



UNIVERSITY OF OSLO

Religion and Migration: The Case of Caritas and Ukrainian Refugees

Jyoti Dahal

MA Thesis

Religion and Diversity: Conflict and Coexistence

Supervisor: Associate Professor Kaia S. Rønnsdal

University of Oslo

The Faculty of Theology

Fall 2023

Abstract:

This thesis explores the intersection of religion and migration, mainly focusing on the self-presentation of Caritas, a religion-based humanitarian organization, in their work with Ukrainian refugees. The research question revolves around how religion/theology is expressed in Caritas's online description of their work to Ukrainian refugees. In order to examine the religious/theological terminology and themes in Caritas, their organizational presentation and documents have to be studied. To achieve this goal, content analysis has been used as a research methodology for this project. Since the project is to examine online descriptions of Caritas, their published documents are selected from Caritas websites, material such as articles, newsletters, field reports, interviews, etc. All online available documents are selected from Caritas Internationalis and Caritas Europa webpages. The topic has been discussed within the framework of migration theology, mainly focused on *missio Dei* and Empathy, Compassion and Love of Neighbor; and acts of citizenship. The main focus of this thesis is to examine the work of Caritas from two different sides. Migration theology is to examine the work of Caritas from a religious point of view, whereas acts of citizenship is to study about practices and acts of Caritas.

Acknowledgments

I would like to express gratitude to my supervisor, Kaia S. Rønsdal, for her expert guidance and support which has played an important role in completing this project successfully. I would also like to extend my gratitude towards my mother, Mina Dahal, and my brother, Prakash Dahal, for their continuous prayers and emotional support throughout this academic journey. Additionally, I am thankful for the support provided by my workplace, 'Pinsekirken Nesodden', and the steadfast encouragement of my friends and family.

I would like to give special thanks to my husband, Subham Bajracharya as well for his continuous support and encouragement.

Keywords:

Religion and Migration, Migration Theology, Ukrainian Refugees, Caritas, *missio Dei*, Religion-Based Organization.

Table of Contents

Chapter 1: Introduction	3
1.1. Introduction:	3
1.2 Significance of study	4
1.3 Scope and limitation	4
1.4 Structure of the paper:	5
Chapter 2: Background	6
2.1. Caritas	6
2.2. Ukrainian war and refugee crisis	12
2.3. Researcher position	13
Chapter 3: Methodology	16
3.1. Introduction and Overview	16
3.2. Research method	17
Chapter 4: Caritas online	20
4.1 Research Materials	20
4.1.1 Caritas' Online Presentation of Ukraine Crisis	21
4.1.2 Religious language and quotes in the work of Caritas in Ukraine case:	23
4.2 Summary	30
Chapter 5: Theoretical Approaches	31
5.1. Introduction	31
5.2. Migration Theology?	32
5.3. Acts of Citizenship?	41
5.4 Summary	47
Chapter 6: Discussion	48
6.1 Introduction:	48
6.2 Through the lens of migration theology	48
6.2.1 Missio Dei	50
6.2.2 Empathy, compassion and love of neighbor	53
6.3 Through the lens of acts of citizenship	62
6.4 Conclusion	73
Chapter 7: Concluding Remarks	75
7.1. Key Findings	75
7.2. Summarising the thesis	77
Bibliography	80

Chapter 1: Introduction

1.1. Introduction:

This thesis aims to research Caritas, a prominent humanitarian organization, who is claiming about their religious foundation as well as their social services. In this regard, I aim to study how a religiously grounded social service provider organization portrays itself online. I will mainly examine, what kinds of material do they publish, how do they express love, compassion along with their actions and organizational values, etc. Furthermore, it is about examining the action and reaction of Caritas in the period of crisis. As a theology student, I am willing to study the role of religion in the work of Caritas. This thesis mainly aims to study the work of Caritas in the Russia-Ukraine case and their religious expression and practical actions for Ukrainian refugees.

Migration is a mainstream topic in today's world. The number of migrants and refugees are increasing abruptly. According to 2023 data, over 100 million people had to forcefully migrate to another country by 2022.¹ The main reason to migrate is to seek for a better future. The cause for this decision could be war, personal, social, political, economic, or environmental issues. No matter what the reason for this decision is, everyone should be treated respectfully, and all have the right to live with dignity. This present invasion, which started on 24 February 2022 in Russia to Ukraine, resulted in another big refugee crisis in Europe after the Second World War. McCloskey cites Amnesty International to define the act of Russia toward Ukraine as "an act of aggression in violation of the United Nations Charter and illegal under international law." (McCloskey, 2022, p. 138). In this war thousands of people have died, and hundreds of medical and education sectors have been devastated, along with different religious places. (Aljazeera, 2022). According to UNHCR, this war has resulted in around 17.6 million people require humanitarian support in the 2023.² Among them, over 6 million displaced Ukrainian refugees are recorded in the world.³

In addition, the Ukraine-Russia case will be studied, not from the political or economic sector; rather it is a study of the social situation where one faith-based organisation is contributing in a broad way. This study will delve into the needs of the vulnerable group of people who come

¹ <https://www.caritas.org/2023/09/free-to-choose-whether-to-migrate-or-to-stay/> (accessed 10.11.2023)

² <https://www.unrefugees.org/emergencies/ukraine/> (accessed 21.09.2023)

³ <https://data2.unhcr.org/en/situations/ukraine> (accessed 10.11.2023)

to the border and get help through this organization. At the same time, this paper will highlight how one organization can stand with the needy people in crisis.

Consequently, this thesis will not cover any other political aspects, previous agreements, or wars, instead, it is to study the Russia-Ukraine war which started on 24th Feb 2022 and what the practices and actions of Caritas have been carried out to support Russia-Ukraine in this period of crisis.

In this context, my main research question will be:

- **How is religion/theology expressed in the self-presentation of Caritas in descriptions online of their work with Ukrainian refugees and in what ways does it relate to migration theology?**

1.2 Significance of study

This thesis significance is multifaceted. This can shed light on the religious values of a religion-based organization. For instance, the visibility of religion and practical action in organizational operation. This thesis enhances the intersection of religion/theology and migration from the organizational sectors that is by grounding on religious expression and migration work by a religion based humanitarian organization. Overall, this thesis has significance more than its immediate scope. This insights from the religion sector to humanitarian, refugees, migration and faith-based organization.

1.3 Scope and limitation

Even though this thesis is about the work of the Caritas related to Ukraine Case, only few relevant materials are selected from Caritas websites. For that as a primary source, I have selected two major Caritas organization i.e., Caritas Internationalis and Caritas Europa. Due to the reason that Caritas Internationalis is head of the Caritas and Caritas Europe is more responsible to look for the European side. Thus, I will focus on the Ukraine Case related materials available in these two websites between 24th February 2022 to 24th February 2023. Along with practices of Caritas, religious languages will be studied in order to answer my research question. In this regard, the materials available in these two websites are going to be studied. Therefore, I will use a content analysis research method to achieve this objective.

As mentioned above, to study the self-presentation of Caritas online, the study will rely only on online available materials, Caritas centres are actively posting on their websites and social

media therefore I will only study the materials available between 24th Feb 2022 -24th Feb 2023.

1.4 Structure of the paper:

In chapter two, I will present the background of the Caritas, religion-based organization which aims to support the vulnerable and protect human dignity. In addition, I will present the Russia-Ukraine war and positionality of the researcher along with my motivation for this research.

In chapter three, I will present the methodological consideration for this project. As this thesis aims to study self-presentation of faith-based organization on their religious expression and practices in their work, content analysis is selected. In addition, I will present the expected religious terms and themes from my materials. I will select my materials from Caritas Internationalis and Caritas Europa' webpages.

Chapter four is my material chapter, that is divided in two parts. First, I will present Caritas' online presentation of Ukraine. In this section, I will present my material which is articles, videos, press releases etc, related to the Ukraine war. All the materials I select will be related to the Ukraine war and religion expressing. Then I will present the explicitly and implicitly expressed religious/theological terminology from my selected materials.

In chapter five, I will present the theoretical framework of the thesis. There are two main directions: migration theology; to examine my data from religious perspective and acts of citizenship; to study practices and acts of Caritas. These two theoretical concepts have to examine data from two different angles.

After the theory presentation in chapter six, I will discuss my data, selected quotes, and excerpts by theoretical framework to explore, challenge and answer my research question. First, I will discuss my data through migration theology then I will examine my data from the acts of citizenship lenses. Then I will conclude the discussion chapter.

In my final chapter, seven, I will present my key findings along with the limitations and significance of this study and then I will summarise the thesis.

Chapter 2: Background

In this chapter, I will study the language used in self-presentation of Caritas in their work with Ukrainian refugees. I will begin with the background of Caritas. In this part, I will explain how Caritas was established, developed and became one of the largest humanitarian aid organizations in the world. I will also include their historical background, mission, role of religion and so on of Caritas. After this, I will give a short overview of the Russia- Ukraine war. Following this, I will introduce myself as the researcher.

2.1. Caritas

I will start by giving a short presentation on the history and the organisational presentation of Caritas. This section is primarily based on the Caritas Internationalis' web pages.⁴

Caritas was started by Lorenz Wethman in Germany in 1897 as ““Deutscher Caritasverband” (German Caritas Association)”.⁵ It is the humanitarian aid organisation of the Roman Catholic Church which is now a global organisation. “The idea was to structure the Church’s social activities in every country to then create a national Caritas and to have it join Caritas Internationalis. This way, Caritas Internationalis became a highly federal organisation covering the whole world”.⁶ Both WWI and WWII showed the necessity of humanitarian organisation which resulted in the enlargement of Caritas in Europe and in North America.⁷ Caritas was started in response to people in need in Germany after WWII. Following this, Caritas expanded their work from one country to international level. The term Caritas comes from the Latin word, meaning ‘Love’ and ‘Compassion’. The initial reason to form the Caritas was the response to human suffering. Since the 1970s, the origin of Caritas, it has demonstrated its objective through their work, whether it is by standing with disaster victims and helping refugees in emergency situations.⁸ In 1916, Caritas was declared “the social wing of the Catholic Church

⁴ <https://www.caritas.org/> <https://www.caritas.org/who-we-are/history/> and <https://www.caritas.org/where-caritas-work/europe/germany/> (accessed 18.02.2023)

⁵ Ibid. (accessed 18.02.2023)

⁶ (*Love Across Borders*) <https://www.caritas.org/wordpress/wp-content/uploads/2017/06/ADayInTheLife.pdf> (p.2) (access 15.02.2023)

⁷ Serving out of love <https://www.caritas.org/wordpress/wp-content/uploads/2019/04/ServingOutOfLove.pdf> (p. 42) (accessed February 2023)

⁸ <https://www.caritas.org/70years/> (Information from timeline slides) (accessed 18.02.2023)

in Germany”⁹ by the Catholic Bishops Conference of Germany. Caritas primarily began by concentrating on social projects inside Germany, then in the 20th century they expanded their focus by setting up an international department to carry out disaster response and assisting with social programs globally.¹⁰ Even though this was started by a single man, it became one of the largest humanitarian aid organisations in the world. Later in the 20th century, Giovanni Battista Montini formed a base for an international network and as a result Caritas Internationalis was recognized officially.¹¹ Caritas was formed in different countries of the world to mitigate the crises which showed the need of Caritas meaning Love and Compassion, a need of a response to human suffering and emergency reliefs thus Caritas resulted as a leading global humanitarian relief organization on a global scale. All these works and support could not happen with one person or one organisation. All these became possible because of their network, their staff, and volunteers who have actively worked to accomplish their missions and projects, including their supporters in different levels and ways. It is “inspired by Catholic faith, Caritas is the helping hand of the church-reaching out to the poor, vulnerable and excluded, regardless of race or religion, to build a world based on justice and fraternal love”.¹² Social mission is the main objective of Caritas by holding “core values of the Catholic Church”.¹³ They also presented that they “believe in dignity, solidarity and stewardship on behalf of the world’s most vulnerable people”.¹⁴ In their website there is a slogan, “When a crisis hits, Caritas is already on the ground.”¹⁵, this slogan particularly shows their attentiveness. Not only the slogan but the symbol of Caritas also holds very profound meaning. As Caritas Australia describes the symbol of Caritas is “a flaming cross, symbolising Christ’s burning love for his people”.¹⁶

⁹ <https://www.caritas.org/where-caritas-work/europe/germany/> (accessed 18.02.2023)

¹⁰ Ibid. (accessed 18.02.2023)

¹¹ <https://www.caritas.org/who-we-are/history/> (accessed 18.02.2023)

¹² <https://www.caritas.org/who-we-are/> (accessed 18.02.2023)

¹³ <https://www.caritas.org/share-the-journey/> (accessed 10.11.23)

¹⁴ Ibid. (accessed 10.11.23)

¹⁵ <https://www.caritas.org/who-we-are/> (accessed 20.02.2023)

¹⁶ <https://www.caritas.org.au/faq-s/> (20.09.2023)



Figure. 1

Caritas claims that they prioritize Catholic Social Teaching in their services. Catholic Social Teaching is a doctrine and principles followed and priorities by Roman Catholic Churches. It is stated that CST is a theological and philosophical tool that empowers all Caritas members to contribute to society by collaborating with all people. As explained and followed by Caritas, Catholic Social Teaching illuminates,

“in the light of the Word of God, the changing temporary realities, promoting as PERMANENT PRINCIPLES the inviolability of human dignity, the universal destination of the goods creation, the primacy of labour over capital, participation in the search for the common good, subsidiarity and solidarity, all taken from, and supporting the perspective of the PREFERENTIAL OPTION FOR THE POOR, an ethical imperative essential for effectively attaining the common good”.¹⁷

In addition, they further state that “All Catholic Social Teaching principles are theological and philosophical instruments which allow Caritas members to engage with the community of the faithful and with all the people of good will”.¹⁸ These writings of Caritas show that Catholic Social Teaching is foundational in the word of God, and it is for the welfare of people. Additionally, they present about safeguarding where they state that they support the vulnerable by “supporting survivors with humility and action”.¹⁹ Catholic Social Teaching is relevant and important to explain in this section because Caritas as a religious organization is based on Catholic Social Teaching and they are stating that by following CST they are serving the people in need.

¹⁷ *Serving out of love - Caritas identity and mission* <https://www.caritas.org/wordpress/wp-content/uploads/2019/04/ServingOutOfLove.pdf> (p.36)

¹⁸ *Ibid.* (p.37)

¹⁹ <https://www.caritas.org/who-we-are/ethics/> (accessed 22.02.2023)

On the website of Caritas.org, there is an introduction video about who they are. In this introduction video, the first sentence they say is “Caritas is love, God’s love for all humanity.”²⁰ In the video, they describe this love of God is for everybody, without any human differences. They present this love as responding with action to help the people in need by providing what they need, being there in the crisis, and creating a peaceful and developing environment. The objective of Caritas is not only the physical fulfilment of the people but also working on the spiritual side by keeping the church at its centre. Caritas is more than one thing: “community centre, international relief agency, home for the elderly and school for the former child soldier, HIV care provider and human rights campaigner”.²¹ Caritas is not only limited here but it is more than all these. Caritas with their central aim to support the people, help in education, business, human dignity and so on. All of this is done for the compassion of people. Caritas is based on Catholic principles, it's one of the main principles is compassion. They believe that the way to show compassion is to act. Along with eliminating poverty from this world, Caritas object and work to feed the hungry, and provide medicines and other basic needs of the people. They are doing this in collaboration with their local members. Caritas states that they are doing this by being together with one another and for one another.²²

How do Caritas work?

As mentioned, Caritas claims that when disasters hit, they are already on the ground. They are involved in various activities and stay connected with their partner organisations and during crises, they play a leading role in the implementation. Along with their own staff and volunteers, they are connected with other leading humanitarian organisations as well. These are: Catholic Relief Services, CAFOD, Secours Catholique, Cordaid, and Trócaire. In order to have effective impact in the world, Caritas cooperate with other leading organisations as well such as different secular, UN, faith-based organizations, and son on.²³ The Caritas organization claims that they strongly believe that their supporters, staff, and volunteers are the strength of the Caritas network to accomplish their objectives in the world and see results.²⁴

²⁰ <https://www.caritas.org/who-we-are/> (accessed 20.02.2023. Time: 0:21-0:25)

²¹ Ibid. (accessed 20.02.2023. Time: 0:57-1:0)

²² Ibid. (accessed 20.02.2023).

²³ *We are Caritas* <https://www.caritas.org/wordpress/wp-content/uploads/2017/06/WeAreCaritas.pdf> (p.3)

²⁴ Ibid. (p.3)

Caritas gets funded through its member organisations and individual donations.²⁵ Including different church offerings, fundraisings, government, and public collections, different trusts, and organisations, etc.²⁶

I have now presented the background of Caritas as a whole. Now I will present Caritas Internationalis and Caritas Europa in brief. Websites from these two organisations are selected to study for my project. Therefore, it is important to see these two organisations more closely.

Caritas Internationalis and Caritas Europa:

Caritas Internationalis is the head of Caritas, which is based in Rome, Italy. They have a confederation with more than 160 members. All Caritas organizations are members in both Caritas Internationalis, the international confederation, and regional Caritas networks.²⁷

Caritas Europa is a Caritas association in the European side of the world. Caritas Europa has its headquarters in Brussels, Belgium. It is working and focusing on all people from different faith and ethnic backgrounds. Under this European regional network, there comes 49 Caritas member organizations from 46 different European countries. Ukraine, one of the eastern European countries belongs to this European regional network along with the international confederation.²⁸

One of the major works of Caritas Europa is to represent the voices of its member organizations. Despite locating and focusing on European regions, Caritas Europa participates in supplying emergency relief and conducting development projects globally. They aim to include different people in their team, so they can use people's ability and capability in different situation. According to Caritas, knowledge and ideas from their staff and volunteers is their strength which supports others as well as impact in the work of Caritas.²⁹

As presented in their work pattern, they work at a local level. This is their strong ground to be present quickly in the emergency field. In their four years strategic framework (2019-2023) they write that they stimulate their people and community to be prepared for all kinds of

²⁵ <https://www.caritas.org/who-we-are/finance/> (20.02.2023)

²⁶ *Serving out of love - Caritas identity and mission* <https://www.caritas.org/wordpress/wp-content/uploads/2019/04/ServingOutOfLove.pdf> (p.54)

²⁷ <https://www.caritas.org/who-we-are/> (accessed: 21.02.2023)

²⁸ <https://www.caritas.eu/who-we-are/> (accessed: 19.02.2023)

²⁹ *Ibid.* (accessed: 21.02.2023)

adversity. Hence, they say confidently that “when a crisis hits Caritas is already on the ground”.³⁰ *We are Caritas*, one of the prospectuses from Caritas Internationalis describes that when a crisis happens their local members inform all their confederations and appeal for the support. By using their local member's power, expertise, and skills they can respond immediately in emergencies.³¹

Regarding migration, they are working from their side to give safety and security along with protecting migrant's rights. Their core values towards social mission are dignity, justice, solidarity, and stewardship.³²

Caritas have mentioned that they are inspired by the biblical church tradition, the early church tradition is described as all sharing what they had, therefore all could have commonwealth. Furthermore, they write that there should be holistic development of the person, and this holistic is all aspects of a person such as physical, social, physiological, spiritual, emotional, religious, etc. In addition to this, they write that all human beings are formed in the likeness of God. Therefore, all are sacred beings, and everyone's dignity should be protected. They also confirm that their works are human centred. They elaborate that to achieve this goal their sole effort is not enough therefore they have to get together with the related community by hearing the needs of the people. According to Caritas an ideal society and implementation of democracy is determined on how they are treating the needy and marginalized people. As they mention that the need of the vulnerable should be prioritized in good societies. Caritas thinks that basic human rights should be protected, and they state that they have always been committed to advocating for and defending basic human rights such as food, shelter, health care and education.³³

Caritas is taken and presented as a church:

According to Caritas it is based on the Gospel and the Catholic faith. In the *Who we are* section of Caritas Internationalis' website, it is written that “Caritas is Church”³⁴, furthermore it is

³⁰ <https://www.caritas.org/who-we-are/> (accessed 21.02.2023)

³¹ *We are Caritas* <https://www.caritas.org/wordpress/wp-content/uploads/2017/06/WeAreCaritas.pdf> (accessed. 20.02.2023)

³² *Ibid.* (accessed. 20.02.2023)

³³ *Serving out of love - Caritas identity and mission* <https://www.caritas.org/wordpress/wp-content/uploads/2019/04/ServingOutOfLove.pdf> (pp.29-38)

³⁴ <https://www.caritas.org/who-we-are/caritas-is-church/> (accessed 18.03.2023)

written that “Caritas shares the mission of the church”³⁵, as mentioned in the same page, that mission is ‘charity’. They acknowledge Caritas as vital support of the church. According to Pope Francis, Caritas is “an essential part of the Church”³⁶ and it “institutionalized love in the church”³⁷. In addition, ““He said that Caritas has two dimensions: action and a divine dimension “situated in the heart of the Church””³⁸. At the same time ‘Caritas Internationalis’ translates as ‘love between peoples’.³⁹

As Caritas state that Caritas and Church are intertwined and absence of one another cannot exist. In addition, the role of a bishop is important for Caritas, for the bishop's work is to assure about the unity in a church and ensure charity work is allowed by governmental and societal authorities. As per Caritas, “Christian charity is first of all the simple response to immediate needs and specific situations”.⁴⁰ According to Caritas, the reason for this response is their religious teaching, tradition, and the hope of the vulnerable.⁴¹

What exactly is the work of Caritas Internationalis?

The meaning of Caritas Internationalis is “love between nations”.⁴² Their objective is to spread love globally by holding the church’s mission. Love visible in the bible is applicable in the work of Caritas. The Bible teaches about the love of God and the love of neighbour, these two commandments are inseparable instead these two are one command and that is to love. Pope Benedict confirms that “closing our eyes to our neighbour also blinds us to God”.⁴³ People who are ready to serve by loving both God and people have to be open to God’s word. As the parable of Good Samaritan explained in this text, serving is not related to a person’s identity, by his belonging or religion rather it is related to the person’s heart. This is foremost important to take.

2.2. Ukrainian war and refugee crisis

The Russian invasion of Ukraine on 24th February 2022 displaced millions of people and created a refugee crisis in Europe. From a population of 41.5 million people, approximately

³⁵ Ibid. (accessed 18.03.2023)

³⁶ Ibid. (accessed 18.03.2023)

³⁷ Ibid. (accessed 18.03.2023)

³⁸ Ibid. (accessed 18.03.2023)

³⁹ Ibid. (accessed 18.03.2023)

⁴⁰ <https://www.caritas.org/2013/09/how-pope-benedict-changed-charity/> (05.10.2023)

⁴¹ <https://www.caritas.org/who-we-are/mission/> (15.03.2023)

⁴² Caritas: love received and given <https://www.caritas.org/wordpress/wp-content/uploads/2017/06/LoveReceivedAndGiven-2.pdf> (accessed 20.02.2023 p.30)

⁴³ Ibid. (accessed 20.02.2023 p.30)

18.6 million people fled from Ukraine. Many have returned, but report from February 2023 show that 8.1 million refugees from Ukraine are still displaced. (CReAM - Centre for Research and Analysis of Migration, 2023).

Around 5 am on the morning of the invasion, they (Russian) started bombing Ukraine. Through this attack Russia 'officially declared war against Ukraine'. This led to the largest refugee crisis in Europe after WWII. According to the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner to Human Rights the number of verified civilian deaths in Ukraine by September 2023 is more than 9000⁴⁴. People inside the country are in need of food, proper shelter, and other essential things. Poland is receiving the highest number of refugees from Ukraine. People are moving from here to other European countries as well. (Margesson & Mix, 2022)

Most of the people who have crossed the border were women and children, not whole families. The situation inside Ukraine became a threat for people because of all the destruction and bombings. Children had to be in the basement for days or weeks mostly with their female parents, then to travel miles to cross the border, to live with all traumas, without their whole family, without their own things, outside their own home and outside their own country. (Ociepa-Kicińska & Gorzałczyńska-Koczkodaj, 2022). In the very situation, there are many organizations and supporters to help Ukrainian refugees but as Olga, one of the Ukrainian refugees says to BBC: "Even though everyone is kind and good, it's a real stress. The fact is we're not home". (Rainsford, 2023)

After presenting the background of the Russia Ukraine war, now I will introduce myself as the author of this thesis. I will also explain about the motivation behind this research.

2.3. Researcher position

In order to understand the researchers' positionality, I will give a short presentation of the researcher subject. I am a female, converted Christian from Nepal. My family witnessed a healing miracle in my close relative, which resulted in my entire family converting to Christianity (Pentecostal + Baptist) when I was 8 years old. I was involved in church activities and played a leadership role in preaching and arranging different activities for children and youths. I came to Norway and started studying for my bachelor's in leadership and theology at the Norwegian School of Leadership and Theology (HLT). After my bachelor's degree, I started my master's in religion and Diversity-Conflict and Coexistence (REDI) at the Faculty

⁴⁴ <https://www.statista.com/statistics/1293492/ukraine-war-casualties/> (accessed 03.10.2023)

of Theology, University of Oslo (UIO). Master's courses from UIO gave me a broader understanding of religion from different perspectives. The course 'Religion and Migration' was one of the most interesting and thought-provoking subjects for me. Even after completing my bachelor's in leadership and theology and gaining several experiences in religion sectors, I never thought about the relation of religion and migration, or this topic was not on my radar. After I enrolled in this course and gained knowledge about the intersections of religion to migration, it made me eager to delve deeper. As a migrant, working in the religious sector, I found this subject resonant. In essence, this master's course has broadened my perspectives on religion and ignited me to pursue more in this area.

Theology, especially Christian theology, has always been an interesting subject for me, mainly I think that through theology I can explore who I am and why I am, basically from a religious perspective. My decision to choose theology was also to know what I believe and why. Hence, I am personally interested in and influenced by theology. Throughout the masters, religion was viewed from different angles, like its connection to ecology, democracy, and so on. It enhanced my thought of a link between religion and migration. Working in a Norwegian Pentecostal church as a 'children and youth leader', working with different age groups, and multi-religious and diverse people attracted me more towards exploring the relationship of migration with religion. Furthermore, this subject gave me new insight to see religion. During my bachelor's program, I did an internship at one religion-based non-profit organization in Texas, USA. Providing food to poor children is their primary mission. (Manna Worldwide, 2022). There I got to learn about the organizational work of a faith-based organization for society. I got a chance to explore how one children and poverty focused mission organization, plans and works. With my supervisor I attended different pastor meeting, planned trip, worked on the mission budget plan etc. Later, I was able to volunteer with Caritas Norway, where I was a consultant and helped people from different countries. Mainly, I was there to let people contact their language speaking consultant, inform the legal department if people need legal consultation, give information about the centre and different courses, like job seeking courses, language courses, etc. I was helping people from small work like printing a paper to connect people with the legal department. Having a migrant background, myself and having this direct involvement with migrants from different countries attracted me towards the work of the Caritas. It enhanced my organisational interest and prompted me to pursue further studies in this sector. At the same time, Russia invaded Ukraine and as part of Caritas, I got to know that

Caritas is supporting and helping at the Ukraine border. That attracted me even more to study deeper in the work of Caritas in the Russia Ukraine case.

In this chapter I have presented the background of the Caritas, Russia-Ukraine case and my introduction. In the following chapter I will present a selected methodology for this project.

Chapter 3: Methodology

3.1. Introduction and Overview

In this chapter I will account for the methodological considerations I made in this research. My research question is, '*How is religion/theology expressed in the self-presentation of Caritas in descriptions online of their work with Ukrainian refugees and in what ways does it relate to migration theology?*'. As the question relates to self-presentation, I had to consider methodologies concerning textual work. In the following, I will shortly present some of the approaches I considered before accounting for content analysis.

I considered conducting interviews and participant observation with staff and volunteers of Caritas Norway. My aim was to study the work of Caritas with immigrants, especially their counselling, guidance and supporting sessions. This approach would have given me information about their organizational operations and their practices of religious values in their humanitarian work. In addition, through participant observation, I targeted to understand the responses of Caritas to different situations and inquiries, their behaviour, and languages they use during dealing with immigrants, etc. However, my research direction changed after Russia invaded Ukraine. In response to this situation Caritas Norway arranged a separate team for counselling and responding to related inquiries in their centre. This realization changed my focus from solely Caritas Norway to Caritas confederation as a whole. I wanted to study the organizational values, actions, and applied principles in the work of Caritas within Ukraine and at the border, with the objective to analyse their organisational language, operation and values and principle applied and practised in their humanitarian work. Now my research question concerns how Caritas present themselves. I will only study documents, texts, and videos where Caritas representatives write/speak about their activities in relation to refugees and displaced people inside and outside Ukraine.

In this chapter I will account for the methodological considerations and decisions I have made throughout the process of this project.

3.2. Research method

This project aims to explore language used regarding the Ukrainian case and religious perspectives connected to this issue in Caritas. How do Caritas implicitly and explicitly express religious aspects when they present their work and activities? In order to find the answer to this, I have explored publicly available documents that are provided by the organization itself. Methodologically, I have done content analysis, which I account below.

Content Analysis.

Nelson and Woods Jr., present content analysis as a popular approach for religious studies (Nelson & Woods Jr, 2011). James Drisko and Tina Maschi (2015), cite Klaus Krippendorff's definition of content analysis as "a research technique for making replicable and valid inferences from texts (or other meaningful matter) to the contents of their use" (Drisko & Maschi, 2015, p. 3). Furthermore, this research technique is useful to "identify and document the attitudes, views, and interests" (Drisko & Maschi, 2015, p 3). As this thesis aims to understand and identify religious expressions, content analysis can be a useful tool to achieve it. As I am interested in the self-presentation of Caritas, I examine the available documents, text and information. Thus, content analysis will help me address my research question. Nelson and Wood Jr., write that research techniques based on content analysis allow replication and valid inferences from texts or their context (Nelson & Woods Jr, 2011). This method is effective for research that focuses on identifying and analyse certain actualities (Nelson & Woods Jr, 2011, pp.109-117). This will further be clarified when I present my data which includes samples of texts and videos from the websites where religious language is used. Nelson and Woods Jr. write that "Content analysis is utilized in religious studies to understand religious expressions and identities, evaluate religion [...] and examine religion in social institutions and culture" (Nelson & Woods Jr., 2011, p. 109). I will delve into contents from Caritas website where Caritas is somehow the author, or that are official statements. As I am searching for explicit and implicit religious or theological reasoning, content analysis is a viable method as it helps to understand their self-presentation.

In research where there is lots of information it makes sense to organise it in simpler systems making it easier to find or navigate information. This is called data sampling. (Nelson & Woods Jr., 2011, pp.112-113). In this project data sampling will be online available documents, texts, videos, etc relating to the Russian invasion of Ukraine. In order to make my sampling into

manageable data, I followed the logic of purposive sampling. It is a selection of a specific sample to answer my research question and aspects (Campbell et al., 2020). In this research, all data are collected from two websites: Caritas Internationalis and Caritas Europa. In this study, I will gather documents related to the Ukraine war and samples that may be understood or interpreted as religious expressions in this context. I will focus on Caritas' publicly available organizational documents, examining language and expressions. For this study, my sampling and data collection will be as follows:

a. Sampling: A sample is a selected document to be studied for the project. What sort of documents should be included for the achievement of the research is determined by the research objective. Basically, the sample is 'what to study' for the project. For instance, I have mentioned that I will read the documents available from the Caritas websites (Caritas.org and Caritas.eu). However not everything presented on these websites are included. In this research, my sampling consists of documents relating to the war in Ukraine, their work for refugees, etc. I will include all kinds of online available brochures, books, articles, minutes, official records, etc.

b. Data collection: Data collection is a crucial aspect of any research. It is a process to gathering information through selected sample and those data will be used to discuss the findings (Brinkmann & Kvale, 2015). In this research, the data are excerpts from the websites where I have found explicit or implicit religious or theological language or references.

As this project aims to study implicitly and explicitly used religious/theological language, I am looking for in my material for data collection are such as;

Explicit religious language/biblical references/Christian language:

God, prayer, Jesus, cross, image of God, love of neighbour, compassion, serve, the good Samaritan, etc.

Regarding implicit religious language, this was something that I found while exploring the material. A few examples of such implicit languages, which will be further exemplified in the next chapter, are:

Mission or mission to help: In this project' context, a response to divine call to assist the people in need by committing on religious values.

Practical love: The way of expressing love through acts and deeds, it also aligns with Christian concept of caring others by feeding the poor and supporting the vulnerable.

Peace and freedom: These terms may hold the religious theme of pursuing peace and freedom. In the time of war this theme might be relevant.

Hope: Hope is a word that can sometimes be religiously pregnant. This might be an interesting word to explore in the work of Caritas.

Generosity and solidarity: This term gives the sense of community and Christian principles of sharing and supporting the vulnerable. Therefore, to explore the charitable words in the materials might be significant.

The above-mentioned words and concepts are some examples of my assumption for my data collection.

In this chapter, I have presented the choice of my research method, content analysis, in order to answer my research question. Along with the web material, I will explore the language Caritas use in my next chapter which will become my data.

Chapter 4: Caritas online

4.1 Research materials

I will now account for the different kinds of documents from Caritas webpages that I have studied. They vary from books, articles, newsletters, prospectus, to videos, slides, etc. After this account, I will give excerpts from these materials, my data, presented as quotes where implicit or explicit terminology is used. These data are what I later will discuss in my discussion chapter.

The purpose of presenting the material I have researched is to show in what kinds of framework/contexts my data appears. In order to explore my research question, I have chosen to study Caritas Internationalis and Caritas Europa, and how they present in documents online. As I have already explained, I have explored both websites, as Caritas Internationalis is the head of Caritas organizations, while Caritas Europa leads the European organizations. To study Ukraine's case, both the main Caritas and regional Caritas are relevant. The two websites are:

1. <https://www.caritas.org>
2. <https://www.caritas.eu>

These two websites are the primary source of my research. Since this is content analysis, their websites, and digitally available information are my study documents. On their websites, there are various categories of information. For instance, their prospectus, articles, newsletters, interviews, etc. In addition, I have examined other online available documents, and documents provided on their social media, namely the Twitter and YouTube of Caritas International.

Caritas is an active organization that keeps posting on its websites and social media therefore for this study, I have limited the study to the documents that were uploaded/posted between February 2022 to February 2023 related to Ukraine.

4.1.1 Caritas' Online Presentation of Ukraine Crisis

In this part I will give a short overview, with some examples. For instance, the way Caritas talk about their practices and activities which are my materials for this thesis. Some of their reports are very descriptive, some are about practical issues, their initiation, people's stories, and some are about being emotionally exhausted by the situation in Ukraine. In this part, I am describing these presentations briefly.

On the Caritas Internationalis' website, there is a separate column called '*Crisis in Ukraine*'.⁴⁵ In that column, there are sections to publish news from the field where they have published different articles about their work to help the Ukrainian refugees. There are stories of beneficiaries, volunteers, and staff at the border. Additionally, they have presented about providing food, shelter, kindergartens, psychosocial support, etc. to the war victims. There they present what are the things they are doing, how many people they have supported, updates from Caritas centres in neighbouring countries, what are their long-term plans to support these people etc.⁴⁶

In the *Crisis in Ukraine* section of Caritas Internationalis' website, there are some of the articles and field reports published by Caritas, presents how Caritas is reaching, reacting, and supporting the Ukrainian people in the time of crisis. Some of the examples are:

Some children were left by their father and went back to the war, some people came half frozen in seeking help, people who spent time in bombing centre with trauma reach up the border,⁴⁷ more other people with different stories come up to the border. These children and people were received by Caritas and got food, shelter, other basic needs along with elementary school for children. Stories of families who lived in the basement for 200 days, they came to contact with Caritas in Ukraine and Caritas-Spes Ukraine supported these families with food and other basic needs and comforted them in this difficult time.⁴⁸

In another side, in their website, they present that Caritas were not only receiving and serving people, however they were calling for an end to the antagonism and humanitarian assistance,

⁴⁵ <https://www.caritas.org/what-we-do/conflicts-and-disasters/crisis-in-ukraine/>(accessed 18.03.2023)

⁴⁶ Ibid. (accessed 05.10.2023)

⁴⁷ <https://www.caritas.org/2022/03/viktoria-christianko-from-ukraine-is-now-a-refugee-in-poland/> (accessed 18.03.2023)

⁴⁸ <https://www.caritas.org/2023/02/one-year-of-war-in-ukraine-people-of-the-dungeon/> (accessed 10.03.2023)

aligned for multiple appeals to stopping the war and seeking peaceful ways to deal with the problem, launched different statements, one of the statements is “an end to the violence”.⁴⁹

There are two major Caritas member organizations in Ukraine. Mostly the representative of these Caritas centres from Ukraine, the president of Caritas Ukraine, Tetiana Stawnychy and Executive Director of Caritas-Spes Ukraine, Father Vyacheslav Grynevych were in the frontline to give different interviews, releases appeals, express gratitude, asks for prayers, attends press releases and conferences etc. One of the examples is, President of Caritas Ukraine gave interview to BBC World. There she explains the situation of Ukraine, their work in the country, their own situation, organizational objective etc.⁵⁰ Most of the videos are published on YouTube, some of them are also available on Caritas Internationalis’ website on ‘Videos from the field’ section.⁵¹ Religious terms used in these materials will be presented in my ‘4.2.2 Religious languages and quotes appeared in the work of Caritas in Ukraine case’ section.

Caritas mentions that preparation for adversity and action is a method to decrease the consequences of humanitarian crises and emergencies. Their key strategy to be available in the emergency field shortly was their network and preparatory work. Caritas had a strategic objective for a humanitarian crisis during the period of 2019-2023.⁵² This resulted in Caritas being at the border when the crisis hit the Ukrainian people. In one of the articles published in Caritas website, they write that Caritas was on the front line to help from the beginning of the Russian invasion to help and support with urgent reliefs to Ukrainian refugees.⁵³ Furthermore, they write that great solidarity and support were seen from different levels to help the war victims, and through this article they claim that it has happened because of Caritas’s work on the ground level in different communities. They state that this has resulted in Caritas providing various assistance such as food, shelter, medicine, hygiene kits, and different pieces of training to staff and volunteers to cope with this situation in serving people and more.⁵⁴

Caritas keep informing about what is going on and how they are helping in the crisis areas. Furthermore, they mention that Caritas is tirelessly serving many regions in Ukraine.

⁴⁹ <https://www.caritas.org/2022/08/six-months-of-war-in-ukraine/> (accessed 18.03.2023)

⁵⁰ https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=ijNPwc9z4JE&ab_channel=CaritasEuropa (accessed 24.02.2023)

⁵¹ <https://www.caritas.org/what-we-do/conflicts-and-disasters/crisis-in-ukraine/> (accessed 10.03.2023)

⁵² <https://www.caritas.org/wordpress/wp-content/uploads/2020/03/03-en-strategic-framework-2019-2023-21ga.pdf> (accessed 15.01.2023)

⁵³ <https://www.caritas.org/2022/05/caritas-united-to-make-a-difference-one-person-at-a-time-for-victims-of-the-ukraine-conflict/> (accessed 17.03.2023)

⁵⁴ Ibid. (accessed 17.03.2023)

According to Caritas, they were immediate responders to the conflict and their service has increased continuously.⁵⁵ President of Caritas Ukraine, Tetiana Stawnychy and Secretary-General of Caritas-Spes Ukraine, Father Vyacheslav Grynevych, posts appeals, updates, gratuities, and information about the work of their centres. In addition, there are different conference videos. All these videos are published in Caritas websites, Twitter and YouTube channels.⁵⁶

In the same way as the Caritas Internationalis website, the website of Caritas Europa has a separate section to describe the work of Caritas in the Russia-Ukraine case. In this section, they explain the situation of Ukraine together with how Caritas inside Ukraine and outside in different neighbouring countries are responding to this situation. They write about how many people crossed the border, how many people have served, what sectors they are working in, etc.⁵⁷

Caritas Europa posts monthly newsletters on its website⁵⁸. Maria Nyman, Secretary General of Caritas Europa, writes this monthly overview. In this letter she gives updates, describes the work of Caritas, refer to meetings, presents released appeals and released statements and important activities Caritas have conducted, informs about and reports from webinar and conference, etc.⁵⁹ And as mentioned above, I have read monthly newsletters in my selected time frame for this thesis. In addition, there is a section where all media coverage documents are available. For this research I have not read through all the additional media published documents, the reason being all related information is available in their original documents which are available in these additional media publications.⁶⁰

4.1.2 Religious language and quotes in the work of Caritas in Ukraine case:

In this section, I will present relevant sections from the documents, where there may be explicit or implicit religious/theological language used to argue, justify, discuss the practices and/or the situation in Ukraine. Here I present some quotes. In the material, there were many others, and

⁵⁵ Ibid. (accessed 18.03.2023)

⁵⁶ <https://www.caritas.org/what-we-do/conflicts-and-disasters/crisis-in-ukraine/> (Videos from the field section) https://www.youtube.com/playlist?list=PLuQafgNw_znwljfI7tSwnyJc0aqTEfhJI (War in Ukraine playlist from Caritas Internationalis YouTube channel) (accessed 05.10.2023)

⁵⁷ <https://www.caritas.eu/war-in-ukraine/> (accessed 19.03.2023)

⁵⁸ <https://www.caritas.eu/caritas-europa-newsletters/> (accessed 19.03.2023)

⁵⁹ Ibid. (accessed 19.03.2023)

⁶⁰ <https://www.caritas.eu/in-the-media/> (accessed 21.03.2023)

I could have selected other quotes or other sections of examples. In the following, I will give excerpts from the text. There might have been others, or I might have included others, but these are the ones I have.

There are a range of relevant quotes concerning Ukraine on the YouTube channel of Caritas Internationalis. For example, on the day of invasion, the president of Caritas Ukraine Tetiana Stawnychy, publishes a video by stating “positioning ourselves to be able to do our mission which is to help people in need”⁶¹ Some days into the invasion, the direction of Caritas-Spes Ukraine reports of bombing of civilian targets, yet stating that they (Russians) cannot destroy “the aspiration for peace and freedom”⁶². In the video after 2 days of invasion, the direction of Caritas-Spes Ukraine asserts that “I am sure that with God’s help we will continue to carry out ourselves to those in need and we will not leave anyone behind. Please keep us in your prayers”⁶³ In an online Interview to BBC World, president of Caritas Ukraine explains the situation of Ukraine and their work at that very moment, in that interview she states that “our mission is to help people in need [...] what we’re thinking about now is the people who are in need. We have a job to do and so we’re focusing on the job that we have in front of us regardless of what happens”.⁶⁴

On an Easter greetings video, then General-Secretary Aloysius John says that in the time of crisis people’s,

“generosity and solidarity is an island of hope. Our hope as Caritas Internationalis is also nourished by the many new benefactors who have joined our community in recent weeks. I cherish integrating you in our family in order to help the poorest. [...] we must not get tired of doing good in active charity towards our neighbours. [...] we must not lose hope especially in these days leading us to the resurrection

⁶¹ <https://www.caritas.org/what-we-do/conflicts-and-disasters/crisis-in-ukraine/?playlist=1b07454&video=ba18605> and https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=NOHfJeylidU&list=PLuQafgNw_znwljfI7tSwnyJc0aqTEfhJl&index=5&ab_channel=CaritasInternationalis (accessed 18.03.2023. Time: 0:39-0:43)

⁶² <https://www.caritas.org/what-we-do/conflicts-and-disasters/crisis-in-ukraine/?playlist=1b07454&video=384fd21> and https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=EkSLaMVA2NA&list=PLuQafgNw_znwljfI7tSwnyJc0aqTEfhJl&index=4&ab_channel=CaritasInternationalis (accessed 18.03.2023)

⁶³ Ibid. (accessed 18.03.2023)

⁶⁴ https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=ijNPwc9z4JE&ab_channel=CaritasEuropa (YouTube video from the official YouTube channel of Caritas Europa). (accessed 24.03.2023. Time: 03:35-04:11)

of our lord. We must continue to be hope for our brothers and sisters who need our help, and this is the wish I want to extend to you this holy easter to continue to have hope, to be hope for others”.⁶⁵

In a press conference on 16th May 2022, many times they have explicitly used religious/theological languages. For instance, the President of Caritas Ukraine states “Behind every figure is a human face. This is the beauty of Caritas. Its ability and its desire to see a human face and each person. And it's what's making the difference in our ministry in Ukraine”.

⁶⁶ In addition, the Director of Caritas-Spes Ukraine expressed his appreciation to every supporter who made it possible to reach and help the war victims. He also said that the consequence of this war needs healing, the need is “the medicine of the Church, the medicine of love, of hope, and it is our vocation as a Caritas family to share this with people close to us”.⁶⁷

In another video, President of Caritas Ukraine, Tetiana Stawnychy says,

“keeping the part of Caritas mission this heart of practical love offered to those in need is finding it's a special light on it these days in Ukraine [...] it's this heart of love and they feel this embrace when they come into our centres [...] to offer a hug, to give somebody to hold someone's hand who has lived through a very traumatic experience.”⁶⁸

Another quote stated by Stawnychy is in the video published on 14th Feb 2023, where she says,

“This past year has been a difficult one. It was a year that was filled with suffering and challenges, with pain and loss, with difficult situations. At the same time, it was also filled with a great solidarity, with a great expression of hope, of faith, of love and assistance to one another. This faith, this hope, this assistance, this ability to see our neighbour in need and to respond has been the fabric that has kept this Ukrainian society together. I believe that it's also the fabric it kept the world society together,”⁶⁹

⁶⁵

https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=64yL9CxAljI&list=PLuQafgNw_znwljfl7tSwnyJc0aqTEfhJl&index=21&ab_channel=CaritasInternationalis (accessed 05.10.2023)

⁶⁶ <https://www.caritas.org/2022/05/caritas-united-to-make-a-difference-one-person-at-a-time-for-victims-of-the-ukraine-conflict/> (accessed 17.03.2023).

⁶⁷ Ibid.(accessed 17.03.2023)

⁶⁸

https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=HwATmloMt1U&list=PLuQafgNw_znwljfl7tSwnyJc0aqTEfhJl&index=24&ab_channel=CaritasInternationalis (accessed 05.10.2023 Time: 1:07 - 1:22 [...] 2:29-2:32 [...] 03:06- 03:16)

⁶⁹ https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=VUd79bD51U4&t=165s&ab_channel=CaritasInternationalis (accessed 05.10.2023. Time: 0:08-0:50)

The article *One year on: over 5 million people assisted by Caritas as since outbreak of war in Ukraine*, published on 21.02.2023, is one of the articles where they present a slide with a quote that Caritas is “Restoring home, restoring hope”⁷⁰. In this same article, Temporary Co-Administrator of Caritas Internationalis Amparo Alonso Escobar, states that Caritas “The number of services delivered over the last year is truly remarkable. However, what Caritas gives is much more than assistance. We accompany people before, during and after a crisis happens. We want to continue this work. We want to give that sense of hope and warmth to the suffering in Ukraine”⁷¹. Another citation in this article is from Fr. Grynevych, where he states,

“Every day, every Ukrainian and every Caritas-Spes Ukraine employee performs a crucial service to save people, and we are not alone in this. We strongly feel your support every day. War is always a tragedy. But at the same time, we have realised that we are not alone. You have been walking with us on this Way of the Cross for 365 days, and we know that you will not leave us alone in the future.”⁷²

He also invites to join their prayer meeting called “The 366th station’ Prayer of the way of the Cross”⁷³. I will return to this prayer further on. In the same article, there is a quote by the External Relations Coordinator for Caritas Ukraine, where she states “We have a lot of scars - death, losses, injuries, destroyed houses, infrastructure, psychological traumas, but in our souls we are not victims”⁷⁴. This article claims that within a week of war began, Caritas Poland started a camp where staff and volunteers of Caritas were present to serve these victims. They had a place called “Tents of Hope”⁷⁵ where they were serving meals, drinks, clothes, resting places, medicines, etc. When I checked the conference video related to this article, in that conference Fr. Grynevych states that on the 24th Feb 2022, after hearing about the war “In my mind that was just one question, God why it’s so so terrible experience in my life I will have, but also I understood that our life not will be the same as before and I just prayed to God and said God please give to me friends that we will not be alone because it was very very difficult

⁷⁰ <https://www.caritas.org/2023/02/one-year-on-over-5-million-people-assisted-by-caritas-since-outbreak-of-war-in-ukraine/> (accessed 18.03.2023)

⁷¹ Ibid. (accessed 18.03.2023)

⁷² Ibid. (accessed 18.03.2023)

⁷³ Ibid. (accessed 18.03.2023)

⁷⁴ Ibid. (accessed 18.03.2023)

⁷⁵ Ibid. (accessed 18.03.2023)

to think about that you can be alone”.⁷⁶ In the same conference, the Director of Public Relations and Communications at Caritas Internationalis, Marta Petrosillo mentions about Fr. Grynevych giving “a cross made out of broken glasses of the buildings destroyed by the war”⁷⁷ to Pope Francis. Many of these examples show how explicit or implicit language appears in relation to Ukraine.

On 24th February 2023, after one year of the invasion, Caritas Spes-Ukraine and Caritas Internationalis organized a prayer meeting. It's written,

“We want to call this Way of the Cross “The 366th station” to symbolize the year of dramatic experience of the Ukrainian People.

This year, we symbolically compare to the path of suffering and torment walked by Jesus before being crucified. Each “station” is written by employees of the National Office of Caritas-Spes Ukraine. In their words, they express the pain they and the Ukrainian people have experienced. Each station tells a personal story and the stories of the people they lovingly serve. Why do we want to share this prayer with our partners? Every day, every Ukrainian and every Caritas-Spes employee performs a crucial service to save people, and we are not alone in this”⁷⁸.

In the YouTube prayer invitation video posted on their website, Fr. Grynevych states that the supporters of Caritas are like “Simon and Veronica who saw Jesus Christ, supported him and helped in the moment of sadness and trio”.⁷⁹

The online conference arranged by Caritas Internationalis held on 1st March 2022, was attended by different people like; President of Caritas Ukraine, Tetiana Stawnychy, Executive director of Caritas-Spes Ukraine, Fr Vyacheslav Grynevych. Then general secretary, Aloysius John begins his words in this conference with greetings where he states, “greetings for peace and harmony”.⁸⁰ He also says that Caritas’ volunteers and staff are there,

“in the frontline courageously mobilising hundreds of young volunteers both men and women to bring care and concern for the poorest for those affected [...] people flocked to Caritas with whatever they had to help those in need driven by inner urge to help their brothers and sisters they gave means to fulfil its mission, mission of Caritas,

⁷⁶ <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=elyAxWvxT1k> (accessed on 18.03.2023. Time 11:24-11:53) (an article of this conference has date 21.02.2023 and YouTube video date is 22.02.2023)

⁷⁷ Ibid. (accessed on 18.03.2023. Time: 17:22-17:28)

⁷⁸ <https://www.caritas.org/2023/02/one-year-of-war-in-ukraine-today-caritas-prays-the-stations-of-the-cross/> (accessed 18.03.2023)

⁷⁹ Ibid. (accessed 18.03.2023)

⁸⁰ https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=zaUh9Z2mHg8&ab_channel=CaritasInternationalis (This YouTube conference video is attached in their website. (accessed 17.09.2023. Time 5:04 - 5:06)

love. In this moment of tragedy for this people, for the Ukrainian being in solidarity with one another is an island of hope”.⁸¹

Additionally, Aloysius John states “each tear and cry of the children, women, the elders and the migrants is a call for solidarity and compassion.”⁸² This statement might be interesting to discuss compassion states by Caritas. In the same conference they mention that Caritas Internationalis was part of Pope Francis’ prayer for peace in Ukraine. Stawnychy states in this conference that they along with local organization.

“trying to help them to organize and offer the aid that we can for people who are in need and that way fulfilling the mission that we have of giving this practical love to neighbour [...]. as Caritas we through our actions, we carry deep truth, and its the truth about the dignity of the human person and through our actions we have a special path to restoring this special deep truth in this deep human dignity of people.”⁸³

One of the questions they addressed in this Caritas conference is “How to keep hope alive”⁸⁴? In response to this question, Stawnychy states that “you keep hope by presenting this deep truth of helping that we carry a deep truth as when we honour the dignity of another person in front of us and it’s restorative act”.⁸⁵ In addition the presenter of this conference asks question to Fr Vyacheslav Grynevych, “how to give hope to your flock”?⁸⁶ Fr Vyacheslav Grynevych also states that “Ukrainian people is something that gives us hope”.⁸⁷ He mentions that need around them and support of other people gives them hope. In concluding remarks, hen general secretary, Aloysius John, states that “our prayers and support to Caritas in Ukraine and we also continue to give hope to you by being in solidarity with you”.⁸⁸

A statement by Caritas Ukraine president, Tetiana Stawnychy is posted in a twitter account of SCIAF uniting for a just world, on 03 Nov 2022, and this was also posted in Caritas Internationalis twitter, I check the original article from SCIAF where she states “Nobody really believed the invasion would happen, but we planned ahead, plugging into our local networks.

⁸¹ Ibid. (accessed 17.09.2023. Time 6:05-6:46)

⁸² Ibid. (accessed 17.09.2023. Time 8:38-8:45)

⁸³ Ibid. (accessed 17.09.2023. Time 13:45-15:00)

⁸⁴ Ibid. (accessed 17.09.2023. Time 45:24:-45:27)

⁸⁵ Ibid. (accessed 17.09.2023. Time 46:20:-46:36)

⁸⁶ Ibid. (accessed 17.09.2023. Time 46:45:-46:47)

⁸⁷ Ibid. (accessed 17.09.2023. Time 47:15:-47:18)

⁸⁸ Ibid. (accessed 17.09.2023. Time 52:48 - :15:-47:18)

This meant that when war did start, we didn't miss a beat".⁸⁹, another quotes stated by her is "We've been working with people who have lost everything. And they immediately felt the embrace of Caritas. People who have been through such trauma don't just need food and shelter, they need kindness; they need a kind hand. And that's where we come in".⁹⁰

Father Vyacheslav Grynevych, Director of Caritas-Spes Ukraine states in one of the videos "thanks to God that we have this opportunity, we have faith, we have motivation to support to continue our work and may the Lord bless you for your help for your solidarity with us and we know that we've been not alone so then we can do more, we can do more together. Thank you so much".⁹¹

In another YouTube video published on 24th November 2022, by Caritas Internationalis, and also shared on their official twitter, Tetiana Stawnychy express deep gratitude to all supports and states "especially your prayer that we feel them and they keep us afloat as we continue to respond to the need of the people on the ground".⁹²

One of the articles from Caritas, writes about a family who spent 200 days in the basement of a 16-story building. This family came in contact with the local branch of Caritas-Spes Ukraine, who helped this family with food, and other necessary items and comforted these people with "prayer and kind words"⁹³.

On Caritas Europa website, there is an article with attached 'joint position paper' which was 'Issued in partnership with eight Christian organization'. In this paper they state, "we are deeply committed to the inviolable dignity of the human person created in the image of God".⁹⁴

⁸⁹ Scottish Catholic International Aid Fund <https://twitter.com/sciaf/status/1588063698454716416>
<https://www.sciaf.org.uk/about-us/news/436-we-learn-how-efforts-are-helping-people-of> (accessed on 3.10.2023)

⁹⁰ Ibid. (accessed on 3.10.2023)

⁹¹ https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=UzmeNq3C8nY&list=PLuQafgNw_znwIjI7tSwnyJc0aqTEfhJl&index=32&ab_channel=CaritasInternationalis (accessed 05.10.2023. Time: 1:49: 2:10)

⁹² https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=-Ne8m3TdwKw&ab_channel=CaritasInternationalis (accessed 20.03.2023. Time: 0:36 - 0:43)

⁹³ <https://www.caritas.org/2023/02/one-year-of-war-in-ukraine-people-of-the-dungeon/> (accessed 18.03.2023)

⁹⁴ <https://www.caritas.eu/protecting-migrants-fleeing-from-ukraine-to-europe/>
<https://www.caritas.eu/wordpress/wp-content/uploads/2022/03/Christian-groups-Statement-on-Ukraine.pdf>
(accessed 05.10.2023)

As per the information presented in both Caritas Internationalis and Caritas Europa websites, religion is explicitly visible in Caritas Internationalis than in Caritas Europa. Many of these quotes, but not all will be discussed further in discussion chapter.

4.2 Summary

In this chapter I have presented my materials and data collected by two selected Caritas websites, Caritas Internationalis and Caritas Europe. As visible in both websites' materials, religion is more visible in the materials collected from Caritas Internationalis. Main material chapter is divided into two major parts, Caritas' online representation of Ukraine crisis and the religious language and quotes appeared in the work of Caritas in Ukraine case.

Throughout this chapter, the mission of Caritas to serve and their practices is visible. They have constantly presented about human dignity, compassion, love, serving the poor, etc. In addition, in the time of war, as presented by their websites, representatives from Caritas Ukraine and Caritas-Spes Ukraine including their partner organisations are focusing on restoring hope and human dignity. Religious languages such as prayer, loving neighbour, peace, hope etc are evident in their materials.

In the next chapter, I will present the theoretical framework relevant to this project. And I will discuss and analyse the materials presented above with the selected theoretical framework in my discussion chapter.

Chapter 5: Theoretical Approaches

5.1. Introduction

In this thesis, I aim to explore the religious or theological presentation of Caritas in the description of their work with Ukrainian refugees online. I will do that by trying to answer the research question: How is religion/theology expressed in the self-presentation of Caritas in descriptions online of their work with Ukrainian refugees and in what ways does it relate to migration theology? Therefore, to shed light on this study, two different approaches are relevant. One of the theoretical concepts, 'Migration Theology' the combination of the theological concept of migration and empathy, compassion and love of neighbor concept will open the concept by deepening my perspectives and help to interpret the language that Caritas has used. In addition, 'Acts of citizenship' will challenge and emphasise my argument from a different angle. Therefore, these two concepts together will give two different sides to open up my argument and view the expression of Caritas.

My first theoretical pathway is related to what I will call migration theology. In this first section, I will present three authors' contributions related to the concept of migration theology. I will commence this chapter with a work by theologian Gioacchino Campese, "The Irruption of Migrants: Theology of Migration in the 21st Century (2012). This is to begin with a framework of migration theology. Then I will present the work of theologian Daniel G. Groody, "Crossing The Divide: Foundations of a Theology of Migration and Refugees" (2009), after that I will elucidate the work by a professor of religious studies, John P. Reeder Jr, particularly his work "Empathy, Compassion and Love of Neighbor" (2016). Neither the perspectives of Campese nor Groody claims to do migration theology; instead, it is a significant contribution to the field of theology of migration. As per my research question I aim to study religious/theological expressions related to migration issues at Caritas. Thus, a work related to the field of migration theology including the concept of love and compassion might be relevant. Therefore, I am presenting this first part that focuses on examining religious/theological expression related to migration, whereas the second part of this chapter focuses on practices, acts and performativity of Caritas. Due to this reason another perspective considered for this project is from political scientist Engin Isin, a prominent scholar in citizenship studies, from his "Acts of Citizenship" (2008). In addition, I will present the work of the theologian Trygve Wyller' "'Something More': The citizenship Performativity of Religious Founded Refugee

Project” (2019), built on the concept of Engin Isin’s acts of citizenship concept. These conceptual perspectives enhance understanding of religious expression and action in the context of Ukrainian refugees and the work of Caritas. According to my research question, two important sectors to be focused on is Caritas’s presentation about their religious values and their work for Ukrainian refugees. Therefore, to examine these factors, first I am presenting the theoretical concept to understand the theology perspective, then acts of citizenship in the second part in order to understand their practices/what they are doing. The acts of citizenship concept is not related to legal citizenship instead it is beyond legal status. It is a conceptual framework for understanding ways of people’s belonging. Therefore, it is not linked to legal or political citizenship.

In the upcoming section of this chapter, I will only present perspectives and highlight their central tenets and significant revelations for this thesis. I will help me to explore the material looking for ways to discuss my research question.

5.2. Migration Theology?

Gioacchino Campese (2011) describes that migration is clearly visible in the Bible. For instance in the story of Abraham and his sons Isaac, Jacob, and Joseph including his brothers who were slaves in Egypt, and the story of Moses, and Ruth. According to the book of Matthew even Jesus was a refugee in Egypt (Campese, 2012). Regarding the connection of migration and theology, theologian Daniel Groody states that even some people think that theology and migration are not incongruent to each other. With the understanding that blending these two entails equates religion and politics. However, he mentions that migration has multidimensional aspects connected to life and society. Therefore, migration can’t be studied through only a social aspect. Groody states that the academic study of migration is necessary to comprehend the nature of migration and its side effects. (Groody, 2009, p. 664)

Campese presents three crucial factors in irrupting migration theology article,

Social factor:

Campese states that migration is typically perceived as a social phenomenon which is intertwined with various social factors and movements today. It has raised a discussion in different sectors in a society. Some sociologists comprehend today’s situation as the “age of migration” (Campese, 2012, p. 5). He further asserts that migration has been a social phenomenon with human mobility since the beginning. Human migration has been the largest

and most rapid ever since. Hence this topic is crucial in political and public sectors, as well as civil society. Due to migration being an emerging topic globally, Campese mentions that “Christian churches and theology deal seriously and urgently with the phenomenon of human mobility”. (Campese, 2012, p. 6).

Theological factor:

Another term presented by Campese is theology. He writes that theology is not only limited to theoretical teaching and understanding rather it is objecting practical implementation to transform the challenges of the people (Campese, 2012, p. 7). Campese refers to the statement of Kevin Burke, an American theologian that theology is not only to ‘think’ about God, but it is to act upon the teaching of God. Burke states that this action upon the word is called “praxis”. (Campese, 2012, pp. 6)

Pastoral-practical:

Lastly, Campese presents pastoral-practical as an important factor in migration irruption in theology. Pastors and other church workers who are focusing to minister to migrants illuminate the theology of migration.

Campese believes that above mentioned factors might fuel the concept of migration in the theology sector and that might result in as stated in the “Ephesians 2:19 - no longer an alien and a stranger, but a full “citizen” in the “city” of Christian theology” (Campese, 2012, p.7). In the case of Caritas, all three factors explained by Campese might be relevant to this research. Another important sector Campese raised is hospitality. He writes that there is no dubious in saying that hospitality is one of the major themes of Theological reflection on human mobility.

Campese presents the views of Polish sociologist Jacques Derrida and philosopher Zygmunt Baumann, who emphasize that hospitality is crucial in the modern world. Campese writes that the Christian tradition of hospitality is restoring as the migration topic is expanding in the theology sector. This restoration of hospitality in Christianity has revealed/enhanced different sectors like, “biblical, pastoral, practical, ethical, spiritual, theological, cultural, gender, and also the limitations and risks of hospitality, especially from the viewpoint of those whose hospitality has been abused” (Campese, 2012, p.29). This is also a result of those Christians whose ministry and spirituality are connected with hospitality. People who work in the migrant camps are a strong example of such a ministry. The author states that “at the heart of hospitality is not the “giving” or the “doing” but the “being”” (Campese, 2012, p.29). He focuses here on the human relationships which are to be with these refugees and migrants. He further writes

that hospitality does not mean ““to do something for” or “to give something to” somebody, but “being with” somebody” (Campese, 2012, p.29). A Christian, hospitality provider in such a condition is a stranger to vulnerable people. (Campese, 2012, pp.28-30) Campese writes that Filipino theologian Emmanuel de Guzman believes that to be a church it should address migrants' hope and problems. (Campese, 2012, p.24)

Campese further writes that Christian God comes as a migrant to be with migrant people. As the author explains Christian God from the view of human mobility. Bible theologians have reflected that Christian God comes as a guest (Gen 18) and asks people to be invited him in (Rev 3:20), comes as a migrant, goes with the Israelites, and does not prefer to live in the temple but rather lives with the people in a tent (1 Chr 17:5). In the New Testament, Jesus Christ is presented as a migrant, he crosses the human and divine border., to understand the situation of vulnerable people he himself became a refugee. These points show us that Christian God is not far from human mobility, instead, migration is clearly visible from OT to NT, from God the Father to God the Son. (Campese, 2012, pp.21-22)

In his work, Campese refers to Daniel Groody, who writes four concepts for a theology of immigration. However, these themes are already familiar and central in Christian theology. Additionally, these four terms are theological themes outside the topic of migration. Nevertheless, Daniel Groody in his work explicitly ties them to migration. I will not explain every theme as I will focus on presenting the link between *missio Dei* and migration, one of the four themes introduced by Groody, which is relevant to this project. I will explain this later. Below are the themes used by Campese:

- *Imago Dei*: (Image of God) “which allows a reading of human mobility starting from the fundamental humanity of migrants created in God’s image” (Campese, 2012, p. 21).
- *Verbum Dei*: (Word of God) “which shows Jesus Christ as the “migrant Son of God”, the one who, in the mystery of incarnation, crosses the border between the human and the divine worlds” (Campese, 2012, p. 21).
- *Missio Dei*: (Mission of God) “*which indicates the participation in the universal mission of God whose will is that in any human being, especially the most vulnerable ones such as refugees and irregular migrants, people would recognize the image and the dignity as children of God*” (Campese, 2012, p. 21).

- Visio Dei: (Vision of God) “which underlines the eschatological dimension of the Christian faith, which teaches that to be disciples of Jesus here on earth, in the different geographic and cultural contexts, means to journey in the direction of God’s reign” (Campese, 2012, p. 21).

The concept of *missio Dei* existed before the contribution of Daniel Groody and that is a major concept in Christian world, particularly in the Catholic world. This is a theological concept not only the concept related to migration theology. Regarding choosing this theme for this project, I see the concept of *imago Dei* also relevant in this topic, that emphasizes every human being as an image of God. However, the concept I am presenting here *missio Dei* emphasises the mission of God, is to go to the world to the people in need. It is to take further steps in support for these people after recognizing them as the image of God. Certainly, the reason behind this action is because of the concept of *imago Dei*. As described by Campese,

Missio Dei: “which indicates the participation in the universal mission of God whose will is that in any human being, especially the most vulnerable ones such as refugees and irregular migrants, people would recognize the image and the dignity as children of God” (Campese, 2012, p. 21).

I understand it as presented by Campese, the foundation of *missio Dei* is certainly an *Imago Dei*. In this thesis, I aim to focus on the work of the Caritas as a partaker in the mission of God. Therefore, even though the cause behind this action is *imago Dei*, I will solely present *missio Dei*.

What is *missio Dei*? Diniz R. Soares, theological seminary principal along with two other theology professors from North-West University in their text *The missio Dei as context for a ministry to refugees* define that *missio Dei* refers to the Latin word “the sending of God” (Soares et al., 2017, p.1). They further state that God is the initiator of the mission, and he is on a mission of restoration, and that is through the work of the church. (Soares et al., 2017, p.1)

Daniel Groody describes in his writing that “migration is a way of thinking about God and human life and an expression of the Christian mission of reconciliation” (Groody, 2009, p. 638). Groody starts the *missio Dei* section by stating that “the *missio Dei* is to restore the *imago Dei*” (Groody, 2009, p.653). As defined by Sores and his friends *missio Dei* is the sending of God or it can be understood as the mission of God, Groody further mentions that an essential aspect of this mission is “Jesus’s ministry of reconciliation” (Groody, 2009, p. 653). Groody presents examples of Jesus' ministry that he was open for Gentiles, and women, and he was together with sinners and other people which shows that Jesus was accepting different kinds of

people. In addition, Groody mentions that there are three parallel incidents in the bible about grain picking on Sabbath, a rest day or worshipping day in Judaism and Christian culture. When I checked in the bible to understand this incident, Jesus' disciples were hungry, and they picked a grain and ate it. Then the Pharisees, a religious group, state that "Behold, your disciples are doing what is not permitted to do on the Sabbath" (Matt. 12:2) (The Lexham English Bible, 2023). In response to this Jesus answers religious leaders that "the Sabbath is made for man, not man for the Sabbath" (Groody, 2009, p. 654). With this statement and Jesus' action Groody asserts that it is essential to prioritize basic human needs. Since his disciples were hungry, even if it was a resting day, he allowed his disciples to pluck grain and eat. As per this example presented by Groody, basic human needs should be priorities. So, this example and context might be relevant to discuss what Caritas is stating about their work for the hungry people. Groody states that Catholic social teaching contends that "people have a right to migrate when their country of origin lacks the necessary means to provide them with the capacity and opportunity to provide for themselves". (Groody, 2009, p. 655)

In this text, Groody mainly present *missio Dei* connected to "Crossing the Human-Human Divide" (Groody, 2009, p. 638). Groody in his article states that there are different biblical situations where Jesus shows the way of reconciliation by going beyond the border of human differentiation. As Groody depicts Jesus' relationship with sinners, tax collectors, women, fishermen, zealots, etc, teaches as well as challenges his disciples to be open to accepting different people and be with them without concern about human or country-set borders. In this point, Groody highlights the pattern of the fellowship table arranged by Jesus where he invites all different types and group of people in his fellowship, Groody mentions that this pattern is a symbol of law of love. (Groody, 2009, p. 659)

In terms of migration, Groody writes that when there is a lack of essential things and protection, people can move to another place. In context of describing migration, Groody mentions different laws, for instance human nature law that "lead people to seek opportunities for more dignified lives" (Groody, 2009, p. 655). Another law he mentions is natural law that is linked with "ethical dimensions of responding to those in need" (Groody, 2009, p.655), and the third law he presents is divine law that embodies God's will for all humanity (Groody, 2009, p.655). At the same time, Groody describes the gifts and tasks, promises, and responsibilities from God to people. As a God's covenant followers, people can get gifts and promises, however, there are tasks and responsibilities to complete as well. According to Groody these tasks and responsibilities are to reach out to the needy people, to help the vulnerable and foreigners. In

order to enhance his statements, he cites Exod. 22:21-22, when I checked these bible verses to clarify his thought, it is written that “21 You will not mistreat an alien, and you will not oppress him [...].22. You will not afflict any widow or orphan” (Exod. 22:21-22)(The Lexham English Bible, 2023). This stated verse might be relevant to discuss the work of Caritas. Groody writes Cathy Ross, a missiologist’s perspective about the missio Dei mentioning that the church should create room for people to come as they are. Groody writes that creating a room is essential in a theology of migration. For this point, Groody argues that generous hospitality is more crucial than imposing evangelization. This ‘generous hospitality’ and its connection with ‘imposing evangelization’ might be interesting and relevant to discuss the work of Caritas. Groody further in the hospitality sector presents that the life and teaching of Jesus is evident to his followers to follow the law, welcome and accept all categories of people, and go beyond to love and help others. (Groody, 2009, pp. 653-659)

Groody believes that to align in missio Dei is to be part of God’s mission to serve. Churches partakes in a missio Dei by supporting the vulnerable. According to Groody “theology provides a clearer lens through which to reach the complexity of reality and a more adequate framework for responding to the most vulnerable members of society and for building a civilization of love” (Groody, 2009, p. 657). These statements from Groody present that theology itself calls for supporting and caring for the vulnerable. And missio Dei is to be part of Jesus’s ministry to serve the world. (Groody, 2009)

Groody through this article is presenting that the mission of God is not limited to church or believers. However, it is to engage and go beyond the church and partake in the mission of God to serve the vulnerable, hardships and displaced people. This concept shed light as an important concept in migration to respond to the refugees and migrants.

John Reeder’s perspective on Empathy, Compassion, and Love of Neighbor can enhance the understanding of migration theology mainly focused on the mission concept of mission Dei.

Empathy, Compassion and Love of Neighbor

Love and compassion have become the main topic to focus by the Christian theologians for centuries. It is prevalent in Christian ethics as well. As presented in previous chapters, love and compassion have a connection with Caritas. It is considered their mission and they tried to express it through their work. Therefore, Reeder, through his chapter; Empathy, Compassion,

and Love of Neighbor, he wants to give insight to explore their mission and work. John Reeder presents three different concepts of love and compassion by three authors, these are: Self-Love by Diana Cates, Radical Other Regard by Edith Wyschogrod and Equal Love by Søren Kierkegaard, which I will elaborate further below. Primarily, these three perspectives hinge on Jesus' second great commandment of loving one's neighbor as oneself.

Reeder builds his work on the German philosopher Arthur Schopenhauer's view on compassion. Reeder writes that compassion is like "that the other becomes an object of my will along with myself, that I in some sense feel the suffering of the other and desire their well-being, and that this desire requires some form of identification with the other" (Reeder, 2016, p.131). I found the connection between mission of love and compassion with this statement. Based on how Caritas represents themselves and presents its practices online, this may be very relevant for this context.

In his first accounts of compassion, Reeder also builds on the work of the religious ethicist Diana Cates (Reeder, 2016). According to Reeder, Cates asserts that compassion is felt and expressed when there is an extension of self-love and interest to include other people. In addition, compassion is felt or expressed when there is an extension of self-love and interest to include other people. It is an extension of love from mine to ours, through stretching and involving others in self (Reeder, 2016, p.132). Furthermore, according to Reeder, Cates states that compassion shouldn't be limited to known people, indeed it should be extended up to strangers and even to enemies. Considering that either friends or enemies all are the same. Reeder quotes Cates: "we are relational creatures who have a personal stake in the flourishing of every other 'human being'" (Reeder, 2016, p.132). According to Reeder, Cates further writes that it is a human relationship that is expanded from oneself to a stranger. Regarding Cates' concepts, Reeder asks the question, if a stranger becomes the same as the nearest and dearest then is the stranger more important than the nearest and dearest? Reeder presents, Cates reply where she states, it is important to preserve personal relations and express compassion. As described by Reeder, Cates means that there should be balanced to fulfil love towards closed ones and show compassion to strangers. As I understand, Cates' concept as presented by Reeder is, strangers or even enemies should be included or accepted as friends

and should show compassion as oneself by stretching the boundaries of one's and others. This concept might be applicable in discussing Caritas's work in Ukraine.

Reeder presents a second model in his work which is based on the concept of the American philosopher Edith Wyschogrod's view on compassion (Reeder, 2016). According to Reeder, Wyschogrod's view on compassion is to empty oneself and take others' interest. Reeder additionally cites, for Wyschogrod, compassion is to "put themselves totally at the disposal of the Other" (Reeder, 2016, p.133), and then again Reeder quotes Wyschogrod that to give a person's "own body and material goods at the disposal of the Other" (Reeder, 2016, p. 133). Reeder's conclusion regarding sacrificing for other or saint models which was built on Wyschogrod's view may seem relevant to this study, where he writes the model of the saint is "to instrumentalize the self in the service of the other". (Reeder, 2016, p.135)

In response to Wyschogrod's viewpoint, Reeder depicts that this sort of sacrificial love is experienced and expressed by parents to their children. This is for the reason that a parent's love does not change on the basis of attraction or merit, there is no condition on parent's love and sometimes they are ready to sacrifice and ready to give beyond. In addition, good parents look for their good without impacting their children's desires. Wyschogrod's perspective presents as parents' love who sacrifice their desires and go beyond to fulfil their children's desires. They give their life if it is required for their children (Reeder, 2016, p. 135). Reeder states that the main point of Wyschogrod's view is a model to serve the people as a saint or parents which is "to instrumentalize the self in the service of the other" (Reeder, 2016, p. 135). I think that this concept of loving as a parent to children or instrumentalizing in order to serve other people might be an interesting concept to discuss the practice and work of Caritas related to Ukraine. In order to show compassion to the people in need, as a religious organization, claiming and focusing on loving others as oneself, are they practicing sacrificial love or are they instrumentalizing self to show compassion to the vulnerable? I will analyse it in the discussion chapter.

The third model presented by Reeder is developed by Danish theologian and philosopher Søren Kierkegaard's views that are connected to Christian tradition or biblical perspective to love others in the world (Reeder, 2016). Indeed, this model presents the middle view of compassion

by emphasizing equal love for all human beings. To love another human being as oneself by holding God's loving pattern, which encompasses compassion, sacrificial love and unconditional love for all human beings. According to Reeder, Kierkegaard in his work raises the concept of agape, as stated by Barbara H. Andolsen, a feminist theologian, agape is self-sacrificing love which is based on Christology, "which concentrates upon Jesus's self-immolation upon the cross" (Andolsen, 1981, p. 69). Andolsen quotes a Swedish theologian Nygren's work on her piece that agape is "a love that gives itself away, that sacrifices itself, even to the uttermost" (Andolsen, 1981, pp. 69-70). Kierkegaard asserts that agape does not come automatically from the material world, instead, it comes from above. Agape is formed or based on a relationship with God. This approach expresses loving others as loving oneself and that love should be equal. Kierkegaard further gives his view that agape love is "inward self-denial' and outward "self-sacrifice" (Reeder, 2016, p.135). Furthermore, Kierkegaard formulates the theme of agape love and connects it with the context of the Good Samaritan, a parable presented by Jesus in the New Testament. In this Biblical story, there is a half-dead injured man on the side of the road, a priest and a Levite, who are religious figures in Jewish society go by the same road, but they ignore this injured man, and nobody helps him. However, one Samaritan goes by the same road and sees this injured man and helps him. In this biblical story from the book of Luke, The Good Samaritan sees the suffering of the person and shows compassion to the one in need, even though this injured man on the street is a stranger, these Samaritan loves and helps him as his own neighbor. Thus, Kierkegaard is conveying that agape love encompasses everyone without identifying any distinction. Reeder describes agape, equal love for everyone, however, this love "calls for service to the other even at great cost to ourselves" (Reeder, 2016, p.135). In agape, there is a place for both loved ones and strangers. In light of this, agape erases "selfishness in preferential love but allows both chosen and unchosen relations to remain". (Reeder, 2016, p.136) As per Kierkegaard, agape "protects the friend and the beloved as neighbor, as child of God, and that it demands that one not exclude the stranger". (Reeder, 2016, p.136). Reeder is trying to present that agape love is for everyone and it sometimes needs sacrifice. This sacrifice applies to both our relationships with the closest ones and with strangers. Agape love, serving others, and giving equal priority to both loved ones and strangers, all these points may fit with the work of Caritas as they have expressed and their objectives. Reeder writes that as a God's Child, one has to love others and give to others, yet there is a limitation on it. There should be self-love and at the same time love for neighbors when they are in need. (Reeder, 2016)

After presenting all three perspectives, Reeder claims that having empathy is essential, yet not enough. He further states that empathy is a blending of “what the other feels” and “what we would feel in the circumstances”. (Reeder, 2016, p.137) Primarily, empathy requires an understanding of a feeling of other’s pain. Cates states that despite the fact that qualitative similarity can be unusual, still it is common to experience pain with some similarity. To have empathy means to feel the pain and then to take that pain to parallel a person’s own experience. Reeder argues that the concept of compassion goes beyond empathy. Three different views have presented and discussed in this chapter, through those perspectives we can get three different sides of loving our neighbor as “the neighbor as part of myself, the neighbor instead of myself, and the neighbor as equal to myself” (Reeder, 2016, p. 138). Reeder enhances the view of loving neighbor by using Cate’ quote “the suffering of the other becomes a parallel object of dislike and desire for me because the other is my friend; since the good of the other becomes part of my good, I love the other to an equal degree”. (Reeder, 2016, p.138)

The way I understand Reeder’s work is that compassion is not only connected with empathy, yet it relates to personal or organizational interests. In addition, a neighbor’s love is not based on the bonding of special relations. The concept of empathy, compassion, and neighbor’s love pertains to our relationship and behaviour towards others, and to expressing our concerns and care for others' welfare. Empathy is to understand others’ feelings and suffering, compassion on another hand is to have sympathy toward people in a difficult situation and neighbors’ love is a central concept in Christian teachings and tradition. It is to love others as oneself and help suffering people. I will use all three perspectives to analyse and discuss the materials collected from Caritas' websites and will delve into them in the next discussion chapter through the lens of love and compassion.

Now I have presented the Migration Theology, by binding migration as well as love and compassion concepts. I will now give an account for the second part of my theoretical framework related to citizenship.

5.3. Acts of Citizenship?

Another important framework for this project is the concept of citizenship. Considering that this project aims to study Caritas on their self-presentation of religious expression in description of their work with Ukrainian refugees online. In this regard, I will go into the

contributions by Engin Isin, from his “Acts of citizenship” (2008) and Trygve Wyller’s work “‘Something More’: The citizenship Performativity of Religious Founded Refugee Project (2019)”, built on Engin Isin’s concert of acts of citizenship by focusing on performativity of people. As I mentioned in the introduction part of this chapter, this citizenship concept is not related to legal status, however it is connected to the concept of people’s belonging. The issues of migration and citizenship are linked with various aspects such as political, legal, social, etc. This theoretical approach obliges us to think about the concept of ‘citizenship’. Acts of citizenship provide a different perspective on citizenship, and they shed light on who and how citizenship can be categorized (Isin, 2008). Isin depicts the citizenship concept as acts of citizenship rather than any formal or certified notion. In line with my research question, this theoretical framework is relevant to analyse and discuss the positionality of Caritas, how they present their values, beliefs and their actions and practices in order to create opportunities for people to act for their belongingness. Isin defines acts of citizenship through several different categories such as ethical and political acts (Isin, 2008). However, I will only focus on the ‘act’ and ‘performativity’ of Caritas in order to achieve its organizational mission.

Engin Isin through this work challenges the concept of citizenship in legal and political sectors. He argues that citizenship of people should not be confirmed or defined on a legal basis, instead citizenship is a fluid concept that can be claimed by the act and performativity of people. One way of exploring ways of thinking about citizenship is through acts of citizenship. Isin asserts that the study of this phenomenon requires an examination of subjects' perceptions of their status, behaviour, and substance as citizens. (Isin, 2008,). Isin presents that the concept of citizenship requires a certain level of active engagement. In this article, the term act refers to doing rather than moving. It means that the action is needed to claim citizenship. Isin states that “citizenship is not inherited but learned” (Isin, 2008, p.17). For instance, in the article “We can teach Sweden a lot”: Experiences of in/hospitality, space-making, and the prospects of altered guest-host relations among migrant and non-migrant Christian in the Church of Sweden” (Kjellin, 2019) by a cultural anthropologist Kristina Helgesson Kjellin, presents a case study from the Church of Dalen, Sweden. In this church, the migrants are translating the church services into their languages, practicing their local traditions in the church by including their food, rituals like remembrance ceremonies etc. As migrants, people might have different legal status there, however these church members are learning, practicing, and claiming their citizenship in their regular lives. In addition, the Church of Dalen is playing a crucial role by providing opportunities to the people to attend church services in their own language and practice church rituals. (Kjellin, 2019). This example shed light on the understanding of act

and performativity of people to learn and claim their citizenship. This is just an example from another case study. Furthermore, I will analyse and discuss the work of Caritas in connection to acts of citizenship concept in my next chapter. Isin writes that acts of citizenship are a phenomenon consisting of human or humanized actors that involves decisions. However, it is not limited by time or space. The act is a process toward the achievement of a purpose. In this article, a distinction between 'act' and 'action' has been unpacked in terms of citizenship. Act holds all the factors that are required for the achievement of a purpose, while actions are presented as the subject's behaviour. Acts of citizenship can be understood as entities that arise from actors to create a scene. (Isin, 2008)

Isin presents that the acts and performativity of people can challenge or disrupt pre-existed social norms and orders, however people's actions do not necessarily force people to leave or exclude their society. In addition, these acts should create actors remaining voluntarily at the scene. Isin states that acts of people create actors, and the action of these actors results in generating 'activist citizens'. Isin defines acts of citizenship as "those acts that transform forms and modes of being political by bringing into being new actors as activist citizens (claimants of rights and responsibilities) through creating new sites and scales of struggle" (Isin, 2008 p 29). Therefore, as per Isin, a citizen who claims their own entitlements and duties through their actions are activist citizens. (Isin, 2008)

What defines an act? Isin presents the definition of an act from the Oxford English Dictionary, Act as a verb meaning "to put in motion", 'move to action', 'impel, actuate, influence and animate', 'to bring into action, bring about, produce, perform, or make', or 'to carry out a project, command or purpose'" (Isin, 2008, p.21). Moreover, Isin describes that an act as a noun is "equally non-interchangeable with action" (Isin, 2008, p. 22). The term act indicates a performance, nevertheless, it does not stand for a completed task. Rather it stands for a process of the action. Isin presents historian and philosopher Robert Ware's view, where he mentions that there are six requirements for something to be considered an act. Five among six conditions are relevant to this case. Those are, "to specify an act is to indicate a doing. [...], acts are doings of actors. [...], acts happen because of a decision to perform the act. [...], acts must have completion. [...], acts build upon acts" (Isin, 2008, p.23). These points might be interesting to discuss the acts of Caritas. Furthermore, Isin writes that in the theory of acts, there should be three different factors, those are "acts, actions, and actors" (Isin, 2008, p. 24). On this point, Isin argues that acts should be created through actions, and the entities to actualize these actions

are actors. In addition, Isin states that “to act, then, is neither arriving at a scene nor fleeing from it, but engaging in its creation. With that creative act the actor also creates herself/himself as the agent responsible for the scene created”. (Isin, 2008, p. 27).

Isin presents that objective is important in an act. Before considering intentions, calculations, or responsibilities, an act is always directed toward its objectives. As objective to help the poor and needy people is the reason for Caritas being there to act. To clarify more Isin writes Heidegger, a German philosopher’s perspectives on ‘being-with’, that is “The being that act, therefore, is already a being-towards-others and has an understanding of others because it is a being whose essence is being-with”. (Isin, 2008, p. 34)

Isin raises the question; can all acts be considered an act of citizenship? If not, at what point does an act become an act of citizenship? Rather than answering these questions, I would like to focus more on what factors are crucial in the act of citizenship. Isin writes that to be considered an act there should be ‘motives, purposes, or reasons. However, Isin further mentions that even though these factors are crucial, the act of citizenship cannot be interpreted solely on those grounds. Additionally, an act of citizenship should not be based on law or responsibility, rather it could challenge the law and can even break it. Furthermore, to be deemed an act of citizenship it must question the fixed responsibilities (Isin, 2008, p.38-39). Isin depicts that “acts of citizenship are those acts through which citizens, strangers, outsiders and aliens emerge not as beings already defined but as beings acting and reacting with others”. (Isin, 2008, p.29).

The other central text that I will use in this chapter about acts of citizenship, the concept of Engin F. Isin is from Norwegian theologian Trygve Wyller in his text “*Something More: The Citizenship Performativity of Religious Founded Refugee Projects*” (Wyller, 2019). Trygve Wyller describes the religious organizations that are focusing on hospitality to refugees and migrants in this text. Wyller presents the incident regarding the address of the Sermon on the Mount from Mark 4. On the 31. Oct 2016, there was a joint religious ceremony where Pope Francis, the Catholic leader, Antje Jackelen, the Lutheran Archbishop of Sweden, and leaders of the Lutheran World Federation participated. After the ceremony, Pope Francis and Antje Jackelen signed a joint statement. In that joint statement, the importance of ‘protection and

compassion' for the vulnerable was highlighted. The biblical text related to this statement was Mark 5, "Blessed are the meek: for they shall inherit the earth. Blessed are they which do hunger and thirst after righteousness; for they shall be filled (King James Bible)" (Wyller, 2019, p. 271). Even though there were debated views on the Sermon on the Mount (Mark 5) regarding its address to eschatology or it refers to 'here and now', the joint declaration agreed to choose the 'here and now' option. This shows the biblical teaching of compassion and protecting the vulnerable was neither only for the past nor for eschatology, rather it is to apply now and on the earth. This joint declaration has supported the religious sectors to apply this teaching in their life.

Wyller presents two different projects related to refugees and migrants in his text. The point for Wyller to include all this information is to show how these two European churches have taken an active position on behalf of helping refugees and migrants. In the context of action does the position taken by these two churches an act of citizenship? I will present both case studies briefly.

The first case presented by Wyller is the project by the Rosengrenska foundation and Bergsjøen church, a Lutheran Church in Gothenburg, Sweden. Rosengrenska is a nonreligious, secular, volunteer network of professional people, such as doctors, psychiatrists, dentists etc. They have been supporting undocumented people since 1998. The project in this church resulted when Rosengrenska, the pre-existed project of a nonreligious organization required bigger space, it led to cooperation with Bergsjøen church. After collaborating with the church, they run the project every Wednesday and provide professional support to irregular migrants. The project is mainly to provide professional support, especially healthcare to irregular immigrants in Sweden. According to Wyller, this project in this church was started before the 2015 refugee crisis and has played a seminal work during and after the period of 2015. This project is especially famous among irregular migrants in Sweden. As per Wyller, until 2013 it was unlawful to render healthcare to irregular immigrants. However, after a legal amendment, they have run the project openly. Rosengrenska foundation played a central role in changing this law. This act may be understood as an act of citizenship. As Wyller mentions, there was a workshop in the church, during the discussion of this project one of the ministers mentioned 'human rights' is the essence of the project. Subsequently, the project leader answered: "It is something more" (Wyller, 2019, p.279). In this case, a religious person from Bergsjøen refers to a secular human rights and non-religious person, a project leader is referring to 'something

more', a transcendent concept. Wyller states that this statement did not address later in the workshop, however, every participant persistently retains this statement until now. Wyller indicates that a statement of a nurse, 'something more' than human rights alluded to the project covers more than regular human rights. In this text, Wyller presents a case of one stateless family whose asylum application was rejected in Sweden, and they were seeking basic needs. At that very moment, Rosengrenska's project helped him with accommodation and health services. According to Wyller, volunteers in this project are from different backgrounds and play a crucial role in providing shelter and health services. This case study might be linked/comparable with the work of Caritas who are providing basic needs to refugees. (Wyller, 2019, pp. 277-280)

The other case in his text is from "Lampedusa's Mediterranean Hope", a joint organization of Catholics and Protestants from Italy (Wyller, 2019, p. 280). Lampedusa is one of the islands located in the Mediterranean Sea in southern Italy. This island was one of the popular entry points for migrants to Europe. In 2016, Wyller explored Lampedusa with the invitation of 'Mediterranean Hope', a religious organization. They basically provide support and information to the depleted people who reach the island at nighttime. One of the projects visited and explained by Wyller is a recording studio for migrants with some professional musicians in Lampedusa. Wyller mentions that there were two youths from a North African country who came to sing in the studio (Wyller, 2019, pp. 280-283). This project was conducted with the objective "to give people a chance to experience life outside the camp, a more homely life and to sing as a subject, beyond their condition as fenced-off migrants". And "to collect and document migrants, both for the migrant community and for research purposes" (Wyller, 2019, p.282). Hence, this quotation underscores that this project was giving an opportunity for performativity to act and claim people's citizenship outside the bounded or legally allocated area. Moreover, this also encourages and supports them to act for their citizenship. This might be interesting to discuss how Caritas is providing an opportunity to claim people' citizenship as per their work description. Wyller, drawing from Isin's concept, emphasizes that citizenship is not only to hold legal documents, indeed it is to declare one's own 'rights and recognition', and it is through active participation for their own entitlement. (Wyller, 2019, p. 277-286)

Furthermore, Wyller states five different sets of performative citizenship building on Engin Isin, even though all five points overlap, one among five is more relevant to this project i.e. “d. People enact citizenship by exercising, claiming, and performing rights and duties”. (Wyller, 2019, p.287). Moreover, Wyller states that “church facilitated projects facilitate acts of citizenship”. (Wyller, 2019, p.286). This statement might be interesting to discuss the work of Caritas.

5.4 Summary

In summary, to explore possible answers to the research question, I have employed two different theoretical frameworks. The first concept, migration theology, provides insight into the religious perspectives. This theoretical framework particularly grounds in the mission of God and showing compassion to the vulnerable people by welcoming, accepting and supporting them. Along with *missio Dei* concept empathy and compassion is rooted in the second great commandment of Jesus, which is loving others as oneself.

Acts of citizenship, another theoretical framework, provide insight from different able. Primarily it sheds light on the act and performativity of a person or organization to claim citizenship based on people’s belonging. This concept centres on performativity of the person or organization from their existing position. Drawing ideas from Two cases by Wyller, which illustrates how one organization can position themselves to create an opportunity for people to act and claim their citizenship. In order to answer my research question, *How is religion/theology expressed in the self-presentation of Caritas in description of their work with Ukrainian refugees online and in what ways does it relate to the idea of theology of migration?* I must delve into the self-presentation of Caritas where they use religious terminology and its relation to theology of migration.

With the presentation of theoretical framework that I have selected for this project and an explanation of why I have chosen them, the next chapter/step will be to examine my data. My data comprises selected excerpts and quotations from Caritas, which I have presented in 4.2.2, I will analyse these data through the lens of my chosen theoretical concepts in order to address my research question.

Chapter 6: Discussion

6.1 Introduction:

So far, I have introduced the methodology, content analysis, and provided an overview of Caritas, including the work they are doing, and the data related to the Ukraine case. I have also provided an explanation of the theoretical framework that directs this study. In this chapter, first, I will examine my data through the lens of migration theology by focusing on missio Dei and empathy, compassion, and love of neighbor concept. Then I will scrutinize my data through the lens of acts of citizenship framework. For the discussion, I will delve into the data, quotes, excerpts from various web materials while applying the presented theoretical framework. Some of the quotes that I have presented in chapter 4.2.2 as key data will reappear in the discussion. This repetition is intentional and serves the purpose of addressing, exploring, or problematising the main research question of this thesis,

How is religion/theology expressed in the self-presentation of Caritas in descriptions online of their work with Ukrainian refugees and in what ways does it relate to migration theology?

6.2 Through the lens of migration theology

In this part I will examine my quotes and excerpts from the lens of migration theology, mainly focusing on missio Dei concept and empathy, love and compassion. In order to explore it, I will address the questions such as ‘what linguistic terms and phrases does Caritas used to highlight the theological concept of missio Dei? and how does Caritas underscores the theological concept of missio Dei, the perspective that Caritas as partaker in mission of God to serve the image of God?’. These questions are important in this part to examine self-presentation of Caritas by identifying linguistic terms and phrases they use in their operation. This will help to understand how Caritas frame their mission and values in the context of theology. In addition, this will help to examine the concept and practice of missio Dei in Caritas by digging deeper in the religious expressions in their self-presentation. Through answering these questions, I aim to show the connection of Caritas’s theological framework and expression in their work on Ukrainian refugees, ultimately shedding light on the broader concept of the migration theology.

As I wrote in my theoretical approaches chapter, Gioacchino Campese mentions three different factors related to theology of migration. These are social factor where Campese discusses migration as a social phenomenon intertwined with various social factors such as human

mobility since the beginning. Migration is emerging globally, and this topic should be addressed in Christian churches and theology. Theology is another factor emphasized by Campese, where he emphasizes that theology goes beyond theoretical teaching and understanding; it is about practical implementation to address people's challenges. The third factor addressed by Campese is pastoral-practical, where he makes clear the role of pastors and church workers who are ministering to migrants in illuminating the theology of migration. Pastoral-practical prioritizes provision of both physical and spiritual support. In the context of migration, it aims to serve people who require basic necessities. (Campese, 2012)

This Russia and Ukraine war has raised the need for pastoral-practical, it is pastors and church ministers to serve the migrants (Campese, 2012, p. 7), especially for the displaced people. Through the pastoral-practical section of Campese's article, it is possible to see the pastors or other church leaders are not only a provider of theological or spiritual needs but also a provider of physical needs. How is this pastoral-practical point of Campese visible in Caritas? As I mentioned in the presentation of my material, Caritas Internationalis has a separate section in their website with name 'Crisis in Ukraine', there they have published different articles, field reports, videos etc. where they have mentioned different services provided by Caritas volunteers inside Ukraine and in the neighbouring countries. They have written that, in the initial week of the war, Poland started providing basic needs like food, shelter, medicine, hygiene kits etc., in a place called "Tents of Hope"⁹⁵. This shows us that with their services and tent name, they are trying to give hope to the displaced and stressed people. As the people come out from their difficult situation in the hope of security, shelter, food, etc. Stawnychy on the war day states, "positioning ourselves to be able to do our mission which is to help people in need".⁹⁶ Here in the Ukrainian case, Caritas, an organization as a whole is playing the role of pastoral-practical or providing pastoral care for the people in need. In this context, Caritas is presenting a caring side by providing or serving the people in need (Campese, 2012, pp.3-7). Caritas website claims that "Caritas is church"⁹⁷, and Campese in his article states that "Christian churches and theology deal seriously and urgently with the phenomenon of human

95

<https://www.caritas.org/2023/02/one-year-on-over-5-million-people-assisted-by-caritas-since-outbreak-of-war-in-ukraine/> (accessed 18.03.2023)

96 <https://www.caritas.org/what-we-do/conflicts-and-disasters/crisis-in-ukraine/?playlist=1b07454&video=ba18605> and https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=NOHfJeylidU&list=PLuQafgNw_znwljfI7tSwnyJc0aqTEfhJl&index=5&ab_channel=CaritasInternationalis (accessed 18.03.2023)

97 <https://www.caritas.org/who-we-are/caritas-is-church/> (accessed 18.03.2023)

mobility” (Campese, 2012, p. 6). These statements indicate us that the action taken by Caritas in the case of vulnerable individuals in Ukraine are serious steps in addressing issues related to human mobility. In addition, Campese writes the view of Filipino theologian Emmanuel de Guzman, where he states that to be a church it should address migrants' hope and problems (Campese, 2012, p.24). Additionally, Campese claims hospitality as crucial aspect in human mobility which is also visible through the services presented by Caritas. Considering the work of Caritas, it is intertwined with spirituality and ministry. In the vary context, both, the people from Caritas who are providing hospitality, and the Ukrainian refugees are strangers to each other. Their identity in the initial phase is an organization that is there to help and support the people in need, and people who are fleeing from war for their lives. Both parties are strangers in this condition. However, hospitality provided by Caritas play an important role in binding both strangers (organization and refugees). Campese has also cited Ephesians 2:19, where the text says that no longer an alien and a stranger, but a full “citizen” in the “city” of Christian theology.” (Campese, 2012, p.7). According to Campese, “the heart of hospitality is not the “giving” or the “doing” but the “being” (Campese, 2012, p.29). Examining Carita’s work through this perspective, Carita asserts in their self-presentation that they are present for people when they are in need. Caritas has mentioned the reason behind their love, care to the world, empathy to the sufferings is because Caritas is “united in one human family we are profoundly moved by the suffering of others and have a moral duty to recognize the humanitarian imperative to respond [...]we recognize our obligation to provide humanitarian assistance and the duty of others to ensure unimpeded access for us to do so”.⁹⁸ In addition Caritas asserts, “The Christian’s programme-the programme of the Good Samaritan, the programme of Jesus- is a ‘heart that sees’. This heart sees where love is needed and acts accordingly”.⁹⁹ Furthermore, Caritas states the reason for doing this “As Jesus told us: in truth I tell you, in so far as you did this to one of the least of these brothers of mine, you did it to me”.¹⁰⁰ This shows us that as Campese mentions, Caritas claims that they are supporting the people in need as one human family and they are not treating the vulnerable as alien or stranger. The statement of Jesus, highlights that showing compassion and love to people in need is equal to serving Jesus.

6.2.1 Missio Dei

Campese defines missio Dei, “*which indicates the participation in the universal mission of God whose will is that in any human being, especially the most vulnerable ones such as*

⁹⁸ <https://www.caritas.eu/code-of-ethics/> (accessed 21.10.2023)

⁹⁹ Ibid. (accessed 21.10.2023)

¹⁰⁰ Ibid. (accessed 21.10.2023)

refugees and irregular migrants, people would recognize the image and the dignity as children of God”. (Campese, 2012, p. 21).

Even though the concept of *missio Dei* is a theological concept rather than migration specialisation, Campese defines *missio Dei* from migration theology perspective as it focuses on the universal mission of God, it is through recognizing the image and dignity of the vulnerable. This definition emphasizes that to be a part of God’s mission is to have responsibility to serve the people in need. As I also mentioned in my theoretical chapter, I think that the *Imago Dei* (Image of God) is an initial reason to take the step for *Missio Dei* (mission of God). It is to understand the value and importance of people as everyone is a child of God and to serve these God’s children who are in need is to be part of God’s mission because God himself is the initiator of this mission. Mainly the definition by Diniz R. Soares emphasises that the mission of God is for restoration and this act to be done through the action of the church. (Soares et al., 2017, p.1). In the case of Caritas, the quote I presented in my material reflect where the director of Caritas-Spes Ukraine stating “I am sure that with God’s help we will continue to carry out ourselves to those in need and we will not leave anyone behind. Please keep us in your prayers”.¹⁰¹ Caritas also express gratitude and states “especially your prayer that we feel them, and they keep us afloat as we continue to respond to the need of the people on the ground”.¹⁰²

Consistent with the material cited earlier, in another interview with BBC, President of Caritas Ukraine states that “our mission is to help people in need [...] what we’re thinking about now is the people who are in need. We have a job to do and so we’re focusing on the job that we have in front of us regardless of what happens”.¹⁰³ These statements show us that Caritas is in a mission to restore the vulnerable and it is by accepting everyone as they states that they are in mission to serve people and they will not leave anyone behind.

¹⁰¹ <https://www.caritas.org/what-we-do/conflicts-and-disasters/crisis-in-ukraine/?playlist=1b07454&video=384fd21> and https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=EkSLaMVA2NA&list=PLuQafgNw_znwljfI7tSwnyJc0aqTEfhJl&index=5&ab_channel=CaritasInternationalis (accessed 18.03.2023)

¹⁰² (Caritas Internationalis, 2022) https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=-Ne8m3TdwKw&ab_channel=CaritasInternationalis (accessed 20.03.2023. Time: 0:36 - 0:43)

¹⁰³ https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=ijNPwc9z4JE&ab_channel=CaritasEuropa (YouTube video from the official YouTube channel of Caritas Europa). (accessed 18.03.2023. Time: 03:35-04:11)

Daniel Groody writes about generous hospitality where he emphasis, *missio Dei*, is partaking in the mission of God for restoration and reconciliation of people. The statement claimed by Caritas that even the situation is dangerous, nothing can obliterate “the aspiration for peace and freedom”¹⁰⁴, shows us their motivation and strength to partake in mission of God.

Human dignity is one of the religious principals mentioned in Caritas website, in joint paper also they have stated that “we are deeply committed to the inviolable dignity of the human person created in the image of God”.¹⁰⁵ Campese has used this very term in the definition of *missio Dei* as well. President of Caritas Ukraine says that “you keep hope by presenting this deep truth of helping that we carry a deep truth as when we honour the dignity of another person in front of us and it's a restorative act”.¹⁰⁶ This statement illustrate that Caritas is concerned with a person, created in the image of God. They are concern about human dignity along with their needs. As outlined in material section of Caritas’s work where they state,

“trying to help them to organize and offer the aid that we can for people who are in need and that way fulfilling the mission that we have of giving this practical love to neighbor [...]. as Caritas we through our actions, we carry deep truth, and its the truth about the dignity of the human person and through our actions we have a special path to restoring this special deep truth in this deep human dignity of people”.¹⁰⁷

Daniel Groody through his concept highlights the importance to provide basic needs of people. Groody cites Matt.12:22, I have written verse in my theory chapter, in this verse Jesus allows his disciples to pluck grains and eat it on Sabbath day. Groody through this verse emphasis to prioritise basic human needs. Caritas states in their work description that they are providing food, shelter, medicine, etc., to the people in need. This can also be called ‘practical love’. It is not just showing love with word or sympathy but also acting on it and showing it practically. Returning to the quote cited in material chapter where President of Caritas Ukraine states that,

¹⁰⁴ <https://www.caritas.org/what-we-do/conflicts-and-disasters/crisis-in-ukraine/?playlist=1b07454&video=384fd21> and https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=EkSLaMVA2NA&list=PLuQafgNw_znwljfI7tSwnyJc0aqTEfhJl&index=5&ab_channel=CaritasInternationalis (accessed 18.03.2023)

¹⁰⁵ <https://www.caritas.eu/protecting-migrants-fleeing-from-ukraine-to-europe/> <https://www.caritas.eu/wordpress/wp-content/uploads/2022/03/Christian-groups-Statement-on-Ukraine.pdf> (accessed 05.10.2023)

¹⁰⁶ https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=zaUh9Z2mHg8&ab_channel=CaritasInternationalis (This YouTube conference video is attached in their website) (accessed 17.09.2023. Time 46:20:-46:36)

¹⁰⁷ Ibid. (accessed 17.09.2023. Time 13:45-15:00)

“keeping the part of Caritas mission this heart of practical love offered to those in need is finding it’s a special light on it these days in Ukraine [...] it’s this heart of love and they feel this embrace when they come into our centres [...] to offer a hug, to give somebody to hold someone’s hand who has lived through a very traumatic experience”¹⁰⁸

In addition, this also relates to the quote that I have mentioned above about Caritas organizing, offering aid for the people, fulfilling the mission of Caritas of giving practical love to neighbor, and restoring human dignity.¹⁰⁹

Through these statements, Caritas is asserting that this organization is focused on practical love. It is through their actions to the people in need. Revisiting the quotes shared in material chapter, where Caritas have stated, the reason behind this mission and practical love -

“Behind every figure is a human face. This is the beauty of Caritas. Its ability and its desire to see a human face and each person. And it's what’s making the difference in our ministry in Ukraine”.¹¹⁰

This statement articulates that this organization is working on restoring and reconciling the people in need, the image of God. Their vision towards the faces of people is making Caritas different than other organization. This also highlight the term practical love. What actually is practical love? It is to act practically in any situation, for instance providing physical needs of the vulnerable, such as providing food, shelter, warm clothes in the wintertime etc.

6.2.2 Empathy, compassion and love of neighbor

John Reeder explains the concept of compassion as “that others become an object of my will along with myself, that I in some sense feel the suffering of the other and desire their well-being, and that this desire requires some form of identification with the other” (Reeder, 2016, p. 131). The statement of Caritas, “the medicine of the Church, the medicine of love, of hope, and it is our vocation as a Caritas family to share this with people close to us”,¹¹¹ make clear

¹⁰⁸

https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=HwATmloMtIU&list=PLuQafgNw_znwjfl7tSwnyJc0aqTEfhJl&index=24&ab_channel=CaritasInternationalis (accessed 05.10.2023 Time: 1:07 - 1:22 [...] 2:29-2:32 [...] 03:06- 03:16)

¹⁰⁹ (Caritas Internationalis, 2022)
https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=zaUh9Z2mHg8&ab_channel=CaritasInternationalis (This YouTube conference video is attached in their website) (accessed 17.09.2023. Time 13:45-15:00)

¹¹⁰ <https://www.caritas.org/2022/05/caritas-united-to-make-a-difference-one-person-at-a-time-for-victims-of-the-ukraine-conflict/> (accessed 17.03.2023)

¹¹¹ Ibid. (accessed 17.03.2023)

the same thing that Caritas, is accepting the vulnerable as their own part by feeling their suffering and actively participating inside Ukraine and the neighbouring countries.

As Reeder builds his view on Cates, compassion is felt or expressed when there is an extension of self-love and interest to include other people. It is an extension of love from mine to ours, through stretching and involving others in self (Reeder, 2016, p.132). Furthermore, according to Reeder, Cates states that compassion shouldn't be limited to known people, indeed it should be extended up to strangers and even to enemies. Considering that either friends or enemies all are the same. Reeder quotes Cates: "we are relational creatures who have a personal stake in the flourishing of every other 'human being'" (Reeder, 2016, p.132). This connects the extending perspective from previous citation where Caritas states,

"This past year has been a difficult one. It was a year that was filled with suffering and challenges, with pain and loss, with difficult situations. At the same time, it was also filled with a great solidarity, with a great expression of hope, of faith, of love and assistance to one another. This faith, this hope, this assistance, this ability to see our neighbour in need and to respond has been the fabric that has kept this Ukrainian society together. I believe that it's also the fabric it kept the world society together,"¹¹²

In a prayer meeting arranged and called for everyone, they state that "Simon and Veronica who saw Jesus Christ, supported him and helped in the moment of sadness and trial".¹¹³

Through this sentence Caritas expresses that when Jesus was suffering, Simon and Veronica extended their self-love and loved Jesus as their friend by helping him in difficult time. In a same way Caritas is presenting that they are widening their space and loving and supporting to these people who are suffering and are in need. Caritas is addressing themselves along with other partaker of this mission as 'Simon and Veronica' who sees the suffering of their friend/neighbour and take a step to be there with them. Two words used in this excerpt is 'support' and 'help'. Caritas proclaims that Caritas sees the suffering of the people and they are extending their space in order to support and help these people. This description of Caritas emphasises that when a neighbour is in need, they extend their self-love to their neighbour and be there in their difficult and painful time. This extension has gathered them together in

¹¹² https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=VUd79bD51U4&t=165s&ab_channel=CaritasInternationalis (accessed 05.10.2023. Time: 0:08-0:50)

¹¹³ <https://www.caritas.org/2023/02/one-year-of-war-in-ukraine-today-caritas-prays-the-stations-of-the-cross/> (accessed 18.03.2023)

solidarity in hope and faith with their neighbour. This shows us that Reeder's perspectives, built on Cates' view is followed and visible in the work of caritas. Another example of love extension from sources provided earlier in Caritas is,

“Every day, every Ukrainian and every Caritas-Spes Ukraine employee performs a crucial service to save people, and we are not alone in this. We strongly feel your support every day. War is always a tragedy. But at the same time, we have realised that we are not alone. You have been walking with us on this Way of the Cross for 365 days, and we know that you will not leave us alone in the future.”¹¹⁴

This quotation is from gratitude expression video, here it is clearly mentioned that in the extension love of Caritas, there is not solely Caritas, however other supporters are also part of this extension which is directly or indirectly involved in this extension of love to their neighbour who is in need, the vulnerable, another human being who is image of God as per Caritas. Caritas also asserts that even there is difficult situation, they are strong and with the people in need, in this journey they are not alone because other member organizations, supporters who are also partaker in the mission of God to serve the vulnerable are with them. Caritas as insider in this tragic war states “We have a lot of scars-death, losses, injuries, destroyed houses, infrastructure, psychological traumas, but in our souls, we are not victims”¹¹⁵. It shows their involvement and motivation to other as they are actively being there for their people. In addition, president of Caritas-Spes Ukraine states when there is need, they alone can't do everything, they need other who has similar vision and mission to serve.

“In my mind that was just one question, God why it's so so terrible experience in my life I will have, but also I understood that our life not will be the same as before and I just prayed to God and said, God please give to me friends that we will not be alone because it was very very difficult to think about that you can be alone”.¹¹⁶

Caritas is not only extending their space to involve others but they are praying and wishing for others to extend space for them or other people to be with them to extend this space for other so they together can serve the vulnerable and live in the mission of Caritas, which is ultimately mission of God as per Caritas.

¹¹⁴

<https://www.caritas.org/2023/02/one-year-on-over-5-million-people-assisted-by-caritas-since-outbreak-of-war-in-ukraine/> (accessed 18.03.2023)

¹¹⁵ Ibid. (accessed 18.03.2023)

¹¹⁶ <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=elyAxWvxT1k> (accessed on 18.03.2023. Time 11:24-11:53) (an article of this conference has date 21.02. 2023 and YouTube video date is 22.02.2023)

Caritas claims their organizational objectives through its actions. For instance, separate news or information sections on their website to write news and articles from Ukraine incidents, as Daniele Piccini, author at Caritas writes different stories of refugee families about how they reached up to the border and what kinds of benefits these people are getting from Caritas, providing warm meal and clothes when crossing border starving and half frozen, starting elementary schools as a means of resilience to the children from their war trauma, involving humanitarian volunteers to serve on the crisis, etc are major works the Caritas doing at the Ukraine border. All their actions show that the act of Caritas towards these war victims. Simultaneously, these acts can be counted as caring as friends by extending from me and mine to we and ours as Cates' perspective on compassion. (Reeder, 2016). Recalling the quote mentioned in my data section, in the video on an Easter greeting, the General-Secretary states,

“generosity and solidarity is an island of hope. Our hope as Caritas Internationalis is also nourished by the many new benefactors who have joined our community in recent weeks. I cherish integrating you in our family in order to help the poorest. [...] we must not get tired of doing good in active charity towards our neighbours. [...] we must not lose hope especially in these days leading us to the resurrection of our lord. We must continue to be hope for our brothers and sisters who need our help and this is the wish I want to extend to you this holy easter to continue to have hope, to be hope for others”.¹¹⁷

Here in this statement, he addresses these vulnerable people as ‘our neighbours, our brothers and sisters’. He also cherishes his team to love and support the vulnerable actively, specially in the time of crisis. In one way it is to extend ourselves and accept these vulnerable as our own and support them, in another way it is to work actively for the mission of God to restore the image of God. They also claim that “the medicine of the Church, the medicine of love, of hope, and it is our vocation as a Caritas family to share this with people close to us”.¹¹⁸ This sentence shows the extension of Caritas to accept those who are close to them, to whom they can reach and serve them in various ways. This sentence also enhances the religious strength that they are able to give the medicine of church, that hope and love to the people in need.

Regarding the view on Cates' self-love presented by Reeder, my thought as an outsider to the work of Caritas and suffering people will be, Yes, everyone either nearest or stranger is the

¹¹⁷

https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=64yL9CxAljI&list=PLuQafgNw_znwljfl7tSwnyJc0aqTEfhJl&index=21&ab_channel=CaritasInternationalis (accessed 05.10.2023)

¹¹⁸ <https://www.caritas.org/2022/05/caritas-united-to-make-a-difference-one-person-at-a-time-for-victims-of-the-ukraine-conflict/> (accessed 17.03.2023)

same. If the work of Caritas separates the nearest and others at the service point, then their mission to support the vulnerable and spread love could not be justifiable.

Another perspective Reeder present is by Wyschogrod, which is about sacrificing oneself for shake of other's service. In this thesis "compassion" has quite a broad meaning than just giving self by adopting others. I do not totally agree at least in Caritas' case with the view of Wyschogrod, to express love to others or compassion she explains that it is to empty oneself to take others' interests. In the case of Caritas, they have not removed their interest rather they have extended who they are, and what their motive is and they have shown their compassion to the vulnerable people. They as a serving organization have not emptied from their organizational interest indeed, they have enhanced their interest to help the needy ones. In this case, Caritas is not emptying itself instead they are holding its organizational objectives and aims and expanding itself to show compassion. Concurring with the quotes presented earlier where Caritas states,

"in the frontline courageously mobilising hundreds of young volunteers both men and women to bring care and concern for the poorest for those affected [...] people flocked to Caritas with whatever they had to help those in need driven by inner urge to help their brothers and sisters they gave means to fulfil its mission, mission of Caritas, love. In this moment of tragedy for this people, for the Ukrainian being in solidarity with one another is an island of hope".¹¹⁹

In this condition, Caritas is "instrumentalize the self in the service of the other" (Reeder, 2016, p.135). Caritas is instrumentalizing themselves for serving others, but above stated statement shows us that what Caritas is doing to not emptying themselves or sacrificing oneself for other, instead their mission is to serve and they have dedicated themselves and extended their love and focus in various situation and direction to accomplish this mission of love and serve.

President of Caritas-Spes Ukraine asserts "I am sure that with God's help we will continue to carry out ourselves to those in need and we will not leave anyone behind. Please keep us in your prayers"¹²⁰. As per this statement, Caritas should love everyone equally. In the context of

¹¹⁹ https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=zaUh9Z2mHg8&ab_channel=CaritasInternationalis (This YouTube conference video is attached in their website) (accessed 17.09.2023. Time 6:05 -6:46)

¹²⁰ <https://www.caritas.org/what-we-do/conflicts-and-disasters/crisis-in-ukraine/?playlist=1b07454&video=384fd21> and https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=EkSLaMVA2NA&list=PLuQafgNw_znwljfI7tSwnyJc0aqTEfhJl&index=4&ab_channel=CaritasInternationalis (accessed 18.03.2023)

the Ukrainian war, this statement shows their focus on equal love for all war victims. Caritas holds the mission to love and serve the vulnerable, and to support the people in need. Kierkegaard's perspective presented in the theoretical chapter highlights that loving others should be like loving oneself without any differentiation. In essence, love should be equal for all human beings. For further elucidation, Reeder presents Kierkegaard's example of the Good Samaritan who shows compassion to a stranger who was in need of help. In the same way, Caritas is supporting needy people. Even though these people are strangers, nevertheless Caritas is showing compassion through work. In addition, in the case of A Good Samaritan physical treatment was a need, while in the Ukrainian case including the medical treatment, they are in need of other essential necessities. According to Reeder, drawing from Kierkegaard's perspective, agape, a self-sacrificing love in Christian understanding, originates from God and extends to love everyone equally, including strangers. As the Good Samaritan shows compassion to the stranger in need, Caritas expands its helping hands and stand with these people to support them. Caritas expresses their loving and compassionate goal frequently in their materials for instance, referring back to the quote mentioned in prior chapter, where Caritas mention that,

“We’ve been working with people who have lost everything. And they immediately felt the embrace of Caritas. People who have been through such trauma don’t just need food and shelter, they need kindness. And that’s where we come in”.¹²¹ Further more, “thanks to God that we have this opportunity, we have faith, we have motivation to support to continue our work and may the Lord bless you for your help for your solidarity with us and we know that we’ve been not alone so then we can do more, we can do more together. Thank you so much.”¹²² In pursuit of these goals, equal love could be a key factor for Caritas.

In addition, Reeder also writes about the limitation of giving. I think this is interesting to explore more, I personally think that no one needs support forever, or critical situations will not exist enduringly, and no one can support others endlessly. Ukrainian refugees are in need right now, and they have specific needs, and this will not last forever. An important lesson to learn from A Good Samaritan is his limitation on his support on what is necessary at the very moment, when to support, and for how long. Therefore, organizations such as Caritas have to take into account and limit their support on what, how, and until when to support. Either with biblical compassion or a social aspect, it is ideal to love and support people in need. However,

¹²¹ <https://twitter.com/sciaf/status/1588063698454716416> (accessed on 3.10.2023)

¹²² https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=UzmeNq3C8nY&list=PLuQafgNw_znwljfI7tSwnyJc0aqTEfhJl&index=32&ab_channel=CaritasInternationalis (accessed 05.10.2023. Time: 1:49: 2:10)

as discussed, there should be limitations on its practice. Caritas has stated that “The number of services delivered over the last year is truly remarkable. However, what Caritas gives is much more than assistance. We accompany people before, during and after a crisis happens. We want to continue this work. We want to give that sense of hope and warmth to the suffering in Ukraine.”¹²³

As stated in this statement “before, during and after a crisis happens”¹²⁴. The need in all these three stages might not be the same. For instance, story written by Piccini presents that people were living in the basement for 200 days, and Caritas-Spes Ukraine provided food, and other basic items and they also states that they comforted these families with “prayer and kind words”¹²⁵. At this point of time, the foremost need of these people is basic need, security, emotional support and after the war the need might change from very basic need to restore their homes or other matters. So, there is limitation on what, where and how to support in the very situation.

How does Caritas extend their space to include and accept the vulnerable and love them as oneself? As presented by Caritas, it is possible only through their work in the field and with their partners. In chapter 2, the background chapter, I have explained how Caritas works together with their local partners. In my point of view, the working strategies of Caritas by collaborating with local partners is plus point for them to act and show compassion to vulnerable people. For instance, local members can be present immediately and understand the language, culture, and most important people on or around the battlefield can know the actual situation and needs of the people. This can inform and lead people or organizations to support or react in the right way. Providing food, shelter, medicine, psychological support, etc is crucial in this very situation. Caritas has taken it as a holistic support which is essential for the people. However, one of the crucial aspects, of spiritual care is unclear in their materials whether it was overlooked or intentionally omitted.

For instance, due to the reason that Caritas has two-member organizations in the Ukraine, it became easier to work with/for Ukrainian refugees. Caritas has a slogan “When crisis hits

¹²³ <https://www.caritas.org/2023/02/one-year-on-over-5-million-people-assisted-by-caritas-since-outbreak-of-war-in-ukraine/> (accessed 18.03.2023)

¹²⁴ Ibid. (accessed 18.03.2023)

¹²⁵ <https://www.caritas.org/2023/02/one-year-of-war-in-ukraine-people-of-the-dungeon/> (accessed 18.03.2023)

Caritas is already on the ground”¹²⁶, they claim that “each tear and cry of the children, women, the elders and the migrants is a call for solidarity and compassion”¹²⁷

This call of solidarity and compassion can be responded immediately due to their partner organization on the ground. Furthermore, they also state that Caritas “positioning ourselves to be able to do our mission which is to help people in need”¹²⁸, this results in quick action to the emergency calls. Additionally, they claim that nothing can destroy the “the aspiration for peace and freedom”.¹²⁹ Caritas through their practices claim that due to their work strategy to involve their supporters, volunteers and staff, they are extending their spaces to accept and assist the vulnerable.

According to Reeder, Cates' friendship model presents an expanded form of love and compassion from the nearest to a stranger. Wyschogrod presents a saint model in order to empty oneself to adopt others' interests. In a way, it is rejecting or ignoring personal interest in a shake of accepting others' interests. Wyschogrod's view regarding keeping aside own interest and taking others' interest is not so convenient to this project or regardless in the work of Caritas. It is important to understand what 'interest' means, is it not a willingness to do, know, or learn about something? I think that the decision to take own interest aside is also an interest. In addition, accepting or taking others' interests is also a person's/organization's interest. Caritas is there at the border and other Caritas centres are helping from where they are, in this condition, it is not like Caritas is taking out their interest to take the interest of vulnerable people rather their interest is to serve and they are combining their interest with other's needs to achieve their love and compassion goal.

As I mentioned in chapter five, when I gave an account on Reeder's work on compassion about instrumentalizing oneself in other's service. Caritas is using its network, other joint organizations, and supporters, to be instrumentalized to accomplish its goal through providing

¹²⁶ <https://www.caritas.org/who-we-are/> (accessed 20.02.2023)

¹²⁷ https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=zaUh9Z2mHg8&ab_channel=CaritasInternationalis (This YouTube conference video is attached in their website) (accessed 17.09.2023. Time 8:38-8:45)

¹²⁸ <https://www.caritas.org/what-we-do/conflicts-and-disasters/crisis-in-ukraine/?playlist=1b07454&video=ba18605> and https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=NOHfJeylidU&list=PLuQafgNw_znwljfI7tSwnyJc0aqTEfhJl&index=5&ab_channel=CaritasInternationalis (accessed 18.03.2023)

¹²⁹ <https://www.caritas.org/what-we-do/conflicts-and-disasters/crisis-in-ukraine/?playlist=1b07454&video=384fd21> and https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=EkSLaMVA2NA&list=PLuQafgNw_znwljfI7tSwnyJc0aqTEfhJl&index=4&ab_channel=CaritasInternationalis (accessed 18.03.2023)

and serving. Thus, the compassion expressed by Caritas is not a saint model. Instead, it is an implementation of the predetermined compassion and love goal from Caritas.

Reeder has presented the sacrificial concept to show Compassion. I am uncertain about the sacrifice sector of Caritas. By holding serving goals, and reaching out to the people from the organizational sector, are they really sacrificing? Or Caritas is focusing on equal love without overlooking sacrificing part. Otherwise, solely equal love is implemented from this model at Caritas and is devoid of sacrifice. Consequently, this model expresses loving both self and neighbor equally. It is because God loves everyone equally. Compassion and love are expressed without expecting something in return in Agape. A Good Samaritan which is used in the text as an example is a person who helped a stranger in his specific condition, with a specific problem. The lover or giver should not be from specific status or condition, instead, all from different classes, and backgrounds can be that lover or helper in the particular need.

Reeder in his work talks about agape, a selfless and sacrificing love for others. I think agape is not limited to self or the nearest one, but it goes beyond it. A challenge in this theory is: in this equality, there is both I and you, either its organization as I or Ukrainian refugee as you. There should be equality between them. One shouldn't be lost in shake for others' gain. If I will lose and another will gain, then it will not be equality or equal love there. Therefore, this theory works for loving yourself and loving others as yourself. This shows that there should be equal love for both sides. Caritas as an agape love is going out at the border, appealing for support, and stepping out from their place to serve or to spread that equal love to Ukrainian refugees. According to Caritas, they are allowing strangers into their lives and taking them as their friends or neighbors and loving them by fulfilling their basic needs in times of crisis. On one way, to reply in the crisis, they are asking "How to keep hope alive?"¹³⁰, "how to give hope to your flock?"¹³¹ At the same time stating "Ukrainian people is something that gives us hope".¹³² Additionally, other Caritas members outside the Ukraine also asserts that "our prayers and support to Caritas in Ukraine and we also continue to give hope to you by being in solidarity with you"¹³³. This shows us that neither Caritas alone is giver nor vulnerable alone is receiver.

¹³⁰ https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=zaUh9Z2mHg8&ab_channel=CaritasInternationalis (This YouTube conference video is attached in their website) (accessed 17.09.2023. Time 45:24:-45:27)

¹³¹ Ibid. (accessed 17.09.2023. Time 46:45:-46:47)

¹³² Ibid. (accessed 17.09.2023. Time 47:15:-47:18)

¹³³ Ibid. (accessed 17.09.2023. Time 52:48 - :15:-47:18)

Both Caritas and Ukrainian take part and here in this Ukrainian case, Caritas is taking hope and inspiration from the vulnerable and caring and responding to them in different ways and all vulnerable people are inspiring missional organisational to work and accomplish their mission. Again, the potency of this viewpoint is the feeling of a 'child of God' or 'creature of God', this can be a motivating factor for one person or organization to extend their own area to reach up to the next person. Having this feeling enhances the ability to construct love, love that is for both me and others as God's children and creatures.

In the case of Caritas, I have aimed at showing that they as an organization feel the pain of the Ukrainian refugees and they are taking it parallel to their own problems. Therefore, to show compassion they are actively participating there at the border 24/7 to act on the very situation. Reeder quotes "the suffering of the other becomes a parallel object of dislike and desire for me because the other is my friend; since the good of the other becomes part of my good, I love the either to an equal degree". (Reeder, 2016, p.138) What Caritas expresses through their work is the help towards their friend as Reeder mentions in his views. They are taking the suffering of Ukrainian refugees as their own and Caritas as an organization is spreading the love that equals love to these neighbors, which was presented in Reeder's work built on Cates' perspective on the friend model. Hence, as per presented by Reeder compassion expressed or acted by Caritas is not exactly like a saint. Even though they are a religion-based organization they are expressing compassion as a friend and spreading equal agape to the sufferings, as described by Cates and Kierkegaard. In addition, I still have question about Wyschogrod's view in the case of Caritas, specially about the concept of showing compassion to others by sacrificing oneself as a saint. (Reeder, 2016) I still believe that Caritas willingly supports the vulnerable by expanding its mission to serve, rather than sacrificing themselves for shake of others.

I have now shown how I understand and interpret the data through the whole migration theology framework, it has given me some interesting points. I will now go into the acts of citizenship part.

6.3 Through the lens of acts of citizenship

I will now examine my data through the theory of acts of citizenship. This research may provide input into the work of Caritas for migration relief. Since this research is to examine the self-presentation of Caritas in description of their work with refugees, the acts taken by war victims

are not covered. It will not focus on the experiences of the migrants, it is focusing on the texts/videos where Caritas talks about itself.

Discussing and interpreting acts as acts of citizenship, typically has to be done when there is no life danger and people's basic needs are covered.

The concept of acts of citizenship underscores the essential role of taking action to assert one's citizenship (Isin 2008). Isin's definition of acts of citizenship places significance on the idea that legal aspect should not be the only determinants for people's citizenship, instead, citizenship is/should be claimed through people's acts and performativity, signifying people's own belonging. Isin further argues that actively participating in society is a fundamental for claiming one's citizenship. (Isin 2008)

Isin's concept of acts of citizenship is not connected in any way with religion, nor he writes about acts of citizenship about religion/theology. It is Trygve Wyller, another author I presented in my theoretical framework, who writes about the performativity, connects the concept of acts of citizenship with religion and theology. Wyller also presents how religion and theology can be an important part of acts. Now I am going into this merge of acts of citizenship and religion/theology by examining the self-presentation of Caritas.

On Caritas websites, they constantly highlight their contributions, such as providing food, shelter, medical kits, money, education etc. Their website and social media feature numerous stories, some of which depicts children and women reaching up to the border in seeking basic necessities and actively engaging in the services provided by Caritas. In the material section, I have briefly presented some of the stories. Caritas has all these different provisions and by ensuring that the refugees have these basic needs covered, it might give those refugees possibilities of an acting their citizenship, instead of just fighting for their basic needs. These acts of people illustrate people's act in claiming their own citizenship.

Caritas, through their self-presentation describes that the act is performed by serving, providing, and helping needy people. Providing food to the hungry ones, and shelter to the homeless are some examples of performances practiced by Caritas. Collecting funds from various sectors and being present at the border to help another human being is an act beyond human boundaries.

Caritas, by using their local network, knowledge, and effective strategies operates as a migrant agency. In order to accomplish Caritas' organizational mission, they provide food, shelter, essential aid, etc., to numerous refugees who are in need. However, while observing the acts of Caritas, one should not overlook the other side of the story where the acts of refugees must not be disregarded. On the subject of acts of citizenship, are these Ukrainian refugees being passive and dependent upon Caritas and giving all decision rights to the organization? Since everything is arranged by Caritas, and its Caritas' decision on what refugees should eat, where to sleep, what activities to do, in children's case, which elementary school to go and mainly the organization decides with whom these people should be, and refugees just come and receive what Caritas has to offer. The only rights to the refugees at this point is either to participate in Caritas or not. In the war cases when people are displaced with nothing and seeking for very basic things, when these people get these basic necessities then it is normal that without thinking any further these people in need will take the offers. Nevertheless, it is crucial to determine whether Caritas, by offering the most basic support to refugees, is limiting people to act or claim their own citizenship. This is Caritas' work directly with/for refugees by providing most fundamental necessities. Moreover, Caritas' self-presentation not solely present about their work for the vulnerable, rather it presents they are supporting from individual to raising voices globally on behalf of these vulnerable. For instance, Caritas is being a representative of these people, as an organization they are issuing joint statements for peace buildings, organizing different programs, providing basic needs, etc. They are actively working on their mission, nonetheless, on the other side, are the citizens who are eating what is provided, living where they are designated, or accepting what is provided is actively acting for their citizenship? As Isin mentions that everyone has to claim their own citizenship through their act. In the time of extreme crisis, basic needs are foremost important, however, in the next step, what will be the situation for these vulnerable after fulfilling all these essential fundamental necessities are not clearly visible in Caritas' materials. Moreover, Caritas' self-presentation gives room to ask whether the people are able to act for their belonging by engaging at the Caritas. Furthermore, it remains uncertain if it is exactly the same act these Ukrainian refugees are willing from one humanitarian aid? which is primarily support for basic needs for time being. It is also not explicitly visible at least in their self-presentation if the opportunity given by Caritas allows or forbid people to act for their citizenship. In the case of Ukraine, these fleeing people are actually supposed to claim their citizenship, therefore their active participation should be prioritized, and they must not be passive receivers and totally dependent upon any other agents. At the same time, Caritas by being a provider of needs and by being a religious organization, there is

a chance of limiting the possibility of the act of the people. It can be very much present not in their purpose, but it is by facilitating many basic needs and this facilitation might result in acts being less in the particular time. The work of Caritas is essential in that immediate situation when people are in need, and it is related to life and death. However, if the people are totally dependent to Caritas, the objective of Caritas to fulfil the basic needs of people and help refugees can be achieved and it is great to work to support the people in need, however work of Caritas might limit the actions of these people in need. In this kind of acts, there is possibility of creating passive recipient instead of creating activist citizen.

While Caritas' effort and presentations are commendable, its essential to explore their work from a different angle. Analysing their actions through the lens of acts of citizenship is a crucial approach to gain a more comprehensive understanding.

The main factor of Caritas and Ukrainian refugees is *acts* in this case. Acts which are taken by Caritas to show their concern to the people in need, acts which generates opportunity for people to act for their own belonging.

Caritas, through their websites, are frequently mentioning about caring for physical, emotional, financial, and psychosocial needs. The situation of the Russia-Ukraine war is threatening for people living inside Ukraine. As the hostilities result in life-and-death situations, people flee from the battlefield to save their lives. In such conditions when people left everything behind including their family members, basic needs like food, and shelter are crucial and Caritas claims that they are providing such basic needs.

Regarding hospitality Daniel Groody states that generous hospitality is more crucial than imposing evangelization. It is important to understand that imposing evangelization is not acts of citizenship. Additionally, by doing imposing evangelization, it makes difficult for the people involved either in acts of citizenship or for the citizenship practices to be recognized or be meaningful. In the case of Caritas and Ukrainian Refugees, if Caritas is imposing evangelization, then neither Caritas acts for citizenship nor the Ukrainian refugees who are involved with Caritas. Generous hospitality, on the other hand, gives a possible space to act citizenship. Acts of citizenship can always appear in anywhere in any kinds of condition. However, there are possibilities to have difficult situation to act. Or it might be difficult to see and interpret act. For instance, the case of Ukrainian refugees at Caritas. There is possibility to act for their citizenship, nevertheless, if people are limited solely to their basic needs and do

not act for their citizenship or limitation is from Caritas by not giving any opportunity to act. Then, it can be difficult in such situation to claim or see act of citizenship. As stated by Cathy Ross, if any church or religion-based organization, like Caritas, can create room for people to come as they are, and the church or religious organization are able to create or offer generous hospitality then the people can act on their citizenship. The concept of acts of citizenship shows that through the organizational purpose, Caritas may be generating the citizens who can act for their citizenship, ‘activist citizens’, by providing them an opportunity to act. (Isin, 2008)

In the following, I will present four excerpts that are examples of Caritas’ action, which I will discuss below:

“positioning ourselves to be able to do our mission which is to help people in need.”¹³⁴. This quote shows the acts of Caritas to accomplish their organizational mission which is by positioning themselves for the mission of helping the vulnerable people. Positioning to be on the field to answer the call of need.

“our mission is to help people in need [...] what we’re thinking about now is the people who are in need. We have a job to do and so we’re focusing on the job that we have in front of us regardless of what happens”.¹³⁵ This quote also highlights that even at the battle field, Caritas is prioritizing people and their organizational objective and responsibilities to serve the vulnerable.

“keeping the part of Caritas mission this heart of practical love offered to those in need is finding it’s a special light on it these days in Ukraine [...] it’s this heart of love and they feel this embrace when they come into our centres [...] to offer a hug, to give somebody to hold someone’s hand who has lived through a very traumatic experience”¹³⁶.

This quote explicitly expresses the mission of Caritas. It is not only to provide food or shelter to the refugees, but however people in extreme situation also require more than all these. As they have stated in the statement to offer practical love to the people. Which is through different

¹³⁴ <https://www.caritas.org/what-we-do/conflicts-and-disasters/crisis-in-ukraine/?playlist=1b07454&video=ba18605> and https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=NOHfJeylidU&list=PLuQafgNw_znwljfi7tSwnyJc0aqTEfhJl&index=5&ab_channel=CaritasInternationalis (accessed 18.03.2023)

¹³⁵ https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=ijNPwc9z4JE&ab_channel=CaritasEuropa (YouTube video from the official YouTube channel of Caritas Europa). (accessed 18.03.2023. Time: 03:35-04:11)

¹³⁶

https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=HwATmloMtlU&list=PLuQafgNw_znwljfi7tSwnyJc0aqTEfhJl&index=24&ab_channel=CaritasInternationalis (accessed 05.10.2023 Time: 1:07 - 1:22 [...] 2:29-2:32 [...] 03:06- 03:16)

acts, as they have explained, it might be by holding the war victim's hand or by hugging them. This act is to make the Ukrainian refugees feel accepted, welcomed and embraced.

“trying to help them to organize and offer the aid that we can for people who are in need and that way fulfilling the mission that we have of giving this practical love to neighbor [...]. as Caritas we through our actions, we carry deep truth, and its the truth about the dignity of the human person and through our actions we have a special path to restoring this special deep truth in this deep human dignity of people.”¹³⁷

Through this excerpt, Caritas underscores their act on offering aid, helping people to organize and providing practical love to neighbor. In addition, they state that through their action they are trying to restore human dignity of people.

Another act taken by Caritas is, conducting prayer ceremony, where they invite everyone and conducted online prayer meeting, where they asserts,

“We want to call this Way of the Cross “The 366th station” to symbolize the year of dramatic experience of the Ukrainian People.

This year, we symbolically compare to the path of suffering and torment walked by Jesus before being crucified. Each “station” is written by employees of the National Office of Caritas-Spes Ukraine. In their words, they express the pain they and the Ukrainian people have experienced. Each station tells a personal story and the stories of the people they lovingly serve. Why do we want to share this prayer with our partners? Every day, every Ukrainian and every Caritas-Spes employee performs a crucial service to save people, and we are not alone in this”¹³⁸.

Through this expression they are showing they are not only physically acting however they are actively acting in spiritual sector as well. Caritas compares the suffering of Ukrainian refugees with the crucifixion path of Jesus. Additionally, they claim their acts to serve and save people with the help of their volunteers, staff, supports.

In one interpretation, whenever Caritas writes about everything, they are doing they are only writing about themselves and expressing how phenomenal and important thing they are doing. This shows that the texts and videos of Caritas are self-centred and only present about their work. For instance, “positioning ourselves,”¹³⁹

¹³⁷ https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=zaUh9Z2mHg8&ab_channel=CaritasInternationalis (This YouTube conference video is attached in their website) (accessed 17.09.2023. Time 13:45 -15:00)

¹³⁸ <https://www.caritas.org/2023/02/one-year-of-war-in-ukraine-today-caritas-prays-the-stations-of-the-cross/> (accessed 18.03.2023)

¹³⁹ <https://www.caritas.org/what-we-do/conflicts-and-disasters/crisis-in-ukraine/?playlist=1b07454&video=ba18605> and

In another interpretation, even though they are writing what they are doing, they are writing about what Caritas is doing for someone else. This means Caritas, through their self-presentation expressing their work centring to someone else in the text and videos about themselves. For instance, their work for Ukrainian refugees. “we will continue to carry out ourselves to those in need and we will not leave anyone behind”¹⁴⁰ “keeping the part of Caritas mission this heart of practical love offered to those in need”¹⁴¹

Another interesting act visible in Caritas is, the president of Caritas-Spes Ukraine giving a cross to the Pope Francis. It is “a cross made out of broken glasses of the buildings destroyed by the war”¹⁴².

On one hand, this act is about the Caritas-Spes Ukraine president, partaker in organizational mission, showing the situation of Ukrainian refugees by giving a cross made by broken glasses to the pope. It is a presentation of symbol and expression of pain and sorrow of Ukrainian refugees by Caritas representative.

On the other hand, this act is conducted by the president of Caritas-Spes Ukraine, who himself is victim of this war. This act shows that the president of Caritas-Spes Ukraine is claiming his own citizenship by expressing the pain of war.

The acts of Caritas have resulted in serving and being served in a difficult time. On the other hand, as Isin describes acts and performativity, and these factors are visible in the work of Caritas as well as through the life of Ukrainian refugees. Isin states that in the citizenship procedure, “being always involves being with others”. (Isin, 2008, p.19). The work of Caritas shows that they are being in and around the country with needy people. Isin claims that there are numerous kinds of acts in this world such as acts of love, hostility, hospitality, etc. (Isin, 2008, p. 19). Acts of love, hostility, hospitality, etc are not necessarily acts of citizenship. This proves that not all acts are ‘acts of citizenship’. According to this definition and evaluation of the act of Caritas as per their presentation online, they may possibly be acts of love and

https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=NOHfJeylidU&list=PLuQafgNw_znwlfj7tSwnyJc0aqTEfhJl&index=5&ab_channel=CaritasInternationalis (accessed 18.03.2023)

¹⁴⁰ Ibid. (accessed 18.03.2023)

¹⁴¹

https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=HwATmloMt1U&list=PLuQafgNw_znwlfj7tSwnyJc0aqTEfhJl&index=24&ab_channel=CaritasInternationalis (accessed 05.10.2023 Time: 1:07 - 1:22 [...] 2:29-2:32 [...] 03:06- 03:16)

¹⁴² <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=elyAxWvxT1k> (accessed on 18.03.2023 Time:17:22-17:28)

hospitality, I argue that some may also be interpreted as acts of citizenship. While examining the work of Caritas, they are through their self-presentation show that Caritas is always being with the vulnerable, supporting the needy ones, providing hospitality, and sharing love and empathy etc. and as per the definition Caritas is always being with/for vulnerable. And this act might create opportunity for people to act for their citizenship.

There are two parties who are playing a vital role to *act* in this situation. One subject is Caritas which is acting to achieve its goal and another subject is the refugees themselves who act to seek security and life. However, as the objective of this thesis is about self-representation, I have included very little from the voices of Ukrainian refugees. Their act is essential to acts of citizenship. This thesis aims to study self-presentation of Caritas in description of their work, and the acts of victims are not visible in their materials. Studying the acts of victims to claim their citizenship might be interesting for future research. Information from the Caritas website presents that Caritas, as an agency being there to play in this action. Isin raises the question “How are subjects enabled to act upon the actions of other subjects?” (Isin, 2008, p. 21) Caritas’s presentation, and work description show their participation in acting for other subjects in this situation. Isin also describes an act as related to ‘conduct, practice, habit and routine’, this point can be relevant to the work of Caritas where they mention that their mission is to serve, love, help, and provide. In order to accomplish their mission as Isin describes it has become conduct to act, habit to react to the vulnerable situation, practice and routine to stand with other subjects in their acts.

Furthermore, to act is to be ‘directed and oriented’ for specific goals. While viewing the definition of an act in the work of Caritas, they are also performing by carrying out a specific project, directed and oriented by the organizational mission.

Even this study does not present the people’s side, according to Caritas, as they explain by their work, they may be facilitating people to act. They are giving an opportunity to act to reach out to them and get the support this organization is providing in different places.

As responsible agents, all the Caritas in and outside Ukraine acting on the situation already created shows their involvement in the creation. Isin cites Stout “Being an agent is being something that acts, something that does actions”. (Isin, 2008, p.22) This definition illustrates, Caritas as an agent is in action to act. However, Caritas is acting to achieve its serving and compassion goal. Isin mentions that to claim citizenship one has to act. It is crucial to focus on

the act of Caritas, are they encouraging people to act for their citizenship, or they are making this vulnerable be dependent upon the organization and creating passive receivers?

Wyller though his Lampedusa case shows us that this organization open the places, welcomes the people and give chance for performativity of their own citizenship. When there is a crisis or need, it is to act immediately on that. And to respond to that situation by the participants or organization is to claim citizenship. Additionally, as Caritas presents itself online, they present its organizational mission and its purpose of being with others. This shows that they have reason to create opportunity for people by being with them. Nevertheless, acting on behalf of others may become the opposite of acts of citizenship (Wyller, 2019). Therefore, it is crucial to focus on the work of Caritas that by supporting and providing the basic things to the people, especially in the next step after fulfilling their basic needs, are Caritas doing something for these people in need or acting on behalf of people is important thing to focus on.

In the first case presented by Trygve Wyller, from Rosengrenska foundation and Bergsjøen church where the Bergsjøen church opens the church up for Rosengrenska foundation and dissenters itself. Thus, Bergsjøen church gave a space for Rosengrenska project to be filled by others that may aid others. This act by Bergsjøen church might be the act of citizenship. This is an important point Since the church/religious place is left for secular organization to do something generally don't happen in the church. The Rosengrenska on the other hand are contributing, helping the irregular migrants with having some of their basic needs. It is by taking care of with professional support such as medical need. It is the way of facilitating that the irregular migrants can find ways to act for their citizenship, instead of being ill or worry. Another important point to understand is, Rosengrenska have been able to work in a way that the laws has been changed for irregular migrants. This act can be interpreted as an act of citizenship. This act has influenced so much which resulted in change the law for undocumented migrants. This is strong act of citizenship from organizational sector. Rosengrenska project has open the place for irregular migrants to receive health care and participate in the project to act for their citizenship. In the same way Caritas arranged the opportunity for Ukrainian refugees to come to their organization and participate. I think possibly the Caritas and Bergsjøen church are similar in as they give space for vulnerable people to act their citizenship. Furthermore, I agree with Wyller where he states, "church facilitated projects facilitate acts of citizenship" (Wyller, 2019, p.286), Caritas as a church or part of church mission is facilitation acts of citizenship through their projects.

In the case of Caritas, it is to act for people's rights, the rights of security, life, basic needs, etc. As Wyller writes, both actions of Caritas and the help seeker are acts of citizenship. The work of Caritas, a popular humanitarian aid organization is also limited. Since there are more needy people than they have reached. Still, as Wyller express, from small to big all kind of such acts are a heroic act of citizenship.

Both of the cases presented by Trygve Wyller, creates opportunity for people to come and act their citizenship, either to come for checkup or to record a song. In the same way Caritas is creating space for people to come and act for their citizenship. They state that "We've been working with people who have lost everything. And they immediately felt the embrace of Caritas. People who have been through such trauma do not just need food and shelter; they need kindness. And that's where we come in".¹⁴³ In the Rosengrenska project in Bergsjøen church presented by Wyller, a church leader states their work is related to human rights and a non-religious person from non-religious organisation states the support to the irregular migrants as 'something more'. In accordance with the citation above, Caritas is stating that, "People who have been through such trauma don't just need food and shelter, they need kindness; they need a kind hand. And that's where we come in",¹⁴⁴ Caritas also emphasizes that the needs of the people is not only food and shelter, they need more than mere physical necessity. In this context Caritas is stating, kindness and kind hand, however, there might be more than this as stated in the case of Rosengrenska in Bergsjøen church.

Through the act both the Caritas and Ukrainian refugees are 'exercising, claiming and performing' their own rights and fulfilling their duties. As a religious organization, from running the organization with the organizational mission on the battlefield to standing there at the border with the basic needs to support the people, welcoming them, and feeding them are acts conducted by Caritas. Whereas living under the basement, contacting Caritas inside the country, and even crossing the Ukraine border and reaching up to them and seeking support are acts of citizenship.

¹⁴³ Scottish Catholic International Aid Fund <https://twitter.com/sciaf/status/1588063698454716416>
<https://www.sciaf.org.uk/about-us/news/436-we-learn-how-efforts-are-helping-people-of> (accessed on (accessed on 3.10.2023)

¹⁴⁴ Ibid. 3.10.2023)

In order to study the organizational aspect, there is no information regarding the acts of the refugees except for their reaching out to the Caritas centre and taking the services Caritas providing for the refugees. Here in this condition, acts and performativity have been carried out by Caritas. They are being available for the people in need, providing different services inside Ukraine and at the border, raising voice against war and violence from their level, etc. Nevertheless, as a migrant agency that acts from their level to support the victims who are willing for life, security, basic needs, etc. In this case of Caritas and Ukrainian refugees, I have encountered performativity from two different sectors. First, the performativity of refugees who come out from their place to claim their rights, their right to security, food, peace, etc. Second, Caritas' performativity as per their organizational mission, the mission to perform for the need vulnerable.

Caritas as a migrant agency is acts at the border and inside the country. This perspective is only from the part of Caritas as per their presentation. However, the acts of these refugees to reach up to the Caritas in and around the country is still opaque. Simultaneously, act from both refugees and Caritas encourages to think from different perspectives. Is the act of refugees crossing the border from the battlefield a more powerful act or are the ones who are serving the ones who come to them by seeking help? If act determines citizenship, then does the effort used to act ascertain the concept of citizenship? I would argue that Isin' act of citizenship is one perspective, however not a complete package to claim citizenship. This theory raises the question that if act only determines citizenship. In the case of Caritas, who acts more to claim the citizenship of whom? Regarding the *act*, does it claim others' citizenship, or does one need to act for their own citizenship? At the same time, can Caritas be observed only through the lens of acts for their work toward the Ukrainian refugees? In this project, Ukrainian refugees need acts for their citizenship, additionally, as per the documents provided by Caritas, they are participating in the act to help Ukrainian refugees to act on their situation to claim their citizenship. In the case of Ukrainian refugees and Caritas, the act is taken by both parties, victims are acting by crossing the border and seeking help with the centre, and simultaneously Caritas acts by providing the basic need to the ones who reach them. And citizenship is claimed through the everyday acts in the Caritas centres in and around the country.

As I have discussed in this thesis the work of Caritas from a migration theology perspective, they are showing love, and compassion to the people in need and supporting the vulnerable people through different sectors by taking all human being are image of God and they are imitator of God's mission to restore and reconcile the world. While this is one side of their

understanding and practice. However, while focusing more on support from the organizational side, there is an equal chance of victims to be neglecting or forgetting the people. In the time of crisis definitely, food, shelter, and other basic needs are crucial, nevertheless letting people act in that very moment is equally essential. Caritas, or any other second party can't act for another person or party. Due to the fact that acts of citizenship is self act for own belonging, so Caritas creating opportunity for these people is positive side, however, if Caritas is more focused on their space creation than letting people perform then it will not be acts of citizenship.

6.4 Conclusion

In order to ultimately respond to my research question, *how is religion/theology expressed in the self-presentation of Caritas in descriptions online of their work with Ukrainian refugees and in what ways does it relate to migration theology?* I will now sum up the discussion and articulate possible answers. I have discussed my data, which are quotes containing explicit and implicit religion/theology through the lenses of my theoretical framework. I have selected two theoretical concepts, first, the migration theology which was focusing on *missio Dei* and empathy, compassion and love of neighbor and acts of citizenship.

The discussion of examining Caritas through the lens of migration theology shows that Caritas recognizes human faces as image of God and in a mission with God to restore and reconcile the people. Caritas is doing it by expressing practical love to the people in need. In order to show their practical love, empathy, compassion and love of neighbor plays an important role. It portrays that Caritas is feeling the suffering of the Ukrainian refugees and extending their space and accepting the vulnerable as their one and assisting them. The discussion shows that empathy, compassion, and love of neighbor should not be limited to near and dear ones, indeed it should extend to strangers and even to enemies. The work of Caritas portrays their extension to vulnerable and support them.

Acts of citizenship glasses shows that citizenship should not be understood solely as a legal perspective. Instead, it extends beyond and relates to people' claim for their own belonging. Hence, it is to claim through people' acts and performativity in the society. Even though the acts of citizenship concept by Engin Isin does not address religious connection, drawing the work of Trygve Wyller on connecting acts of citizenship and religion became an interesting aspect for this project.

The discussion in this chapter shows that Caritas is an active organization with a serving mission, providing basic needs to the vulnerable and caring for the people in dire emergencies. The supporting work in critical situations is necessary and both Caritas and the Ukrainian refugees act in this very situation. This discussion underscores the work of Caritas along with emerging different questions to view the work of Caritas from different angles. Questions such as: if Caritas is limiting Ukrainian refugees by creating passive recipients, how Caritas fosters Ukrainian refugees for their citizenship claim etc.

I see that I could have discussed more, specially from acts of citizenship concept or taken this discussion from another direction, by using examples from the Good Samaritan or using other theoretical frameworks, for instance from the hospitality or migrant agency glasses, to scrutinize the self-presentation of Caritas in their work. However due to the limitation on this master's thesis, I have decided to move on from this point.

So far, I have discussed my data from a selected theoretical framework. In my next chapter I will elaborate on the possible answers to research questions, then summarise the thesis.

Chapter 7: Concluding Remarks

7.1. Key Findings

I will now summarise the key findings regarding my research question, *how is religion/theology expressed in the self-presentation of Caritas in descriptions online of their work with Ukrainian refugees and in what ways does it relate to migration theology?*

Caritas predominately emphasizes religious/theological terminology in their self-presentation in description of their work with Ukrainian refugees online. Caritas implicitly and explicitly use these terms to express their organisational mission, values, and their work. For instance, to show compassion to the vulnerable, to express their gratitude, to describe their religious values, and foundations. The terms like ‘mission’ to explain their organizational objectives, call for ‘peace’, ‘God’s help to support the people in need’, statement of ‘not leaving anyone behind, their call for ‘prayers’, ‘hope, generosity, solidarity, help the poorest, charity’, addressing the vulnerable as ‘neighbour’, using terms ‘Jesus, God, Lord’, ‘brother and sister’, ‘compassion’, ‘every figure is a human face’, ‘ministry’, ‘church medicine of love’ ‘heart of practical love’, ‘faith, love, fabric which keep all together’, ‘tent of Hope’ ‘prayer of the way of the Cross’, ‘deep truth, dignity, stating that the refugees needs ‘kindness’ and Caritas is there for it’, ‘human created in image of God’, etc. These terminology shows their commitment and connection to a religious/theological approach in their humanitarian work.

Moreover, Caritas constantly use religious/theological themes and terminology in their self-presentation. While these terms are explicitly visible in their conferences, press releases, organizational meetings, and short videos, it is comparatively less visible in their field reports where they write and talk about the practical application of their work. In addition, it is interesting to see the Caritas Internationalis, head of Caritas, expressing and presenting more languages and related materials than the Caritas Europa.

Caritas explicitly expresses its mission as being a partaker in *missio Dei*, meaning mission of God, which is initiated by God himself. This mission is to recognize the image of God in every suffering human face and accepting them as brother and sister or neighbor. The practice of Caritas to show practical love, to serve the vulnerable, to love the needy one, to show compassion and support their neighbour shows pastoral-practical in the context of crisis as a

church. It is to be partner with God in his restoring and reconciling mission in the world. Caritas in their self-presentation shows that they are instrumentalizing themselves to serve the vulnerable by holding religious values.

The acts of citizenship, on another hand is evident in the work of Caritas. As they create spaces for Ukrainian refugees to come and act for their citizenship. Since this project only present from Caritas' side with very little information of refugees' acts, shows that Caritas is creating space and gives opportunity for refugees to claim their citizenship by utilizing the created space by Caritas. This space creating act challenges Caritas to not just creating the space for people, however facilitating genuine acts of citizenship in their work.

Caritas' self-presentation indicate a deep embedment with religion/theology, with the mission to love and serve the vulnerable by emphasizing the theological idea of *imago Dei*, *missio Dei*, to reconcile, restore and protect human dignity. It is by extending their spaces for vulnerable, through empathy, compassion and love, and giving open space for people to claim their belonging through their acts.

Migration theology highlights the religion in the work of Caritas, and it shows the compassionate, loving, serving sector of Caritas. However, the act of citizenship shows and challenges the work of Caritas that in order to fulfil religious values, other essential factors such as acts of these vulnerable should not be disregarded.

It is also crucial to acknowledge the limitation of this project. One of the limits is this project focused only the Ukrainian refugees. For instance, there has been discussion in Europe about how Ukrainian refugees might have been treated differently, possibly better than other refugees, meaning that if I have focused on other migrants or other refugees, I might have had different discussion in this thesis. Additionally, this could be interesting to research further on topic such as; how Caritas is implementing their organizational values of seeing all human faces as God's image to migrants and refugees from other poor countries, or what is the situation of religious conversion in Caritas's humanitarian work. This might be interesting to research if Caritas exclusively priorities the people affiliated with their religious group.

There might be documents that have slipped my mind, or failed to locate them, or there might be other documents that I could have found if I could have made different searches, so there

might be information that also within my time frame that might have given different information for this project. Lastly, I relied on all available documents on Caritas websites about their work in Ukraine, and this might mean that they did not provide completely accurate information about the work of Caritas in Ukraine. In addition, they have mentioned about what they did in Ukraine, but there is not information about what they did not do even it was required.

This study covers the self-presentation of Caritas in Ukraine, researcher could study other areas, include more documents and even study from the refugees' sides to understand the implication and effectiveness of Caritas. This can give even broader and more accurate information of how Caritas help refugees.

This research has significant both academic and practical implications. For instance, this project contributes to the field of religion and migration/theology of migration. It is by shedding light into how a faith-based organization like Caritas, hold their religious values and express or practice it into their humanitarian work with refugees. This project might also expand the understanding the concept of *missio Dei*, empathy, compassion and love of neighbor along with acts of citizenship. In addition, this thesis provides an insights for religion based organization to enhance their religious root and apply it in their humanitarian work with migrations by holding both empathy, compassion and acts of citizenship concept.

7.2. Summarising the thesis

Introduction, the first chapter, introduces the project with research question, significance of the study and scope and limitation.

In my chapter two, I presented the background of Caritas, the case of Russia Ukraine war and positionality of author. There I presented, Caritas, a Catholic-rooted humanitarian organization, began with local initiation from Germany and became one of the largest humanitarian organizations in the world. The organizational mission of Caritas is to love and serve the vulnerable. It is by focusing on human needs, dignity, solidarity, etc. By holding this objective, Caritas stands on the frontline to serve the war victims from Ukraine. In addition, the Russia-Ukraine war has led to the largest refugee's crisis in Europe since WWII. Millions of people are displaced and in dire emergency situation.

Chapter three presents the Methodology of this project. In that chapter I introduce content analysis. With the objective of studying self-presentation of Caritas, I selected contents such

as articles, videos, interviews, etc, from Caritas' websites. I have selected webpages from Caritas Internationalis and Caritas Europa for this research. In addition, I also present the expected explicit and implicit religious terms and themes from my materials.

In chapter four, I presented the materials that were collected from Caritas Internationalis and Caritas Europa websites. First part of this chapter presents the Caritas' online materials related to Ukraine crisis. And the second part of this chapter shows the quotes and excerpts from the selected materials. The excerpts and quotations from these materials emphasize religious/theological languages that revolve around themes such as compassion, hope, love, neighbor, mission, an image of God, etc., which were the data that I used in my discussion. Selected materials for data collection were reports, newsletters, videos, articles, etc.

Theoretical Approaches chapter gives an account for two theoretical concepts 'migration theology' and 'acts of citizenship'. These two concepts were selected to examine the work of Caritas from two different angles. The migration theology perspective is to explore the work of Caritas from a religious lens whereas the act of citizenship is to examine my data from the citizenship angle.

The migration theology concept shows the connection between migration and religion, especially Christianity. It also highlights that migration has existed since the beginning of the world and it has a connection with the Christian mission, the mission of restoration and reconciliation of human beings. *missio Dei*, one of the major concepts presented and discussed in this thesis, underscores the cruciality of providing for and supporting the vulnerable. It also emphasizes that *missio Dei*'s concept is to partner with God in his mission in the world to serve these vulnerable migrants. The reason to partake in this mission is to recognize the creation of God, human beings who are an image of God.

The same concept shows that in order to serve these vulnerable, from individuals to organizations, have to extend self-love and include others, sacrifice sometimes if needed, and create equal love for everyone. It is about loving our friends and neighbors as ourselves. This concept also shows that only empathy is not enough, compassion goes beyond to other's feelings. This concept was to examine the work of Caritas from the lens of self-extension, to show love and compassion to the Ukrainian refugees in a time of extreme crisis.

Acts of citizenship was another concept selected in this project to analyse my data. This concept presents citizenship from the belonging concept. Acts of citizenship are learned and must be acted upon to claim one's citizenship. 'Acts' and 'Performativity' are crucial aspects in this concept of acts of citizenship. Acts of citizenship concept, open up as well as challenge the work of Caritas to concern about the acts and performativity of the vulnerable to whom they are serving as image of God. This also shows creating the space is not enough or performing for others is not acts of citizenship.

In my chapter six, I discuss my data, quotes, and excerpts from Caritas' material, with the two major concepts selected in this project. This discussion shows that Caritas is partaker in God's mission to restore and reconcile the vulnerable, it is through the extension of their space and including the stranger and vulnerable as their friend and neighbor. Caritas is instrumentalizing themselves to accomplish their organizational mission. In addition, both Caritas and Ukrainian refugees acts for their citizenship. Caritas in one hand, opening the space for the refugees and giving people opportunity to come and act for their belonging. Ukrainian refugees on other hand might come and claim it. Furthermore, the discussion challenges the work of Caritas that being partaker in God' mission, showing love and compassion to the vulnerable and creating space is not enough, however Caritas has to care by aiming to help and support vulnerable if they are creating the passive recipients, limiting the people to claim their citizenship, etc.

By focusing on intersection of religion and migration, this study sheds light on Caritas' self-presentation in their work with Ukrainian refugees, highlighting the implementation of religious values to achieve their organizational mission. This project became interesting and meaningful to study the work of Caritas, a faith-based organization through the migration theology and acts of citizenship lenses.

Bibliography

- Aljazeera. (2022, May 10). Ukraine civilian deaths 'thousands higher' than official toll: UN. Al Jazeera. Retrieved February 21, 2023, from <https://www.aljazeera.com/news/2022/5/10/russia-ukraine-war-civilian-death-toll-un>
- Andolsen, B. H. (1981, Spring). Agape in Feminist Ethics. *The Journal of Religious Ethics*, 9(1), 69-83. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/40014924>
- Brinkmann, S., & Kvale, S. (2015). *InterViews: learning the craft of qualitative research interviewing* (3rd ed.). Sage.
- Campbell, S., Greenwood, M., Prior, S., Shearer, T., Walkem, K., Young, S., Bywaters, D., & Walker, K. (2020, June 18). Purposive sampling: complex or simple? Research case examples. *Journal Research in Nursing*, 25(8), 652-661. 10.1177/1744987120927206
- Campese, G. C.S. (2012, February 1). The Irruption of Migrants: Theology of Migration in the 21st Century. *Theological Studies*, 73(1), 3-32. <https://doi.org/10.1177/004056391207300101>
- Caritas Australia. (2023). FAQ's - Caritas Australia. Caritas Australia. Retrieved September 20, 2023, from <https://www.caritas.org.au/faq-s/>
- Caritas Europa. (2022, March 2). War in Ukraine. Caritas Europa. Retrieved March 19, 2023, from <https://www.caritas.eu/war-in-ukraine/>
- Caritas Europa. (2022, March 24). Protecting migrants fleeing from Ukraine. Caritas Europa. Retrieved October 05, 2023, from <https://www.caritas.eu/protecting-migrants-fleeing-from-ukraine-to-europe/>
- Caritas Europa. (2022, October 3). Caritas Ukraine interview on BBC World. YouTube. Retrieved February 24, 2023, from https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=ijNPwc9z4JE&ab_channel=CaritasEuropa.
- Caritas Europa. (2022-2023). Caritas Europa Newsletters. Caritas Europa. Retrieved March 20, 2023, from <https://www.caritas.eu/caritas-europa-newsletters/>
- Caritas Europa. (n.d.). Caritas Europa in the media. Caritas Europa. Retrieved March 21, 2023, from <https://www.caritas.eu/in-the-media/>
- Caritas Europa. (n.d.). Caritas Europa. Caritas Europa. Retrieved 2022-2023, from <https://www.caritas.eu>
- Caritas Europa. (n.d.). Code of Ethics. Caritas Europa. Retrieved September 2, 2023, from <https://www.caritas.eu/code-of-ethics/>

Caritas Europa. (n.d.). Who we are. Retrieved February 19, 2023, from <https://www.caritas.eu/who-we-are/>

Caritas Internationalis. (2013, September 25). How Pope Benedict changed charity - Caritas. Caritas Internationalis. Retrieved October 05, 2023, from <https://www.caritas.org/2013/09/how-pope-benedict-changed-charity/>

Caritas Internationalis. (2018, May). Serving out of love - Caritas identity and mission [Brochure from Caritas.org. This was approved by the Dicastery for the Promotion of Integral Human Development.]. Vatican City. <https://www.caritas.org/wordpress/wp-content/uploads/2019/04/ServingOutOfLove.pdf>

Caritas Internationalis. (2019, May 25). Draft Caritas Internationalis Strategic Framework 2019-2023. 1-22. <https://www.caritas.org/wordpress/wp-content/uploads/2020/03/03-en-strategic-framework-2019-2023-21ga.pdf>

Caritas Internationalis. (2021, December). Caritas Internationalis 70th anniversary - Caritas. Caritas Internationalis. Retrieved February 18, 2023, from <https://www.caritas.org/70years/>

Caritas Internationalis. (2022, February 24). "We ask for your solidarity, prayers and support!" - The appeal of the President of CARITAS UKRAINE. YouTube. Retrieved March 18, 2023, from https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=NOHfJeylidU&list=PLuQafgNw_znwljfi7tSwnyJc0aqTEfhJl&index=6&ab_channel=CaritasInternationalis

Caritas Internationalis. (2022, February 26). "Please keep us in your prayers!" - Video message from the Director of Caritas Spes (UKRAINE). YouTube. Retrieved March 20, 2023, from https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=EkSLaMVA2NA&list=PLuQafgNw_znwljfi7tSwnyJc0aqTEfhJl&index=5&ab_channel=CaritasInternationalis

Caritas Internationalis. (2022, March 1). CARITAS IN UKRAINE:"THE SITUATION IS DRAMATIC, BUT WE ARE STAYING TO HELP". YouTube. Retrieved September 17, 2023, from https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=zaUh9Z2mHg8&ab_channel=CaritasInternationalis

Caritas Internationalis. (2022, March 26). VIKTORIA CHRISTIANKO FROM UKRAINE IS NOW A REFUGEE IN POLAND - Caritas. Caritas Internationalis. Retrieved March 18, 2023, from <https://www.caritas.org/2022/03/viktoria-christianko-from-ukraine-is-now-a-refugee-in-poland/>

Caritas Internationalis. (2022, May 23). "We do all these things together!" (Tetiana Stawnychy, President of Caritas Ukraine). YouTube. Retrieved October 5, 2023, from

https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=HwATmloMt1U&list=PLuQafgNw_znwljfi7tSwnyJc0aqTEfhJl&index=24&ab_channel=CaritasInternationalis

Caritas Internationalis. (2022, November 24). "Please support Ukraine, especially in winter" (Tetiana Stawnychy, President of Caritas UKRAINE). YouTube. Retrieved March 20, 2023, from https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=-Ne8m3TdwKw&ab_channel=CaritasInternationalis

Caritas Internationalis. (2023, April 11). Easter wishes from CARITAS INTERNATIONALIS! YouTube. Retrieved October 5, 2023, from https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=64yL9CxAljI&list=PLuQafgNw_znwljfi7tSwnyJc0aqTEfhJl&index=21&ab_channel=CaritasInternationalis

Caritas Internationalis. (2023, February 14). Tetiana video message One Year. YouTube. Retrieved October 5, 2023, from https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=VUd79bD51U4&t=165s&ab_channel=CaritasInternationalis

Caritas Internationalis. (2023, February 22). Press conference on Caritas work and humanitarian situation in Ukraine. YouTube. Retrieved March 18, 2023, from <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=elyAxWvxT1k>

Caritas Internationalis. (2023, November 24). "Nothing can stop our mission!" (Father Vyacheslav Grynevych Director of Caritas Spes). YouTube. Retrieved October 5, 2023, from https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=UzmeNq3C8nY&list=PLuQafgNw_znwljfi7tSwnyJc0aqTEfhJl&index=32&ab_channel=CaritasInternationalis

Caritas Internationalis. (n.d.). Caritas - Germany. Caritas Internationalis. Retrieved February 18, 2023, from <https://www.caritas.org/where-caritas-work/europe/germany/>

Caritas Internationalis. (n.d.). Caritas and Catholic Social Teaching. Caritas Internationalis. Retrieved October 28, 2023, from <https://www.caritas.org/who-we-are/catholic-social-teaching/>

Caritas Internationalis. (n.d.). Caritas is Church. Caritas Internationalis. Retrieved March 18, 2023, from <https://www.caritas.org/who-we-are/caritas-is-church/>

Caritas Internationalis. (n.d.). Caritas. Caritas.org. Retrieved 2022-2023, from <https://www.caritas.org>

Caritas Internationalis. (n.d.). Caritas's commitment. Retrieved February 22, 2023, from <https://www.caritas.org/who-we-are/ethics/>

Caritas Internationalis. (n.d.). Crisis In Ukraine. Caritas Internationalis. Retrieved March 18, 2023, from <https://www.caritas.org/what-we-do/conflicts-and-disasters/crisis-in-ukraine/>

Caritas Internationalis. (n.d.). Finance - Caritas. Caritas Internationalis. Retrieved February 20, 2023, from <https://www.caritas.org/who-we-are/finance/>

Caritas Internationalis. (n.d.). History - Caritas. Caritas Internationalis. Retrieved February 18, 2023, from <https://www.caritas.org/who-we-are/history/>

Caritas Internationalis. (n.d.). Love across borders: A Day in the life of Caritas [Caritas Brochure from their official website]. Caritas Internationalis.

Caritas Internationalis. (n.d.). Our Mission. Caritas.org. Retrieved March 15, 2023, from <https://www.caritas.org/who-we-are/mission/>

Caritas Internationalis. (n.d.). Share the Journey - Caritas. Caritas Internationalis. Retrieved November 10, 2023, from <https://www.caritas.org/share-the-journey/>

Caritas Internationalis. (n.d.). We are Caritas [Caritas Brochure from their official website]. Caritas Internationalis. <https://www.caritas.org/wordpress/wp-content/uploads/2017/06/WeAreCaritas.pdf>

Caritas Internationalis. (n.d.). Who we are. Retrieved February 18, 2023, from <https://www.caritas.org/who-we-are/>

Caritas. Caritas Internationalis. Retrieved March 17, 2023, from <https://www.caritas.org/2022/05/caritas-united-to-make-a-difference-one-person-at-a-time-for-victims-of-the-ukraine-conflict/>

CReAM - Centre for Research and Analysis of Migration. (2023, February 14). Current migration flows from Ukraine. cream-migration.org. Retrieved February 20, 2023, from <https://cream-migration.org/ukraine-detail.htm?article=3573>

Drisko, J. W., & Maschi, T. (2015). Introduction. In *Content Analysis* (pp. 1-20). Oxford University Press. <https://doi.org/10.1093/acprof:oso/9780190215491.003.0001>

Durand, J.-P. (n.d.). Justice and Charity: the Apostolic diakonia and humanitarian service of the Caritas Internationalis confederation. In Ó. A. Rodríguez Maradiaga (Ed.), *Caritas: love received and given* (pp. 87-101). Caritas Internationalis. <https://www.caritas.org/who-we-are/publications-and-resources/>

Groody, D. G. (2009). Crossing the divide: Foundations of a theology of migration and refugees. *Theological Studies*, 70(3), 638-667.

Isin, E. F. (2008). *Acts of citizenship*. Bloomsbury Publishing.

Kjellin, K. H. (2019). "We can teach Swedes a lot!": Experiences of in/hospitality, space making, and the prospects of altered guest–host relations among migrant and non-migrant Christians in the Church of Sweden. In *Contested Hospitalities in a Time of Migration* (pp. 97-112). Routledge.

- Lombardi, C. (2022, August 23). Six months of war in Ukraine - Caritas. Caritas Internationalis. Retrieved March 18, 2023, from <https://www.caritas.org/2022/08/six-months-of-war-in-ukraine/>
- Manna Worldwide. (2022). MANNA Worldwide: Our mission to rescue children out of poverty. MANNA Worldwide. Retrieved February 18, 2023, from <https://mannaworldwide.com/our-mission>
- Margesson, R., & Mix, D. E. (2022, November 23). Humanitarian and Refugee Crisis in Ukraine. Congressional Research Service. Retrieved February 20, 2023, from <https://crsreports.congress.gov/product/pdf/IN/IN11882#:~:text=Russia's%20war%20against%20Ukraine%20has,also%20exacerbated%20global%20food%20insecurity.>
- McCloskey, S. (2022). The War in Ukraine Has Revealed a Hierarchy of Victims | Development Education Review. Development Education Review |. Retrieved February 15, 2023, from <https://www.developmenteducationreview.com/issue/issue-34/war-ukraine-has-revealed-hierarchy-victims>
- Millare, M. K. (2022, July 19). CARITAS MOVING TOWARDS NEXT PHASE OF HUMANITARIAN RESPONSE TO SUPPORT VICTIMS OF WAR IN UKRAINE - Caritas. Caritas Internationalis. Retrieved March 17, 2023, from <https://www.caritas.org/2022/07/caritas-moving-towards-next-phase-of-humanitarian-response-to-support-victims-of-war-in-ukraine/>
- Millare, M. K. (2023, February 20). "The kids are homesick and so am I," says the teacher of the Ukrainian adaptation club run by Caritas - Caritas. Caritas. Retrieved March 18, 2023, from <https://www.caritas.org/2023/02/the-kids-are-homesick/>
- Nelson, C., & Woods Jr., R. H. (2011). Content Analysis. In *The Routledge Handbook of Research Methods in the Study of Religion* (pp. 109-121). Routledge.
- Ociepa-Kicińska, E., & Gorzałczyńska-Koczkodaj, M. (2022). Forms of Aid Provided to Refugees of the 2022 Russia–Ukraine War: The Case of Poland. *International journal of environmental research and public health*, 19(2), 7085. doi.org/10.3390/ijerph19127085
- Piccini, D. (2023, February 21). ONE YEAR ON: OVER 5 MILLION PEOPLE ASSISTED BY CARITAS SINCE OUTBREAK OF WAR IN UKRAINE - Caritas. Caritas Internationalis. Retrieved March 18, 2023, from <https://www.caritas.org/2023/02/one-year-on-over-5-million-people-assisted-by-caritas-since-outbreak-of-war-in-ukraine/>
- Piccini, D. (2023, February 24). One year of war in Ukraine. People of the dungeon - Caritas. Caritas Internationalis. Retrieved March 10, 2023, from <https://www.caritas.org/2023/02/one-year-of-war-in-ukraine-people-of-the-dungeon/>

- Piccini, D. (2023, February 24). One year of war in Ukraine. Today Caritas prays the Stations of the Cross - Caritas. Caritas Internationalis. Retrieved March 18, 2023, from <https://www.caritas.org/2023/02/one-year-of-war-in-ukraine-today-caritas-prays-the-stations-of-the-cross/>
- Piccini, D. (2023, September 13). "Free to Choose whether to Migrate or to Stay" - Caritas. Caritas Internationalis. Retrieved November 10, 2023, from <https://www.caritas.org/2023/09/free-to-choose-whether-to-migrate-or-to-stay/>
- Rainsford, S. (2023, February 19). Ukraine War: 'Everyone is kind, but the fact is, we're not home'. BBC. Retrieved February 21, 2023, from <https://www.bbc.com/news/world-europe-64678844>
- Reeder, J. P. (2016). Empathy, Compassion, and Love of Neighbor. In *Love and Christian Ethics* (F. V. Simmons & B. C. Sorrells ed., pp. 131-154). Georgetown University Press. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/j.ctt1jktq08.12>
- Rodríguez Maradiaga, Ó. A. (n.d.). Caritas: love received and given (Ó. A. Rodríguez Maradiaga, Ed.). In (pp. 5-108). Caritas Internationalis. Retrieved March 13, 2023, from <https://www.caritas.org/who-we-are/publications-and-resources/>
- SCIAF. (2022, November 3). Twitter. Retrieved October 3, 2023, from <https://twitter.com/sciaf/status/1588063698454716416>
- SCIAF. (2022, October 13). We learn how efforts are helping people of Ukraine. [sciaf.org.uk](https://www.sciaf.org.uk). Retrieved October 03, 2023, from <https://www.sciaf.org.uk/about-us/news/436-we-learn-how-efforts-are-helping-people-of>
- Soares, D. R., Lotter, G., & van der Merwe, S. J. (2017). The missio Dei as context for a ministry to refugee. In *die Skriflig*, 51(1), 1-7.
- Statista Research Department. (2023, September 12). Ukraine civilian war casualties 2023. Statista. Retrieved October 3, 2023, from <https://www.statista.com/statistics/1293492/ukraine-war-casualties/>
- The Lexham English Bible. (2023). The Lexham English Bible. Lexham Press.
- UNHCR Data Portal. (2023, November 7). Ukraine Refugee Situation. UNHCR Data Portal. Retrieved November 10, 2023, from <https://data2.unhcr.org/en/situations/ukraine>
- USA for UNHCR. (2023). Ukraine Refugee Crisis: Aid, Statistics and News. USA for UNHCR. Retrieved September 21, 2023, from <https://www.unrefugees.org/emergencies/ukraine/>
- Wyller, T. (2019). 'Something More': The Citizenship Performativity of Religiously Founded Refugee Projects. In *Refugee protection and civil society in Europe* (pp. 269-290).