UNIVERSITY OF OSLO, NORWAY

FACULTY OF THEOLOGY

CHURCH, WELFARE AND CITIZENSHIP:
A STUDY OF THE CONTRIBUTIONS OF THE SOCIAL WELFARE WORKS OF THE
PRESBYTERIAN CHURCH OF GHANA AND THE CHRIST REFORMED CHURCH
TO PARTICIPATORY CITIZENSHIP IN GHANA.

By:

DANIEL ASANTE BOAMAH

Supervisor:

PROFESSOR AUD TØNNESSEN

A Thesis submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Philosophy Degree in Inter- Contextual Theology

SPRING 2014

I

ABSTRACT

Although Ghana is not a Welfare State like Norway, Sweden, Netherlands and other western countries, there has been a conscious effort by different stake holders in providing for the welfare needs of its citizens. The traditional family is the main and oldest provider of social welfare for members of the society. However, with the coming in of the British Colonizers and increasing demand for to seek the welfare of citizens, the role of the traditional family as providers of social welfare has expanded to include other benefactors such as the government and Non-Governmental Organizations. Among such NGO's are the religious organizations such as the Churches.

The main aim of this study is to find out how the social welfare works of the Presbyterian Church of Ghana and the Christ Reformed Church, contributes to Participatory Citizenship in Ghana.

The study will seek to explore the role of the Ghanaian churches as co-partners of the State in building the nation together, as well as the churches role as surrogate family who substitutes for the traditional family, undertaking social welfare works in areas where they are absent.

This study explores key questions as:

- What kind of welfare works do the churches engage in, and what do they put their priorities on?
- What are the motivations behind the churches engagement in social welfare?
- What kind of citizenship do their welfare works contribute to?
- What is their source of funding and
- What challenges do they encounter in their welfare works?

This study was conducted during a two months fieldwork in Accra, Ghana. Key leaders and representatives of the studied churches were interviewed. Other people such as lecturers and students in the field of social work who had knowledge about Ghana's social welfare system, and welfare beneficiaries were also interviewed.

DEDICATION

I dedicate this thesis to my parents, Catechists R.Y.Boamah and Janet Asare Boamah, for all their support, care, love and prayers in ensuring that I get this far in life. God richly bless you.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

This work could not have been completed without the guidance, co-operation and support of some people.

I am grateful to the Lord Almighty for His grace mercies and guidance to have finished this work. I could not have even started without Him. He has seen me through the thick and thin and I am forever grateful.

My profound gratitude goes to my supervisor, Professor Aud Tønnessen for her immense contribution to this work. I am grateful to her for giving of her time, expertise, advice, comments, encouragement, love and constructive criticisms to ensure that this work was completed. God richly bless and replenish all your efforts.

I am equally grateful to the Norwegian Quota Scheme for the scholarship awarded to enable me to pursue this course. I say a very big thank you to Vemund Blomkvist, Samuel Etikpah and Ole Jakob, all faculty of Theology, University of Oslo. God richly bless you for your support.

I express sincere gratitude to, Prof Kofi Agyekum, Rev. Daniel Oppong-Wireko, Mr. Kwame Ossei, Michael Okyere Asante, Sarah Frimpong, Emmanuel Dwamena, Grace Afumwaa, Betty Sarfo-Kwakye, Samuel Nana Bediako, Mrs. Bella Acheampong, Mr. & Mrs. Lindsay and Mr.& Mrs. Boateng for all the help and love you gave me.

I am equally grateful to Afua Ataa Boakyewaa Agyekum for all the care, love and support that you showed me. Your encouragement spurred me on through this program. I say a very big thank you to Fredua Agyeman, Elizabeth Silayo and Dzifa Lolo. You have been true friends to me. I could not have come this far without you. God bless you.

List of Tables

Abbreviations

AIDS- Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndrome

CCG- Christian Council of Ghana

CHRAJ- Commission on Human Rights and Administrative Justice

CMS- Christian Mission Society

CRC- Christ Reformed Church

CRS- Christian Religious Studies

ENOTHE- European Network of Occupational Therapy in Higher Education

ICCO- Interchurch Organization for Development Co-operation

NAB- National Accreditation Board.

NADMO- National Disaster Management Organization

NGOs- Non-Governmental Organizations

NT- New Testament

OT- Old Testament

PCG- Presbyterian Church of Ghana

PPAG- Planned Parenthood Association of Ghana

PRO- Public Relations Officer

UNICEF- United Nation's Children's Emergency Fund

WREP- Welfare and Religion in a European Perspective

TABLE OF CONTENT

CHAPTER 1

STUDY PERSPECTIVES AND METHODOLOGICAL APPROACH

1.0 General Introduction

Social welfare protection, in the form of insurance and assistance programs, emerged in Europe in the 1800s in order to provide citizens with an economic safety net during periods of illness, economic hardship, and other shocks (Palacios and Sluchynsky 2006). According to International Social Security Association (2005), there is a form of social protection developed to provide economic support in times of need in nearly every country today. These forms of assistance, in the view of Dixon, come in the form of old-age pensions, family allowances, survivor benefits or other supports (Dixon 1987). He continues to argue that in Africa, social welfare programs were originally developed in the 1950s and 1960s as a safety net for white workers (Dixon 1987).

Backstrom and Davie (2010:18) posit that, "almost all commentators agree that welfare begins with the basics: economic and social security, adequate housing, medical care at the point of need and education for all." It is worthy of note that these social interventions are carried out by varied agents of welfare. Among such agents is the church.

This research thesis is an examination of the involvement of churches in social welfare in Ghana. The researcher's approach to what churches can do in matters of social welfare is more grassroots-oriented and involves analyses of perspectives of local church leaders, in addition to views from social welfare benefactors and people with knowledge of Ghana's social welfare system. The thesis basic question is on how social welfare is integrated in the churches' understanding of welfare, and more particularly, what kind of citizenship their works contribute towards. This study shed light on the kind of social work the churches carry out, what they focus on, where their motivation comes from, the challenges they face, among others. The study analyzed, examined and explored the social works undertaken by two different Christian churches in Accra, the capital city of Ghana. Undertaking such a study was necessary because of the fact that little had been done academically on this subject in the Ghanaian context. There was

therefore the need to undertake a study like this to fill the academic gap between a developing country like Ghana and that of the developed world where research like *Welfare Citizenship and Welfare Nationalism (*Suszycki, 2011*)* has been done in the Nordic context. Furthermore, my personal interest in how religion affects society and people's day to day activities was a motivation to research on this topic. My perspective as a researcher is that Ghana is a suitable country to conduct research on Christianity and social welfare, as it is considered a religious country: not only does a high percentage (71.2%)[1] of the population belong to Christianity; it is also an important part of Ghanaian society and something that is largely expressed. Having studied about some European countries which are considered to be secular countries, and knowing the role of religion in their social welfare system, I found it interesting to examine the relationship the church and the government have in Ghana, a country considered to be a Christian country, as compared to the European context which is more secular.

1.2 Research on Welfare and Church

The key elements in Ghana's welfare system are social security and income protection schemes, labour and other legislation, services sponsored and financed by government, and services offered by voluntary organizations(Dixon 1987:30).

Social issues were a matter for the traditional system in pre-colonial Ghana. The traditional system was based on a social institution of extended family members and traditional authorities. According to Avendal (2011) and Radcliff-Brown (1940), the traditional system is often described as a single system that guides political, judicial, social and religious functions in society, as well as norms, values and the safeguarding of these. This system was the foundation of social life. With industrialization and urbanization, Ghana emerged at independence with the rudiments of a formal welfare system that reflected both the ideology and basic structures of the system in the United Kingdom (Dixon 1987). The colonial powers' introduction of the British welfare system with formal institutions, classroom education, a currency-based economy and Christianity contributed to extensive alterations in the social system and order. With formal institutions such as the government and courts of law, the chiefs lost their power as government and judge (Nukunya 2003).

---

[1]The 2010 government of Ghana census showed 71.2% of the Ghanaian population as Christians: http://www.ghana.gov.gh/: retrieved, September, 2013.

In Ghana, like many other developed countries, the provision of social welfare is not limited to the state or government agencies only, but also Voluntary Associations and Non-Governmental Organizations (NGO's) such as Religious Organizations. Even though actual figures are difficult to obtain, it is estimated that NGOs in Ghana have an annual development expenditure of about US$150-US$200 million. According to the World Bank, NGO's in Ghana contribute about US$180 million annually to rural water supply schemes alone. This is three times the volume of loan advanced by the World Bank itself for such schemes.[2]The Bank of Ghana estimated that NGOs contributed about US$173.2 million and US$149.8 million in 2005 and 2008 respectively to welfare and social development purposes.[3]

The contributions NGO's, and for that matter churches in Ghana, to the social well-being of the individual can therefore not be under estimated. Although the immense contribution of churches in Ghana in social welfare has not been given much attention in the academic field, the subject has attracted academic interest in developed continents like Europe, of which some of the scholarly works in the European context may have direct link with this study. For instance, in their article in their edited book *Religion, Class Coalitions, and Welfare States*, Kees Van Kersbergen and Philip Manow argue, "it seems possible that the anti-capitalist aspects of catholic ideology such as notions of fair wage or prohibitions of usury as well as the generally positive attitude of the Catholic Church towards welfare for the poor might encourage government welfare spending." (van Kersbergen and Manow 2009:1)They further argue that "Catholicism indeed constituted an even more important determinant of welfare statism than left power did." To add to, Schmidt enthusiastically asserts that "Social Democracy and Christian Democracy were functionally equivalent for welfare state expansion." (van Kersbergen and Manow 2009:2)

Van Kersbergen and Manow (2009:1) are of the view that most comparativists who study welfare state developments agree that religion has played a role in the development of modern social protection systems. The work of van Kersbergen and Manow focuses primarily on the

---

[2]http://opinion.myjoyonline.com/pages/articles/201110/74236.php: Retrieved, 24th April, 2014.
[3]http://www.modernghana.com/news/200111/1/discussions-on-ngos-accountability-held.html: Retrieved, 24th April, 2014

positive impact of Catholicism as politically represented by Christian democracy on the European continent. This work is an important eye opening to the role of the church to social welfare in Europe and may have less direct link on my research study area. However, general perspectives from this work could be used in assessing what pertains in the Ghana situation.

According to Backstrom and Davie (2010:3), both in Europe and beyond, religious institutions are not only becoming partners in the delivery of care, but also bearers of values that from time to time at least change and critique both global and national systems. They further believe that the churches are part and parcel of the discussions that go on in the welfare arena. Their contributions (both real and potential) are best expressed in series of questions. How, for example, is welfare defined or described in different theological traditions? What do the churches do to promote these goals? How do they respond to the 'failures' of the society to meet the expectations of its citizens? And what, finally, are the expectations of these citizens?

In his edited book *Social Welfare in Africa*, John Dixon examines social welfare in some major African countries including Ghana. It considers for each country the ideological/value framework which underlies the social welfare system, and describes the historical development of the system and the political and socio-economic context. Each chapter then goes on to look at the structure and administration of the system and how the system is financed. Dixon examines the nature of the different parts of the welfare system, surveying social security, personal social services, and the treatment of the following key, target groups: the aged, the disabled and handicapped, children and youth, needy families, the unemployed, and the sick and injured. Each chapter concludes with an assessment of the effectiveness of the system considered. Particular attention is paid to the role of foreign aid agencies and missionaries, and to the special problems of poverty and famine in Africa. Dixon's work will be very beneficial to the present research as it will enable the researcher not only have an idea of what is happening in other African countries, but also compare and contrast the different welfare structures in different African countries. It is also a good material to evaluate how the social welfare system in Ghana has evolved over the years, by comparing what pertained years back to the current situation.

Other literatures which are relevant to this current research such as *The Churches and Ghana Society: 1918-1955* (Parsons 1963), *Social Work in Africa: Exploring Culturally Relevant Education and Practice in Ghana* (Kreitzer 2012), *Welfare and Religion in 21st Century Europe:*

Volume 1. Configuring the Connections (Backstrom et al 2010), and *Social Welfare in Global Context (*Midgley 1997), will be reflected upon and considered in this work.

However, other literatures including *Social Work: An Introduction to the Field*(Stroup 2008),*Organization of Social Welfare* (Kohli and Sharma 1997), and *Social Security and Welfare: Concepts and Comparisons* (Walker 2005), touch on matters that have little bearing on the current work interest and therefore will not be considered for further analysis.

Drawing on the scholarly works done in Europe and a few others from the African and Ghanaian contexts, this research draws insights from the contexts of European and other African countries into the Ghanaian context, as well as build on and fill the gaps in those that have been made in Ghana. The research questions were therefore framed to meet this target. Though the study takes, as its primary perspective, the issue of societal well-being, the results from fieldwork will be compared to other perspectives around the theme to understand its significance to citizenship development. The principal concept therefore shall be the notion of 'citizenship'. Other notions such as "the home we build together" will be employed to support the main concept.

1.3 Research Questions
With earlier motivation from works on subjects and opinions surrounding church-state relations and the universal rise of religious corporate social responsibilities, the researcher sought to investigate *Churches' involvement in social welfare and how it contributes to citizenship in Ghana.* Social welfare may be viewed as an approach for promoting people's well-being and may be contrasted with other approaches such as social philanthropy, social work and social administration (Midgley 1995). However, such development is not always embraced in all institutions. Based on the empirical case of the contribution of two churches to social welfare in Ghana, the study seeks to find among other issues why the churches engage in social welfare. How do the churches explain this act of service? Does willingness to contribute to social welfare have roots in their doctrine? Do their religious tenets stress support for the poor rather than extorting from them and why so? Do they engage in social welfare because they see themselves as part of nation builders? Do they engage in social welfare because those legislatively responsible for it have failed in doing so? Or does their involvement in social welfare arise out of taking up the role of helping the traditional family who has been responsible for the welfare of its members? What kind of citizenship do their welfare works contribute to? These are critical

concerns in the research. The research therefore involves a two month's fieldwork to collect data on two Ghanaian churches in the contexts of their contributions to social welfare. The main subject (in italics above) is deliberated upon by an examination of the following fundamental questions:

1. What kind of social welfare programs do the churches offer?
2. How are the different projects funded?
3. What motivates the churches to be involved in social welfare?
4. What are the challenges encountered in discharging such responsibility?

1.4 Aims/Significance of the Study
The main aim of the research is to study the social responsibility of two Christian churches in Ghana, taking into account their role towards both the community and its members. The research was therefore planned with the following sub-goals.

1. To embark on a qualitative research on the contribution of two Christian churches to social welfare in Ghana.
2. To reflect on how social work is integrated in the churches' understanding of social welfare.
3. To reflect on the impact of the churches' contribution to the welfare life of the individuals both within the church and the nation as a whole.
4. To investigate the motivation behind the churches' acts of service.
5. To discuss with the leaders of the churches on challenges associated with undertaking such social welfare projects, and the possibilities for finding solutions to such challenges.
6. To relate the lessons and findings to the theoretical, comparative and empirical literature.

It is anticipated that the findings of this study will be important to the following:

The results of the study will provide other Churches and the nation as a whole with a framework to guide them on the key issues needed to be considered in the design and formulation of welfare policies in order to ensure the successful implementation of social welfare programs.

In terms of theory, this study will be of immense benefit to the academic community by providing literature that will seek to bridge the knowledge gap between developed and

developing countries on social welfare and religion. It will also serve as a basis for further studies and a reference to scholars interested in the subject of religion and social welfare.

1.5 Methods

1.5.1 Research Plan and Data Gathering
Allan Bryman in his book on social research methods (4th edition), considered 'ethnography' as a means of research method in which the researcher "is immersed in a social setting for an extended period of time; makes regular observations of the behavior of the members of the setting; listens to and engages in conversations; interview informants on issues that are not directly amenable to observation or that the ethnographer is unclear about; collect documents about the group; develops an understanding of the culture of the group and people's behavior within the context of that culture; and writes up a detailed account of that setting (Bryman 2012).

Although observing the interaction in selected social activities between representatives of the churches and the 'clients' might have been a fruitful way of studying matters of citizenship, and therefore employing ethnography research method would have been appropriate, this study however does not adopt this research method for several reasons.

Marcus (1998) notes that ethnographical research has usually spanned over a long-term period where researchers sometimes lived with communities for years, with a 12–18 month stay typical. Again, Allan Bryman draws our attention to the fact that in an ethnography research, the ethnographer immerses himself or herself in a group for an extended period of time, observing behaviors, listening to what is said in conversations both between others and fieldworker, and asking questions (Bryman 2012). In light of these classical social-anthropological ideals, it seems that the nine (9) weeks official length of time allotted for the fieldwork in the Master's program at the University of Oslo is inadequate to adopt an ethnographical research method for this study, because it is not possible to spend such long time on the field.

Moreover, Marcus (1998) argues that because ethnographic researchers are committed to long-term research planning, it is expensive to undertake ethnographic research. Financial constraints on the part of the researcher in this current work did not allow for adopting this method.

It is worth mentioning that although this study does not employ an ethnographic research approach, the researcher undertook some 'participant observations' during his visit to the Sunday and Saturday church services of the studied churches.

Considering the challenges associated with an ethnographic research method to this study, the researcher adopted a qualitative research method whereby he gathered data using two techniques, namely, *documentary analysis* and *semi-structured interviews.* Chapter three (3) of this study will discuss in detail the qualitative research approach used in this study.

1.5.2 The Fieldwork

The field work was carried out during a period of nine weeks (10th June to 21st August, 2013) in Accra, the capital of Ghana in West Africa. Before my arrival in Ghana, the original idea was to collect data on the Presbyterian Church of Ghana and the Lighthouse Chapel International. Unfortunately, the Lighthouse Chapel International declined to my request with the excuse that they could not grant any further interviews if the information I sought for was not available on their website. This forced me to substitute the Lighthouse Chapel International with Christ Reformed Church (CRC) popularly known in Ghana as "Kristo Asafo". Further motivations for the selection of these two churches will be reflected upon in the methodological chapter. Mr. Emmanuel Ankamah and Professor Kofi Agyekum were my contact on location for the Presbyterian Church of Ghana (PCG) and Christ Reformed Church (Kristo Asafo) respectively. The former directed me to the Director in charge of Development and Social Services, Rev. Daniel Oppong-Wireko. In the case of Christ Reformed Church, I was provided with the telephone number of the Public Relations Officer, Mr. Ossei Kwame Bempah to be contacted and schedule for a meeting.

1.5.3 Fieldwork Challenges

1.5.3.1 Access

Bryman (2012) notes that one of the key and yet most difficult steps in fieldwork is gaining access to a social setting that is relevant to the research problem in which you are interested.

Hammersley and Atkinson identify two different kinds of settings: 'Open or public' settings as opposed to 'closed or non-public' settings. 'Closed or non-public' settings are likely to be organizations such as firms, schools, cults, social movements, while 'Open or public' settings are likely to be everything else – that is, research involving communities, gangs, drugs-users among others (Bryman 2012:433).

The case of the current researcher falls under 'closed or non-public' settings as he deals with churches and other organizations. The challenge of the current researcher was getting access to the right informants to one of the churches under study. Bryman proposes ways of getting around the access problem. The current researcher did not adopt what Bryman calls 'covert role' – that is, not to disclose the fact that you are a researcher. But rather the researcher assumed the position by Bryman (2012:435) to use friends, contacts, colleagues, academics to help gain access. In the case of the current researcher, a former college Professor and a friend was used. To establish a more formal relationship, the researcher went a step further to introduce himself as a student and a researcher working on a thesis on churches' contributions to social welfare through a formal letter with copy of his student identification card to the heads in-charge of the chosen churches. Unlike the case of 'covert role' approach, the key informants were informed of the researcher's status. With this done, the informants willingly spent quality time talking with the researcher upon each interview visit. Notwithstanding, there were others such as those he worshiped with at Saturday and Sunday church services who were not aware of his status as a researcher.

The open approach made it possible to arrange time for the interview with the church leaders who might hitherto be occupied with other engagements. Note taking and recording of interviews in their presence was not a problem as they were pre-informed in the introduction letter and with the assurance of getting a copy of the transcribed interview afterwards.

1.5.4 The sample size

The population for this study would have been all churches in Greater Accra Region of Ghana that undertake social welfare works. However, due to time factor and the approach chosen for this study, the sample was limited to the Presbyterian Church of Ghana and the Christ Reformed Church (KristoAsafo).

1.5.5 Data Sources

1.5.5.1 Primary sources of data
Primary data were collected mainly through qualitative interviews. The interviews with the church heads, church welfare committee leaders/members, and lecturers/students from the department of social work (University of Ghana) formed part of the methodology. Furthermore, the researcher extended the conversation to ordinary members of the churches he fellowshipped with during his fieldwork. All in all, data were qualitatively gathered from the following sources:

- Head office of the Presbyterian church of Ghana
- Head office of the Christ Reformed Church, Ghana
- Leader of the welfare committee, Legon campus congregation of PCG
- Leader of welfare committee, Newtown branch, Christ Reformed church
- Congregants, Legon campus congregation of PCG
- Congregants, Newtown branch, Christ Reformed church
- Lecturers/Students, Department of Social Work at University of Ghana.
- Sampled welfare beneficiaries of the studied churches

Aside the heads of the churches and leaders of the welfare committees, the researcher did not talk extensively with the other informants. This is because bulk of the research was centered on the contribution from the churches. More so, with the exception of the heads of the churches and welfare committee leaders, conversations with other informants were not recorded. Notes were however taken. The interviews with the church leaders were meant to ascertain the official stands of the churches towards social welfare including their contributions and motivations to the topic. Talks with the other informants were geared towards having a general overview of social welfare in Ghana as well as their evaluation on the contribution of the churches to the social welfare in Ghana.

1.5.5.2 Secondary sources of data
Connected and available published materials, relevant and trusted material from the internet and libraries were qualitatively analyzed and used. Additional matters relating to methodology will be expounded in chapter 3.

1.6 Concepts and Theoretical Perspectives

The whole analytical focus rotates carefully around the concept of Citizenship. The notion of "the home we build together" is used in sections of this work where relevant.

1.7 Structure and Synopsis of the Thesis Writing

This research deliberates on empirical data, analyzing fieldwork evidence by a review and use of both theological and social science perspectives with the basic aim of examining the contributions of two Christian churches in Ghana, when it comes to social welfare. A thematic analysis in which field data are organized into main themes and subthemes is employed. The thesis comprises five main chapters which examines themes moved by both the field transcript and relevant literary sources. Chapter 1 has assessed a general introduction by defining the key research questions, the research methods and the theoretical frameworks, together with the objectives and relevance of the study. Chapter 2 makes an effort to place the study into its context. It looks at the nature of the social welfare in Ghana – from the British colonial era (1874 -1957) to the present. Mention is made of the relation between the public and voluntary welfare on the basis of available literature. Chapter 3 is devoted to methodological reflection(s) that is/are used in this study. Chapter 4 presents the theoretical concept that drives this study. The analysis and presentation of empirical data from the field work is presented in chapter 5. Critical comments on the findings are further pursued in chapter 6 wherein an attempt is made to draw out the significance of the results for the theoretical perspectives that have kindled the research project. The conclusion in chapter 7 summarizes the entire study and gives recommendations.

1.8 Summary

This chapter has presented some perspectives which are important to this study. Among such include a general introduction on the perspective of church and social welfare. Reference was made to European perspectives that will be relevant for the current study which takes its context from Ghana. Reflections were made on: research questions that are critical in this study; methodological approach; the theories that drives this study; and a description of the structure of this thesis. The chapter that follows situates the study into context – by looking at the nature of social welfare in Ghana and how the PCG and CRC's welfare works integrate into the Ghana system.

CHAPTER 2

SITUATING THE STUDY IN CONTEXT

2.0 The Ghana System: Social welfare in Ghana from British Colonial Era (1874-1957) to Present

2.1 Introduction
This chapter, under the caption, *The Ghana System* looks at the nature of the social welfare in Ghana – from its British colonial era (1874 – 1957) to present. Mention is made of the relation between the public and voluntary welfare on the basis of available literature. Finally, this chapter examines some available records of the work of the churches, relevant reports, and related periodical literature.

2.2 Historical Origins: 1874 - 1957
The history of social welfare in Ghana can be traced to the development of the colonial social welfare by the British's presence in the then Gold Coast.[4] Dr. Blavo, a pioneer social worker in Ghana notes: "social welfare has been in existence from time immemorial in Ghana because we all have problems… long ago, before colonialism, social welfare was in practice but it was being performed by a different group of people." (Kreitzer 2012:33) Professor Apt, a pioneer in social work affirms the above assertions when he states:

> Before colonialism, social problems were solved within the context of a traditional system, which had always been an integral part of social life of the indigenous people. The traditional system was a social institution of extended families characterized by strong family ties, which assured the security of its members. The system dictated its social norms, safeguarded its moral values and conserved its economic base (Kreitzer 2012:33).

Today social welfare in Ghana is provided chiefly through the government's Department of Social Welfare. All other agents of social welfare such as Non-Governmental Organizations (NGOs), non-religious organizations, and religious organizations directly or indirectly channel

---

[4]The Gold Coast was a British colony in West Africa from 1874 until it became the independent nation of Ghana in 1957.

their contributions to social welfare through the Department of Social Welfare. Notwithstanding the fact that the government is the chief provider of social welfare, the first providers of social welfare in Ghana were the families and tribes within the country (Lidzén 2008). It was common for individuals to obtain economic support from members of his or her extended family[5] in pre-colonial times. This practice of inter-dependence on each other was born out of the understanding that the wealth of the family was derived from the family properties such as land and livestock handed down from generation to generation. The individual was however expected to reciprocate this act of provision by fulfilling certain responsibilities, such as contributing labour when needed. It was this observation of interdependence that moved the Anthropologist, Robert S. Rattray to define the extended family in Ghana as the primary political unit. With the development of complex issues and devastating disaster, the colonial traders changed the face of the social welfare structure with missionaries taking part of offering social services. For instance, Kreitzer (2012) posits:

> In 1929, the British government passed the first Colonial Development Act. This led to the Colonial Development and Welfare Act of 1940. Social development projects were requested by the colonial administration that maximized co-operation of the local peoples in the initiation and execution of projects. This initiative was meant to assist families who were affected by an earth quake that struck the Gold Coast (pp. 34-35).

In all these social projects, the colonial missionaries were key in its execution. According to Kreitzer (2012), the United Nations in 1964 wrote:

> In Africa, organized social services owes much to the activities of missionaries who pioneered in the medical services, in the education and in the care of needy children and mothers … the missionaries were involved in literacy … they did much to bring home to colonial administrations the need to concern themselves with the social welfare of their subjects (p.34)

---

[5]The extended family includes uncles, aunts, grandparents and cousins from both the paternal and maternal sides of the family.

Kreitzer further notes that between 1945 and 1957 the Colonial Development and Welfare Act[6] was revised to include greater funding and commitments to social sciences including education, medical and health services, housing, nutrition, water supplies, broadcasting, and welfare (Kreitzer 2012:36).

Asamaoh and Nortey note in Kreitzer (2012:36) that the British in the history of Ghana set up a welfare system "that reflected both the ideology and basic structures of the system in the United Kingdom." As noted earlier in this chapter, social issues in pre-colonial Ghana were matters for the traditional system, a social institution based on membership of the extended family and traditional authorities. The traditional system, based on kinship, was the foundation of social life. The new social order introduced by colonialism in the 19th and 20th centuries destabilized the traditional system.

The British welfare system was characterized by formal institutions, classroom education, a currency-based economy and Christianity contributed to extensive alterations in the social system and order. With formal institutions such as the government and courts of law, the chiefs lost their power as government and judge (Vendal 2011).

These structures according to Asamoah and Nortey used primarily a remedial model in which clients' problems were identified and immediate needs were sought to solve the problem. A weakness of this social welfare system as noted by Kreitzer (2012:36) is that preventive measures, structural changes, and social developmental services were not addressed, but rather attention was focused on physical and mental rehabilitation, with special attention to homeless children, the disabled, women and migrants. Another shortcoming of the British administered welfare system in Ghana has been pointed out by Asamoah and Beverly as failure by the colonial welfare policy to take a holistic view of the human condition, an overriding importance of political considerations, minimization of the positive effects of traditional structures, and emphasis on economic expediency or advantage for the colonial power instead of benefiting the colonies (Kreitzer 2012:36).

---

[6]The impact of the World War II called for a policy that could sustain the families who had been affected. For those regions under the authority of the British colonial office, the Colonial Development and Welfare Acts of 1940 and 1945 signaled Britain's commitment to the development of empire at a time of internal weakness.

2.3 The Present Situation

Although the same system of pre-colonial welfare assistance[7] prevails in rural areas where a significant number of the country's population resides, the nature of social welfare in Ghana today has taken a different shape with new developments over the years. The Department of Social Welfare is constitutionally charged with the administration of the country's social welfare system in Ghana today (Siobhan 2008).

2.3.1 The Department of Social Welfare

The Department of Social Welfare as is called today in Ghana has gone through different phases since its establishment. The Colonial Development and Welfare Act of 1940 was the backbone for the establishment of this department (Kreitzer 2012). Kreitzer's assessment on the social work in Ghana gives more emphasis on this changing phase of the department. According to Kreitzer (2012), in 1946, the Department of Social Welfare and Housing was created. Other changes followed. "A social development branch of this department was set up in 1948, which has now become the Community Development Department. In 1951, social welfare separated from Housing, and a Ministry of Education and Social Welfare was created. The Department of Social Welfare and Community Development was created in 1952" (Kreitzer 2012:35). Kreitzer further notes that with the revision of the Colonial Development and Welfare Act to include greater funding and commitments to social sciences, there was the need to train more professionals to administer the works at the department. In light of this new development, the department was attached to the University of Ghana to train such minds for the Department (Kreitzer 2012:35). In 1998, the Department was elevated to a full government department with the name Department of Social Welfare. According to Siobhan (2008), although the Department of Social Welfare operates nationally, personnel are concentrated in urban areas while those posted to district offices outside of the major Metropolis, are effectively working in rural or semi-rural settings (Siobhan 2008).

Siobhan (2008) notes that the department is charged to

    1. provide community based rehabilitation for people with disabilities;

    2. provide professional social welfare services in all districts and ensure that the statutory responsibilities of the Department of Social Welfare are carried out;

---

[7] The welfare system based on the membership of the extended family and traditional authorities.

3. promote access to social services for vulnerable and marginalized groups;

4. co-ordinate and regulate specialized residential services for children and people with disabilities;

5. facilitate opportunities for NGOs to develop social services;

6. raise awareness on HIV/AIDS prevention and promote community care strategies in collaboration with the Ministry of Health;

7. create awareness on population issues and family planning;

8. promote social, economic and emotional stability in families; and

9. promote poverty alleviation and income security among disadvantaged groups.

Although social welfare in Ghana is usually provided by the government under the auspices of the Department of Social Welfare, presently, there are other agents of social welfare providers who supplement the efforts of government. Among such agents include Non-Governmental Organizations (NGOs), Non-Religious Organizations and Religious Organizations.

Ghana's social welfare policy encompasses various spheres of human life and needs, from social security to income protection schemes, and extending to labour and other legislation welfare policies. In recent years, social welfare works in Ghana are focused mainly on education, medical services, and children and women (Sundkler& Steed, 2000). These welfare works are undertaken under two broad categories: services sponsored and financed by government, and services offered by voluntary organizations (Siobhan 2008). The welfare programs that offer help in Ghana are identical to Macarov (1995) categorization of social welfare programs. These are:

i.   those that give financial aid—directly to clients, to third parties, or through third parties to clients,

ii. those that give goods rather than money (often referred to as "in-kind" programs), and

iii. those that offer services.

2.4 THE VOLUNTARY SECTOR AND SOCIAL WELFARE

The Voluntary sector, often referred to as the Non-profit sector (Anheier and Salamon 1998) is long recognized as an instrument of relief and promoter of human rights. In recent years it has

come to be viewed as an essential contributor to basic economic growth (Atingdui 1995) and to the social welfare works of many African countries. Ghana's voluntary sector includes very different types of organizations reflecting the country's traditional cultures, colonial past, and uneven economic and political course since independence. In addition to traditional forms of organizing that date back well into pre-colonial times, Ghana's nonprofit sector today includes indigenous grassroots organizations, government-sponsored community development organizations, church related and Islamic welfare organizations, international development and relief organizations, professional and business associations, local craft unions, market women's associations, migrant groups, and village associations among others (Atingdui 1995). Aside the efforts of the government to improve the livelihood of the people of Ghana through various welfare schemes, Voluntary organizations also supplement the efforts of the government and in some cases are good substitutes in areas where the government has neglected. Voluntary groups such as Religious bodies, Charity Associations and Clubs have been instrumental in Ghana's social welfare. Dixon (1946) for instance notes the contribution of voluntary organizations such as the Christian Council of Ghana and the Planned Parenthood Association of Ghana (PPAG) in the implementation of Ghana's official population policy (a policy aimed at maintaining a level of population growth which is consistent with national development objectives in order to improve the quality of life for the populace). Voluntary Organizations including the Rotary Club, American Women's Association, British Women's Association, and Association of University Women, have over the years been involved in welfare programs that address individual and community welfares. The NGO's tend to focus more on development work, and philanthropy/charity, that is, relief work. Some religious organizations focus on both development and relief work, while others focus entirely on the latter (Lidzén 2008).

Education in Ghana is provided by the government (through public schools either free of tuition fees or subsidized, depending on the level), churches (through privately run religious schools) and other non-religious NGOs (through their own privately run schools). Health care is given by the same providers as with education; mainly the government, churches and NGO's (Lidzén 2008). Voluntary organizations in Ghana unlike the government can choose to be very narrow in the people or cause they provide social welfare for, making them more visible and quicker in sending aid (Lidzén 2008). This has comparatively made the Voluntary sector more effective and

receive the people's trust than the government does, mainly because the voluntary organizations are seen as meeting local needs better and being more flexible and committed to their cause (Van de Walle and Johnston 1996).

2.5 CHURCH-STATE RELATIONS: THE CHURCH IN SOCIAL SPACE

2.5.1 History of the Church in West Africa

The history of Christianity in Africa can never be complete without recounting the history of the church in the West Africa sub region. According to Agbeti (1986), 20th January, 1482, has been traditionally acknowledged as the date on which Christianity was introduced to West Africa in modern times. Agbeti asserts that the arrival of the Portuguese expedition of 600 men, under the command of Don Diagod'Azambuja who had landed at Elmina, near Cape Coast, in Ghana, a day before the above date, "suspended the banner of Portugal from the bough of a lofty tree, at the foot of which they erected an altar, and the whole company assisted at the first mass that was celebrated in Guinea, and prayed for the conversion of the natives from idolatry, and the perpetual prosperity of the church which they intended to erect upon the spot." (Agbeti 1986)Despite the zeal with which Christianity was introduced, Elizabeth Isichei in her book *A History of Christianity in Africa: From Antiquity to the Present* posits that not until the period after 1900, the West African sub region had seen no significant impact of western and Christian influences. Many people had never met a missionary, and, even in centers with a long-established mission presence, Christians were in the minority (Isichei 1995). This assertion by Isichei is confirmed by the report by the Christian Mission Society (CMS) report in 1897 which states that their nearly forty years intensive work in a small district on the lower Niger touched only about one per cent of the people (Isichei 1995). Agbeti (1986) brings to light the fact that the missionary societies in West Africa who evangelized to make converts cut across many denominational groups. From the Wesleyan Methodist Missionary Society to the Basel Missionary Society, the Scottish Free Church Missionary Society, Roman Catholic Missionary Societies, among others. The membership of the church right from the colonial period portrays that the church identified with the marginalized in the society. As noted by Isichei, in West Africa, as in South, East, and Central Africa, early converts were often drawn from the enslaved, the poor, the disabled, and the marginalized (Isichei 1995). Isichei further notes that, generally

most of the people attending the church are women that have no money and the rest are the poorer class, very few of the wealthy chiefs (Isichei 1995). Gathering from the background of the kind of people the church associated with, it is not too surprising that most of the activities of the churches are human centered; taking the welfare of the community in which they lived in at heart. Isichei notes such activities as provision of subsidized schools, hospitals and other health facilities, redeeming slaves, and providing a refuge for those whom society marginalized (Isichei 1995).

2.5.2 Ghana

According to Agbeti (1986), the Roman Catholic friars who sailed with Portuguese merchants introduced Christianity to Ghana in the late fifteenth century. Their Christian beliefs did, however, not have any significant impact on the native people, who confessed to traditional African beliefs at the time (a tradition that a small percentage of Ghanaians still confess to until this very day). The few converts that were made among the native people were alleged to have converted for material motives, such as for the new weapons the white people possessed, rather than spiritual ones (Omenyo 2006). With the setting of forts along the coast by several European countries including Sweden, Germany and Britain, arrived the first Protestant missionaries in 1618. However, it was not until four decades later that Christianity started to flourish in southern Ghana, largely through Protestant missions, and further spread throughout the country. The 2010 government of Ghana census showed 71.2% of the Ghanaian population as Christians, Muslim makes up 17.6%, traditional African religion practitioners is 5.2%, other religions comprised 0.8%, while those who profess no religious belief consisted of 5.2% (2010 census).

Presently, there are numerous types of Christian denominations found in Ghana. Omenyo (2006) has divided them into five categories: Mainline(Historic) Churches (originating from the missions, of western), African Independent Churches (indigenous origin, mainly founded in the beginning of the twentieth century), Classical Pentecostal Churches (the oldest Pentecostal churches dating back from the 1910s, of western roots), Neo- Evangelical / Mission-related Churches (Evangelic churches with western ties from the 1940s, mostly found in northern Ghana) and Neo-Pentecostal / Charismatic Churches (charismatic churches which started to appear during the 1980s, some of which have their roots in the west). The current data on the

Christian census indicates that the largest Christian groups in Ghana are the Pentecostal / Charismatic (28.3 percent of the 71.2 per cent Christians), Protestant (18.4 per cent), Catholic (13.1 per cent) and miscellaneous Christian groups (11.4per cent) (2010 Census).

2.5.3 Contribution of Missions to Social Welfare

The social welfare work of the churches in Ghana could be recognized in the activities of both individual missionaries and the church as an entity, who acknowledged the need for this type of service. As Parsons noted, often with no special preparation, these individual missionaries and churches "dealt with the particular social problems of their parishoners in the rounds of their pastoral duties" (Parsons 1963). Available literature indicates that outstanding contributions were made in the areas of education, medical services, and other welfare services related to the poor and needy in society. Works from scholars like Sundkler and Steed (2000), recounts the contributions from missionaries such as the Basel (Presbyterian), Wesleyan (Methodist) and the Catholics to the development of Africa and in particular Ghana. Special account is made of their quota to education and health. More also, Robert T. Parsons in his work, "*The Churches and Ghana Society"* undertakes a survey of three protestant mission societies; the Ghana Presbyterian Church, the Methodist Church and the Evangelical Presbyterian Church. According to Parsons (1963), these churches have contributed to the welfare needs of Ghanaians. He noted: "It was in the several social activities of the Mission and Church that societary development was more largely achieved, namely in, education, medical service, social welfare, work among women cooperative church efforts and political development" (Parsons, 1963).

2.5.3.1 Education

In his book, "*West African Christianity: The Religious Impact*", Lamin Sanneh agrees that: no single subject has attracted as much consistent attention and resources in the history of Christian penetration of Africa as education, and no subject was as effective in the revolutionary transformation of African societies (Sanneh 1983). As Sanneh noted, until about 1850, education in Ghana remained relatively stagnant and characterized largely by the lack of organization or of a disciplined curriculum. What in present day Ghana is regarded as the flowering of learning in terms of schools geared to an academic syllabus was largely missing

(Sanneh 1983). However, the period from about 1850 to the end of the century witnessed tremendous developments in education (Sanneh 1983). This development could partly be attributed to the epochal legacy of Charles MacCarthy in 1822-4, but more significantly was in the 1860s when new energies stirred in the field, with missions leading the way (Sanneh 1983). By the end of the First World War, the Ghana Presbyterian Church, Methodist Church and Evangelical Presbyterian Church were responsible for well over 90% of all educational efforts in the country, and in some areas, had established a pattern of education for well-rounded community development that has not been achieved since (Parsons, 1963). Missionary institutions like the Wesleyan Methodist missionary, the Breman missionary, and the Catholics contributed to the welfare of education in Ghana in their missionary activities. They were instrumental in the building of schools and training of teachers for the various schools (Sanneh 1983).

The Basel missionary (presently the Presbyterian Church of Ghana), like her other compatriots, is worth mentioning anytime the subject of education is under discussion. Noel Smith, writing on the Presbyterian Church in Ghana states: "No account of the Presbyterian Church of Ghana would be complete without a survey of the part played by the Missions and the Church in the development of education in the country." (Smith 1966:165) According to Parsons (1963), the record of education introduced by the Basel missionaries revealed a broad base of operation in this enterprise. He notes that apart from holding its numerous schools, the Basel Mission—here too in advance of everybody else—trained African lads in all the useful arts; carpentry, iron work, tailoring, house building and painting (Parsons 1963). More crucially, Parson notes that when the educational system of Ghana had not yet been unified by the Educational Department, the Basel Mission's distinctive type of product—scholastic as well as vocational, girls no less than boys—proved themselves very well fitted to enter into the common life and work for the community (Parsons, 1963). By 1844, the Basel Mission was running a school at Akropong and by 1850, when the Gold Coast Colony became independent of Sierra Leon, the main educational effort was coming from the Wesleyan and Basel Missions. Between them, the two Missions had about 1,000 pupils in their schools (Cox and Haar 2003). Until the 1852 Educational Ordinance, the Wesleyans in the West and the Basel Mission in the East were the chief providers of education (Cox and Haar 2003). By 1858, the Basel Mission had 13 day schools and 4 Boarding

21

Schools in Christiansburg, Aburi and Akropong Districts (Cox and Haar 2003). By 1881 the Basel with three other missions owned 136 out of the existing 139 schools in Ghana. They also enrolled 4,500 odd pupils as against 507 enrolled by the 3 government schools. Not all, they employed about 200 teachers as against 16 by the government (Cox and Haar 2003). According to Smith (1966), the statistics showed that there was a constant and steady growth in the number of schools managed by the Presbyterian Church of Ghana. Between 1868 and 1958, the number of schools managed by the church rose from 500 to 108,880. Around this same time, about one-sixth of all Primary and Middle school children in Ghana were in Presbyterian Church Schools, and a greater part of the total activity of the church was taken up with educational administration (Smith 1966).

Sundkler and Steed (2000) recount the contribution of the Basel missionaries (Presbyterian Church of Ghana) to education when he states that far into the twentieth century no other agency took any real interest in African education, but the Methodist and Basel missions were strong supporters of schools (Sundkler and Steed 2000). Between the 1860s and 1870s, the Presbyterian Church had a number of boarding schools and a seminary for training catechists at Akropong (Sundkler and Steed 2000). In the area of secondary education, the church had an enviable Girls' Secondary School at Odomase Krobo in 1938 and the Presbyterian Girls' Secondary School at Aburi in 1953 (Sundkler and Steed 2000; Smith 1966). In 1943, the Methodists and the Presbyterians opened a joint secondary school in Kumasi, called Prempeh College (Sundkler& Steed, 2000). In the same year, the two churches also co-operated in establishing a theological college, Trinity College, in Kumasi (Sundkler and Steed 2000). Since vocational education was seen by the church as an integral part of the educational structure, they provided agriculture and limited industrial training for their pupils. The church opened a school and carpentry workshop at Navrongo in 1907 (Cox and Haar 2003). The Basel Mission made agricultural, industrial and manual work an essential part of their education. Citing Kimble, Cox and Haar note that the Mission's most original contribution to Ghana's educational system was its combination of practical work with book-learning (Cox and Haar 2003). In order to equip the various primary and secondary schools in the country with teachers, the mission churches placed importance on teacher training education. By 1913, the only institution providing formal training for teachers in the country was owned by the Basel Mission (Cox and Haar 2003). The Presbyterian Church

had in 1930, 1944, 1946 and 1952 opened up Teacher Training Colleges at Aburi, Krobo, Mampong and Abetifi respectively (Smith, 1966). As Sundkler and Steed note, teacher training facilities run by the churches were markedly expanded and this was combined with an improvement in the quality of teacher education (Sundkler and Steed 2000).

The missionary activities in education were not limited to physical infrastructural developments. They also supported the efforts of the state/government in the form of scholarships to students. The various missions offered financial support in varied forms to needy students. Cox and Haar (2003) for instance recount the financial support of the Basel Missionary to the education of ex-slave boys. They note that in 1882 for instance, the Basel Mission offered to sponsor the education of an ex-slave boy who had admission to Akropong Middle School (Cox and Haar, 2003). The church runs 487 nursery schools, 984 primary, 399 junior secondary and 27 secondary schools, 40 private schools, six vocational institutions, five training colleges, a research center and a university college.[8]Smith acknowledges the Mission's significant contributions when he notes: "the Presbyterian Church has become one of the three large educational units in Ghana, the other two being the Methodist and the Roman Catholic Churches." (Smith 1966:173)

2.5.3.2 Medical Services

Next to the spreading of the Gospel, one chief aim of missionary activity was health. The hostility of the climate, which exposed them to the vagaries of tropical diseases resulting in early deaths (Sundkler and Steed 2000; Amanor, undated), made the provision of health facilities and centers worth considering. According to Amanor, it was the clinics that were established by the mission doctors that became the basis for the development of a health delivery system in Ghana. In the area of health care, the Presbyterian Church of Ghana for instance is recorded to have founded health clinics. With four hospitals, 11 primary health care programs, eight health centers, 13 clinics, two nurses training colleges and a technical unit, the PCG is the third largest health care provider in Ghana today (covering 9 per cent of the total amount), after the governmental Ministry of Health and the Roman Catholic Church (Amanor, undated). By the year 1929, the Basel Mission had opened the Agogo Hospital in Asante (Sundkler and Steed

---

[8]http://www.oikoumene.org

2000). Sundkler and Steed assert that, "this hospital has become perhaps the most important inland medical center run by a Protestant church, in what is normally a Catholic–dominated medical field." (Sundkler and Steed, 2000:723) No less was Christianity's contribution to the health foundation of Ghana. The Christian Missions, by helping to popularize scientific medicine and improve sanitation, contributed significantly to the growth in rural population between 1920 and 1930 (Cox and Haar 2003). As Cox and Haar note, by the 1890s, Basel missionaries in the interior were treating wounds and minor ailments without asking for payment beyond the cost of the drugs.

Before 1922, a dispensary for women and children was organized at Christiansborg and in 1922; a hospital was opened at Aburi. The Agogo Presbyterian Hospital was started in the middle of 1928, and in the following year, a 60-bed hospital was opened (Smith 1966:187-188). Christian missions' contributions to health in Ghana and Africa at large are not only recorded in the provision of infrastructure such as clinics, hospital and other health centers, but also they were key contributors to the human resources needed to run these health centers. Smith (1966:186) posits that the Basel Missionary by 1882 had brought in medical doctors and nurses to take care of the health needs of not only the missionaries but the indigenous Ghanaian society as well. In 1951, the Basel Mission agreed to staff a clinic erected by the Dormaa Ahenkro Local Authority and a year later, a similar clinic was opened at Bechem. A much larger venture was the acceptance by the Mission of the responsibility for the running of the new Government Hospital at Bawku in the far north-east of Ghana (Smith 1966). Drs. Ernst Mahly, Rudolf Fisch, Eckhardt and Nurse Klara Finckh were few examples of health practitioners sent to Ghana by the Basel Missionary to support the health needs of the government of Ghana (Smith 1966).

2.5.3.3 Other Welfare Works
Christian missions have been supportive to welfare services of the government in several other areas aside education and health. The government's welfare service in the areas of the aged, the disabled and handicapped, and children and women has been a success not only by the government's own efforts and resources, but also by the enormous support from the Christian community in Ghana.

Orphans, the destitute, the poor and needy have benefited from variety of welfare services from the Christian churches in Ghana. Sundkler & Steed in their work on the History of the Church in Africa for instance, recount the activities of the Presbyterian Church of Ghana (under the Basel Missionaries) in their welfare support to orphans and destitute in Ghana. Accordingly, Sundkler and Steed note that the Basel Mission established a Christian village as a refuge for runaway slaves and other outlaws. Mobile, unattached young men, who had not achieved any position in society and were looking for new openings were adopted by the Basel missionaries. Some attended school, and some took up work in the missionaries' homes as well (Sundkler and Steed, 2000). Sundkler & Steed agree that the Basel mission in many instances came to be looked upon as a shelter and refuge for people in trouble (Sundkler and Steed 2000). A special piece of welfare work requiring mention is in the area of welfare works for specialized people like the blind and deaf. The Presbyterian Church of Ghana with assistance from the Scottish missionaries in 1943 established the Akropong School for the Blind, the first of its kind in West Africa (Smith 1966).

2.6 Summary

Chapter two of this study has assessed the nature of social welfare in Ghana from the British colonial era to the present. Highlights were made on the transition of the welfare system from what used to be a welfare system based on the extended family and traditional authorities, to the British system of welfare that introduced formal institutions, classroom education and currency-based economy. This chapter also highlighted the various welfare works of the churches, with most reference to the PCG on their education and health care. The chapter showed that the churches in Ghana have been part and parcel of the history of social welfare in Ghana since the coming of the European missionaries. The chapter that follows presents the method employed in gathering data on the welfare works of the PCG and CRC highlighted in this chapter.

CHAPTER 3

METHODOLOGY

3.0 Introduction

The social science is led by two broad methodological approaches: the quantitative and qualitative approaches. According to Babbie and Mouton (2001), the quantitative approach is preoccupied with numbers of similar theme. The qualitative approach on the other hand concerns an insider's viewpoint on a particular social phenomenon, (Babbie and Mounton 2001).

This study employed the use of qualitative research methodology. Bryman (2012:380) posits that qualitative research is a research strategy that emphasizes words rather than quantification in the collection of data. Babbie and Mouton (2001) are of the view that qualitative methods make it possible for a researcher to get an in-depth understanding of his or her research theme. Also, as noted by Casley and Kumar (1988), qualitative methods promote more contributions and participation by the respondents who may be individuals, focus groups, or communities. Moreover, Babbie and Mouton (2001) emphasize that this process is carried out in the natural location of the social actors. Thus, the researcher is sure that this approach will assist him or her in getting an insider's viewpoint that's dealing with his or her research enquiry and accomplishing his or her objectives.

My choice of this method stems from the fact that I want to bring to light the contributions of churches to social welfare in Ghana. According to Bryman (2012:380), qualitative research is an inductive research which is generated by theories. On the one hand, it has an epistemological position regarded as interpretivist that attempts to interpret the world and stress the understanding of the world; on the other hand, it has an ontological position regarded as constructivist that indicates outcome of interactions between individuals (ibid. p. 380). This study fulfilled the nature of qualitative research since it investigated churches' involvement in social welfare; it made clear the developments in social welfare support for citizens and evaluated the impact rather than simply describe a phenomenon of churches' contribution to social welfare.

The study also assumed a case study approach. It specifies two Christian churches as the case studies. According to Bryman, a case study research entails the detailed and intensive analysis of a case, and may be associated with the study of a location such as a community or organization. A case study research is concerned with the complexity and particular nature of the case in question (Bryman 2012: 66-67). The two churches selected for this study provided a good basis for a case study technique due to their diversity in structure and uniformity in function. The case study approach was suitable for this study because by selecting the two cases, it was possible to carry out an in-depth research on them and their involvement in Ghana's social welfare. The Presbyterian Church of Ghana is a mainline church from a western descent (Scottish) while Christ Reformed Church is associated with the Neo-Pentecostal Christian tradition. They represent two important classifications of Christian traditions involved in social welfare works. The focus of this study is not to compare and contrast the two churches; however, highlights will be thrown on areas with significant similarities and differences in their welfare works and how they shape the notion of citizenship in the discussion chapter. Comparison on themes such as the motivation behind their welfare works, how their different administrative structures characterize their welfare works, among others will be explored.

3.1 Study Selection

Neuman (2007: 280) has identified important issues that can be considered during the selection of a research site. Key among them is richness of the data and suitability. For that reason, the researcher selected a site that offers diverse information including varieties of events, activities and social relations. With regards to suitability, the researcher considered practical issues such as researcher's time, skills, serious conflicts among people in the site, researcher's personal characteristics and feelings and access to parts of the sites. This study was conducted on the Presbyterian Church of Ghana and Christ Reformed Church all in Accra, Ghana. The selection of the research site was based on the reasons explained below.

The fieldwork for this study was conducted in mid-June to August 2013, a time when the University of Oslo was on a long recess. Thus, this was one of the vacations that students of the university were to take a fieldwork in their home country as part of their master thesis project. The fieldwork was therefore conducted at 'home'. Jackson (1987) and Madden (2010), in

connection with their fieldwork, research experiences and theoretical approaches, understand home as a nation state, familiar region, a culture and/or macro-language bloc. 'Home' therefore connotes a distinctive quality and could therefore have personal and subjective meanings ascribed to it. Hence, home is not one thing; home is a great diversity of representations. It is therefore appropriate to make clear which home I did my fieldwork. In my case, home is an acquainted place where I have lived a greater part of my life years. To be more specific, this familiarity is founded on a number of factors: geographical, cultural, social and emotional constituents. I basically did my fieldwork in a community I know very well its streets, highways, buildings, among others. It is a place that brings back to me memories of old habits of speech, manners, attitudes and moods. I was born there, spent most of my life and school going ages there; as such it has molded my adult personality. Moreover, I have since my stay in this community involved myself in the activities of various groups including religious organizations and in particular with the Presbyterian Church of Ghana (PCG). These personal features are meant to express the specificity and familiarity of the place where I conducted fieldwork for this thesis. It was in my home country Ghana and among my own religious tradition in my habitat community. Among other reasons, I was motivated to study in my home country but particularly to explore how its Christian churches become effective agents of human well-being and social development through their social welfare works. Arising from this interest, I framed my home country and community research field as a social space with discursive and exploratory questions. On the one hand, I aimed at interviewing home with the objective of understanding critically the familiar social welfare works of the churches, and on the other hand, to engage in an exploration of the unfamiliar reasons, beliefs and motivations behind these works. My fieldwork was therefore a reflexive discourse with a place I already had natural connections. In order to approach this work in an academic way, and to explore critically my natural connections and familiar experiences with home, I have made and treated the familiar place (native country/religious tradition) as a research field (constituting social and geographical elements) through the use of reflexive dialogue. By means of this, I involve the relationships between me and my home country; scrutinize my views, perceptions and positions that I formed by my attachments to these churches and place.

Easy access to the churches and availability of social services were also considered. The churches were located in the researcher's home country, therefore, it was easy to get accommodation and other social services during the field work.

This study is limited to two churches in Ghana: the Presbyterian Church of Ghana and Christ Reformed Church, which are direct contributors to social welfare works. Most Christian churches in Ghana are not recognized under the bigger umbrella of the Christian Council, which implies that these churches are most likely not enlisted as existing churches. For this study, I chose to look at two churches that are fully accredited members of the Christian Council of Ghana (CCG)[9]. Another reason for selecting these churches was the scope of their social welfare works. Unlike some other churches whose welfare works are limited to their congregation, the selected churches extend their services beyond the four walls of their churches, which implies that they have a wider scope. As a result, a higher percentage of Ghanaian citizenries are most likely to benefit from their contributions, and as such results from the case study churches could be better grounds for generalization. To add to, the choice of the Presbyterian Church (mainline) and Christ Reformed Church (neo-Pentecostal) was to gain perspectives from two Christian denominations that are from different traditions. The assumption here is that if these churches are from different traditions, have different organizational structures, and differ in doctrinal issues, they may have different approaches to social welfare works and most especially their motivation for doing such works may differ. As noted earlier in this chapter, it is not the focus of this study to compare and contrast the two churches, but similarities and differences will be pointed out where those similarities and difference have significant effect on welfare and citizenship. Again, the two churches examined in this study were carefully chosen because of their long standing impact and influence in Ghana's social welfare works. Owing to their extensive contribution in Ghana, a lot of information is available on their activities.

---

[9]The Christian Council of Ghana (CCG) is an umbrella group that unites churches in Ghana.

3.2 Data Collection Method

According to Silverman and Marvasti (2008:134), methods are specific research techniques that a researcher uses to gather information. The data used in this study was gathered by using two techniques, namely, *documentary analysis* and *semi-structured interviews.*

The term 'documents' covers a very wide range of different kinds of sources (Bryman 2012: 543). J. Scott in discussing the different kinds of documents used in the social sciences distinguished between personal documents and official documents (ibid. pp. 543-544). Personal documents can both be in written form (such as diaries and letters) and in visual form (such as photographs). Official documents may include those derived from the state (such as public inquiries) and those derived from private sources (such as documents produced by organizations). Other kinds of documents identified by Scott include Mass Media outputs and Virtual outputs, such as internet resources (Bryman 2012: 543).

The documentary analysis in this study was established on the analysis of the secondary data. These included available published materials, relevant and trusted material from the churches (such as brochures, reports and leaflets), libraries and the internet. They are all included in the list of references.

Interviews were intended for generating primary data on the phenomenon under study. As identified by Flick (1998), semi-structured interview guide assist the interviewer to direct the process by conducting the interviews through relevant questions. The interview guides were developed in advance of the data collection. They were constructed in such a way that they covered all the areas that were likely to provide data necessary to answer the research questions. The interviews were conducted with key members in the study churches and other relevant institutions in question: pastors and top office holders of the churches, welfare committee leaders and members, lecturers from the faculty of Social Work at the University of Ghana, and key individuals who were knowledgeable about Ghana's social welfare system. In sum, thirteen (13) interviews were conducted, eight (4 each from both churches) of them becoming my most important sources, providing me important information, and the remaining four functioning as supporting sources.

Apart from selecting them as representing their respective institutions or churches, the interviewees were also chosen on the basis of how active they were as representatives, as well as what their position inside their respective institutions and churches was, giving priority to those in leadership positions. The reason for these lies in the assumption that those in leadership positions and more active participants posses more and relevant information on the subject. Moreover, they were also the ones who were more likely to take initiatives and implement them, thus, have a better insight into the motivation behind some of the social welfare works. Before every interview, 'face sheet' information of a general kind (name, age, gender, etc.) and of specific kind (position in organization, number of years involved in the group etc.) of each respondent was recorded. This, in the view of Bryman, "is useful for contextualizing people's answers (Bryman 2012: 473).

The interviewing took place in July and August, 2013. Face-to-face interviews were conducted with all the respondents and in all sessions (except informal conversation with some people on general issues), note taking and recording were done. All the respondents agreed to be recorded. As noted by Bryman, recording is important as it ensures that the interviewees' responses are captured in their own terms and allows the interviewer to be responsive to the interviewee answers and be able to follow them up (Bryman 2012). The interviews were conducted in English, the official language of Ghana. This was helpful because both the interviewer and the interviewee understood and could communicate in English better. The interviews were conducted in the premises of the churches' offices and in the individual work offices for other respondents. These areas where the interviews took place were quiet and private places that were agreed upon by the respondents themselves. Bryman notes that the importance of conducting interview in a quiet and private place is to ensure the quality of recording and to ensure that the interviewee does not worry about being overheard (Bryman 2012: 473).

In the view of Williman (2011), semi-structured interview puts the researcher in a better position to judge the quality of responses, to notice if the question is not properly understood and encourages the respondent to provide rich answers. The use of interview guide in questioning allows interviewers to glean the ways in which research participants view their social world and that there is flexibility in the conduct of the interviews (Bryman, 2012: 473). Moreover, the

semi-structured interview allows the researcher to make reflections and probing questions so as to get detailed information (Bryman, 2012). Notwithstanding the advantages associated with this, Scott and Usher points out some challenges. They note that although semi structured interview encourages the respondents to set the agenda of the interview, the presence of the interviewer and other forms of control such as power relation, may reduce full control of the setting (Scott and Usher 2011). The researcher went around this challenge by establishing an open environment that allowed sharing of different experiences so as to reduce the gap and to enhance the interviewees to share more experiences so as to provide detailed information. The average duration of interviews was about 60 minutes.

The transcription of the interview was done after the data collection was completed. Transcription has the advantage of keeping intact the interviewee's (and interviewer's) words (Bryman 2012:484). However, as noted by Gerson and Horowitz in Bryman (2012:486), some qualitative interviews are 'uninspiring and uninteresting'. For this reason, the researcher only transcribed portions of the interviews that were useful and relevant to the research topic. Bryman (ibid., p.486) posits that transcribing brings the researcher closer to the data, and encourages him or her to start to identify key themes, and become aware of similarities and differences between different participants' accounts. During the transcription, the researcher took notes of the key themes, similarities, as well as differences to be used for further analysis in this study.

3.3 Trustworthiness and Authenticity

Some writers have suggested that qualitative studies should be judged or evaluated according to quite different criteria from those used by quantitative researchers (Bryman 2012: 390). According to Bryman (2012), Guba and Lincoln identify *trustworthiness* and *authenticity* as alternative criteria to *reliability* and *validity* for evaluating qualitative research. This section will look at how these concepts reflect on this study.

3.3.1 Trustworthiness

Bryman (2012: 390) notes that 'trustworthiness' is made up of four criteria: credibility, transferability, dependability and confirmability. I will only touch on the issue of credibility and confirmability as discussed by Bryman in this study.

Credibility finds meaning in the view that if there can be several possible accounts of an aspect of social reality, it is the feasibility or credibility of the account that a researcher arrives at that is going to determine its acceptability to others. The establishment of the credibility of the findings entails both ensuring that research is carried out according to the canons of good practices and submitting research findings to the members of the social world who were studied for confirmation that the investigator has understood that social world (ibid. p. 390). The latter is what Bryman (2012) terms respondent validation. Respondent validation "is a process whereby a researcher provides the people on whom he or she conducted research with an account of his or her findings with the aim to seek corroboration or otherwise of the account that the researcher has arrived at." (Bryman 2012: 391) One way of achieving this is for the researcher to provide each research participant with an account of what he or she has said to the researcher in interviews and conversations (ibid. p.391). In this study, the researcher provided all the major informants with a copy of the transcribed interviews. All the informants reviewed and acknowledged their association with the transcribed data.

Confirmability is concerned with ensuring that although complete objectivity is impossible in social research, the researcher can be shown to have acted in good faith; in other words, he or she has not overtly allowed personal values or theoretical inclinations manifestly to sway the conduct of the research and the findings deriving from it (Bryman 2012 pp. 392-393). To achieve this, the researcher was pre-informed to neither conform to his personal experiences and values nor over-theorize the research survey. For this reason, the researcher did not simply accept theoretical terms that have been so influential from works over the past decades, nor accepted issues based on his personal relation with the research environment, but rather interpreted these theories into a plan of enquiry through fieldwork and focused on what the field research literally brought out. There was the sense that there is something to be discovered by the fieldwork.

3.3.2 Authenticity

As noted by Bryman (2012), the criteria of *authenticity* raise wider set of issues concerning the wider political impact of research. As he notes, the *authenticity* criteria are thought-provoking but have not been influential, and their emphasis on the wider impact of research is controversial (ibid., p. 393). Among the criteria of *authenticity* which I find relevant to this study are the issues

of *fairness*, that is, whether the research fairly represents different viewpoints among members of the social setting, and *ontological authenticity* which asks the question whether the research helps members to arrive at a better understanding of their social milieu.

This study meets the criteria of fairness in many ways. Firstly, the data collected represent more than one view point within the Christian church in Ghana. Not only do these perspectives come from two different traditions, but also they represent the two largest Christian traditions; the mainline churches (18.4%) and the neo-Pentecostals (28.3%), consisting 46.7% out of the total 71.2% Christian population (2010 Census). Furthermore, data collected during the research were not confined to the perspectives from the studied churches, but also those outside the church had an input. This gave a fair and balance assessment of the churches' contributions to social welfare in Ghana.

On the subject of *ontological authenticity,* the study addresses it through the survey questions asked. The data collected touched on questions that brought to the fore and gave clearer understanding of the background of the social welfare system in Ghana.

3.4 Ethical considerations

Ethical consideration according to Neuman is relevant to research because it helps to define what is or is not legitimate to do or what moral procedures are involved in the research process (Neuman 2007). As Bryman notes, there are certain areas of the research that could be observed albeit indirectly through hidden hardware like microphone without the clients being party to such agreements. Ethical principles of informed consent and invasion of privacy should be taken into consideration (Bryman 2012:495). In this study, issues such as informed consent, confidentiality, among others were taken into account. Formal letters of introduction and permission to conduct a research were sent to the churches under study to officially seek their consent and approval. This was submitted together with a copy of my University of Oslo student identity card. Prior to the data collection, oral consent was sought from all the participants. This involved an explanation of the purpose of the study, and an assurance of confidentiality relating to the information to be given. Participation in this research was entirely voluntary, free from compulsion and participants were told that they had the right to decline or make available information as well as to withdraw at any time during the interview process. Since there wasn't anything controversial

about this study, the identities of all participants relating to specific information were made open. The identities of those with whom the researcher had informal conversations were not revealed. However, permission was sought so that anonymous quotations may be used. The entire interview process was conducted in private places.[10]

3.5 How the empirical data is presented and analyzed

Much detail has been given in the preceding section on how empirical data in this thesis was gathered. It has also been established that the study is based on two months of field research of how and why churches contribute to social welfare in Ghana. This was achieved through interviews with relevant informants. It is this method of data collection that Bryman (2012) calls qualitative research method.

One may achieve the goal of presenting and analyzing data collected on a study by utilizing any of the approaches to theory building. A good example is by using a combination of what Bryman (2012) describes as *inductive* and *deductive* study. This thesis follows this structure in its presentation and analysis of the ethnographic data. Moreover, because contemporary local identities are networked in a global system (Madden, 2010), I will make relevant comparison between the Ghana system and other systems such as that of the European context.

The analysis in the succeeding chapters (5 and 6) contains information about my interactions and interview conversations with informants. In describing and interpreting the contributions of churches to social welfare in Ghana, I employed a thematic analysis of qualitative data in which empirical data is organized into core themes and subthemes. Data presentation/analysis and the discussion chapters of this thesis comprise chapters that explore themes moved by field research data from Ghana and by relevant theoretical frameworks.

3.6 Summary

In sum, this chapter has been reflecting on the method employed for this study. The discussion centered on sub-topics such as qualitative research method, study selection, data collection method, trustworthiness and authenticity, ethical considerations, as well as how the empirical

---

[10] Private places in this context means the personal offices of the informants. The intention was to have the interviews void of noise and intrusion from outsiders.

data is presented and analyzed. In order to put the discussion of welfare and citizenship in a theoretical context, the data gathered by the qualitative research method must be analyzed and discussed based on a theory. The subsequent chapter will therefore look at the theoretical concept that drives this thesis.

CHAPTER 4

THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

4.0 Introduction

This chapter sets out the conceptual framework of the thesis. The central research question bothers on how churches contribute to the social welfare and its impact on citizenship in Ghana. The theoretical point of departure is therefore citizenship.

4.1 The origin and definition of Citizenship

Shafir (1998) traces the history of the word 'citizenship' to the Greek city-state, the *polis*, where citizenship appeared as a double process of emancipation. It first served as a tool for liberating a portion of humanity from tribal loyalties and its fusion into a voluntary civic community. Secondly, in Shafir's words,

> it was the transcendence of the instrumental sphere of necessity, in which we toil to satisfy our material wants, into the sphere of freedom where the practice of freedom, in collective rational and moral deliberation over a common destiny, is its own reward (Shafir 1998).

The term 'citizenship' has gained different definitions and meanings from various arenas of the globe. Historically, the word 'citizen' refers simply to a member or "denizen" of a city, a carrier of urban collectivity which was relatively decoupled from the demands of a state (Janovski 1998). Recent definitions of the term however limit the above definition to simply imply the occupant of a city or a certain region.

The British sociologist and writer T.H. Marshall's conception of citizenship is often considered a good starting point for contemporary thinking. Marshall assesses citizenship and for that matter the citizen from three main dimensions: "civil, political and social" (Pierson and Castles 2006:30). According to Marshall, the civil element is composed of the rights necessary for individual freedom–liberty of the person, freedom of speech, thought and faith, right to own property and to conclude valid contracts, and the right to justice. The political rights consist of the right to participate in the exercise of political power, as a member of a body invested with

political authority or as an elector of the members of such a body. The last element – the social right, in the view of Marshall is different from the first two. To him, it is the right to defend and assert all one's rights on the terms of equality with others and by due process of law (Pierson and Castles 2006:30).

A classical definition of citizenship is the one by Bryan Turner. Turner defines citizenship as "that set of practices (juridical, political, economic and cultural) which define a person as a competent member of society, and which as a consequence shape the flow of resources to persons and social groups." (Turner 1993) A very important aspect of this definition is the idea of *practices.* The emphasis on the idea of *practices* avoids a state and juridical definition of citizenship as merely a collection of rights and obligations. As Turner argues, "the word *practices* should help us to understand the dynamic social construction of citizenship which changes historically as a consequence of political struggles." (Turner 1993) Thus, the concept of social practice as used by Turner, points out the idea of citizenship as a genuinely sociological and distinct from a legal or political notion. Another critical aspect of this definition as noted by Turner is how this definition of citizenship places the concept in the debate about inequality, power differences and social class (Turner 1993). This is because citizenship is bound up with the problem of the unequal distribution of resources in society. As a consequence of this definition, Turner argues for four issues that a general theory of citizenship must address. Citizenship, in Turner's view is concerned with: the content of social rights and obligations; the form or type of such practices; the social forces that produces such practices; and finally the various social arrangements whereby such benefits are distributed to different sectors of a society (Turner 1993). The context of citizenship refers to the exact nature of the rights and duties which define citizenship (Turner 1993) making Turner's definition essentially about the nature of social membership within modern political collectivities.

Richard Bellamy in his book *Citizenship* argues that traditionally, citizenship refers to a particular set of political practices involving specific public rights and duties with respect to a given political community (Bellamy 2008). In this sense, Bellamy sought to define citizenship in the light of political tasks citizens perform to shape and sustain the collective life of the community. This political task, deducing from his definition, is expressed in the citizen's involvement in the democratic process–primarily by voting, but also by speaking out,

campaigning in various ways, and standing for office. According to Bellamy, the evolution of this early conception to the classic citizenship, in which citizens are the members who are allowed to have some legal and political rights and obligations, can be traced to Ancient Greece (Bellamy 2008).

4.2 Diverse traditions in citizenship thoughts

Deliberations of citizenship often start by defining the liberal, communitarian and civic republican approaches. As with most categorizations, these perspectives are groups of ideas with common structuring dimensions, rather than categories into which particular ideas around citizenship can be slotted neatly (Jones and Gaventa 2002:2). For a clearer understanding of the divergent thinking around citizenship, I will give a brief summary of the principal elements of these perspectives.

4.2.1 Citizenship in liberal thought

Theories from the liberal arena promote the idea that citizenship is a status, which entitle individuals to a specific set of universal rights granted by the state. According to Oldfield (1990:2), central to liberal thought is the notion that individual citizens act "rationally" to advance their own interests, and that the role of the state is to protect citizens in the exercise of their rights. The understanding of liberty is a negative term (freedom *from*), in this 'protection' role of rights (Isin and Wood 1999; Smith 1998). The giving away of every individual the same formal rights is perceived as a way to encourage equality through making a person's political and economic power 'irrelevant' to rights claims. Consequently, the exercising of rights is understood as the choice of the citizens, on the assumption that they have the necessary resources and opportunities (Isin and Wood 1999). While rights to participate have long been central to liberal thought, these are largely rights to political participation, thus, the right to vote within a representative democratic system (Jones and Gaventa 2002).

A contribution from thinkers such as Marshall is considered *civic liberal* thought (Jones and Gaventa 2002). Marshall's (1950) theorization of citizenship, mainly his inclusion of social rights to the traditionally political and civil rights, is often considered a good starting point for contemporary thinking. "The understanding of citizenship underlying Marshall's work, which should be situated in its post-war British context of economic expansion, is marked by faith in the capacities of the state to protect individuals from social and economic uncertainties through

welfare provision" (Jones and Gaventa, 2002:3). Marshall, like many other liberal thinkers such as Modood Tariq, argues not for abolition of inequalities, but as Jones and Gaventa (2002:3) put it, "a reduction in the risks associated with capitalism for the poorest citizens." In Marshall's view, this would lead to an overarching sense of community and social cohesion (Jones and Gaventa 2002:3).

4.2.2 Citizenship in communitarian thought

Communitarian critics such as Michael Sandal have criticized the notion of the 'self-interested', 'independent' individual (Jones and Gaventa 2002:4) that liberalists such as Marshal and Rawl advocate for. Sandal notes that "an individual's sense of identity is produced only through relations with others in the community of which she or he is a part" (Jones and Gaventa 2002:4). As noted by Smith (1998), thoughts from the communitarians emphasize the concept of the socially-embedded citizen and community belonging. The individual, Jones and Gaventa (2002:4) argue, "can only realize her or his interests and identify through deliberation over the 'common good' and 'individual liberty is maximized through public service and the prioritization of the common good over the pursuit of individual interests."

In the view of Jones and Gaventa (2002:4), Smith (1998) suggests that "for communitarians, citizenship is defined through, and is seen to develop, particular 'civic virtues', such as respect for others and recognition of the importance of public service." In relating this to post-modern societies, Sandal (1998, cited in Jones and Gaventa 2002:4) puts forward that the "civic virtue distinctive to our time is the capacity to negotiate our way among the sometimes overlapping, sometimes conflicting obligations that claim us, and to live with the tensions to which our multiple loyalties give rise."

4.2.3 Citizenship in civic republican thought

The Civic republican thought, as expressed by Isin and Wood (1998) and noted by Jones and Gaventa (2002), makes effort to integrate the liberal notion of the self-interested individual within the communitarian context of egalitarianism and community belonging. Similar to communitarian thought, the civic republic puts emphasis on what binds citizens together into a

community. But as noted by Oldfield, for civic republican thinkers, this is underpinned by a concern with individual obligations to participate in communal affairs (Oldfield, 1990). Unlike civic liberal thought, civic republicans such as Oldfield posit that to enable participation in community life, basic resources are necessary, rather than conceiving them as basic rights per se (Jones and Gaventa, 2002). This affirms Kymlicka and Norman's view that while the liberal emphasizes on representative political systems, much civic republican writing promotes deliberative forms of democracy (Jones and Gaventa, 2002).

4.3 Concepts of Citizenship

4.3.1 Citizenship as a social status

Reference was made earlier in this chapter to the work of the British sociologist T. H. Marshall. He defines citizenship as "a status bestowed on those who are full members of a community" (Pierson and Castles (2006:34), and as such citizenship as being made up of three constituents – *civil, political, and social rights.* He explains the *civil* as rights necessary for individual freedom – liberty of the person, freedom of speech, thought and faith, the right to own property and to conclude valid contracts, and the right to justice. The *political* includes right to participate in the exercise of political power, as a member of a body invested with political authority or as an elector of the members of such a body. The *social*, on the other hand embraces the right to a modicum of economic welfare and security (Pierson and Castle, 2006). Marshall argues that the first two were given much prominence in the 18th and 19th centuries. Social rights in the form of economic and welfare rights on the other hand are utterly new phenomena in the 20th century (King & Waldron, 1988). Together with this understanding of citizenship, Marshall insists that the question of citizenship is not only a legal agenda but also is a social agenda which focus on a right to participate and practice in a social rights and access social services such as education, health services, among others (Turner, 2002).

Social rights would empower people to exercise civil and political rights. Social rights would give individuals a sense of security, which, in turn, would foster a sense of a collective identity between the state and its citizens. What is essential about citizenship is not only that it is a legal status but that it includes practices—social, political, cultural and symbolic. (Isin & Nielsen, 2008)

Marshall's conception of social rights was not concerned with equalizing incomes, but rather the general enrichment of the concrete substance of civilized life, a general reduction of risk and insecurity, an equalization between the more and the less fortunate at all levels – between the healthy and the sick, the employed and the unemployed, the old and the active, the bachelor and the father of a large family (Pierson and Castle 2006:39). By the notion of social citizenship, Marshall was advocating for equality of status and not equality of income.

4.3.1.1 Criticisms of Marshall's theory

T. H. Marshall's status as a historian, writer, social theorist, and his conception about citizenship and welfare rights has perhaps been widely received than those of his contemporaries. But this does not go without criticism. Key among his critics on his work *Citizenship and Social Class* (1949) is Jose Harris. In his work, *Citizenship in Britain and Europe: Some Missing Links in T.H. Marshall's Theory of Rights*, Harris points out critical loop holes in Marshall's work.

Among some of the criticisms of Marshall's notion are as follows:

Firstly, his conception of citizenship has been criticized as being Anglo-centric viewpoint. His critic argues that his assumption is based explicitly on the environment of England, and is not applicable neither to the whole British kingdom nor other European or countries in other parts of the world.

Furthermore, Harris (2010) points out the relationship between citizens' rights and property rights in Marshall's theory and argues that the right to procure property is not a civil right, but market-imposed right and should be treated distinctly from civil rights.

Marshall has also been criticized for being gender-biased in his conception. In what he thinks is the chronological process of gaining right, that's civil right first, then political right, followed by social right, his description can only be applied to male rights. His critic notes that the struggle for civil rights by females was a contested subject in the late 20th century and not just an issue from the 18th century.

4.3.2 Citizenship and Welfare Provision

T. H. Marshall puts forward that state welfare is the culmination of the evolution of citizenship rights (Midgley 1997). Marshall (1950) posits that in earlier times in Western democratic societies, civil, political, and social rights were enjoyed by only a small minority. The monarch and aristocrats held political power, and rights were limited to the few. However, the evolvement of society resulted in the extension of rights (Midgley 1997). As civil rights were applied to larger groups of people in the 18th century, the idea of citizenship was enlarged. The 19th century saw further extension of rights in the political arena that permitted men and later women to participate in political affairs (Midgley 1997). This development further enhanced the notion of citizenship. However, one cannot be regarded as full citizen, if he or she does not gain "the basic human equality associated with full membership of a community," (Marshall 1950) that is, if they live in poverty, are badly housed, experience poor health, and are inadequately educated (Midgley 1997). Therefore, the move towards full citizenship required that people also had social rights (Midgley 1997).The fulfillment of citizenship thus requires the state to intervene to ensure that citizens' basic needs are met, that their problems are addressed, and that they have opportunities for advancement. As the state guarantees civil and political rights, it must extend social programs to establish social rights for all (Midgley 1997). Marshall's idea of citizenship, which embraces civil, political, and social rights, in the view of Midgley, underlies his conception of the ideal – typical welfare state (Midgley 1997). According to Midgley, the welfare state is a society in which all three rights (civil, political, social) are guaranteed and in which people have opportunities to realize their full potential. The granting of social rights, he argues, is essential for the proper enjoyment of civil and political rights (Midgley 1997). The concept of social citizenship as proposed by Marshall has exerted a powerful influence on social policy and his representational approach has helped to frame debates about the welfare state (Midgley 1997).

4.3.3 Citizenship as an "Act"

In 2008, Engin F. Isin, a professor of Citizenship in Politics and International Studies in his quest to contribute to the citizenship debate used the concept "act of citizenship" to connote how institutions and individuals respond to the needs of other less privileged citizens to bring them to

par with the rest of the society. The concept "act of citizenship" theorizes that on one hand, one party has pressing needs that must be heard, and on the other hand, one party must turn to these pressing needs. To this end, Isin (2008) are of the view that an "act of citizenship" is established when the needs and demands of the less privileged citizens in society are equally met with positive response from other citizens or institutions. To 'act' in the Oxford English Dictionary according to Isin (2008) includes "to bring into action", "bring about, perform or make", or "to carry out a project, command or purpose". To these scholars therefore to 'act' goes beyond being *directed* and *oriented* towards something but also includes to perform an action either as genuine or counterfeit (Isin 2008). Any action that is liable to yield either genuine or counterfeit result can therefore be termed as an act. Citizenship as an Act, according to Isin (2008) is built on three principles: the first principle of investigating acts of citizenship is to interpret them through their grounds and consequences, which includes subjects becoming 'activist citizens' through scenes created; second is the recognition that acts produce actors and become answerable to justice; and finally, is to recognize that act of citizenship do not need to be founded in law or enacted in the name of the law (Isin 2008).

4.4 Justification of the theory

Although there are many theories such as 'Power' and 'Social Development' that may fit well into the discussion of social welfare, I think the concept of Citizenship is more relevant than others in this study. Welfare issues in developing countries like Ghana are more focused on seeking the well-being of individual citizens rather than looking at a broader idea of, for instance, Social Development.

Analyses from the fieldwork data gathered reveal that the PCG and CRC engage in social welfare works that mainly provide 'social rights' – education, health care, and other social care programs. Despite the various criticisms on Marshall's notion of citizenship, his notion of Social Citizenship will be relevant to this case.

It was also found out that the provision of these social rights contribute to a *Participatory Citizenship*,[11] making citizens more active in societal/community activities. The data further

---

[11] Participatory Citizenship will be expounded in the introductory section of Chapter 6.

revealed that the PCG and CRC in their provision of social welfare viewed themselves as co-partners with the State in 'building a home together'. The notion of the "home we build together" describes a narrative of citizenship based on responsibility to society connected by the ideas of giving and belonging instead of individual rights (Sacks 2007:13-23).[12]

Employing Marshall's notion of '*social citizenship*' together with Sacks' perspective of '*the home we build together*', this study will look at how the churches in Ghana through the provision of 'social rights' (education, health care and other social care) contribute to Participatory Citizenship.

4.5 Summary

The discussion under theoretical framework has been focused on the concept of citizenship from a general standpoint. The chapter discussed topics such as *citizens as a social status, citizenship as an act, citizenship and welfare*, among others. The chapter ended with justification for employing Marshall's notion of 'Social Citizenship', together with Sacks' idea of "the home we build together" as appropriate theories to be used for discussing how the churches in Ghana through their social welfare programs contribute to Participatory Citizenship. The next two chapters will present, analyze and discuss data from the fieldwork using these theories.

---

[12] Further perspectives on "home we build together" will be highlighted in Chapter 6.

CHAPTER FIVE

DATA PRESENTATION

5.0 Introduction

This chapter is devoted to the presentation and findings of the data from the fieldwork. The study is focused on the contribution of the Presbyterian Church of Ghana (PCG) and the Christ Reformed Church (CRC) in transforming the lives of Ghanaian citizenries through their social welfare programs. Much interest was placed on the motivation behind the churches' social welfare activities. Other perspectives of the study explored issues such as funding and challenges that come with undertaking these social welfare activities. The data of this study were gathered mainly through interviews. The greater part of this data is presented herein with considerations for the research questions. The interpretations on the findings will be followed further in chapter 6 in which an effort is made to draw out the significance of the results for the theoretical concept(s) that have moved the research thesis.

5.1 Key Informants

As indicated in the introduction above, the data for this study was gathered through qualitative interviews and informal discussions with a range of relevant people whom the researcher met during the fieldwork. The interviews were conducted with the help of an interview guide developed in advance of the data collection. The interview guide covered all the areas that were likely to provide data necessary to answer the research questions. The interviews were conducted with key members in the study churches and other relevant institutions in question: pastors and top office holders of the churches, welfare committee leaders and members, lecturers from the faculty of Social Work at the University of Ghana, and key individuals who were knowledgeable about Ghana's social welfare system. The identities of informants whose views formed the core of this study are opened while informants that gave supporting views and those the researcher had informal conversation with are identified as anonymous. The interviews were carried out in the offices of the informants and in some cases during participation in social welfare programs by the churches. The table below shows the information on the various participants.

Table 1: List of informants according to their gender, position, church affiliate and date of interview

Informant Name /Number	Gender	Position	Church Affiliate	Date of Interview
Rev. Daniel Oppong	Male	Clergy	PCG	04.07.2013
Cat. Janet .A. Asare	Female	Catechist	PCG	01.07.2013
Mr. Emmanuel Antwi	Male	Presbyter	PCG	15.7.2013
Mrs. Grace Bediako	Female	Welfare Leader	PCG	14.07.2013
Mr. Kwame Ossei	Male	PRO	CRC	20.07.2013
Mr. Owusu Badu	Male	General Secretary	CRC	02.08.2013
Ms. Evelyn Sefa	Female	Welfare Member	CRC	02.08.2013
Mad. Irene Yeboah	Female	Deaconess	CRC	04.08.2013
Mr. Samuel Asare	Male	Lecturer	-	10.08.2013
Informant 1	Female	Beneficiary	-	12.08.2013
Informant 2	Female	Beneficiary	-	12.08.2013
Informant 3	Male	Beneficiary	-	12.08.2013
Informant 4	Female	Beneficiary	-	12.08.2013

5.2 Background of Case Study Churches and Interview Participants

This study used two Christian churches as its case study; the Presbyterian Church of Ghana (PCG) and the Christ Reformed Church (CRC).

5.2.1 The Presbyterian Church of Ghana (PCG)

In the interview with Rev. Daniel Oppong, the Director of Development and Social Services of the PCG at the church's headquarters, he noted that the PCG is under the bigger umbrella of the mainline churches in Ghana. According to Omenyo (2006), the mainline churches are products of missionary bodies, which began effective and sustained evangelization in Ghana (formerly Gold Coast) in 1828, with the arrival of the Base1 Mission which produced the Presbyterian Church of Ghana. Afterwards, other western missionary societies followed, and gave birth to other mainline churches such as the Methodist, Catholic, Anglican, Evangelical Presbyterian and the African Methodist Episcopal Zion Church. Omenyo (2006) further posits that for all intents and purposes, the mainline churches during the immediate post-independence era were invariably complete replicas of their respective missionary societies. The churches imbibed the ethos of the western missionary bodies.

According to Rev. Daniel Oppong, the first Basel missionaries that came to Ghana (then Gold Coat) stationed itself in the Akwapim Hills, close to Accra, where there were fewer mosquitos to spread diseases. Rev. Daniel Oppong reiterated that the church received its current name in 1926, although it was then known as the Presbyterian Church of the Gold Coast until the country's independence and change of name. According to him, the church has been well-known for its social work, especially within the educational sector. It was first in establishing a College in Ghana (in 1848), a school for the blind (1934) and later a school for the deaf and dumb (1957). The church has kept its tradition within the educational sector and ran many schools (most of them being primary schools). "The Basel missionaries also founded health clinics, and the PCG is in charge of several health programs (including hospitals, clinics, a nursing training college etc.)," Rev. Oppong asserted. In the interview, Rev. Oppong narrated that the PCG is the third largest health care provider in Ghana today (covering 9 per cent of the total amount), after the governmental Ministry of Health and the Roman Catholic Church.

When asked on the structure of the church, Rev. Daniel Oppong noted that the PCG operates in the system referred to as 'the court'. The various Courts of the church in ascending order are: Session, District, Presbytery and the General Assembly. In addition to the various Courts, the PCG has seven church departments that have specific tasks of building up the church in their respective activities. According to the World Council of Churches data, by close of 2012 the

PCG had more than 565,600 members and almost 2,200 congregations (www.pcgonline.org, *Retrieved 20.08.2013).*

5.2.2 Christ Reformed Church (CRC)

The Christ Reformed Church (CRC), popularly known in Ghana as "Kristo Asafo" can be classified under the Neo-Pentecostal or Charismatic tradition of Christian group. According to William Kay, Pentecostalism is a renewal movement within Christianity and can be understood as a continuation of a series of renewal movements that go right back to the earliest days of the church. Kay is of the view that Pentecostalism is usually dated from the start of the 20th century with immediate roots going back to the 19th century into revivalist Methodism, holiness offshoots of Methodism, Pietism, international missions, and protagonists of divine healing (Kay 2011).

In narrating the history of the church during the fieldwork interviews at the premises of the church offices in Accra, the Public Relations Officer of CRC, Mr. Kwame Ossei noted that the CRC was founded on 3rd February, 1971 by Apostle Dr. Kwadwo Safo. Mr. Ossei further asserted that the church began with the founder preaching the gospel single-handedly and later with the help of the only convert he made during his evangelism. According to Mr. Ossei, the history of the church recounts that the initial converts began worshipping in the house of the founder. With the increasing number of members, the church relocated to the Ghana County Preparatory School in Accra Newtown which eventually became the first branch of the church. With continued evangelism, the church expanded its territories outside the borders of Accra, the capital of Ghana, to other towns and cities across the country. The Christ Reformed Church has branches all over the ten regions in Ghana. Touching on the structure of the church, Mr. Ossei narrated that the church is headed by the leader and founder, Apostle Dr. Kwadwo Safo. He noted that there are Pastors (solely males) who serve in the capacity as overseers in the various branches across the country. Other departments such as finance and administration are manned and staffed with hired professionals who have the technical knowhow. According to Mr. Kwame Ossei in the same interview, he said that with 137 church branches across the length and breadth of Ghana, the CRC has a membership of over 60,000 congregants.

5.3 Contributions of PCG and CRC to social welfare in Ghana

5.3.1 Social welfare programs undertaken to help citizens

The information from the churches indicates that there are numerous social welfare programs undertaken by the churches to better the lives of Ghanaian citizens. Both Rev. Daniel Oppong and Mr. Kwame Ossei highlighted Education and Health as key areas of focus. Both churches also had other programs which were exclusive to them. Rev. Daniel Oppong noted:

Aside education and health, we have other social interventions such as Relief and disaster risk reductions; Support to homes and orphanages; Rural water and sanitation; and Employable Skills Development/Livelihood Support.

According to Mr. Kwame Ossei, the CRC also engages in other programs. He said,

The church's social welfare programs also cover welfare services for the aged; support for children Homes and rehabilitation centres; feeding program for street children, mentally disabled, and other physically challenged individuals.

The findings of this study revealed that a welfare program such as Employable Skills Development/Livelihood Support is a source of income generating for citizens. As Rev. Daniel Oppong notes, the skills acquired by beneficiaries during these trainings makes them employable while others starts their own businesses.

Moreover, the fieldwork data brought to bear that not all social welfare programs fall under the churches priorities. Mr. Owusu Badu asserted,

It's not all welfare programs that the church involves in. Aside what the founder and leader of the church decides on, they also consider those programs that their budget can finance.

Mrs. Grace Bediako of PCG claimed:

We consider welfare programs that have international and national interest. Since part of our funding comes from external sources, we undertake those programs that easily attract sponsorships from international donors and the general public.

Although Mr. Samuel Asare, a lecturer at the Social Welfare department of the University of Ghana notes that one of the areas the government is focusing on recently is social welfare programs directed towards eradication of juvenile crimes and substance abuse among the youth. The finding however indicates that the churches do not put priority on welfare programs such as juvenile crime prevention and substance abuse.

5.4 Church – State Relations in social welfare

The churches in Ghana contribute to the welfare of the citizens through collaboration with state welfare agents. In undertaking their social welfare programs, they link with one state agency or the other. The Director of Development and Social Services of PCG, Rev. Daniel Oppong, points out that the PCG works hand in hand with state social welfare agencies in their social welfare deliveries. The reason is to integrate their activities into the national interest and to identify potential welfare beneficiaries that the church may not be aware of. He asserted,

The church always has to work within the institutional framework. So we work with the National Disaster Management Organization (NADMO), Fire Service, Commission on Human Rights and Administrative Justice *(CHRAJ) and other state agencies depending on the particular situation.*

Catechist Janet Asare of the PCG commented:

Collaborating with the state in social welfare delivery is very helpful to us as a church. Most of these state agencies are well informed of the people who need our services and in which areas. Collaborating with them gives us this information and reduces the stress of finding out all by ourselves and yields greater results.

The PRO of CRC, Mr. Kwame Ossei said,

All our social welfare programs to homes and orphanages are undertaken in collaboration with the government's department of Social Welfare.

The findings of this study showed that the churches do not encounter any confrontations or oppositions from the state in undertaking social welfare programs. The relationship between the church and the state is cordial. As Mr. Owusu Badu of CRC noted,

Our relationship with the state as a church in doing social welfare works is very cordial. The state appreciates our works for the citizenry and has never at any point interfered in doing such

welfare works. The founder and leader of the church, Apostle Dr. Kwadwo Safo has received many awards from past governments (including The Order of the Volta award in 2007, the highest award by government of Ghana) on the church's contribution to social welfare work. That should tell you that we are at peace with the state in this regard.

Rev. Daniel Oppong claimed,

The church does not have any confrontation with the state in doing social welfare works.

The findings further revealed that the state-church relation in social welfare is more of a complementary role from the part of the church to the state. The data seems to suggest that the churches complement the state in seeking the welfare of the citizens rather than the notion that the church is taking up the role of the state because the state has failed in their social welfare responsibilities to the Ghanaian citizens. Rev. Daniel Oppong posits:

We know the responsibility of the welfare of the citizens lies on the state, but the government alone cannot shoulder such huge responsibility. That's why we come in as a church to support what the government is already doing with our social welfare programs.

PRO Kwame Ossei said,

The government has a responsibility; there is no doubt about that. The government collects taxes from the people, but you do agree with me that government alone cannot cater for all these needs. So that is where as a religious institution, we also identify where we have a responsibility and supplement the efforts of the state.

5.5 Social Welfare and Motivation
The findings from the fieldwork pointed out that there were diverse motivations behind the doing of social welfare works by the churches in Ghana. The motivations span from theological to secular motives.

5.5.1 Theological motivation
In the citations that follow, I understand the informants to mean that religion is a key motivator behind their social welfare programs. The researcher asked:

Will you say that the motivation for engaging in social welfare drives on theological perspectives?

Rev. Daniel Oppong, the Director of Development and Social Services of the PCG noted**:**

Basically yes! The Bible says that if you meet a Christian or anybody and you tell him or her well done, God bless you or be warm while you see the person visibly shaking and cold and you have three or more clothing which you can give him or her but you refuse to, arguably it is good to pronounce good wishes but better to act practically. So we as a church concretize or make more explicit and practical what we preach. This is love, which is what Jesus preached.

The PRO of CRS, Mr. Kwame Ossei said:

Every motivation and inspiration is from the mission and vision of the founder through the gospel. He tells you and cites biblical examples that the fact that you are a Christian does not mean that you should be poor. Rather you should be wealthy to live a comfortable life and also assist those who are in need. That's where the motivation comes from.

The findings of the data indicated that the theological motivation is not based on denominational doctrines but rather on scriptures. Both Rev. Daniel Oppong and Mr. Kwame Ossei cited Bible references such as James 2:15-16, Job 29 and Deuteronomy 15:7-11 as basis for their motivation.

One interesting finding from the data about theology as a motivator is that it stems from Bible passages based on either 'the love of God' or 'the poor being with us'.   On the poor being with us, Mr. Kwame Ossei of CRC insists that,

In the Bible, there are several quotations that support the act of giving. In Deuteronomy 15:7ff, God instruct the Israelites to help the poor and needy among them. Every individual is supposed to give something as charity to the poor and the needy. This instruction tells us that God himself recognizes that there will be poor people, the needy, motherless and fatherless among us always.

Mrs. Grace Bediako, a welfare committee leader in PCG comments by quoting Deuteronomy 15:11. She quotes:

"There will always be poor people in the land. Therefore I command you to be openhanded toward your brothers and toward the poor and needy in your land." It is our responsibility as a church to fulfill this mandate from God, she asserted.

On love for God, Rev. Daniel Oppong said,

We obey the commands of God because of the love we have for Him. Nothing else counts. We don't do that because of the fear of men, or because we want to please humans. No man can reward us for this. We do that out of the love we have for God.

Mr. Kwame Ossei noted:

In James 2:15, the Bible says that if any of your brethren is in need and they come to you and you say go in peace and you don't give them what they need, you cannot call yourself a Christian. Faith without works is dead, and it is God who will reward our good works. But on top of this all, we do it to express our love towards God.

5.5.2 Mutual Support as a motivator

The churches pointed out that another motivation for doing social welfare works was the opportunity to support each other for their common good. A welfare member of the PCG, Ms. Evelyn Sefa made it clear:

It is the desire of the church that our social welfare activities will serve as a mutual support for people in the society.

It looks as if the mutual support motivation has placed the church in a role as a new surrogate family providing for the welfare needs of the traditional family. Do the following excerpts support this finding?

Mr. Emmanuel Antwi, a presbyter at PCG commented:

In Ghana today, the structure of the family is changing from the 'traditional' family (a group of people bonded by blood) to a myriad of different forms, with the church emerging as a stronger part of the family. We do not see ourself as independent of the traditional family. When we support people, it is because we see ourselves as one family.

Mr. Kwame Ossei stated that,

It is different families bonded by blood who come together to form a big family called church. We take up the responsibility to help those in need because the burden of the various families is also the burden of the church.

Furthermore, it was found out that the churches' motivation of mutual support rests on the fact that there is a need in the society and that the government alone is not in the position to provide for the citizens. Since they are 'family members', they must support one another. Presbyter Emmanuel Antwi makes it clear by saying,

Those who are in need cannot get the adequate support they require from the government, so the church comes in to cushion them up.

5.5.3 Ideological motivation.

The ideology of humanitarianism was one of the motivating factors for the churches involvement in social welfare works. The researcher found out that, the churches were of the belief that, when the welfare of people is not attended to, it could result in for instance, political fear and social unrest. Catechist Janet Asare during the interview noted:

As a church we don't only believe in the spiritual, we also believe that when people face too much hardship, they may resort to dubious means like armed robbery and other social vices to survive. This can lead to political and social chaos. We help the society with our social welfare works to prevent some of these social vices.

Moreover, the data points out that, there is the idea of a category of the citizens in need by virtue of natural circumstances like old age. Deaconess Irene Yeboah of CRC was of the view that:

The aged in our society need support in all aspects of their lives, but most especially economically. We believe most of them are not financially sound because they are no more working to generate income. Those of them without immediate families to support them must benefit from the church's social welfare programs.

5.6 Welfare and Politics

The researcher found out that partisan politics is a challenge to social welfare in Ghana. The churches had this to say on welfare and politics. The data revealed that there is the challenge of identity politics with regards to welfare distribution.

Rev. Daniel Oppong claimed:

There is always a problem of politicking when the church collaborates with state agencies in social welfare delivery. Sometimes when goods are entrusted in the hands of government welfare agencies for distribution, they end up benefiting citizens who share the same political affiliation with the government in power. And when all is done, they project it on national television that it is the political party in power that has presented these items and they will not mention the church's name because they want political recognition.

Similarly, Mr. Kwame Ossei opined:

You will bear with me that in this part of our world, our understanding of politics is limited. Depending on which political party is ruling, when you are involved in these philanthropic activities, you are labeled as a supporter of the party in government. We however remain focused because we involve in this social welfare all the time no matter the political party in power.

5.7 Funding - international and national donors, private and public funding
This study sought to find out how the churches in Ghana financed their various welfare programs. The findings indicate that both churches have different sources of funding, though they agree at some point. The data revealed that the churches rely on both internal and external sources in raising funds for their welfare programs.

5.7.1 Internal sources of funding
The PCG asserted that internally they raise funds through donations from church members and contributions from the churches headquarters. As Rev. Daniel Oppong asserts:

Initially, when the missionaries were around and shortly after they left, they were funding it. But now they are no longer financing it. Besides, now we understand the Gospel and know that there is more blessing in giving than receiving so we also want to teach our people to give. Donations from our own members support our welfare works. Aside members' contributions, bulk of the money for funding of our welfare programs comes from the headquarters.

The CRC on the other hand internally generate funds for their welfare programs through the leader and founder of the church, as well as contributions from church members. When the question of how they finance their social welfare programs was asked, Mr. Kwame Ossei argued:

The founder and leader himself had this vision before even establishing the church so he invested in a lot of businesses in order to raise money to finance some of these projects. He has a transport company with about 150 buses running around every part of Ghana. Several other companies including mining companies also come and rent the buses. He also has a nail factory at Tema Industrial area and he is still investing. Also, we have a congregation of more than 60,000 people who donate generously towards our welfare programs. So from the founder's own resources and the little we get from the congregations, we invest in these projects

5.7.2 External sources of funding

Both churches sourced for funding from outside the church. This comes in the form of donations from corporate organizations, appeal from benevolent individuals and donations from overseas partners.

Rev. Daniel Oppong of the PCG indicated that the church relies on their western partners such as Interchurch Organization for Development Co-operation (ICCO) and the Dutch Government. Rev. Oppong further noted:

Sometimes we get some funding from generous individuals and other corporate bodies. We write proposals and when we get the monies, we use them for the proposed projects.

Mr. Owusu Badu, the General Secretary of the church asserted that the CRC, who scarcely rely of external funding, occasionally makes appeal to the general public for financial support in situations where the work load is enormous.

The findings of the study reveal that the churches are faced with the challenge of financing their social welfare programs. Rev. Daniel Oppong argued that,

Key among the challenges we face is inadequate funds to undertake the various projects. I am just from a working visit to the North. After the storm in the North, about six schools had their roofs ripped off. We couldn't serve all the schools. We were to select few and what we heard is

that apart from the schools we served, all the other schools are still there without any help yet. There is a lot to do but the resources are also limited.

Mr. Kwame Ossei, the PRO of CRC said,

There are numerous challenges. First is lack of adequate financial resources as against the numerous requests for help we receive. Sometimes we are so overwhelmed with the request from leprosy associations, blind and cripple, that you find it difficult to raise the necessary resources to meet those obligations.

In an interview with Mr. Kwame Ossei of CRC, I noted that the church's plan to venture into profit making business to solve their financial challenges also benefits the citizens directly. On the one hand, it generates income for the church to enable them fund their welfare programs, and on the other hand it is a source of employment for the citizens. As Mr. Ossei noted:

One of the ways to solve our financial crisis is that the church has started venturing into profit making businesses to fund our various welfare programs. This does not only bring us income, but creates job for the unemployed citizens in the society.

Moreover, it was found out that the kind of welfare program the churches undertake influence the decision whether to be supported financially or not, especially from international donors and the general public. Rev. Daniel Oppong argues that welfare works that are observable attracts more donors than those that are difficult to show fast enough accomplishment.

5.8 Access to welfare and rules of eligibility

The research data dived into finding out from the churches those worthy or unworthy to receive welfare benefits. The finding indicates that every person within the borders of Ghana qualifies to be a recipient. As Mr. Kwame Ossei argues,

All manner of people benefit from our services. We do not discriminate against anybody. We don't give based on tribe or nationality. If the person is staying in Ghana and we realise he is in need, then he is qualified.

Rev. Daniel Oppong said,

We do not care so much about who benefits from our welfare programs. Our aim is to meet the needs of the people. We don't take into account the tribe or country of birth of the person. Whether a Ghanaian or not, the most important thing is that the person is in need and needs our support.

Although the churches claimed that every citizen is worthy of welfare benefits, the findings further indicates that there are criteria to be met for welfare benefits. Mr. Kwame Ossei in an interview during the fieldwork notes *priority* and *recommendation* as key in this regard. (Interview conducted, 20.07.2013)

Based on the information from the churches, it was revealed that some recipients who are given access to welfare programs that gives training do not put them to practice after the training. Rev. Daniel Oppong claims that when welfare programs deals in distribution of items, a lot of people turn up but very few are available for programs that gives training to beneficiaries. He further noted that very few out of the people who turn up for training programs put what they learn to practice to earn a living for themselves.

Mr. Kwame Ossei said,

We have challenges with the people on the ground themselves. Like the adage goes, 'You teach a person how to fish instead of always giving a person fish'. We normally go out there like I earlier indicated, we buy sewing machines for those who are crippled and those who are in need, we pay for their apprenticeship with the hope that after they are done, they will go out there to make a living for themselves. Sometimes when they are confronted with challenges in their work, they abandon the work and go back to the streets to beg.

The researcher tried to find out the reasons for the above claims by the churches. An interview with some welfare beneficiaries during the fieldwork brought out the following findings:

Respondents 1 and 3 commented that they are not interested in some of the vocational training programs that they receive from the churches. They claimed it is part of the reasons they do not put to practice the skills they acquire after the training. The respondents further indicated that

they would have preferred to be given a chance to choose which training program they are interested.

Respondents 2 and 4 argued that they would have preferred to be trained in skills that will require very little or no capital to start their own business after the training. They claimed sometimes the kind of skills they are trained in leaves them with little choice to work with, as they do not have the required capital to start something on their own.

Although some of the beneficiaries claimed not all the welfare programs serve their interest, they admitted that it is helpful in diverse ways. Respondent 1 and 4 claimed it has made them financially independent as they are self-employed through the skills they acquired in past trainings.

5.9 Summary

In Chapter 5, I have presented the findings from the data gathered from the fieldwork. This chapter has given information about informants and the studied churches. The chapter further highlighted significant findings that will be taken over to chapter 6 for further discussion. Key among these findings includes the following: it was found out that education and health care are the two key welfare programs the two churches engage in. On the relationship between the churches and State in welfare works, the findings indicated three dimensions of relationship: collaborative, cordial and complementary.

The chapter also revealed that both churches' motivation for doing social welfare spans from theological to secular motives. Moreover, funding of welfare works in the churches is sourced from both internal and external donors. Another key finding revealed in this chapter was the role of the churches as a "surrogate family" and as "co-partners in nation building". Finally, this chapter has highlighted some challenges faced by the churches in doing social welfare works. These challenges come in the form of financial, human and political factors.

Using the theories of "Citizenship" and "building home together", the chapter that follows discuses into details these findings and how they contribute to Participatory Citizenship.

CHAPTER SIX

CHURCH, WELFARE AND CITIZENSHIP IN GHANA

6.0 Introduction

Chapter six of this study discusses the empirical data presented in the preceding chapter. The subject of social welfare and citizenship is to a larger extent reflected upon in this chapter. This is achieved by linking to the theoretical concepts of "Citizenship" and "building home together" presented in chapter 4. It seems a truism to say that the studied churches through their welfare programs, which come in the form of Marshall's 'social rights', contribute to a Participatory Citizenship in Ghana.

Wertheimer and Kahne (2004) define Participatory Citizenship as the active participation in the civic affairs and the social life of the community at the local, state, or national level. Wertheimer and Kahne note that proponents of participatory citizenship emphasize engagement in collective, community-based efforts. The engagement in community activities develops relationships, common understandings, trust, and collective commitments (pp. 241-242).

A classical definition of Participatory Citizenship that will be relevant to this study is the one by Bryony Hoskins in Hoskins et al (2012). Hoskins defines *Participatory Citizenship* as "participation in civil society, community and/or political life, characterized by mutual respect and non-violence and in accordance with human rights and democracy." (p.18)

Hoskins by this definition encompasses participatory citizenship to a range of actions, from involvement in participatory democracy (including actions that hold governments accountable), to representative democracy (including actions such as voting), and to participation in the everyday life of the community. The definition is inclusive with respect to new forms of civic and political participation such as one-off issue politics and responsible consumption, as well as the more traditional forms of membership in political parties and non-governmental organizations (Hoskins et al 2012: 14-15).

By adopting the definition by Hoskins, the kind of Participatory Citizenship advocated by the two churches (PCG and CRC) in Ghana appears to be more focused on community activities than political activities. Specifically, the PCG and the CRC contribute to a kind of Participatory

Citizenship that is focused on community and social participation. This has been typical in the scope of the civil society in which citizens have been beneficiaries of the churches' welfare programs such as Education, Health, and other Social care. The churches do not engage in the practice of political participation, through which citizens involve in traditional forms of political participation in voting, political parties, among others.

Although the churches are not involved in direct political participation, this study shows that the kind of Participatory Citizenship provided mainly through social rights by these churches creates the capability for citizens to exercise other rights such as political and civil rights. This study confirms that access to social right such as education and health care supports civil and political rights.

Welfare programs by the PCG and CRC span from those that give financial aid, those that give goods rather than money, to those programs that offer services. In this chapter, much devotion is paid to how the various social welfare programs of the churches, the motives for doing such works, and the challenges they face contribute to the idea of Participatory Citizenship in Ghana. I approach this discussion under two broad themes: the church as partner in nation building, and the church as a surrogate family.

6.1 CHURCH AND STATE IN SIMILAR SOCIAL WELFARE ACTIVITIES: BUILDING THE HOME TOGETHER

6.1.1 The home we build together

The researcher's analysis of an interview remark from Rev. Daniel Oppong implied that the church was convinced it has a mission to partner the State in seeking the welfare of the poor and needy in the society. The reading of his view on the Church-State relationship in welfare works can be picked out from the following interview excerpt:

Researcher: *Do you think it is the responsibility of the church to engage in social welfare works that are originally supposed to be for the State?*

Rev. Daniel Oppong: *We know the responsibility of the welfare of the citizen lies with the state, but the government alone cannot shoulder such huge responsibility. That's why we come in as a church to support what the government is already doing with our social welfare programs.*

I think the remarks from Rev. Daniel Oppong highlights the interplay between the Church and the State in social welfare. To be successful in working together on shared challenges, Rev, Oppong suggests the Church must work together with the State. He sees the Church as having a part to play in providing for the needs of citizens. Accordingly, the quotation could be viewed from the perspective of *the home we build together*.

In arguing for a new way of thinking about society, Sack (2007) considers reconstructing society and advocates for a new model substituting earlier approaches to national identity, in particular, assimilation and multiculturalism. That new model is what he calls "the home we build together." The concept suggests that society should be viewed as the home we build together, bringing the diverse gifts of different groups to the common good:

> …the home we build together values the identities of both the majority and minorities. It states: we are different, but that does not mean there is nothing to bind us in shared belonging. We create the common good. The more different we are, the richer the possibilities of what we make together (p. 16).

6.1.2 Social welfare programs
The PCG and the CRC partner the State in seeking the welfare of Ghanaian citizens through their welfare works in *Education*, *Health care* and other *Social care* such as support for the orphanage, the aged and children's home.

6.1.2.1 Education for all
The PCG and the CRC's engagement in education as social welfare program is open to people of different race and religion. The churches' priority in education could arise from certain factors. Somewhat, education and churches have belonged together in history, due to the protestant tradition that in order to read the Bible and become a Christian, you had to learn the skill. This is part of a missionary tradition. And obviously this has expanded and become a vital contribution

to society in Ghana as a whole. Smith (1966: 168-169) notes that the curriculum of the Presbyterian schools in Ghana not only provided secular instructions but existed as training grounds in Christianity. (Smith (1966); Sundkler and Steed (2000), provides further readings on missionary works in Ghana and Africa). Though the churches' involvement in education as welfare program has missionary roots, one can observe that there has been a significant change in the nature and trend of the present educational system in Ghana from that of the colonial missionary years. The missionary schools were attached to their churches and most of the students were adherents of the Christian faith, mostly children of missionaries and children with their parents attending such churches. Heads of missionary schools were Pastors, Catechists or leading members of the church. Again, Christian Religious Studies (CRS) and Bible studies were compulsory subjects for all students aside other subjects like Mathematics and English. The trend is different in Ghana today. The educational institutions operated by the churches in Ghana today are opened to all categories of persons, irrespective of tribe, religion, or religious denomination. Again, there is the inclusion of all religious based subjects with courses in (Christianity, Islam and African Traditional Religion) dominating. One may assign these changes to the churches' adherent to the constitutional provision that states that,

A person shall not be discriminated against on grounds of gender, race, colour, ethnic origin, religion, creed or social or economic status. (The Constitution of the Republic of Ghana, 1992)

I also think a possible explanation for this change could be the cordial relationship that exists between the various religious faiths in Ghana today. Parson (1963: 4) notes that the missionary works in Ghana were confronted with a strong resistance to Christianity because the indigenous people believed that the God who was being preached to them was the white man's God. Unlike the missionary days where there were great resistance of Christianity by especially the Indigenous Ghanaian Religion, which usually resulted in hatred and discrimination among fellow citizens, the case is the reverse today. Etikpah (2010:53) posits that "people of different faith traditions in Ghana live peacefully and share many things in common." This sense of belonging would consequently appear to give space for communal values as sharing, mutual aid, caring for others, interdependence and social harmony.

Marshall (1950) notes that, real citizenship should include social and educational rights in order to be convincingly inclusive. But his notion does not explicitly tell to what extent education is

important to the citizen. Many studies show that the higher the educational attainment, the greater is participation in all areas of Participatory Citizenship. Education in Ghana for instance is a strong indicator for political participation. In a study on citizens' participation in political activities in Ghana, Reynolds (2012:39) argues that out of the ten (10) factors that account for low participation in political activities, level of education accounted for 14.9 % (the third highest factor). Communities with high levels of education among citizens tend to participate more in political activities than those with low levels of education. Education increases the chances of voter turnout and quality of voting during elections. The probability that citizens who are educated will turn up for voting is high, because such people are, for instance, able to read and understand posters and flyers educating people about the elections. Again, they are likely to find out information on candidates before they vote, thereby increasing the quality and not just the quantity of voting. Education informs citizens of their civil and political rights and thus increases their participation in such rights.

Moreover, the educational system run by the churches encourages citizenship inclusion and participation. The various educational institutions of the churches admit all categories of persons irrespective of race and religion and they teach different kinds of religious based subjects. Mr. Samuel Asare claims that,

With the introduction of other religious subjects like Islamic studies and African Traditional Religion in the Christian educational institutions, it has been observed that students have developed keen interest in religious studies other than their own. They have come to understand and tolerate each other the better on issues concerning religious doctrines.

I think the acceptance of all categories of persons and teaching of the various religious faith subjects in the educational institutions of the churches helps people of different religious faiths to understand and accept each other's faith better, thereby enhancing interreligious tolerance among citizens. One could therefore argue that at the level of creating *social citizens* (Marshall 1950), the churches' social welfare program in education do not only give citizens access to education as a social right, but creates a kind of citizenship that appreciates the differences between fellow citizens. This observation broadens the notion of Participatory Citizenship by going beyond racial and religious boundaries, by emphasizing a common identity between citizens of different nationality, religion and tribe.

6.1.2.2 Health for free

Reflecting further on health as a priority on the churches' social welfare programs, like education, one may also link it to the roots of the missionary presence in Ghana. Rev. Daniel Oppong notes that among the first health centres in the Gold Coast (present day Ghana) were those that were created to treat the early missionaries of malaria (due to the heavy presence of mosquitoes). Sundkler and Steed (2000:207) notes that out of nine Basel missionaries sent to Ghana, all but one of the missionaries died from indigenous diseases within a couple of years of arrival (as affected all missions to tropical Africa). One may partly associate the numerous health centres and hospitals owned by for instance the PCG today to the missionary presence in Ghana. The churches' welfare services in health serve as option or alternative for low-level income citizens who hitherto cannot afford to patronise the services of public hospitals. Unlike government owned health care facilities, most health care services provided by the churches' health centres and hospitals are free of charge or considerably subsidised.

The churches' offer of free health services may stem partly from inherited missionary practices. History has it that one of the evangelism strategies of the early missionaries in Africa and for that matter Ghana was that they gathered people to share the gospel with by organizing programs as health screening and other related health programs. The churches in Ghana might have adopted this strategy after the missionaries had left, and this plausibly has remained a tradition among the churches in Ghana. One may not need a health insurance to received subsidised services in the churches' hospitals. Again, citizens are offered a cheaper alternative to health care in the churches' hospitals because most of the church hospitals in Ghana treat ailments with herbal medicines. The CRC for instance treat ailments with traditional herbal medicines in all its health facilities. It is important to point out here that unlike most Pentecostal and Charismatic churches that are characterised with the doctrine of divine healing, the CRC do not put much emphasis on divine healing. This is partly because of the church's belief in the "power of applied knowledge".[13] Thus, the CRC believes that by hard work and perseverance through science and technology, humans will be able to solve problems around them.

---

[13]http: // www.kantanka.com/kristoasafo.html

It can be observed that the church's health centres do not only give citizens access to health as social right, but also a cheaper alternative to citizens who cannot afford the high cost of orthodox medication. An apparent reason for the low cost in treating patients with herbal medicine is because there is easy access to raw material and at cheaper prices in tropical regions like Ghana. Notwithstanding, one could argue that the PCG and CRC's welfare in health add something new to what Marshall (1950) notes. On the one hand, they give citizens access to health services (as a social right), but more importantly, they give them access to choice or alternatives. Access to health care increases good health and quality of life of citizens. Good health promotes participatory citizen action in community dialogue. The furtherance of participatory citizenship embraces concern for those citizens constrained not only in access to social rights, but also restricted to the processes of citizenship including equitable participation in discussion and decision making. By expressing their views, citizens not only have the potential to influence decisions that have real consequences and impact on their lives but also demand accountability and transparency from those in authority who must see to the welfare of citizens.

6.1.2.3 Social Care as human right

Regarding other forms of social care, the research findings revealed that the churches see it mostly as a form of instant relief for people who are in a particular problem at a given time. Such services are connected primarily with human rights and with the intention to bring cohesion between groups. The promotion of participatory citizenship through the welfare works of the churches, can be argued, is strengthened by the values of human rights. Council of Europe (2010) rightly argues:

Participatory citizenship is enacted through participation in the everyday life of society and is interconnected with the concepts of human and occupational rights. While human rights are concerned with the broader spectrum of fundamental rights and freedoms in every aspect of people's lives, citizenship focuses primarily on democratic rights and mutual responsibilities, social cohesion and tolerance. (p. 1)

The churches in their social care services place prominence on solidarity, equality, empowering all members of the society to take part fully in civic life, among others. This type of welfare programs may be perceived as directed towards groups vulnerable to marginalization (the

physically disabled, the aged, the mentally retarded, orphans etc.) and intended to improve their integration within the society as well as increase their independence. But while the CRC's social care programs such as feeding street children and the mentally retarded, and providing sowing machines for the physically disabled are targeted at the individual, the PCG's welfare programs in Employable Skills Training/Development and Community Health Outreach are directed at associations and organized groups. This observation points out two different approaches to Participatory Citizenship by the two Ghanaian Churches. One may argue that while the CRC's welfare programs build the individual, the PCG's welfare programs are geared towards building the community.

Contrastingly, two reasons in my view may explain the churches' priority in education and health over other social welfare programs. Firstly, since the churches have a long tradition and involvement in education and health, it can be assumed that they are likely to have the necessary experience and means to succeed in those areas relative to new programs which come with their own new challenges. It can be argued that is reasonable for the churches to put priorities on where their strength is.

Secondly, one may contend that most Non-Governmental Organizations (NGO's) and Voluntary Organizations in Ghana who engage in social welfare put much preference on welfare works for the aged, children homes, destitute and the likes. These organizations receive massive funding from their donors to undertake such projects. With the limited funds of the churches, it is rational to concentrate on those programs that do not have much attention from the NGO's and Voluntary Organizations, while they leave the others to them.

The thesis here is that the churches' priority in social welfare works in education and health is not novel, but rather they have historical roots in the missionary presence in Ghana.

6.1.3 Church-State relationship in building home together

One highlighted observation from the data presented above is the relationship that exists between the welfare works of the Churches and that of the States. Information from respondents on the relationship between the Church and State in social welfare provisions seems to suggest a *collaborative, cordial* and a *complementary* relationship.

6.1.3.1Collaborative relationship

By *collaborative* relationship, the researcher meant to carry out the following understanding:

Firstly, both the Churches and the State undertake similar social welfare programs intended to solve particular kinds of welfare challenge. In this sense, they all work independently of each other but towards solving a common challenge shared by citizens. Both the CRC and the State's social welfare department undertake welfare programs that support children's home. They do this independently, but they all aim to seek the welfare of orphans.

Secondly, the Churches and the State in some instances come together to work on particular welfare programs. These welfare works of the Churches are done in partnership with the States' welfare agencies. Rev. Daniel Oppong for instance notes that the PCG has most of its educational institutions ran in collaboration with the state. While the church provides the physical infrastructure, a greater portion of the human resources (teachers, administrators) are provided by the government.

It must however be emphasized that this church-state collaboration in the education sector is characteristic of the PCG. One possible explanation for the collaboration between the PCG and the State in education has to do with the history of mission schools coming under the auspices of the state. Shortly after the departure of the colonial missionaries, the inability of the indigenous Churches to financially run the educational institutions established by the missionaries forced the Churches to relinquish them under the care of the State. Though schools that were set up by the indigenous churches after the departure of the missionaries are technically speaking, run by the churches themselves, they still collaborate with state agencies in areas like running the same curriculum, staffing of teachers through government established teacher training colleges, among others. This is particular with mainline churches like the Presbyterians, Methodist and Catholics. But one other interpretation that may apply to both the mainline churches and that of recent ones like the Pentecostals is that, government is the sole giver of accreditation for educational institutions as well as supply of curriculum materials for schools in Ghana. In Ghana, it is legal for individuals and private entities that have the financial means to establish and run for example, schools and hospitals. But establishments like schools must receive approval from the National

Accreditation Board[14] to be legally operational. Moreover, the schools must run the approved curriculum by the National Accreditation Board. All schools must therefore cooperate with the state in this regard. While church-state collaboration in education is more characteristic of the PCG, the CRC's welfare programs to homes and orphanages are undertaken in collaboration with the government's department of Social Welfare[15]

This idea of *responsibility to society* as expressed in the notion of "home we build together" may explain why the churches do not act as onlookers when the State takes on the responsibility of ensuring the welfare of citizens, but rather see it as their responsibility too. Rev. Daniel Oppong sees the Church as belonging and having responsibility to the community, fulfilling that by contributing to the wellbeing of citizens through their welfare works in education, health and other social care programs. Responsibility towards other citizens, according to Isin (2008), brings other less privileged citizens to par with the rest of the society. Although Isin does not tell exactly how and in which areas these citizens are brought to par with other members of society, it could be argued that the PCG and CRC's responsibility towards society in the form of education, health care and social care bring citizens to par in the society in terms of recognition as full citizens. This recognition is recognized when the churches' welfare programs empower citizens to fully participate in community discussions, decisions and activities.

The "home we build together" values the identities of both the majority and minorities (Sack 2007:16). Mr. Kwame Ossei correctly notes that,

All manner of people benefit from our social welfare services. We do not discriminate against anybody. We don't give based on tribe or nationality. If the person is staying in Ghana and we realise he is in need, we will help such a person.

I think in "the home we build together", the churches recognize and value the identity of all citizens, irrespective of race, tribe or religion. It is this recognition that moves them to seek the welfare of all without discrimination. Empowering citizenship participation includes the feeling

---

[14]The National Accreditation Board of Ghana is the Government of Ghana agency responsible for the regulation, supervision and accreditation of educational institutions in Ghana. It is an agency under the Ministry of Education.
[15]Interview with Mr. Kwame Ossei: 20.07.2013

of belonging. The inclusion of both majority and minorities in the churches' welfare programs strengthens the idea of *belonging*. And it is this idea of belonging that promotes opportunities for people to share experiences of life with others.

One could argue that assessing the Church–State collaboration in the perspective of 'the home we build together' "allows collective investment of energies in what we build, and there is a greater potential for group achievement in such paradigm" (Sacks 2007:14). Catechist Janet Asare notes:

Collaborating with state agencies in social welfare is helpful because those state agencies have more information on citizens. As a result, they get easy access to information on the needs of citizens, and such collaboration yields greater result.

The potential achievement of Church-State collaboration can be evident in the churches' social welfare program in education. Smith (1966) and Sanneh (1983), recounting the success of missionary works in social welfare in chapter 2 of this work, note that education was as effective tool in the revolutionary transformation of African societies than any other. One may interpret the successes of the churches' welfare program in education to the collaboration they have with the State, as both build a home together by working hand in hand on shared challenges. Van Bruggen et al (2010) argue that the process of getting citizens to fully participate in national matters involve many social actors, and need to be approached from a 'kaleidoscopic perspective'. By this, Van Bruggen et al (2010) advocates for collaborative approaches between social actors in different sectors to address citizenship dilemmas. The PCG and CRC collaborate with the State in education, health care and social care. Through this collaboration, they are able to pool resources and experiences, and spark innovation for the empowerment of citizens' participation in societal matters. Citizenship participation is achieved when mutual trust exists among citizens. "Making something together breaks walls of suspicion and misunderstanding." (Sacks 2007:15)

6.1.3.2 Cordial Relationship

Many are convinced that cordial relationship is a necessity for collaboration. Both Rev. Daniel Oppong and Mr. Owusu Badu could be construed as supporting this conviction when they say that the Church is at peace with the State:[16]

Cordial relations refer to friendly, sincere, hearty and warm relationships people share with others in their social network. ...Although a cordial relationship is an affable one with warm feelings, it tends to take on a slightly formal tone.[17]

The use of the term 'cordial relationship' in this work is based solely on the description from the churches. Mr. Owusu Badu sees the relationship between the CRC and State as cordial when the State appreciates their welfare works and do not interfere in such welfare works.[18] Rev. Daniel Oppong is of the view that, the absence of confrontation with the State in doing social welfare works amounts to cordial relationship.[19]

Cordial relationship from the perspective of the churches, one may argue, encourages collaboration. This can be seen in areas from education and welfare programs to children's homes. Because of the cordial relationship that exists between the PCG and the State, both are able to work hand in hand in welfare programs in education. While the PCG provides physical infrastructure such as school buildings, the State provides resource personnel like teachers and administrators. Similarly, the CRC annually combines resources with the State's department of social welfare to provide buses, food items and cash to various children's homes across the length and breadth of Ghana.[20]

I think both Rev. Daniel Oppong and Mr. Owusu Badu are talking about peaceful coexistence between the Church and the State in social welfare but I find nothing concrete in their data by which I could say they are insisting on cordial relationship as essential in supporting participatory citizenship. The researcher wanted to know more from Rev. Oppong about how the

---

[16] Refer interview citation in Chapter 5 page xxx.
[17] http://www.ehow.com/info_10072692_define-cordial-relations.html
[18] Interviewed: 02.08.2013.
[19] Interviewed: 04.07.2013
[20] Interview with Mr. Kwame Ossei: 20.07.2013.

cordial relationship between the Church and the State supports citizens' welfare. This made the researcher direct this question to him:

Researcher: *In your position as the Director of Social Services and Development, what will you say is the importance of cordial relationship between the Church and the State to your social welfare programs?*

Rev. Daniel Oppong: *It is practically impossible for the Church to work all alone in seeking the welfare of people in the society. To be effective and productive in our welfare works, we must have friends who can give us honest feedback. We need people to discuss various issues, evaluate pros and cons and reach solutions profiting not only the church but also the people who benefit from our welfare programs. And the State's social welfare agencies are very vital in this regard. Having a good relationship with the State is very important because we can easily fall on them when we come across serious problems and challenges in our work.*

Flowing from the above extract, I think the cordial rapport between the Church and the State in my view arouses a kind of relationship expressed in collective activity in the act of citizenship development. I think Rev. Oppong's remarks highlight interdependency accruing from cordial relationship. The Church falls on the State in times of problems, and for advice in undertaking their welfare programs. To approach citizenship development in such a way might also increase the sense of being part of a group of citizens with plural convictions, fitting together on a constructive or mutual project to which each brings his or her resources.

6.1.3.3 Complementary role

Reflecting further on the Church and State working together on shared challenges, the findings of the data seem to suggest that the role of the PCG and CRC in social welfare should be seen as complementing that of the State's. By 'complementary role', the researcher means to suggest that the churches are not taking up the role of the State for the reason that the State has failed in their social welfare responsibilities to its citizenry. Rather, the churches come in to make up for the lapses in the States' welfare programs.[21]

---

[21] Interview with Mr. Kwame Ossei: 02.07.2013

This complementary role can be seen in an area as education. With the ever-growing demand for formal education, especially secondary and tertiary education, public institutions face serious challenges of functioning with the constraints of their limited allocations given by the government. In 2008 two-thirds of all applicants to universities were denied. The strict selection is caused by a lack of university places, costing Ghana a lot of potential talent.[22] The situation in the public tertiary institutions worsens as the year goes by. In 2011, for example, the total number of qualified applicants to the University of Ghana was 12,702 (i.e., 85% of total applications). Out of this, only 52% of the qualified applicants were admitted to study in various programs. The status of the 48% of students who were denied admission remains unknown (Atuahene and Owusu-Ansah 2013:2-6). It is possible that some of the qualified students may have been accepted into private tertiary institutions in the country, because in practice, students usually resort to private tertiary institutions if they do not gain admission in the public institutions.

The active involvement of private educational institutions (majority being church-owned) supports these public institutions to increase their capacity. Currently, private higher education institutions co-exist within the Ghanaian higher education system to provide complementary roles. With the role played by the private institutions, there has been remarkable increase in enrollment and participation of females; individuals from low economic backgrounds; minorities such as students from less endowed schools[23], and those from remote geographical areas (Atuahene and Owusu-Ansah, 2013:7).

One could argue that through the complementary role played by private educational institutions (which include the schools of the PCG and CRC), access to education has been broadened to include all social groups. The unequal participation among women, minorities, individuals from low income backgrounds, and spatial based disparities in education is being bridged. The churches' complementary role in education promote participatory citizenship by taking into account the concerns of those people restricted not only in access to public schools, but also

---

[22]http://www.justlanded.com/english/Ghana/Ghana-Guide
[23]The less endowed schools are mainly schools located in deprived communities and lack basic facilities. These facilities include classrooms, potable water, electricity, as well as trained and experienced teachers: Journal of Science and Technology, Vol. 33, No. 2 (2013), pp. 106.

restricted to the processes of citizenship including equitable participation on the bases of gender-based disparity, spatial disparity and socio-economic status.

In this complementary role, one may see the work of the church as more flexible and personal, compared to that of the states'. This difference can be seen in the approach of the two in undertaking welfare works. While the state meets the welfare of the people through the collection of taxes which is quite impersonal; the churches on the other hand have direct and personal contact with the people and can cater for more and other needs. The reason for this could be that since the services of governments are established by law, they may not be readily adjustable to new circumstances in times of crisis and change. The churches, not being so restricted, may adapt their services more flexible to new situations.

6.1.4 Distinguishing between the worthy and the unworthy: means-testing in the public and the church domain.

Citizens' recognition that comes in the form of benefiting from social rights raises the question of who is 'worthy' or 'unworthy' for such benefits, and therefore the subject of "means-testing" comes to play. Means-testing benefits are those welfare benefits that are distributed on the basis of prove of need.

6.1.4.1 Means-testing in the public domain

Although Ghana is not strictly speaking a welfare state, the State through its Department of Social Welfare provides welfare services to members of the society in diverse ways. To benefit from some of these welfare services, one must prove himself or herself deserving. In the public domain, means-testing takes the form of assessing one's status as tax payer. People are worthy of some welfare benefits on the basis that such people are tax payers. This mainly applies to public servants.[24] Other forms of means-testing take the form of assessing one's level of income to see if he or she needs assistance to survive. This is opened to all and is normally administered through the Department of Social Welfare. One may have to apply through some assigned

---

[24] Public servants are employees of government established institutions either than individual interpreneurs and employees of private corporations.

government welfare agencies such as NADMO[25] by submitting documents to proof that they are in need of such support.

6.1.4.2 Means-testing in the Churches' domain

The information from Mr. Kwame Ossei indicates that though the church's welfare services are open to the entire Ghanaian population, in some cases one needs to fulfil certain requirements to benefit from such welfare programs. But unlike welfare services provided under the public domain that requires citizens to undergo rigid "means-testing", it is quite flexible under the churches' domain. One does not have to be a worker of a particular sector, or be a tax payer to qualify for welfare benefits. Mr. Kwame Ossei notes *Priority* and *Recommendation* as basis for one's qualification in some cases. By *priority*, what he means is that one needs to show proof of being among a category of persons (for example the aged, mentally disabled, orphans, etc.) to qualify for welfare programs that are specifically designed for these people. On the other hand, one may need to be recommended by a trusted person to be in need of a particular welfare service in order to benefit. Although the churches' welfare programs aim to be all inclusive, one may argue that the criteria of *priority* and *recommendation* can be a form of discrimination—discrimination not based on the criteria of race, tribe or religious affiliation. But how do citizens who are not in the position to get people to recommend them and at the same time do not fall under the criteria of *priority* benefit from the churches' welfare programs? Such people are indirectly side-lined from the churches' welfare benefits. The topic of means-testing raises questions for further reflections on welfare and citizenship.

Can the process involved in means-testing be a process of social exclusion?

An informal conversation with a welfare beneficiary of the PCG notes:

When we apply for welfare benefits, we are not certain on when we will be informed of the outcome. It takes so long that we have to either forget about it or resort to other means. Sometimes too, by the time it comes, your situation has worsened and the benefit you get cannot

---

[25]NADMO stands for 'National Disaster Management Organisation'. A government agency responsible for the management of disasters as well as other emergencies in Ghana.

adequately solve those issues again. It is difficult to apply for the same welfare benefits at different places because you are asked if you have applied to somewhere else. People who haven't applied to other places are given priority over those who have.[26]

One may argue that prolonged lengths of time on welfare benefits results in a fall in living standards, especially for those who do not have any other means of support. Moreover, people who hitherto could have accessed other options of welfare benefits but opted for that from the churches may lose such opportunities if they are found unworthy after long periods of waiting. It may be contended that long processes involved in means-testing by the PCG do not encourage Participatory Citizenship because they could deny citizens' access to benefits they would have hitherto gotten from elsewhere.

Could it also be argued that means-testing benefits do not promote Participatory Citizenship because they threaten the integrity of the self?

Mr. Kwame Ossei notes:

After people have been recommended for means-testing benefits, the church requires applicants to undergo a thorough examination. Owing to the rules of eligibility, they go into many facets of their private life and personal conduct.

The practice of investigating into the personal conduct and private life is seen by some beneficiaries as intimidating and stigmatizing. A member of the CRC notes:

I feel shy sometimes to openly apply for means-testing benefits. The process sometimes requires that I give out information I see as private and confidential. Sometimes this information requires you to go back into your past family history. Some of these information do not only bring back unpleasant memories, but are also made known to people who may not have been aware of them. And it can be very humiliating.[27]

---

[26] Conversation with a welfare beneficiary : 12.08.2013
[27] Conversation with a member of CRC: 27.07.2013.

Means-testing, one may argue, stigmatizes and separates people from the rest of the society, marginalises them, makes them feel less deserving of everyday interactions and transactions that make up the community. This experience, Twine (1994) rightly observes, "often produces a 'spoilt identity', a self-image which is damaged and diminished impeding the autonomous actions of the individual." (p. 97). Individuals who do not have 'good self-image' and feel marginalised cannot actively participate in daily social interactions to express their desires. Since such people are unable to express their desires, either individually or through a community group, they cannot bring about the change they desire in the society.

6.2 THE GHANAIAN CHURCHES IN THE SECULAR SPACE: PLAYING THE ROLE OF A SURROGATE FAMILY

6.2.1 The Ghanaian family system

At the center of the Ghanaian social order is the family. The term 'family' is used to denote both the nuclear and extended units of the family. The father, mother, and children make up the nuclear family. The extended family comprises parents, siblings, cousins, aunts, uncles, grandparents, and great-grand parents. The extended family, for the most part, is the most important unit of Ghanaian family structure. "Sustained through a sense of kinship, networks, and marriages, the family is acknowledged as the bedrock of all social life." (EveryCulture.com). The upkeep and development of children is the responsibility of the family. The family serves as an organized unit providing social, economic and psychological security to all members of the family. Children on their part have the responsibility to be respectful and obedient to the elderly in the family. In the Ghanaian traditional family, the father is seen as the head, provider and protector of the family. Traditionally, the mother plays a role of childbearing and as a house keeper, doing almost all the household chores. In recent years however, the role of mothers have come to include working to earn money to complement the fathers' income.[28] The traditional Ghanaian family has been a place to nurture citizens. The traditional Ghanaian social system is based on a social institution of extended family members and traditional authorities. The welfare of members of a family is not the responsibility of only the nuclear family. It is the responsibility of the extended family to ensure that individual members of the family are adequately supported

---

[28] The bulk of the information provided under this section is from personal knowledge as a natural Ghanaian; with some information from online resource: http://www.everyculture.com/Ge-It/Ghana.html: retrieved April 19, 2014.

and that members are receiving the best possible care. But most importantly, the Ghanaian traditional family has the responsibility to seek the welfare of members of the society who are not part of their 'blood family'.[29] For instance, it is an acceptable norm for an elderly person to rebuke or correct and in some cases recommend punishment for a wayward child he or she meets on the streets. Such a child does not have to be a member of his or her family. In the Ghanaian traditional societies, the process of socialization—the adaptation of a person to his environment and the learning of habits—first starts from within the family. Moreover, a person's socio-cultural growth starts from the nuclear/extended family; the family shapes one's character to fit into the society.

6.2.2 The Church as a surrogate family

In Ghana today, the structure of the family is changing from the 'traditional' family (a group of people bonded by blood) to a myriad of different forms, with the church emerging as a stronger part of the family. We do not see ourselves as independent of the traditional family. When we support people, it is because we see ourselves as one family. – Emmanuel Antwi

It is different families bonded by blood who come together to form a big family called church. We take up the responsibility to help those in need because the burden of the various families is also the burden of the church. – Kwame Ossei

Considering the above quotations from Presbyter Emmanuel Antwi and Mr. Kwame Ossei respectively, one could argue that a motivational factor as *mutual aid* places the Church in Ghana in a role as a new surrogate family providing for the welfare needs of the traditional family.

Mills (2011) defines family as

> A diachronic and synchronic association of persons related by blood or marriage, and other social conventions, organized for the dual purpose of enhancement of its social status and legitimate transfer of property. (p. 29)

Mills further defines the church as a surrogate family:

> The intentional gathering of persons that become a spiritual group for the purpose of spiritual formation and growth of all and who will all inherit a spiritual kingdom. (p. 29)

---

[29] By 'blood family' I mean a group of people related by blood.

She however notes that the origin of the church as a family is spiritual, but it produces healthy people within the family in all realms of life from the inner spirit to the outer physical body. What Mills sought to suggest is that the church as a surrogate family is not only concerned with the spiritual needs of its members, but the physical needs as well.

The assumption of the role of a surrogate family by the churches in Ghana could be linked to two main factors:

Firstly, due to the constraints on the state's budget, government has often been unable to provide welfare benefits for all citizens (and even those who benefit do not receive enough). The 2008 UNICEF report on *Social Protection for the Poorest in Africa* notes that in Ghana, the Ministry of Manpower and its implementing wing, the Department of Social Welfare, both have serious financial and capacity constraints. As a result of this the poorest people have often had to rely on informal and traditional forms of social protection based on the extended family system and religious groupings (Sultan and Schrofer, 2008:7). For this reason, many people are in want of basic social needs and therefore need a new form of benefactor through which they can attain a sense of certainty and security in their life. Presbyter Emmanuel Antwi recognizes this need in society when he comments:

Those who are in need cannot get the adequate support they require from the government, so the Church comes in to cushion them up.

Secondly, the churches acknowledge that not all the traditional families who come together to make the church are able to provide all that is required of them as a family to their members. It is based on the relationship shared between the churches and the traditional family that enables the churches to recognize the needs of these 'family members' and subsequently go to their rescue. Both Presbyter Emmanuel Antwi and Mr. Kwame Ossei say of the churches:

When the church comes to the aid of some members, it is because they admit that not all members of the church have the provisions they need from their immediate families.

One may ask how the activities of theses churches situate them in the position of a surrogate family. In my participation as a researcher in the various activities and church services of the studied churches, I observed the following:

6.2.2.1 Accommodation for all

First and foremost, it was observed that the churches do not only serve as a place for spiritual renewal and fellowship, but also accommodate people (especially the youth) who suffer from different kinds of life distress – alienation, lack of parental care and love, loneliness, insecurity about the future–which result from their inaccessibility to basic social needs/care that make life comfortable for human. For example, the Legon congregation of the PCG has office spaces that serve as counseling rooms for people with diverse problems. It is open to the general public on Mondays, Wednesdays and Thursdays. On Sundays, it is open to members of the congregation after the close of church service. The Newtown branch of the CRC twice every month organizes Career Counseling and Development Training for young people who are preparing to enter the corporate world but are uncertain of the challenges out there.[30]

In the quest to meet the needs of these youth, parents work long hours outside the home, decreasing the face-to-face interaction among family members and in the process weaken kinship ties. Family support is mostly absent, and these young people suffer from much strain and frustration. The churches as a family become partners with the traditional families to provide a sense of belonging to these youth. This they do by reestablishing interpersonal relationships. As Presbyter David Yeboah of the Legon congregation of the PCG puts it in a sermon during my visit to one of their Sunday divine service,

With the economic hardship and struggle for daily bread, the relationship among people has worn out. The church of Christ is a big family. That is why we would have a feeling for the brethren who are going through hard times. It is the hope of the church that anyone who comes here is able to experience the warmness that comes from this relationship.[31]

The building of relationship begins from reaching out to those people on the street. This observation was typical of the CRC with their welfare program in feeding street children. In this regard, I see the church play a role as "a father figure" to those young people whose wish for

---

[30] Interview with Deaconess Irene Yeboah: 04.08.2013
[31] Excerpts from a sermon on 14.07.2013 - Sunday Devine Service of the Legon congregation of the PCG

love and care, inclusion, companionship and a sense of security about the future cannot be met by the state and their close families. To guide them past this perilous period, the churches' approach is to spend much time with them, engaging them in all sorts of activities, taking them on tour as well as counseling them. Once reciprocal trust is established, these people turn to the churches for help anytime they are confronted with problems. In light of this, one could see the churches in Ghana having many roles including father, counselor, and leader. In actuality, the churches fit a position of a father for members of the church and other citizens outside the church. The relation between the church as a family and the traditional Ghanaian family model is symbolized by the father figure of the church.

In the ENOTHE[32] annual report, Fransen et al (2013:2) note that engagement with others, the recognition of and respect for differences, as well as acceptance of those alienated are essential to the process of participatory citizenship. The PCG and CRC's acceptance and accommodation of people who are alienated from their close family, those who lack parental care and love, and those who are lonely and insecure about the future strengthens the process of participatory citizenship. Such people now receive from the church the care, affection, love and the companionship which they lacked from their traditional families. The feeling of being recognized and respected as equal citizens and human beings with a contribution to make helps develop in them a strong sense of social responsibility. This responsibility can be passive (by avoiding engaging in social vices that are harmful to society) or active (by performing activities that directly advance social goals). Between January to May 2013, about 50 people (including 27 youth) were recorded to have quit from vices as prostitution, armed robbery, cyber fraud and drug related abuses through the counseling sessions by the PCG (Legon congregation).[33] The CRC through their youth development trainings had succeeded in encouraging their young people to engage in community activities such as planting trees, checking erosion and distilling chocked gutters. This is done twice every month.[34]

The researcher's informal conversation with some church members during one of his visits to Sunday church service of Legon congregation of the PCG disclosed that some members see the

---

[32] ENOTHE is the acronym for European Network of Occupational Therapy in Higher Education
[33] Interview with Mr. Emmanuel Antwi : 15.07.2013
[34] Ms. Evelyn Sefa : 02.08.2013

church as their family.[35] I think reflecting on the role the churches play in the lives of its members will help work out their point. In the first place, the members are not by that intending to say that they are related to the church by 'blood'. Flowing from the narrative above on the churches taking the place and filling in the gap where the traditional families have failed, one could understand their response from the perspective of *the home we build together.* This is inferred from the analysis that portrays the churches as father, protector and counselor. By that, they seem to recognize the church as a helpmate to their traditional families in the discharge of their responsibilities

6.2.2.2 Having a say and being listened to
Mills (2011: 40) notes that the church as a surrogate family provides an opportunity for children and youth to share their concerns with others; they learn that their voice matters and they will be heard.

Contrary to usual practice in the Ghanaian traditional family where children and adolescents are deterred from voicing out their concerns especially in the gathering of the elderly, my observation with the churches confirmed the opposite. The researcher observed that members (including children and youth) were given opportunity to share testimonies, offer prayers in front of the congregation, share their challenges with other members, and engage in other open activities.[36] "Participatory citizenship as a way of being with others includes: having a say and being listened to … being recognized and respected as equal citizens and human beings with a contribution to make." (Fransen et al 2013:2) The 'church family' offers a caring environment, a safe place for members' self-development. The Church respects the views and opinions of all members (including children and youth) not only in word but in practice. Members are allowed to voice out their opinions and share their thoughts with others through activities as *giving testimonies, leading song ministrations, involvement in drama*,[37] among others.

Consequently, my observations confirmed that the PCG and CRC served as significant "salvage homes" for members of the society in the face of the serious problems of the State and

---

[35] Researcher's informal conversation with members at Legon congregation : 14.07.2013
[36] Observation on 27.07.2013 - Saturday Divine Service at Accra Newtown branch of CRC
[37] Leading song ministrations and involvement in drama were witnessed at the Legon congregation of PCG, while sharing of testimonies was witnessed at CRC, Accra Newtown branch.

immediate families not meeting their welfare needs. In other words, the church is seen as a potential source of support in the relationship between the individual and their access to welfare benefits. This happens for several reasons. Alarmed by the fact that the support from the State comes at a high price (for example, means-testing by the state is rigid compared to that of the church), the stigma attached to means-testing especially among the elderly people, among others. Moreover, it appears to be right that as the human relationships provided by the traditional family and the broader blood relations weaken and disintegrate, church belonging will undoubtedly hold the option of becoming more relevant to the Ghanaian citizen.

On a divergent observation to that of a surrogate family is the liberal economic-based relationship that exists between the church and individuals. This is peculiar to the CRC. Commenting on reasons that move the church to go to the aid of the needy, Mr. Kwame Ossei noted:

As a church we do not operate in a vacuum, but rather live in a society and generate income, so it is incumbent on us to support the needy in the society.

The liberal contractual relationship is based on the respect for persons as agents and bearers of individual rights. By this, the CRC acknowledges a relationship of mutual recognition between themselves as a church and the individual Ghanaian citizens. Thus, their notion of contract is deeply embedded in a universal respect for the equal sovereignty of persons, and not in the non-democratic kinds of recognition rooted in relationships of love and of solidarity like that of a surrogate family.

Could one be right to relate both the help that comes from a surrogate family relationship and that which arises from a liberal contractual relationship to *"act of citizenship"* being answerable to citizens' needs (Isin 2008:39)? To a large extent yes, but with different reasons. While the church as a surrogate family responds to the welfare needs of citizens on a relationship based on a common orientation towards values, those that stem from contractual relationship is based on a 'legal recognition'. By legal recognition, the researcher means to say that the idea of *contract* is best captured in the legal, not moral.

6.3 WHAT IS THE MOTIVATION BEHIND THE CHURCHES' SOCIAL WELFARE WORKS?

In their roles as nation builders and surrogate families, certain motivational factors play key role in the welfare works of the PCG and CRC. They include the following:

6.3.1 Theological motivation

The discussion here in highlights the 'faith factor' in social-services provision by the PCG and CRC. The findings of the data point out that although the PCG and the CRC are different in their own sense (have different structures, originate from different religious traditions etc.), they seem to agree on doctrinal issues with regards to charity. Both churches have the same reason for their theological motivation – to carry out God's command or instruction. In evaluating data from theological perspective of motivation, it is interesting to observe that both churches made reference to the same Bible verses. But more interesting is that reference to these Bible texts as the sources of their theological motivation leads to a generally Christian sub-text in this study, rather than a strong denominational one. No church makes claim to either a denominational personality or a doctrine peculiar to their denomination as the source of their theological motivation.

A common theme that runs through the responses from both churches in the data presented in chapter 5 of this work is the issue of biblical command to help the poor and the needy. The field data indicates that the churches are motivated to engage in social welfare works because their Christian doctrines and teachings entreat them to do so. Rev. Daniel Oppong and Mr. Kwame Ossei cited James 2: 15-16, Luke 10:27, Job 29, and John 14:15 to support this claim. Mr. Kwame Ossei further quoted Deuteronomy 15:7-11 and Luke 6:46 to support the CRC's involvement in social welfare.

One can observe that the churches' faith-based motivation is based on both Bible verses from the New Testament (NT) and Old Testament (OT). These cited verses can be interpreted in two ways: on the one hand, verses such as James 2: 15-16 from the NT and Job 29 and Deuteronomy 15:7-11 from the OT talk about having the poor among us always and therefore extending a hand of charity to them. On the other hand, Luke 10:27, John 14:15, and Luke 6:46, all from the NT are centred on the love for God which leads to obedience to God's commands. One could argue

that the PCG and CRC's understanding of social welfare is integrated into their religious tenets that stress support for the poor and needy rather than extorting from them. These tenets are not based only on the understanding of 'having the poor with us always' but also based on their 'love for God' by obeying His commands to care for the poor. This argument could partly be explained in the light of the observation by some theologians that while there are differences between the Old Testament and the New Testament, in many ways, they are complementary. In my understanding, the reference to the biblical verses in both the OT and NT presumes that the churches acknowledge the fact that the commandments in the OT are not restricted to the people of that particular generation but also applies to the present generation. This understanding moves them to seek the welfare of the poor in society.

The observation that the PCG and CRC's motivation in social welfare is based on scripture can be likened to the Greek welfare as noted by Foka and Molokotos-Liederman (2010:173) in the Welfare and Religion in a European Perspective (WREP) project. In that case, some respondents attributed the church's involvement in welfare programs to a 'divine concept'. They viewed welfare as a divine concept, indicating primarily God's providence and humanity's call to emulate it. One could argue from this point that the practical demonstration of Christian beliefs and teachings by the churches in Ghana is a resultant factor in their social welfare works. Macarov (1995:88) correctly argues:

When religious beliefs are demonstrated in individual behaviour, the charitable act is usually a response to a commandment or a requirement of the religion and has no ulterior motive.

The churches' involvement in welfare works can thus be explained as a response to their religious commandments.

6.3.2 Ideological motivation

As a church we don't only believe in the spiritual, we also believe that when people face too much hardship, they may resort to dubious means like armed robbery and other social vices to survive. This can lead to political and social chaos. We help the society with our social welfare works to prevent some of these social vices.[38]

---

[38] Interview with Catechist Janet Asare.

The aged in our society need support in all aspects of their lives, but most especially economically. We believe most of them are not financially sound because they are no more working to generate income. Those of them without immediate families to support them must benefit from the church's social welfare programs.[39]

The above excerpts draw home two main points in the churches' ideological motivation. While the PCG places emphasis on socio-political reason, that is, the need to curb social vices which could lead to political instability, the CRC on the other hand has an ideological motive stressing on economic reason: the need to remove the aged from the labour force and to increase their consumptive capacity.

Research has confirmed that in Ghana the youth (mostly between the ages of 15-35) are more prone to social vices such as cybercrime, financial fraud and armed robbery (Coomson 2006; Boateng et al 2011). If the PCG welfare programs are aimed at reducing or preventing such social vices, then it could be presumed that such welfare programs are targeted at youthful citizens.

By their ideological motivation, one may argue that the PCG and the CRC promotes a participatory citizenship among two different age groups. While the PCG builds citizenship around a youthful generation, the CRC on the other hand encourages participation among the aged.

6.4 CHALLENGES FACED BY THE CHURCHES IN SOCIAL WELFARE

The challenges faced by the churches in doing social welfare come in three fold: underfunding on the part of the churches; behavioral challenge on the part of citizens; political challenge which comes in the form of mistrust on the part of the state welfare agencies and misrepresentation of the churches on the part of the citizens.

---

[39] Interview with Deaconess Irene Yeboah.

6.4.1 Financial challenges

Key among the challenges we face is inadequate funds to undertake the various projects. I am just from a working visit to the North. After the storm in the North, about six schools had their roofs ripped off. We couldn't serve all the schools. We were to select few and what we heard is that apart from the schools we served, all the other schools are still there without any help yet. There is a lot to do but the resources are also limited.[40]

There are numerous challenges. First is lack of adequate financial resources as against the numerous requests for help we receive. Sometimes we are so overwhelmed with the request from leprosy associations, blind and cripple, that you find it difficult to raise the necessary resources to meet those obligations.[41]

Both Rev. Daniel Oppong and Mr. Kwame Ossei admitted that the financial resources of their respective churches are woefully inadequate in funding the various welfare programs. As a result the demands of their welfare beneficiaries are not fully met. Furukawa (2008) justifies this challenge identified by the Ghanaian churches when he argues that,

The greatest challenge in the voluntary welfare sector is to secure the financial basis necessary for maintaining the continuity and stability of services of these organizations. (p. 367)

The financial constraints faced by the churches may partly be due to their high dependence on external sources for funding their welfare programs. Rev. Daniel Oppong notes that the PCG relies on their western partners such as Interchurch Organization for Development Cooperation (ICCO) and the Dutch Government. The CRC fund their projects mainly through private contribution from the founder and leader of the church, Mr. Kwame Ossei asserted.

One could argue that lack of sufficient and sustainable funding derails the attention of the churches from focusing on Participatory Citizenship to focusing on their own survival. Mr. Kwame Ossei notes:

---

[40] Interview with Rev. Daniel Oppong,
[41] Interview with Mr. Kwame Ossei.

Because of the high demand from welfare beneficiaries as against the insufficient funds to meet their demands and other projects of the church, it is our plan to engage in profitable businesses that can generate income to sustain the activities of the church.

Lack of funds impedes Participatory Citizenship. This is because the churches need sufficient funding to turn aims into reality for citizens. It is problematic for the churches to engage in activities that promote Participatory Citizenship when they are focused on seeking funding simply to keep other church projects afloat. The consequence of this is that churches are forced to undertake welfare programs that suit the interest of their external donors. Mrs. Grace Bediako correctly notes:

We consider welfare programs that have international and national interest. Since part of our funding comes from external sources, we undertake those programs that easily attract sponsorships from international donors and the general public.

When lack of funding forces the churches to single out welfare programs against others, it undermines the idea of Participatory Citizenship being all inclusive. This is because people whose welfare needs do not fall under the selected programs are left uncared for.

Moreover, lack of funds leads to underfunding of welfare projects. Underfunding consequently leads to discrimination and other forms of exclusion, the very canker Participatory Citizenship seeks to address. As Rev. Daniel Oppong notes:

Because of inadequate funds, the PCG could not serve all the six schools in the North that had their roof ripped off by rainstorm. They had to be selective. And there are complaints from the other schools because there is no help for them yet.

Flowing from the above, it is evident that bad economy is a treat to citizenship.

6.4.2 Politicization of welfare works
Another challenge the data found out has to do with partisan politics. In an attempt to establish the link between welfare and politics, two issues surfaced.

Firstly, Rev. Daniel Oppong claims that political parties sometimes take credit for the welfare works of the churches. This happens with welfare programs that the churches undertake in collaboration with the State's social welfare agencies. One possible explanation to this is that political parties use that medium in order to score political points. In Ghana and on the African continent in general where illiteracy is high, the possibility of winning the votes of electorates largely depends on what you do to benefit them directly rather than on political ideologies. This could partly explain why political parties would want to credit themselves with the welfare works of the churches. The consequence of this is that it could breed mistrust. Trust in welfare distribution, Markus Crepaz claims, takes a crucial place because it is impossible to regulate every aspect of human interaction on the basis of legal codes alone (as cited in Banting and Kymlicka 2006). Mistrust leads to identity politics. Rev. Daniel Oppong rightly notes that sometimes these state welfare agencies are selective on who should benefit from these welfare services and goods. Markus Crepaz notes:

> focusing on identity politics directs attention away from the truly important issues as rising inequality, and issues of economic redistribution as well as erodes solidarity because they emphasize differences between citizens, rather than commonalities (ibid.)

By this, one could argue that identity politics does not promote Participatory Citizenship because it discriminates against citizens and encourages division rather than inclusion and unity.

Secondly, the research data revealed that there is the challenge of political misrepresentation. Mr. Kwame Ossei asserted that the church's social welfare faces the challenge of being aligned with particular political parties. This situation can damage the cordial relationship between the churches and the state in social welfare issues. Mr. Ossei admits:

Linking the church to a particular political party makes collaboration with government welfare agencies very difficult when there is a change in government.

This development affects citizens who stand to benefit from the churches' social welfare programs. This is because when the relationship between the church and state social welfare agencies is ruined, the churches may lose such assistance as identifying potential needy citizens,

which hitherto was offered by the state welfare agencies. Some citizens may therefore be denied welfare services that could have bettered their lives.

6.4.3 Challenge with welfare beneficiaries

The field work data presented in chapter 5 of this work revealed that both churches had challenges with the people who benefited from their social welfare programs. From the data, Rev. Daniel Oppong indicates that people are more interested in welfare programs that offer 'in kind' services than those that empower them to be self-dependent. It was found out that beneficiary of welfare programs that offer services for human empowerment do not either put them to use after acquiring the skills and training or they totally abandon them in the process.

The reaction from respondents on the above challenge pointed to one thing: interest. Respondents 1 and 3 claimed that they do not put to practice what they learn because they are not interested in the kind of vocation they are trained.

Respondent 2 and 4 noted that they would prefer to be given the chance to choose which vocational training they prefer to be trained in.

I think reluctance on the part of the churches to give citizens freedom to make choices defeats the notion of 'inclusion' (Parker 1998:188) and participatory citizenship. Citizenship participation occurs when the churches know who their recipients and beneficiaries are, and the differences in their needs and changing circumstances (Abel-Smith and Titmus 1987:15).

In the final analysis, the evidence from the above discussion on the churches' role as nation builders and as surrogate families, the motivations for the churches' engagement in welfare works, and the challenges they encounter indicates that regardless of the differences and similarities in their approaches, the welfare works of both the CRC and the PCG make citizens self-reliant. As Mr. Kwame Ossei notes, to solve the funding challenge of the CRC, the church ventures into profitable businesses which are good sources of employment for unemployed citizens. Moreover, welfare programs such as Employable Skills Training/Development by the PCG empower citizens with employable skills in order to be self-employed. Welfare programs that open up employment opportunities to citizens make them financially sound and independent.

6.5 Summary

In Chapter 6, I have presented how the PCG and CRC's social welfare works contribute to Participatory Citizenship. This was discussed under the broad themes of "building a home together" and "the Church as a surrogate family". The discussion pointed out that in "building a home together", the Ghanaian churches saw themselves as co-partners with the State in seeking the welfare of its citizens. On "the Church as a surrogate family", both the PCG and the CRC viewed their welfare works as an opportunity to support each other for their common good. They see the Church as not separated from the traditional family.

This chapter further discussed the motivation behind the churches' involvement in social welfare. Apart from mutual support which led to their role as surrogate family, the churches had theological and ideological reasons.

Another section covered in this chapter was the challenges faced by the churches in doing welfare works. The challenges ranged from financial, political to human factors.

The next and last chapter of this study summarizes the entire thesis and gives recommendations for future research in the area of Church, Welfare and Citizenship.

CHAPTER SEVEN

SUMMARY, CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

7.0 Introduction

This chapter offers a conclusion to the study. It comprises three sections. Section one presents the summary of the study. The second section is a conclusion with section three giving some recommendations for this study.

7.1 Summary of the study

The chief aim of the study was to assess how the contribution of the Presbyterian Church of Ghana (PCG) and the Christ Reform Church (CRC) to social welfare in Ghana impacts on citizenship. By this, the study looked at what kind of welfare programs the two churches engage in, what motivates their involvement and the challenges they are facing in undertaking such welfare work.

The motivation for the study stems from:

- A personal desire to know how Ghana, a nation acclaimed to be a Christian nation, is being impacted by the Christian Churches through their social welfare works.
- To contribute to research in the area of Church, Welfare and Citizenship. This is to bridge the knowledge gap between the developed world like the Nordic countries and a developing country like Ghana where much research has not been done in this area.

This study was limited to the PCG and CRC, a mainline church and a neo-pentecostal church respectively. The study involved interviewing heads of the two churches, welfare leaders, church elders, lecturers in the field of social work and beneficiaries of welfare works of the studied churches.

The review of available literatures pointed out the important role of religion in welfare and citizenship development.

Empirical data gathered from the fieldwork for this study revealed that both the PCG and the CRC put much importance on Education and Health Care in their social welfare works. Others included Social Care programs such as support for orphanage and children's home, welfare programs for destitute and street children and human empowering programs such as Employable Training / Development.

The principal theoretical concept employed in the study was Citizenship. The focus was on Marshall's notion of *Social Citizenship* and Hoskins' *Participatory Citizenship.* By employing these two concepts, the study looked at how the churches social welfare programs which was seen as mainly provision of social rights, contributed to participatory citizenship in Ghana.

The concept of "the home we build together" was also used in this study. By this notion, the churches were viewed as nation builders, who co-partner the state in building the society together.

The research methodology employed by this study was a qualitative research method. Using semi-structured interviews, data were collected in two months of fieldwork. Face to face interviews were conducted with heads of the churches, welfare leaders, church elders, people in academia, and welfare beneficiaries of the churches, as well as informal conversation with other members of the society who were relevant to this study. Secondary sources of data such as documents and internet resources were also used.

7.2 Conclusion

The main theme which the study revolved around was:- Church, Welfare and Citizenship: A study of the contributions of the social welfare works of the Presbyterian Church of Ghana and the Christ Reformed Church to Participatory Citizenship in Ghana.

The study found out that the PCG and the CRC played key role to participatory citizenship through provision of social welfare programs like education, health care and other social care services. This seems an essential approach for the citizens to increase their participation in national issues. The study noted that, social welfare work of the churches was an effective means of promoting participatory citizenship – increasing citizens economic well-being, societal

development, participate in and influencing decisions in the society, as well as making them self-reliant.

This study affirms that, the PCG and the CRC play a role of a "surrogate family" and "nation builders". By their role as "surrogate family", they step in where the traditional family and the government are not present, engaging in welfare works originally intended for the traditional family and the government. As "nation builders", the churches were seen as co-partners, who support the state in seeking the welfare of its citizenry.

The study further noted that the churches motivation for undertaking social welfare works span from religious to secular motives. They included theological, mutual aid and ideological motivations.

With regards to challenges in doing social welfare, the study pointed out three main challenges: financial, political and human factors.

7.3 Recommendations

This study makes the following recommendations based on the results:

In the first place, the study recommends that churches should make it a point to undertake and be involved in various welfare activities. This should not just be an activity carried out once in a blue moon but it should form part of the social duties of the church. This is because such an involvement would help to increase both the economic and social wellbeing of its own church members as well as people in its immediate community and the country as a whole.

In addition, this study recommends for further study to be carried in this area. Further studies could be carried out to find the relation between churches involvement in welfare activities and its impact on church growth.

8.0 BIBLIOGRAPHY

Abel-Smith, B and Titmus, K., (1987) "The Philosophy of Welfare" London: Allen & Unwin.

Agbeti, J.K. (1986), "West African Church History: Christian Missions and Church Foundations" Leiden: Brill Archive

Amanor, J. D. (Undated) "Pentecostalism in Ghana: An African Reformation" Unpublished manuscripts.

Anheier, H.K and Salamon, L.M. (1998), "The nonprofit sector in the developing world", Oxford Road: Manchester University Press

Atingdui, L. (1995) "Defining the Nonprofit Sector: Ghana" Working *Papers of the Johns Hopkins Comparative Nonprofit Sector Project*, no. 14, edited by Lester M. Salamon and Helmut K. Anheier. Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins Institute for Policy Studies.

Atuahene, F and Owusu-Ansah, A (2013) "A Descriptive Assessment of Higher Education Access, Participation, Equity, and Disparity in Ghana". Available at: http://www.sagepublications.com. Accessed: 09/04/2014.

Avendal, C. (2011) "Social Work in Ghana: Engaging Traditional Actors in Professional Practices", Sweden: Lund University.

Babbie, E and Mouton, J. (2001) "The practice of Social Research" Cape Town, Southern Africa: Oxford University Press.

Backstrom, A., Davie, G (2010) "The WREP Project: Genesis, Structure and Scope" In, Backstrom, A., Davie, G., Edgardh, N. and Petterson, P. (Eds). "Welfare and Religion in 21st Century Europe" *Volume 1. Configuring the Connections,* Farnham: Ashgate.

Bellamy, R., (2008) "Citizenship: A Very Short Introduction" Oxford: University Press

Boateng, R. , Olumide, L. , Isabalija, R.S and Budu, J., (2011) "Sakawa- Cybercrime and Criminality in Ghana" *Journal of Information Technology Impact, Vol. 11, No. 2, pp. 85-100*

Bryman, A. (2012) "Social Research Methods.4th edition" NY: Oxford University Press

Casley, D. J., and Kumar, K. (1988) "The Collection, Analysis and Use of Monitoring and Evaluation Data" Baltimore, MD: Johns Hopkins University Press for the World Bank.

Coomson, J., (2006, October 4) "Cyber-crimes in Ghana", *Ghanaian Chronicle.* Retrieved 20/04/2014 from http://allafrica.com/stories/200610040856.html.

Council of Europe (2010) "Council of Europe Charter on Education for Democratic Citizenship and Human Rights Education" Available at: http://www.coe.int/t/dg4/education/edc/Source/Charter/Charter_brochure_EN.pdf.Accessed: 05/03/2014

Cox, J. L and Haar, G. (ed). (2003) "Uniquely African?: African Christian Identity from Cultural and Historical Perspectives" Trenton, New Jersey: Africa World Press.

Crepaz, M. L. (2006) "If you are my brother, I may give you a dime. Public opinion on multiculturalism, trust and the welfare state" in: *Multiculturalism Policies and the Welfare State.* Edited by: Keith Banting and Will Kymlicka. Oxford University Press

Dixon, J., (1987) "Social Welfare in Africa" London: Crooms Helm

Etikpah, B.S (2010) "Interreligious Relations: The Potency of Peaceful Coexistence for Community Development in Rural Ghana" (Unpublished MPhil. Thesis) Oslo: University of Oslo.

Flick, U. (1998) "An Introduction to Qualitative Research" SAGE Publications"

Fokas, E and Molokotos-Liederman, L (2010) "The Disgraceful and the Divine in Greek Welfare: The Cases of Thiva and Livadeia" In, Backstrom, A., Davie, G., Edgardh, N. and Petterson, P. (Eds). "Welfare and Religion in 21st Century Europe" *Volume 1. Configuring the Connections,* Farnham: Ashgate.

Fransen, H., Kantartzis, S., Pollard, N. and Moldes, I.V., (2013) "Citizenship: exploring the contribution of Occupational Therapy" Available at: http:// www.europa.eu/citizens-2013. Accessed: 15/04/2014.

Furukawa, K., (2008) "Social Welfare in Japan: Principles and Applications" Melbourne: Trans Pacific Press

Ghana Statistical Service (2010) "2010 Population and Housing Census Report" Accra: (Ghana Statistical Service)

Harris, J (2010). "*Citizenship in Britain and Europe: Some Missing Links in T.H. Marshall's Theory of Rights"* St Catherine's College University of Oxford, working paper.

Hoskins, B., Abs, H., Han, C., Kerr, D and Veugelers, W., (2012) "Contextual Analysis Report: Participatory Citizenship in the European Union Institute of Education" Available at: http://ec.europa.eu/citizenship/pdf/report_1_conextual_report.pdf. Accessed: 10/04/2014

http://opinion.myjoyonline.com/pages/articles/201110/74236.php: Retrieved, 24th April, 2014.

http://www.ehow.com/info_10072692_define-cordial-relations.html

http://www.everyculture.com/Ge-It/Ghana.html_ retrieved April 19, 2014.

http://www.ghana.gov.gh/:retrieved,September,2013

http://www.modernghana.com/news/200111/1/discussions-on-ngos-accountability-held.html: Retrieved, 24th April, 2014

http://www.oikoumene.org/en/member-churches/presbyterian-church-of-ghana

International Social Security Association, (2005)

Isichei, E. (1995), "A History of Christianity in Africa" Michigan: Wm. B. Eerdmans Publishing Co.

Isin, E and Wood, P., (1999) "Citizenship and Identity" London: Sage

Isin, E. F (2008) "Theorizing acts of citizenship. In: Isin, E. and Nielsen, G. (eds) Acts of Citizenship" London: Palgrave Macmillan.

Isin, E. F. & Turner, B. S., (2002) "Citizenship studies: an introduction, in: E. F. Isin and B. S. Turner (Eds) *Handbook of Citizenship Studies, pp. 1 – 10 (London: Sage)*

Jackson, A (1987.), "Anthropology at Home" (ed) London: Tavistock.

Janovski, T., (1998) "Citizenship and Civil society: A Framework of Rights and Obligations in Liberal, Traditional, and Social Democratic Regimes" Cambridge, U.K: Cambridge University Press.

Jones, E. and Gaventa, J., (2002) "Concepts of Citizenship: a review"*, IDS Development Bibliography No.19, Brighton: Institute of Development Studies

Kay, W.K. (2011) "Pentecostalism: A Very Short Introduction*" New York: Oxford University Press Inc.

King, D and Waldron, J., (1988) "Social Citizenship and the Defence of Welfare Provision" *British Journal of Political Science*, Vol.18, No.4, pp.415-443. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. Accessed via /stable/193879 on 20/03/ 2014

Kohli, A.S and Sharma, S.R (1997) "Organization of Social Welfare" Anmol Publications: New Delhi.

Kreitzer, L (2012) **"**Social Work in Africa: Exploring Culturally Relevant Education and Practice in Ghana." *University of Calgary Press: Calgary, Alt.*

Lidzén, L. (2008), "A Comparative Study of the Social Welfare Provided by Three Christian Churches in Accra, Ghana." Unpublished manuscript**.**

Macarov, D. (1995) "Social Welfare: Structure and Practice". SAGE Publications.

Madden, R. (2010) "Being Ethnographic: A Guide to the Theory and Practice of Ethnography" Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE Publications

Marcus, G.E (1998) "Ethnography Through Thick and Thin." New Jersey: Princeton University Press.

Marshall, T. H. (2006) "Citizenship and social class" in: Pierson, C. & Castles F. G. (Eds) The Welfare State Reader *(2nd Edition)*. pp. 30 – 41 (Cambridge: Polity Press).

Midgley, J. (1995). "Social Development: The Development Perspective in Social Welfare." London: SAGE Publications.

Mills, R. E (2011) "The Church as the Surrogate Family" Bloomington: Westbow Press.

Neuman, W.L. (2007) "Social Research Methods: Qualitative and Quantitative Approaches" *(6th Edition).* Pearson Education.

Nukunya, G. K. (2003). *Tradition and Change in Ghana. An Introduction to Sociology*. Accra: Ghana University Press.

Official website of Christ Reformed Church - *http: // www.kantanka.com/kristoasafo.html*

Official website of the Presbyterian Church of Ghana - www.pcgonline.org*, Retrieved 20.08.2013).*

Oldfield, A., (1990), "Citizenship and Community: Civic Republicanism and the Modern World" London: Routledge.

Omenyo, C. N. (2006). "Pentecost outside Pentecostalism:A study of the development of charismatic renewal in the mainline churches in Ghana" *Zoetermeer: Uitgeverij Boekencentrum*

Palacios, R., & Sluchynsky, O. (2006). *Social Pensions Part I: Their Role in the Overall Pension System*, *Social Protection Discussion Paper NO. 0601.* Washington: World Bank.

Parker, J., (1998) "Citizenship, Work and Welfare: Searching for the Good Society" Houndmills: Macmillan Press.

Parsons, R.T. (1963), "The Churches and Ghana Society 1918-1955: A survey of the work of three protestant mission societies and the African churches which they established in their assistance to societary development." Leiden: Netherlands.

Radcliff-Brown, A.R. (1940). *"Preface"* In E. E. Evans-Pritchard & M. Fortes (Eds.), *African Political Systems*. London: Oxford University Press

Reynolds, S (2012) "Assessment of Voter Turnout in District Level Elections in Ashaiman" (Unpublished EMBA Thesis) Ghana: Kwame Nkrumah University of Science and Technology.

Sacks, J., (2007) "The Home We Build Together: recreating society" Continuum, London & New York.

Sanneh, L. (1983) "West African Christianity: The Religious Impact" Maryknoll: Orbis Books.

Scott, D. and Usher, R. (2011) "Researching Education: Data Methods and Theory in Educational Inquiry", 2nd edition. London: Continuum

Shafir, G. (1998) "The Citizenship Debates: A Reader" Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.

Silverman, D. and Marvasti, A.B. (2008) "Doing Qualitative Research: A Comprehensive Guide" SAGE Publications.

Siobhan E. L (2008) "African Social Services in Peril: A Study of the Department of Social Welfare in Ghana under the Highly Indebted Poor Countries Initiative", *Journal of Social Work* London: SAGE Publications

Smith, A. M., (1998) "Laclau and Mouffe: the radical democratic imaginary" London: Routledge

Smith, N. (1966), "The Presbyterian Church of Ghana, 1835-1960: A Young Church in a Changing Society" Accra: Ghana University Press

Stroup, H.H (2008) "Social Work: An Introduction to the Field" *(2nd Edition).* Jurjeet Publications: India.

Sultan, S. M and Schrofer, T. T., (2008) "Building Support to have Targeted Social Protection Interventions for the Poorest – The Case of Ghana" Available at: http://www.unicef.org/socialpolicy/files/Social Protection for the Poorest Ghana.pdf. Accessed: 27/03/2014.

Sundkler, B and Steed, C (2000) "A History of the Church in Africa", Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Suszycki, A.M. (2011)"Welfare citizenship and welfare nationalism" (ed) Nordic Centre of Excellence NordWel: Helsinki.

The Constitution of the Republic of Ghana, 1992

The Welfare State Reader, pp. 32 – 41 (Cambridge: Polity Press)

Turner, B.S., (1993) "Citizenship and Social Theory" London: SAGE Publications.

Twine, F., (1994) "Citizenship and Social Rights: the Interdependence of Self and Society" London: Sage Publications.

Van Bruggen, H., Kantartzis, S. & Rowan, S., (Eds) (2010) "Competences for Poverty Reduction" Amsterdam: ENOTHE

Van de Walle, N. and Johnston, T.A. (1996) "Improving Aid to Africa" Washington DC: Johns Hopkins University Press

Van Kersbergen K. and Manow, P. (2009) *Religion and the Western Welfare State – The Theoretical Context,* in Van Kersbergen K. and Manow, P. (Eds). *Religion, Class Coalitions, and Welfare States:* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Walker, R (2005) "Social Security and Welfare: Concepts and Comparisons." Open University Press: Maidenhead.

Westheimer, J and Kahne, J., (2004) "What Kind of Citizen? The Politics of Educating for Democracy" *American Educational Research Journal*, Vol. 41, No. 2, pp. 237-269 available at: http://www.jstor.org/stable/3699366, accessed: 26/04/2014.

Williman, N. (2011) "Research Methods: The Basics" London: Routledge