activities for kids who have little to do, because they can fall into drug use. They said SANCO also brings information to people locally, for example would send a representative to the COP in Durban, the climate meeting, that could bring information to lower levels of the organisation so people can learn more about the challenges of climate change (Interview Mtotywa and Mfazwe 2011). Christopher Kibiti was positive to the street committee, and said it is working well, and that it is a good system. He says they have meetings and people can contact them, and then they will take the issues to the ward councillor (Interview Kibiti 2011).

There has been a debate about SANCO and civics, and their role and weakening since apartheid. They are playing a less important role nationally and provincially, but locally they are a major part of community politics in townships in Cape Town. They are part of mediating relations between ward councillors, residents and city officials, and also NGO's and market actors which deal with development issues and service delivery. In Delft they therefore played a role of gatekeepers in the community. Criticism has also been directed at the role of the civics in South Africa. Millstein writes that the civics who played an important role in the fight against apartheid, have had difficulties finding their role after apartheid (Millstein 2008:133), and also describes conflicts in relation to SANCO locally in Delft, Cape Town. She writes that there is mistrust between organisations and actors, and community activists feel discriminated against by SANCO related to racial issues, as Delft is a community which inhabits both black and coloured people. (Millstein 2008:185-187).

Party politics is structured along racial lines, and SANCO is perceived as a black organisation, because of this coloured activists, and also some black activists, felt that coloured people were excluded from decision-making in Delft South. There were also many conflicts between the ward councillors and SANCO, which could indicate elite power struggles concerning access to resources and control over these. The residents were not always content with the leadership role of SANCO, especially in Delft South were the leadership attempted to control community projects and resources, however they still relied on the SANCO street committees in everyday life. Millstein writes that lower levels of the SANCO organisation has more legitimacy than higher levels, and the street committees played an important role in crime prevention, security and conflict resolution. They could for example be involved in making sure that illegal sales and transfers of houses happened without conflict. This shows local informal governance structures, which played a central role in the resident's daily life (Millstein 2008:186-187).

Councillor Nqulwana means it is important to work with the street committee and SANCO, and explains that if you work with them things will be more effective.

He means if you agree with SANCO your political life will be easy, and if you disagree with them it will be difficult. If you want to act on something, you have to ground it with SANCO first. They can speak with their branches and pass the information on, and in this way relations with the community can be built. In order to bring up a case you must be able to convince them (Interview Nqulwana 2011). This can point to certain power relations, because the councillor is dependant on the cooperation of SANCO local to be able to address an issue. The SJC also worked with SANCO, and said that if they are having a door to door campaign, they speak with SANCO first to clarify that they are not a political party and make themselves known up front (Interview Bregman 2011). this could be in line with the gatekeeper role described by Millstein.

According to SANCO Local an example of a problem that the street committee can solve is if there is an argument between two people in the community on small issues, they can bring this to the street committee and they can try to resolve it. If they cannot resolve it, they will then bring it to the branch executive who can try to meddle and decide in the conflict. In case of criminal problems, this must be reported to the police, but people will also report it to SANCO (Interview Mfazwe and Mtotywa 2011).

In the interviews with local people the role of SANCO as a mediator, and involved in conflict solving is described. Mpho Lekau said people contact the street committee if they have a problem with their neighbour, or kids stealing things from their property. If you are applying for a grant such as a child, disabled or elderly grant, you need a proof of your address, and this you can get from SANCO. They write a proof that they know where you live, and stamp it (Interview Lekau 2011).

In the additional information, from the shorter interviews there were also critical views. Camilla Asikho who lived in an informal settlement meant it is not easy to contact the street committee and that they can be difficult. They can say you can build a house in one place and then change their minds and say it should be

another place Interview Asikho 2011). Ethel Nosicelo said that you can go to the ward councillor if you have a problem with the street committee (Interview Nosicelo 2011), indicating that there could be conflicts.

The relations between SANCO and the formal channels could make it confusing for people were to address concerns. Nombulelo Ntsali had been in touch with the street committee, but she said it takes time for issues to be solved. She had contacted them about a child that was not going to school. She lived with her grandmother because her mother was dead, and she did not have a birth certificate. The street committee had told her to go to the child services. She means the system would be better if it was more straight forward, and you did not have to go to one office and them another, but could go straight to the source. People have little money for transport, so this can make it difficult (Interview Ntsali 2011).

The SANCO were agents of change at the end of apartheid, in being part of the transition as representatives of the grassroots, and in shaping policy. The organisation of SANCO in Khayelitsha reflects a democratic structure as was present during the fight against apartheid, and the activities of street and block committees shows that the organisation is still a big part of the local community. They can be a mediating structure between the community and the ward councillor.

On the other side there seem to be difficulties in the relations between the councillors and SANCO. SJC also had to relate to SANCO in their campaigns for example. This role as a gatekeeper can make it more difficult for the councillor to address issues and can be limiting for other civil society organisations such as the SJC. All though this thesis focuses on formal and civil society channels, SANCO seems to have an informal governance role which set rules for the community, as Millstein discusses. The informal governance mechanisms were seen in their involvement with placement of houses, and such mechanisms can make it confusing for the residents where they should direct different matters.

7. Political participation and development

In Khayelitsha there are problems such as poverty, housing, unemployment, sanitation and crime (Interview Mpho 2011), but even if there are many serious problems, there is also hope and people finding solutions to the problems. The issues are connected in different ways and are difficult to solve. In this chapter I will discuss how development is being promoted through channels for political participation in the township. Firstly, I will look at development issues present in Khayelitsha relating to the UN-HABITAT's definition of a slum household. Secondly I will discuss how political participation is connected to the concept of agency, and finally aspects of political equality.

7.1 Meeting needs and socio-economic rights

Within sustainable development meeting the needs of the present is prioritized and this is important in another development theory as well. In South Africa the proportion of people living under the national poverty line is 23 per cent, and the proportion of people living in urban slums is also 23 per cent (Globalis 2015). Economic growth has been positive in South Africa, and the proportion of people living in extreme poverty has gone down (Millstein 2013), it is now 13,8 per cent (Globalis 2015). However, the socio-economic inequality has continued to increase, and analytics mean the growth is not high enough for the country to reach goals of welfare and redistribution (Millstein 2013). According to Seekings the rural and urban poor have little power and they are missing land, jobs, good health and good education. Although there has been more redistribution through welfare programs, and services have been improved and subsidized (Seekings 2009:150).

The UN-HABITAT's definition of a slum settlement is a household which is suffering one of these five criteria: 1) no access to adequate water sources, 2) no

access to adequate sanitary services, 3) no steady income, 4) no lasting materials for buiding houses and 5) inadequate living space. Many households are missing one or more of these points, although it is rare that all five are missing from a household (Maseland 2010:27). In the following I will look closer at these aspects.

7.1.1 Water and sanitation rights

Ethel Nosicelo thinks there should be better sanitation and better provision of water (Nosicelo 2011). In Khayelitsha 38 per cent of households do not have access to piped water in their dwelling or inside their yard, and 28 per cent do not have access to a flush toilet connected to the public sewer system. 10 per cent do not have any toilet facility (City of Cape Town 2013).

Mobilization for rights can even happen when rights are enshrined in the constitution and are part of national and international norms and policy declarations. The relationship between rights "on paper" and rights "in practice" is not linear, and there is not necessarily a causal connection between mobilizing for rights and achieving these rights. Regarding policies for water provision in South Africa, sins of omission are preventing access to the right to water for many vulnerable groups. This is also because there is a lack of financial resources, low institutional capacity and not enough knowledge of rights, resulting in that the rights are not claimed and realised by citizens. There are also sins of commission in the collision of policies of free basic water (FBW) and privatisation and cost-recovery (Mehta, Thompson and Nleya 2010:114-115).

South Africa is among seven countries who acknowledge the human right to water both in the constitution and through policies. Recognizing this right is not the norm, and the FBW policy is not conventional in water politics, where cost-recovery mechanisms are underlined. The FBW policy was considered from the beginning of 2000, at the Department for Water Affairs and Forestry, and was part of the ANC program for local government elections in September 2000. The

government stated in February 2001 that there would be provision of 6000 litres of safe water per month, which was free, to all households, and according to the Water Services Act 108 from 1997 a level of basic water should be afforded to those who are unable to pay for the services (Mehta, Thompson and Nleya 2010:116).

All though the right to water has been promoted in the constitution and this was ground breaking, there are contradictions in policies and water management, where privatisation, commercialisation and cost-recovery have been part of these. The state mediation of socio-economic rights are on one side enforcing rights (FBW) and on the other side undermining them by for example installing water meters. The state has a regulatory role, and this policy has been built on a semi-consensus between multilateral and bilateral agencies, which has spread in poor and middle-income countries. Therefore policy changes induced by the World Bank has been commenced parallel to the commitments to free basic water. This includes disconnection of water to non-paying customers, which has been related to health conditions such as cholera. The water provision limit per household was found unconstitutional in a court case where five unemployed applicants went to court against the City of Johannesburg in 2008, in addition highlighting that people's mobilisation and agency can serve in challenging administrative decisions which are unjust and unequitable, especially when the case is supported by the judiciary (Mehta, Thompson and Nleya 2010:115,116-118).

The Imvula Iyeza- Official Newsletter of the Department of Water Affairs Western Cape Region, writes that in 2011 the City of Cape Town was assessed by the Blue Drop and Green Drop certification programmes, who assess the drinking water quality and waste water services respectively, to be among the top ten performing municipalities in the country. Regarding waste water management the top seven places were given to municipalities from the Western Cape, with City of Cape Town on the seventh place (Rayi 2011:8). The newsletter encourages residents of Cape Town to use water sparingly, as there are few alternatives for

surface water development, which can increase water supply to the City of Cape Town and municipalities surrounding the City (Imvula Iyeza 2011:12). They write that the City of Cape Town has invested in:

> *Infrastructural upgrades and replacements, water metering, water pressure management among other measures to reduce their water losses (…)* (Imvula Iyeza 2011:12).

This means that water meters have been introduced in Cape Town. The internet page for water affairs for the City of Cape Town shows that 6000 litres of water per month is provided free of charge while above this limit there are charges according to steps. However there is a system for indigent households, meaning that there is provided 6000 litres and in addition 4500 litres of water free of charge (City of Cape Town 2014[2]). This means that there is a tariff system, although this was deemed unconstitutional, but there is an added provision of water for indigent households which could indicate that demands for water have been heard.

One of the issues the SJC worked with was sanitation and a brochure told about some of the problems. Nosakhe Thethafuthi experienced sewerage that would flow outside the house, and her grandchildren would play be the sewerage because they did not have anywhere else to play. The three youngest got sick with diarrhoea, and in July 2009 and May 2010 two of them, twins, had to go to hospital. She says that after the SJC had been campaigning, City officials improved the problem and stopped the leaking. In South Africa over 100 children may die every day because of diarrhoeal diseases. This can be improved up to 40 per cent by better sanitation. In addition tests of a canal going through the RR section had E. coli levels 500 times higher that the "high risk" level (Social Justice Coalition 2011:14,16).

7.1.2 Unemployment and housing

One of the biggest challenges is unemployment (Millstein 2013). Unemployment is high in South Africa at 25 per cent (Globalis 2015). The unemployment rate in Khayelitsha according to the 2011 Census is 38 per cent. Bregman means the number is higher, that there is about 50 per cent unemployment in Khyelitsha (Interview Bregman 2011). Seekings write that unemployment is a driver of poverty and there is no direct protection against unemployment by the welfare state. The South African state has not addressed the challenges of job-creation or extending the welfare state to help those who cannot work because there are no jobs (Seekings 2009:148). Bregman says the unemployed are mostly young people who have left school and are looking for work. He says people want to work, but there are not enough opportunities, and that the government is not offering enough opportunities for people. He means this can lead to problems with social issues such as domestic abuse (Interview Bregman 2011).

About job creation the councillor thinks the ward councilors must help in providing space for employment and decide on projects that will create lasting and sustainable jobs. This is their core business within job creation. For example by initiating projects to make sidewalks or create parks and greenery, these decisions can provide jobs. The majority of the unemployed are youth, and he would like them to organize themselves to start fundraising or projects. (Interview Nqulwana 2011).

Lekau thinks one of the main problems in Khyelitsha is a lack of housing (Interview Jrdana 2011). According to Pithouse the many slum dwellings in South Africa illustrate the negative consequenses of the elite transition in South Africa. The settlements are the reason for the many protests which have been against the government since 2004, and often locally organised. These areas have also been an important place for the largest resistance movements of the poor such as Abahlali baseMjondolo, landless People's Movement and the Treatment Action Campaign. (Pithouse 2010:35).

Abahlali baseMjondolo was started in 2005 and the goal was to create politics for the poor, developed and realized by the poor. Their protests were striked down by the police and forbidden without law. In spite of this they have been fighting evictions and become part of public debate. They were able to achieve that the Slums Act was declared against the constitution, an act which made any illegal occupation of land or resistance of eviction criminal. The state has now changed their decision of eradicating slum settlements, but have not decided on an alternative (Pithouse 2010:38-39).

Lekau says the government is aware of the problems but they are not attending to them, and that the same issues are found all over South Africa. For example in Soweto in Johannesburg, the problems are the same (Interview Lekau 2011)

7.1.3 Everyday life

Attention toward the issue of slums can be negative and it is important to remember that the material conditions are only part of the truth. The informal settlements also represent access to the city with prospects for work or education, or other activities. There is also the everyday life, and this dualism is important in an analysis, and creates a need for seeing both the positive aspects of the settlements, and the negative side such as a lack of government support to people in these areas (Pithouse 2010:35-36). In Khayelitsha I also got the sense of everyday life. People going to work, shopping groceries, kids going to school, or playing in the street. The newspapers reflected this as well with happy news, in between the news which were more serious.

These news included a story of a Khayelitsha school who took part in a choir competition. The Harry Gwala High School got third place in the Cape Town International Airport local school choir competition. Ten finalists took part in the week long event, and all ten schools will be part of a CD issued at the airport. The winner was Settlers Way High School and the second place went to Jan van Riebeek High School. The schools choir master Mhlalisi Nungeka said it was a

great experience for the children to be in a competition with other pupils from different backgrounds. The communications manager for Cape Town International Airport, Deirdre Davids said that they have great talent in the country (Vukani 2011).

Another article was about students being introduced to engineering. This article says students from the Centre of Science and Technology in Khayelitsha received the performance trophy and the research quality award in the regional leg of the biggest science and technology competition in the world, the First Lego League. It took place at the University of Western Cape, and in the Robotics Challenge the task was to find solutions to the global energy crisis. The competition aimed at creating more interest in science, engineering and technology (Vukani 2011).

The City vision Khayelitsha writes that Radio Zibonele is calling for nominations to their board of directors. They will host a bi-annual general meeting and is inviting community organisations to send in nominations for people they would like to be part of the radio's board of directors. This is a new approach to nominating the board, and the station manager Mzamo Ngomana, call for organisation to nominate people who have the expertise and competency to be in charge of the community radio vision (City Vision Khayelitsha 2001).

7.2 Agency

Previously participation and empowerment has been identified as one of the key concepts of human development (Alkire and Deneulin 2009:29-30). In this section I will discuss how political participation in Khayelitsha fits into this perspective as part of the human development approach. Regarding processes where people act as agents, as individuals or groups, such processes are present in Khayelitsha, in different shapes. I will here link the understanding of participation and empowerment in the human development approach, which

includes an agent perspective, with the concept of *agency* in the capability approach.

Civil society organisations is a way of acting as a group, such as the Social Justice Coalition. Regarding the definition of an agent, of acting and bringing about change, one can say that this is important to the SJC. Pressing the government on important issues to the community, and pushing for changes is central to the movement. Since the issues they deal with is informed by the community locally, this can be a way for people to pursue goals they value, following the definition of agency. The SJC are working towards the government, and can therefore be agents in acting and bringing about change. Taking action about issues in the community is part of this, and getting the City to acknowledge problems is a step on the way to change, and also to influencing development in the community. Holding seminars where people can discuss issues about the city, is part of public debate, and in line with a human development view.

Abalimi Bezekhaya is an organisation which promotes agency. Through holding government workshops and advising government they participate in political issues, which can have implications of influencing decisions and development in the community. They work with empowerment through small scale farming projects. In giving training about small-scale urban agriculture they create jobs and increase food security. The organisation's newsletter told the story of 31 year old Khangela who together with friends started a garden on the grounds of a school. They were unemployed and decided they did not want to wait for jobs and with Abalimi's help they began with farming. Their hope and aim is to become successful micro-farmers who can produce food for their families, and earn a living from farming (Abalimi Bezekhaya Newsletter 2011). In giving people an opportunity to become micro-farmers and creating employment they are increasing capability by helping in pursuing and realizing goals. Relating to the dimension of participation and empowerment described in the human development approach this does increase the freedom to make decisions in issues that affect their lives, and to influence development in the community.

About the ward councillor and ward committee, in terms of capability, there is a divide between capabilities and functionings in the issue of participation. On one side there is one opinion that people are not participating because they are disappointed in the lack of services such as the ward councillor claims, and Stofile means that people are part of the problem because they have lost trust in politicians. This refers to people's functionings as the actions of people, what they chose to do. On the other hand, another opinion is that people are people are not participating because of the lack of space for participation. That there is no room for voices from the community, or that councillors are not available, which would refer to capabilitites, as freedom to be able to participate, or what actions are possible.

Regarding protests, in a human development perspective people are here acting in a group, and protests can be part of holding others accountable to promises, in this case the government. In response to violent protest a monitoring group was started to address problems with a housing project. People are here finding new ways of engaging with the state and holding them accountable. In case the structures and actors in the political environment may have been limiting agency, the monitoring group is furthering agency by the creativity of the people involved. The increse in protests in Africa in general is in line with this and can show that people wish to be able to affect decisions.

The presence of SANCO in the local community and the communicating role they have, as well as the important role they had at the end of apartheid would indicate that they are part of furthering participation and encouraging debate, which is part of the agency principle. However it seems they also have a lot of power in relation to the councillors and other civil society organisations, and could influence which issues will be part of the political agenda. There is an indication that they have an informal governance role, so residents have to relate to them on different issues. Because of these questions, agency could be limited for the councillor and civil society organisations, and the power confusion and

the gatekeeper role could therefore be limiting for capability and agency in local politics in Khayelitsha.

In relation to human development the Makhaza case and the Khayelitsha Police Inquiry shows that litigation is a way of holding others accountable, and influencing decisions affecting one's life, and The Grootboom case also shows this. People are here active subjects of their own destiny, being agents of change. This is part of acting and bringing about change, and the ability to pursue and realize goals, in line with the capability principle.

7.3 Political equality

The five criteria for political decision-making in turn determine political equality, and the first of these is effective participation (Deneulin 2009:187,188). In Khayelitsha there are possibilities to make your opinion known to others about a policy, before this policy is adopted, through the media for example. The media is a place where you can write, and one of the local newspapers printed a letter about political issues. There are the meetings called by the councillor or IDP meetings, and in the IDP process you can express how you wish policies should be. You can contact the councillor regarding this process or about other issues you want to address. However there is criticism about a possibilities for participation and that the politicians do not want to hear from the community which could be an hindrance to effective participation.

The second criteria is voting equality (Deneulin 2009:187), and there are free and fair elections in South Africa which are held regularly and have multiparty competition and everyone has the right to vote (Seekings 2009:134), therefore this criteria would be reached. On the other hand voting can be influenced by isuues such as clientelism (Deneulin 2009:200). An article in City Vision Khayelitsha is about residents in ward 33 in Philippi who received food parcels as Christmas presents from their Councillor. Councillor Mxolisi Mzalisi gave groceries to about 30 disadvantaged families and said his programme is part of

alleviating poverty in the community. He had started the programme the year before when he was a chairperson in the ANCYL, and increased the number of families this year (City Vision Khayelitsha 2011:6). Although helping the disadvantaged is fundamentally a good thing, this situation can cause people who received the food parcels to feel obligated to vote for this councillor at the next election.

When it comes to enlightened understanding, the third criteria (Deneulin 2009:187) educational levels could influence learning about different policies and outcomes of these. There could be children not attending school, or leaving school at a lower level which can influence knowledge about policies. In my additional information two of the interviewees were teenagers (13 and 15) who were not in school, but working at home and at a local market (Interview Asikho and Wolwethu 2011). One interviewee also told about a case of a child not going to school, as written earlier (Interview Ntsali 2011).

There can also be language difficulties as Xhosa is the most spoken language in Khayelitsha, and most of the media uses English. Lower educational levels can affect language skills and in turn the ability to read newspapers for example. The newspapers had a few articles in Xhosa, but mostly they were in English. Although the literacy rate in South Africa is 93% (CIA 2015) meaning that most people would be able to understand information about policies. Knowledge about different issues is important, and Bregman means it is important to promote active citizenship and get people involved, and that with more information on issues people can criticize and ask questions. (Interview Bregman 2011).

Another criteria of political decision-making is about being able to decide the agenda and change it (Deneulin 2009:187). The cases discussed in the previous chapter show that this is possible. This can be influenced by a lack of space for participation. Millstein writes that neo-liberal political ideas in combination with narrower participation such as top-down communication is part of "institutional and political fragmentation" (Millstein 2008:273). Through civil society there has

been an influence on the agenda about sanitation (Interview Bregman 2011). Litigation can be a way of deciding and changing the agenda, although there can be difficulties in pursuing this route, if there are not enough resources to follow it, which can be a problem in marginalised areas.

The results of the litigation is also dependent on real change for the people involved. The Mail and Guardian writes that in 2008, Irene Grootboom died, still homeless and penniless. Her legal representative at the time of the case, Ismael Jamie, said that the fact that Grootboom died homeless demonstrates that civil society and the legal system failed her (Joubert 2008). Therefore the litigation process that granted her and the community the right to houses, did not transform into change in Grootboom's life. As Nyoko writes, there is still a question whether the Khayelitsha police investigation results in changes in the organisation and actions of the police.

This criteria could in addition be affected by social issues, crime and poverty, if people are in a difficult situation because of violence and abuse, or deep poverty it can be harder to engage in political issues and address issues to the government (Briggs 2008:263-264). Vukani writes that members of the Mitshell's Plain police station handed out pamphlets on a walk to and from Khayelitsha police station to highlight the 16 Days of Activism Against Women and Children Abuse campaign from November 25. To December 10. Constable Jerome Voegt explains the communities are working together with them in fighting abuse of women and children (Mpalanshane 2011:22). Women and child abuse was stated as the main issue in Khayelitsha in one interview (Interview Asikho 2011).

The final criteria about whether all (or most) citizens have the rights according to the criteria (Deneulin 2009:87). Partly they are fulfilled, but there are some challenges as well. Although the channels for participation are there, and there is in principle voting equality, issues such as educational levels, top-down approaches, and poverty and crime can contribute to not fulfilling the criteria, and therefore a lack of political equality.

8. Connections: political participation, democracy and development

The awareness of connections, and the rights and responsibilities that derive from them is important (Shiva 2005:1). This chapter will focus on the connections between theories of participatory democracy and development theory related to development. I will start by discussing issues of social justice and inequality, and the political historical reasons for inequality in South Africa. Then I will look at connections between another development and political participation, and following this freedom and social sustainability.

8.1 Social justice and issues of inequality

One of the dimensions of sustainable development is social justice within generations, nationally and globally (Langhelle 2006:235), and Macpherson argues a prerequisite for participatory democracy is reducing social and economical inequality (Grugel 2002:24). Africa is the continent with the fastest economic growth. At the same time almost 80 per cent of the population on the continent can be described as poor. Close to half of all people are earning less than 1,25 dollar a day, while another 30 per cent are earning between 1,25 dollar to 2,50 dollar a day. Only between 1-2 per cent of Africa's population has an income of 54 dollars or more per day. Therefore the slogan of the Occupy Wall Street movement, "we are the 99 per cent", fits especially well in Africa, where a few are getting richer and the majority are falling behind (Johnstad 2013:4).

Even if the economy is growing, poverty is also growing, for example in Nigeria the number of people characterized as poor increased between 1992 to 2010, from 80 million to 130 million. This happened at the same as oil revenue doubled. Parallel with this development, civil protest has also been increasing, without the same attention. Johnstad asks what is good news from Africa, the

economic growth or that poverty is down to 48 per cent? She means good news are the new movements, millions marching the streets with demands to the leaders, and protesting with non-violence (Johnstad 2013:4-6).

Just arriving in Cape Town you become aware of the great differences between rich and poor. Taking a taxi from the airport you see the shacks on the side of the highway on the way in to town. Arriving in Long Street where I stayed in the beginning of fieldwork, there are cafés and restaurants, and shops lining the street. On the way to the Waterfront, a shopping area with restaurants and walkways along the sea, way you pass by tall buildings which house banks and other companies.

I also visited another township called Imizamo Yethu, which means "our struggle". Located on a hillside the little informal settlement houses were gathered together and were very visible driving across the Cape Town peninsula, being a contrast to the villas scattered around in the valley below the shanty town. Here people had built houses and fought to be able to stay which is how it has gotten the name. While in for example Camps Bay another place in Cape Town, luxury villas roll down towards the sea, and restaurants line the promenade along the beach. Going from Khayelitsha and back to central Cape Town made inequalities clear, and they seemed to be different worlds. However some things had changed and in Summer Greens, an area previously a white area during apartheid, was now an area inhabited mainly by black people, and seemed to be more of a middle class area.

Constantia is one of the most affluent areas in Cape Town, and compared to Khayelitsha the census says there are 0,14 per cent living in informal settlements and 84,72 per cent living in a house on a separate stand of yard. 94 per cent has a water pipe inside their dwelling, and the percentage of unemployed is 1,76. In income statistics the largest group has an income of between R6401-R25 600 at 35 per cent. There are 87 per cent white people living in the area and 33 per cent has higher education (City of Cape Town 2015).

Christopher Kibiti means inequality will always be there, the white people are the rich. He thinks they will never be equal, and that the shacks will continue to be there for the rest of their lives (Interview Kibiti 2011). To make inequalities better in South Africa, Lekau thinks there should be provided employment for everyone and better salaries. She means people are being paid less than what they are worth and companies are exploiting them. She also means there should be better distribution of land, that the majority of people do not have land, while a few rich people own most of the land (Inerview Lekau 2011).

About inequality and political participation, Mfazwe means that it is often the case that the poor will remain poor, and they are not satisfied. The government must create more jobs, and there should be contributions from the government to the poorest of the poor. This will help in decreasing crime. People demand a better life, but how can they do so without money, asks Mfazwe. He means job creation is important, and also basic services such as water and sanitation, and electricity. This is what government should focus on. A large proportion of Khyelitsha lives in informal settlements and there are problems with deseases such as TB. Government cannot help this without drastic measures (Interview Mfazwe and Mtotywa 2011). Monde Nqulwana thinks political participation is sometimes just on paper, and issues such as inequality cannot be addressed politically. He means there should be created space for non-political people to participate, otherwise the inequalities will remain (Interview Nqulwana 2011).

8.1.1 Political historical reasons for inequality and poverty

Pithouse argues that many do not situate poverty in an historical and political context (Pithouse 2010:37). Housing is one of the most important issues in Cape Town (Millstein 2008:23). This issue is very relevant for Khayelitsha, because a large part of the inhabitants live in informal settlements as shown by the census (City of Cape Town 2013). Housing conditions are also closely connected with other conditions such as water, sanitation and electricity. On the political side

councilor Nqulwana claims informal settlements make it difficult to provide services such as water and electricity, because these are areas where people are not supposed to be living (Interview Nqulwana 2011). However, according to Joel Bregman there is a lack of resources, partly because the city views Khayelitsha as a temporary settlement, and do not want to use resources for services (Interview Bregman 2011).

Cape Town was the first of South African cities to suffer the physical segregation of residential areas during apartheid. The slums in the city are the most contrasted manifestation of the horribly divided and unequal society (Minister of Housing Lindiwe Sisulu in Millstein 2008:16). Cape Town has been described as one of the most unequal cities in South Africa, and there is a major housing crisis facing the city. During apartheid the population was divided into racial categories, and Bantustans or homelands were created fort the black population. They were not citizens of South Africa, but of the homelands which were again divided according to ethnic groups. There were originally mixed residential neighbourhoods in Cape Town for a long time, in close distance to the city centre. Then, apartheid policies changed the city dramatically and the Group Areas Act of 1950 defined the city centre as a white area, and coloured people were removed by force. The black population were not allowed access to the city, apart from as migrant workers (Millstein 2008:16,18).

There were constructed a few black townships, but services and housing was limited. Despite the influx control to the city, black people travelled to the city such as men without work permits, wives and children of workers, and settled in informal settlements and backyard shacks. The politics towards these settlements was expulsion and they were in danger of demolition of shacks at any time, and people without work permits would be returned to the homelands (Millstein 2008:19). After apartheid it was a major challenge for the democratic government to deal with the fragmented spaces created during this period. They had to restructure the city, and address the racially divided structures, and millions of

people, mostly the black population were in a situation of extreme poverty after the end of the regime (Millstein 2008: 19,22-23).

The abolition on movement restriction at the end of the 1980's and democratisation from 1990 resulted in a stream of people moving to the cities searching for opportunities. This also impacted the housing crisis, which constitutes one of the most visible legacies of the urban policy during the apartheid regime. During democratisation the housing issue was one of the essential issues, and is still a critical issue in the country. Because of the fight against apartheid communities have a history of mobilisation and collective action (Millstein 2008:23).

The current housing crisis has come from a neglect of the housing situation and has origins in the exclusionary politics of the past. There was a minimal effort to provide housing for the black population. The first black township in Cape Town was Langa, after this Nyanga and Gugulethu was built, here there were however a basic level of services. Beginning at the end of the 1970's local housing struggles became significant in the city's anti-apartheid movement. The racial divisions constructed by the apartheid government still characterise Cape Town (Millstein 2008:23-24), and the

> *"us and them" constructions influence place-based politics of resource allocation, participation and decision-making and this has been extremely difficult to overcome* (Millstein 2008:24).

8.2 Endogenous development and participation

There are some common points between definitions of political participation and theory of another development. Another development describes endogenous development, where the local community should be the starting point of development, and should decide the visions and values this should be grounded in (Smukkestad 2005:146). The definition of public participation from the ILO, says

that this is an effort by the people concerned to join together their resources to achieve objectives set for themselves, on the background of their own thinking and over which they exercise control (Theron 2009:115). This is connected with the idea of "bottom-up" democracy described by Banik and Shiva.

Sen describes three ways in which democracy enriches the lives of citizens. Firstly, political freedom is part of human freedom, and the exercising of civil and political rights is an essential part of the life of individuals as social beings. There is an intrinsic value in political and social participation, for human life and well-being, and it is a great deprivation to be hindered in participating in the political life of the community. Secondly, democracy has an instrumental value which is important for forwarding the expression and support of people's claims and bringing them to political attention (Sen 1999:10). Thirdly, exercising democracy gives an opportunity for citizens to learn from each other, and *helps society to form its values and priorities* (Sen 1999:10).

In this context, if the visions and values of the local community should be the foundation for development, and political participation focuses on reaching objectives set by people themselves, the practice of democracy is important in fulfilling this. This is because democracy is vital in expressing and supporting rights, and because it is central in forming the values and priorities which can be the basis for development.

People in Khayelitsha expressed a wish for more possibilities for participation. Mcosana means more participation is a good thing because you can weigh ideas against each other and find common points between people. From that you can find the most important issues that people are dealing with. She thinks there should be more participation (Interview Mcosana 2011). Nosicelo says there should be better channels for participation. She means nothing is happening, the local politicians say they will talk to people about the problems but nothing is changing (Interview Nosicelo 2011). Jrdana says it is a process that takes time, and a budget needs to be made. She says politicians mostly listen when they are

making a budget, but that there could be more channels to participate, such as more organized meetings (Interview Jrdana 2011).

There is also a connection between endogenous development and the definition by Mogale about citizen participation. An aspect of endogenous development is to give back control to indigenous peoples and other marginalized groups (Smukestad 2005:147), and Mogale's definition includes an increase of control over resources and institutions, particularly to those excluded from such control (Mogale 2003:220). In the case of Khayelitsha, especially after the political history of South Africa, the people in Khayelitsha have become marginalized and political participation can be a way of returning control to the marginalized, which is largely the black population.

Mosibudi Mangena, former science and technology minister writes in the Mail and Guardian that genuine hopes of a new dawn have been crushed and South Africa has been reduced to a protest society. People in the country are confused over corruption and indirect indications of this, since senior officials have been suspended from the National Prosecuting Authority, the South African Revenue Service and the Hawks (corruption police, own remark), and in addition the debate over Nkandla. It is now 25 years since the unbanning of the political organisations which fought for freedom, this started a series of events which made possible negotiations for a political settlement and the forming of the Constitution (Mangena 2015).

This political event changed the direction of South African politics, towards a free and democratic society. There were expectations that the new dawn, especially for the oppressed black population, would mean an end to the poverty, social degradation and landlessness they were facing. There was hope that it would lead to a truly non-racial society, the prosperity would be shared fairly, and the dignity of the black majority would be restored. Mangena writes that unfortunately, 25 years later South Africa has become a protest society, where strikes and protests happen so often and are so many that people are accustomed

to them. One of the major concerns of the black majority was the issue of land reform, which was a central element in the freedom struggle. Land dispossession was the cornerstone in the system of oppression and impoverishment of the black population, and this system continued for centuries of colonialism, however the government has not made much progress in in this area (Mangena 2015).

The issue of land distribution was mentioned in interviews, Lekau said there should be better distribution of land, because the majority of people do not have land while a few rich people own most of the land (Interview Lekau 2011). Councillor Nqulwana meant that after 2014, which is the end of the transition period, some issues will become more pressing such as the issue of land reform. These issues have been on wait, because in 1994 they decided to bring them up gradually. At that time he said in 2014 they will maybe come into question and he is worried about political instability around this issue (Interview Nqulwana 2011).

Corruption was also brought to attention. Thembeke Mcosana thinks the government is aware of the problems in Khayelitsha, but she means many people working in government are dishonest. There is a lot of government fraud and corruption. She means the system of power is destructive and that people in power use their power unnecessary. They justify this with democracy even though they are doing the wrong thing. If someone is caught doing something wrong they will go into defense instead of accepting that what they did was wrong, and blame it for example on culture (Interview Mcosana 2011).

There have been discussions about corruption for example the security upgrades to Zuma's Nkandla homestead, which have exceeded budgets from originally 27,8 million rand in 2009 to a projected total of 270 million rand in October 2012. Documents reveal that money has been moved from other programs to accommodate the spending and that there was little cost control and no budget limit allocated on the project (Mail and Guardian/AmaBunghane 2013[1]). Only five per cent of the costs will be paid by Zuma (Mail andGuardian/AmaBunghane

2013[2]), however many of the upgrades will benefit the president long after he leaves office. They include a cattle yard, a plant nursery, a road network, (Mail and Guardian/AmaBunghane 2013[1]) and landscaping costing 14,3 million rand (Mail and Guardian/AmaBunghane 2013[2]).

8.3 Freedom and participation

Within the human development approach, the principle of participation and empowerment is relating to the freedom to make decisions in issues that affect one's life, the freedom to hold others accountable, and the freedom to influence development in the community (Alkire and Deneulin 2009:30). While Grugel writes that participatory democracy is based on the belief of the importance of activism and freedom (Grugel 2002:23).

There is a general consensus that there is a close relationship between democracy and freedom. Many definitions of democracy apart from minimalist definitions, refers explicitly to different individual freedoms. There is also an assumption that through democracy basic human rights would be promoted such as certain minimum freedoms. Those of expression, assembly, speech and opposition which are critical for elections to be meaningful. In a democracy checks and balances part of the democratic system is expected to ensure citizen's rights and entitlements, and prevent oppression and abuse of power. The association between democracy and freedom is not without complication, and the two concepts should be viewed as distinctive (Banik 2010:85-86).

Although there is criticism towards what has happened since the change to democracy, it is important to remember the positive developments. Stofile thinks a lot has changed since apartheid, and it is a lot better. Not much is hindering you and people have a lot of opportunities, you can also tell your problems (Interview Stofile 2011). According to Kibiti although there are problems with the lack of housing and protests, there is democracy now and people have the right to voice

their grievances. There is a big difference from apartheid to democracy, now you are free to speak and go where you want (Interview Kibiti 2011). The minimum freedoms connected to democracy have been greatly forwarded since the democratic transitions, but freedoms within human development could be at risk, if people do not feel they can influence decisions.

8.4 Social sustainability

Social sustainability refers to how social groups and institutions are involved in and support development initiatives over time (Deneulin 2009:30). In the UN Department of Economic and Social Affairs's definition where participation is a means for development, it is focused on the process where efforts of the people are united with efforts of government to better the communities' economic, social and cultural conditions (Theron 2009:115). Following one interpretation, there is here a connection in that both the definitions relate to people being involved in development efforts. The definition on social sustainability also adds a dimension of time, which is important. To secure political participation and the cooperation between people, government and other institutions over time, gives more stability to these efforts.

9. Conclusion

9.1 Participation in local politics in Khayelitsha and issues of democracy and development

In Khayelitsha, People can participate through formal channels of addressing the ward councillor, the ward committee or being part of development planning, such as the making of the IDP. There was critisism among the participants about these channels, that there is a one sided dialogue, and a lack of space for participation. Another formal channel is litigation, the Human Rights Commission took the case of unenclosed toilets in Makhaza to court and the claim was found rightful. The case of police inefficiency and poor relations between the community and the police was also taken to court and the Khayelitsha Police Inquiry held with the complainants, a group of civil society organisation, one of them the Social Justice Coalition. Therefore the channel of litigation and civil society organisations are linked because the organisations can take the course of litigation.

The organisations I interviewed were the SJC, Abalimi Bezekhaya, and SANCO Khayelitsha. SJC works for rights and better conditions for people in the township. There has been a new wave of social movements, and SJC means can be easier for an organisation to put pressure on government than for a single person. Abalimi Bezekhaya is an organisation who supports people to start small scale urban agriculture, and give advice to the government. SANCO Khayelitsha is a local division of the national civics organisation, which were important in the fight against apartheid. They have street committees, block committees and branches in Khayelitsha, and they communicate with the ward councillors. However, there seem to be some power relations which influence this communication, as the councillor depended on SANCO to be able to address issues.

Of civil society channels there is also protests, and in Khayelitsha there was a protest about housing at the time of my fieldwork. People were tired of governments promises, and wanted housing problems to be addressed. Civil protest is a new tendency on the African continent, and this along with the new social movements, could be an indication that people want to increase opportunities to make decisions about their lives.

In South Africa the socio-economic inequality has increased, and the urban poor have little power. In Khayelitsha 55 per cent live in informal settlements, and relating to elements in the definition of a slum household by the UN-HABITAT, there are problems with regards to this. Water meters could create a conflict between rights on paper and rights in practice, and the situation of sanitation is poor. Unemployment is high in Khayelitsha, and there are not enough opportunities. Housing is also a central issue, and has been the reason for many protests. However, it is also important to remember, that these conditions only form part of the truth, and there is also an everyday life. This dualism is important to remember.

Agency is promoted through SJC, they can bring about change by taking action on issues in the community. Abalimi Bezekhaya are being agents in advising government, and giving people the opportunity to become small-scale farmers they are increasing capability. SANCO could play a limiting role, in deciding the agenda. Litigation is a channel were organisations and actors have been able to hold others accountable in line with a human development principle. Protests are also showing agency, but are not always listened to, and sometimes dramatically struck down. About political equality, although there are many aspects in place, there are also challenges, which could contribute to a lack of political equality.

It is important to be aware of connections, and some of the connections between political participation, democracy and development are reducing inequality, endogenous development, the idea of freedom and social sustainability.

9.2 Limitations of the thesis

The fieldwork in this thesis was conducted three and a half years ago, and therefore much could have changed with regards to political participation in Khayelitsha. There has been a national election in this time, and aspects of the political structure could have changed as a result of this. However, municipal election runs on a different cycle, the last election was in May 2011 (Electoral Commission of South Africa 2011), and the next will be in 2016 (Citypress 2014), therefore there have not been changes in the local governance structures, such as a change of ward councillors.

Since the study is a qualitative study, there is limitation when it comes to generalizations. Although you can draw generalizations from a case study, it is not a representative study, and the results can not directly be transferred to a different population. Because of security issues there were difficulties in moving around which made fieldwork more difficult. There were also difficulties in finding interviewees which could represent local people, party for this reason, and partly because of ethical concerns of choosing interviewees. Therefore the number of local people in the study is limited, and ideally should be higher. There was a limited amount of research done on political participation in Khayelitsha, so comparisons to other studies have also been limited. In this thesis I have looked at formal channels and civil society channels, therefore informal channels for political participation is not discussed at length. Within civil society channels I have chosen three organisations, however there are several organisations which could be relevant, and these are just a few.

9.3 Notes on participation, democracy and development

From the findings of this thesis some issues could be addressed. Formal channels could be more responsive in including voices from the community, and there could be better connections between levels of democracy. Decisions could to a

greater extent include the people, especially since people are protesting and their expectations are not fulfilled. As Banik and Shiva pointed out more focus could be given "bottom-up" approaches, and this could also be a point for future research.

Bibliography

Abalimi Bezekhaya Newsletter (2011) *Newsletter.* No. 38 April 2010-March 2011

AmaBhungane[2]: Mail and Guardian Centre for Investigative Journalism (2013) *Number One emerges as a clear winner.* Available from URL: http://www.amabhungane.co.za/article/2013-07-05-number-one-emerges-a-clear-winner. Downloaded 17.01.2015

AmaBhungane[1]: Mail and Guardian Centre for Investigative Journalism (2013) *The Nkandla documents.* Available from URL: http://amabhungane.co.za/article/2013-07-05-the-nkandla-files. Downloaded 17.01.2015

Alkire, Sabina and Séverine Deneulin (2009) Ch 2 "The Human Development and Capability Approach" in Deneulin, Séverine and Lila Shahani (red.) *An Introduction to the Human Development and Capability Approach: Freedom and Agency.* London: Earthscan

Ballard, Richard (2005) "Ch 4: Social Movements in Post-Apartheid South Africa: An Introduction in Jones, Peris and Kristian Stokke *Democratising Development: The Politics of Socio-Economic Rights in South Africa.* Leiden: Martinus Nijhoff Publishers

Banik, Dan (2010) *Poverty and Elusive Development.* Oslo: Universitetsforlaget

Berg, Bruce L. (2004) *Qualitative Research Methods for the Social Sciences.* Fifth Edition. Boston: Pearson Education Inc

Bigman, David (2011) *Poverty, Hunger and Democracy in Africa: Potential and Limitations of Democracy in Cementing Multiethnic Societies*. Houndmills: Palgrave Macmillan

Blanche, Martin Terre and Kevin Kelly (2002) "Ch 7: ?" in Martin Terre Blanche and Kevin Durrheim (ed.) *Research in Practice: Applied Methods for the Social Sciences.* Cape Town: University of Cape Town Press

Briggs, Xavier de Souza (2008) "Rights, Conflicts and Civic Capacity: Meeting the Needs of Poor Children and Families in Post Apartheid Cape Town" in *Democracy as Problem Solving: Civic Capacities in Communities Across the Globe.* Cambridge: MIT Press

Brockington, Dan and Sian Sullivan (2010) "Ch 4: Qualitiative Research" in Scheyvens, Regina and Donovan Storey (ed.) *Development Fieldwork: A Practical Giude.* London: Sage Publications Ltd

Brynard, Dirk J. (1996) Ch 10 "Planning: the participatory approach" in Bekker, Koos (red.) *Citizen participation in local government.* Pretoria: J.L. van Schaik Publishers

Butler, Anthony (2009) *Contemporary South Africa.* Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan

Cawe, Phiri (2011) "Residents want watch back on the beat" in *Vukani* 17.11.2011

CIA World Factbook (2015) *Africa: South Africa.* Available from URL: https://www.cia.gov/library/publications/the-world-factbook/geos/sf.html. Downloaded 09.01.2015

City of Cape Town (2014) *About Council.* Available from URL: https://www.capetown.gov.za/en/CouncilOnline/Pages/AboutCouncil.aspx. Downloaded 14.01.2015

City of Cape Town (2010) *An Integrated Local Economical Development Strategy for Khayelitsha and Mitchell's Plain.* Available from URL: http://www.capetown.gov.za/en/urbanrenewal/Pages/StrategicDocumentsandReports.aspx. Downloaded 17.10.2012

City of Cape Town (2015) *City of Cape Town- Census 2011- Constantia.* Available from URL: https://www.capetown.gov.za/en/stats/2001census/Documents/Constantia.htm Downloaded 28.01.2015

City of Cape Town (2013) *City of Cape Town- 2011 Census- Khayelitsha Health District.* Available from URL: https://www.capetown.gov.za/en/stats/2011%20Census%20%20Health%20District%20Profiles/Khayelitsha%20Health%20District.pdf. Downloaded 28.01.2015

City of Cape Town (2012) *City of Cape Town: Five-Year Plan for Cape Town 2012-2017: Integrated Development Plan (IDP) 2012/13 Review.* Available from URL: http://www.capetown.gov.za/en/IDP/Pages/default.aspx. Downloaded 26.03.12

City of Cape Town[1] (2014) *What is the five year plan (IDP)?* Available from URL: https://www.capetown.gov.za/en/IDP/Pages/WhatisThe5yearPlan.aspx. Downloaded 23.10.2014

City of Cape Town[2] (2014) *Your connection.* Available from URL: https://www.capetown.gov.za/en/Water/Pages/Your-connection.aspx. Downloaded 08.01.2014

Citypress (2014) *Helen Zille sets her sight on 2016 municipal elections.* Available from URL: http://www.citypress.co.za/politics/helen-zille-sets-sights-2016-municipal-elections. Downloaded 02.02.2015

City Vision Khayelitsha (2011) "S-Section in flames" in *City Vision Khayelitsha* 01.12.2011

Constututional Court of South Africa (2000) *Government of the Republic of South Africa vs. Grootboom and others.* Available form URL: http://www.saflii.org/cgi bin/disp.pl?file=za/cases /ZACC/2000/19.html&query=grootboom. Downloaded 26.11.14

Creswell, John W. (2013) *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design: Choosing Among Five Approaches.* Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications Ltd

Deneulin, Séverine (2009) "Ch. 8: Democracy and Political Participation" in Deneulin, Séverine and Lila Shahani (red.) *An Introduction to the Human Development and Capability Approach: Freedom and Agency.* London: Earthscan

Electoral Commission of South Africa (2011) *IEC releases final local government results.* Available from URL: http://www.elections.org.za/content/new.aspx?id=1850 Downloaded 02.02.2015

Globalis (2015) *Sør-Afrika.* Available from URL: http://globalis.no/Land/Soer-Afrika/(show)/indicators. Downloaded 15.01.2015

Gontsana, Mary-Anne (2014) *Another Cape Flats housing project goes bust.* Available from URL: http://groundup.org.za/article/another-cape-flats-housing-project-goes-bust_2443. Downloaded 19.11.2014

Grugel, Jean (2002) *Democratization: a critical introduction.* Houndsmills: Palgrave Macmillan

Heller, Patrick (2013) "Ch 3: Participation and Democratic Transformation: Building effective Citizenship in Brazil, India and South Africa" in Stokke, Kristian and Olle Törnquist (ed.) *Democratization in the Global South: The Importance of Transformative Politics.* Houndsmills: Palgrave Macmillan

Imvula Iyeza (2011) "Fewer Water Supply Options for Cape Town" in *Imvula Iyeza: Official Newsletter of the Department of Water Affairs Western Cape.* Bellville: Department of Water Affairs Western Cape

Johnstad, Sigrun (2013) "Vekst og protest: Afrikas 99%" in Jonstad, Sigrun (ed.) *Afrikas 99%: økonomisk vekst ulikhet og protest.* Oslo: Norwegian Council for Africa

Joubert, Pearlie (2008) *Grootboom dies homeless and penniless.* Available from URL: http://mg.co.za/article/2008-08-08-grootboom-dies-homeless-and-penniless. Downloaded 24.11.14

Khayelitsha Commission Inquiry (2014) *Report of the Commission of Inquiry into Allegations of Police Inefficiency and a Breakdown in Relations between SAPS and the Community of Khayelitsha.* Available from URL: http://www.khayelitshacommission.org.za/final-report.html. Downloaded 04.11.2014

Local Government Action (2015) *How elections work.* Available from URL: http://www.localgovernmentaction.org/activists-guide/key-processes/elections. Downloaded 14.01.2015

Lovan, Robert W., Michael Murray and Ron Shaffer (2004) "Ch. 14: Interactive Public Decision-Making in Civil Society" in Lovan, Robert W. et al. *Participatory Governance: Planning, Conflict Mediation and Public Decision-Making in Civil Society.* Aldershot: Ashgate Publishing

Mail & Guardian (2011) *City of Cape Town loses open-toilet battle.* Available from URL: http://mg.co.za/article/2011-04-29-city-of-cape-town-loses-opentoilet-battle. Downloaded 24.11.14

Mangena, Mosibudi (2015) *The Promise of the time hasn't been fulfilled.* Available from URL: Downloaded 01.02.2015

Mehta, Lyla, Lisa Thompson and Ndodana Nleya (2010) "Ch. 5: Water and rights: state management in South Africa and India" in Thomson, Lisa and Chris Tapscott (ed.) *Citizenship and Social Movements: Perspectives from the Global South.* London: Zed Books

Memela, Siabonga, Benjy Mautjane, Tina Nzo and Paul van Hoof (2008) *The State of Local Governance in South Africa: What does the Local Governance Barometer tell us?* Cape Town: Idasa

Millstein, Marianne (2008) *Challenges to substantive democracy in post-apartheid Cape Town: The politics of urban transformations and community organising in Delft.* Oslo: University of Oslo

Millstein, Marianne (2013) *Landprofil Sør-Afrika 2012/13.* Available from URL: http://www.afrika.no/Detailed/23907.html. Downloaded 15.01.2015

Mogale, Thomas M. (2003) "Developmental Local Government and Decentralised Service Delivery in the Democratic South Africa" in Mhone, Guy and Omano Edigheji (red.) *Governance in the New South Africa: The Challenges of Globalisation.* Landsowne: University of Cape Town Press

Mpalantshane, Loyiso (2011) "Police step out to raise awareness" in *Vukani* 17.11.2011

Mpeshe, Olwethu (2011) "Angry residents protest after shacks demolition" in *Vukani.* 17.11.2011

Nel, Etienne (2004) "Ch 2: Evolving participatory governance and developmental local government in post apartheid South Africa" in Lovan, Robert W., Michael Murray and Ron Shaffer (ed.) *Participatory Governance: Planning, Conflict Mediation and Public Decition Making in Civil Society.* Aldershot: Ashgate Publishing Company

Nyoka, Ayanda (2014) *Khayelitsha Commission findings: what now?* Available from URL: http://groundup.org.za/article/khayelitsha-commission-findings-what-now_2198. Downloaded 21.11.2014

Pithouse, David (2010) «Skitt, brann, gummikuler og en veldig sårbar optimisme» in Johnstad, Sigrun (ed.) *Bybevegelser: urbanisering og urban kultur i Afrika.* Oslo: Norwegian Council for Africa and Solidaritet forlag

Poonah, Vanessa (2014) *Coalition to take City of C Town to court over sanitation*. SABC. Available from URL: http://www.sabc.co.za/news/a/454df28045acfede89848b90ca3f4715/Coalition-

to-take-City-of-C-Town-to-court-over-sanitation-20140110. Downloaded 24.10.2014

Presence, Chantall (2014) "Khayelitsha Commission shown "Field of Death"" in *Mail and Guardian* Available from URL: http://mg.co.za/article/2014-01-22-khayelitsha-commission-shown-field-of-death. Downloaded 24.10.2014

Rayi, Malusi (2011) "Western Cape Municipalities dominates top ten on water quality nationally" in *Imvula Iyeza: Official Newsletter of the Department of Water Affairs Western Cape Region.* September –November 2011

SAHRC (2010) *South African Human Rights Commission Report: African National Congress Youth League and City of Cape Town.* Available from URL: http://www.sahrc.org.za/home/21/files/Makhaza%20Finding%202010.pdf. Downloaded 25.11.14

Scheyvens, Regina, Henry Scheyvens and Warwick E. Murray (2003) "Ch 9: Working with Marginalized, Vulnerable or Privileged Groups" in Scheyvens, Regina and Donovan Storey *Development Fieldwork: A Practical Guide.* London: Sage Publications Ltd.

Shiva, Vandana (2005) *Earth Democracy: Justice, sustainability and peace.* Cambridge: South End Press

Seekings, Jeremy (2009) "Ch. 8: South Africa since 1994: Who holds power after Apartheid?" in Mustapha, Abdul Raufu and Lindsay Whitfield (Ed.) *Turning Points in African Democracy.* Woodbrigde: James Currey

Sen, Amartya (1999) "Democracy as universal value" in *Journal of Democracy* vol. 10 nr.3, s. 3-17

Simpson, Nardia and Linda Waldman "Ch 4: Mobilization through litigation: claiming health rights on asbestos issues in South Africa" in Thomson, Lisa and Chris Tapscott (ed.) *Citizenship and Social Movements: Perspectives from the Global South.* London: Zed Books

Smukkestad, Oddvar (2005) *Den innviklede utviklingen: En innføringsbok i økonomisk og politisk utviklingsteori.* Oslo: Gyldendal Norsk Forlag

Social Justice Coalition (2014) *About us.* Cape Town: Social Justice Coalition. Available from HTTP: http://www.sjc.org.za/about-us. 04.06.2014

Social Justice Coalition (2014) *Campaign for safe communities*. Available from URL: http://safecommunities.sjc.org.za/. Downloaded 24.10.2014

Social Justice Coalition (2014) *Joint statement- Social Justice Coalition, Ndifuna Ukwazi and Equal Education.* Available from URL: http://www.sjc.org.za/posts/joint-statement-social-justice-coalition-ndifuna-ukwazi-equal-education. Downloaded 04.11.2014

Social Justice Coalition (2011) *Social Justice Coalition: Standing for safety and security for all.* Cape Town: Social Justice Coalition

Stake, Robert E. (1995) *The Art of Case Study Research.* Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications Ltd

St. Clair, Asuncion Lera (2006) "Ch. 14 Development Ethics: Open-Ended and Inclusive Reflections on Global Development" in Banik, Dan (ed.) *Poverty, Politics and Development: Interdiciplinary perspectives*

Stokke, Kristian and Sophie Oldfield (2004) "Ch 6: Social Movements, Socio-economic Rights and Substantial Democratisation in South Africa" in John Harris, Kristian Stokke and Olle Törnquist *Politicizing Democracy: The New Local Politics of Democratisation.* Houndmills: Palgrave Macmillan

Theron, Francois (2009) Ch 10 "Public participation as a micro-level development strategy: the principles and context for authentic and empowering development" in Davids, Ismael, Francois Theron and Kealeboga J. Maphunye *Participatory development in South Africa: A development management perspective*. Pretoria: Van Schaik Publishers

The South African Constitution (1996) *Chapter 2: Bill of Rights.* Available from URL: http://www.justice.gov.za/legislation/constitution/bill-of-rights.html. Downloaded 24.10.2014

UNDP (2002) *Deepening democracy in a fragmented world.* New York: Oxford University Press

XE Currency converter (2015) Available from URL: http://www.xe.com Downloaded 28.01.2015

Appendix: List of informants- in chronological order

Lesiwe Stofile, Abalimi Bezekhaya, 23.11.2011

Dalisile Mfazwe, secretary, and Gladwell Mtotywa, safety and security responsible in SANCO Khayelitsha 24.11.2011

Monde Nqulwana, ward councillor in ward 89, 25.11.2011

Joel Bregman, senior researcher, Social Justice Coalition, 30.11.2011

Thembeke Mcosana, local inhabitant, 06.12.2011

Mpho Lekau, local inhabitant, 07.12.2011

Christopher Kibiti, local inhabitant, 08.12.2011

Additional Information:

Luthando Tokota, volunteer, Social Justice Coalition, 30.11.2011

Nombulelo Ntsali, 06.12.2011

Camilla Asikho, 08.12.2011

Amanda Jrdana, 09.12.2011

Zikhona Wolwethu, 09.12.2011

Ethel Nosicelo, 09.12.2011