Studien und Texte zu Antike und Christentum Studies and Texts in Antiquity and Christianity

Herausgeber/Editors

Liv Ingeborg Lied (Oslo) \cdot Christoph Markschies (Berlin) Martin Wallraff (München) \cdot Christian Wildberg (Pittsburgh)

Beirat/Advisory Board
Peter Brown (Princeton) · Susanna Elm (Berkeley)
Johannes Hahn (Münster) · Emanuela Prinzivalli (Rom)
Jörg Rüpke (Erfurt)

134



The Nag Hammadi Codices as Monastic Books

Edited by Hugo Lundhaug and Christian H.Bull

Mohr Siebeck

Hugo Lundhaug, born 1970; 2000 Cand. philol. from the University of Oslo; 2007 Dr. art. in the History of Religions from the University of Bergen; Professor of Theology (Biblical Reception and Early Christian Literature) at the University of Oslo, Faculty of Theology.

orcid.org/0000-0003-4643-7198

Christian H. Bull, born 1978; 2003 Cand. philol. from the University of Bergen; 2014 Dr. art. in the History of Religions from the University of Bergen; Associate Professor of the History of Religions at the University of Bergen, Department of Archaeology, History, Cultural Studies and Religion. orcid.org/0000-0003-0054-8052

ISBN 978-3-16-162232-8/eISBN 978-3-16-162233-5 DOI 10.1628/978-3-16-162233-5

ISSN 1436-3003/eISSN 2568-7433 (Studien und Texte zu Antike und Christentum)

The Deutsche Nationalbibliothek lists this publication in the Deutsche Nationalbibliographie; detailed bibliographic data are available at https://dnb.de.

Published by Mohr Siebeck Tübingen, Germany, 2023. www.mohrsiebeck.com

© Hugo Lundhaug, Christian H. Bull (ed.); chapter: respective author.

This work is licensed under the license "Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International" (CC BY-NC-ND 4.0). A complete version of the license text can be found at: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/. Any use not covered by the above license is prohibited and illegal without the permission of the publisher.

The book was printed on non-aging paper and bound by Laupp & Göbel in Gomaringen.

Printed in Germany.

Table of Contents

Acknowledgements	V
Abbreviations	X
Christian H. Bull and Hugo Lundhaug Monastic Readings of the Nag Hammadi Codices	1
Lance Jenott Peter's Letter to Philip: Textual Fluidity in a New Testament Apocryphon	7
Ingvild Sælid Gilhus Ascetic Readings in Codex II from Nag Hammadi6	7
René Falkenberg The "Single Ones" in the Gospel of Thomas: A Monastic Perspective 8	7
André Gagné The Gospel of Thomas in a Monastic Context: Reading the Text as a Spiritual Exercise	21
Hugo Lundhaug "This is the Teaching of the Perfect Ones": The Book of Thomas and Early Egyptian Monasticism	5
Kristine Toft Rosland "Not as Moses said" Revisited: Christ as Interpreter of Scripture in the Apocryphon of John	7
Kimberley A. Fowler Eschatology in Nag Hammadi Codex II: A Monastic Reading of the Hypostasis of the Archons (NHC II,4) and On the Origin of the World (NHC II 5)	5

Paul Linjamaa	
Why Monks Would Have Read the <i>Tripartite Tractate</i> :	222
A New Look at the Codicology of Nag Hammadi Codex I	223
Tilde Bak Halvgaard	
The Thunder: Perfect Mind and the Notion of Epinoia	
in Early Christianity	255
Dylan M. Burns	
The Nag Hammadi Codices and Graeco-Egyptian Magical	
and Occult Literature	279
Christian Askeland	
Translation Technique in the Coptic Version	
of Plato's Republic (NHC VI,5)	317
Christian H. Bull	
Plato in Upper Egypt: Greek Philosophy and Monastic Origenism	
in the Coptic Excerpt from Plato's Republic (NHC VI,5)	333
Contributors	367
Control to thousand the control to th	507
Index of Modern Authors	
Index of Subjects	376

"This is the Teaching of the Perfect Ones": The *Book of Thomas* and Early Egyptian Monasticism*

Hugo Lundhaug

In the Book of Thomas, preserved to us as the last of seven texts in Nag Hammadi Codex II, Jesus urges Thomas and the rest of his apostles to listen to him, for he has important things to tell. Indeed, he lets them know that it is nothing less than "the teaching of the perfect ones" (τες Βω ΝΝΤελειος), which is to be understood as required knowledge in order to achieve perfection. But who exactly are these perfect ones, and what do the apostles, and others looking to attain perfection, need to know? As it turns out, Jesus sets out to explain to his apostles how they may free themselves from their captivity to bodily passions and attain rest among the holy ones in heaven – in short, he will provide them with ascetic instruction. The Book of Thomas is a fascinating discourse on the challenges and goals of the ascetic life that, in stark contrast to the Gospel of Thomas found in the same codex, has received surprisingly scant attention in scholarship, especially in recent years after the publication of the English, French, and German critical editions.² On the one hand, this lack of attention may be ascribed to the fact that it has no claim to having been composed as early as the Gospel of Thomas, and on the other hand, unlike another famous text in this codex, the Apocryphon of John, the text does not conform well to many of the cliches associated with the category of "Gnosticism," nor does it contain any reference to a "Gnostic myth." There is good reason, however, to return to this text armed with different scholarly perspectives, as its ascetic focus certainly appears to lend itself well to a reading in light of its manuscript

^{*} This contribution was written under the aegis of the research project APOCRYPHA, funded by the European Union's Horizon 2020 research and innovation programme under grant agreement no. 865971 (ERC Consolidator Grant), and hosted by the University of Oslo, Faculty of Theology.

¹ Book Thom. 140.10–11 (Coptic text ed. Bentley Layton, and trans. John D. Turner. "The Book of Thomas the Contender," in Nag Hammadi Codex II,2–7 Together with XIII,2*, Brit. Lib. Or. 4926(1), and P. Oxy. 1, 654, 655 [ed. Bentley Layton; 2 vols.; NHS 20–21; Leiden: Brill, 1989], 2:186). All translations of Coptic texts are my own unless otherwise stated.

² Raymond Kuntzmann, *Le Livre de Thomas (NH II,7): Texte établi et présenté* (BCNH.T 16; Québec: Les Presses de l'Université Laval, 1986); Hans-Martin Schenke, *Das Thomas-Buch (Nag-Hammadi-Codex II,7): Neu herausgegeben, übersetzt und erklärt* (TUGAL 138; Berlin: Akademie Verlag, 1989); Layton and Turner, "Book of Thomas the Contender."

context, i.e., a reading from the point of view of the monastics who copied and read the Coptic text as we have it at the end of Nag Hammadi Codex II.³ Not in order to argue that the *Book of Thomas* has necessarily influenced monastic literature, but in order to understand how, and why, the monastics who owned this copy of the text may have read it.

The *Book of Thomas* is probably one of those Nag Hammadi texts that is easiest to imagine being read by monks. Certainly, its heavy ascetic emphasis, not least its strong stance against women and sexuality, with its exclamation of "Woe unto you who love intimacy (ςγνηθοία) with womankind (τημητεριμό) and its polluted intercourse (ποσφατίο νημάζε όττοοφ)," makes it highly amenable to such a context. But it is not simply the general ascetic stance of the text that brings it into the orbit of late-antique Egyptian monasticism. As we shall see, numerous motifs, metaphors, biblical allusions, and turns of phrase found in it are paralleled in monastic literature, making the inclusion of the *Book of Thomas* in an early monastic library in Upper Egypt, even a Pachomian one, easily understandable.

Most previous scholarship on the *Book of Thomas* has had a rather different perspective, focusing primarily on the text's authorship, sources, and redaction. Hans-Martin Schenke, for instance, characterized the *Book of Thomas* as a collection of sayings gathered around the keyword of light/fire, which was only secondarily, and artificially, forced into the framework of a dialogue between Jesus and Thomas,⁵ and he presented a highly imaginative suggestion as to how it might have developed from an original composition, which he proposed may have been a pseudepigraphical *Epistle of James the Contender*.⁶ A similarly creative hypothesis has been presented by John Turner. Suggesting that the text

³ On the monastic provenance of the Nag Hammadi Codices and the interests of the monastics who copied and read them, see esp. Hugo Lundhaug and Lance Jenott, *The Monastic Origins of the Nag Hammadi Codices* (STAC 97; Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2015) and the introduction to the present volume.

⁴ Book Thom. 144.8-10 (Layton and Turner, "Book of Thomas the Contender," 200).

⁵ Hans-Martin Schenke, "Sprachliche und exegetische Probleme in den beiden letzten Schriften des Codex II von Nag Hammadi," *OLZ* 70 (1975): 9; cf. Martin Krause, "The Christianization of Gnostic Texts," in *The New Testament and Gnosis: Essays in Honour of Robert McL. Wilson* (ed. Alaistair H. B. Logan and Alexander J. M. Wedderburn; Edinburgh: T&T Clark, 1983), 191, also describing the dialogue as artificial.

⁶ See Hans-Martin Schenke, "The Book of Thomas (NHC II,7): A Revision of a Pseudepigraphical Epistle of Jacob the Contender," in *The New Testament and Gnosis: Essays in Honour of Robert McL. Wilson* (ed. Alaistair H. B. Logan and Alexander J. M. Wedderburn; Edinburgh: T&T Clark, 1983), 213–28. Cf. also Jean Doresse, *The Secret Books of the Egyptian Gnostics: An Introduction to the Gnostic Coptic Manuscripts Discovered at Chenoboskion: With an English Translation and Critical Evaluation of the Gospel According to Thomas* (trans. Leonard Johnston; London: Hollis & Carter, 1960), 226, 336, who speculated that the text might perhaps be identical with the *Gospel of Matthias* referred to by Origen and Eusebius, or the *Traditions of Matthias* mentioned by Clement of Alexandria.

in its current form can be said to consist of two rather distinct parts, the first being a *dialogue* between Thomas and Jesus, with questions and answers, and the second part consisting of a *monologue* by Jesus with warnings and beatitudes, Turner presents an elaborate redactional theory, the gist of which is that these two parts originally existed separately before being combined into what now constitutes the *Book of Thomas* as it has been preserved to us at the end of Nag Hammadi Codex II.⁷

Whether these redactional theories come close to actual historical reality is, however, impossible to know, as the single surviving witness cannot provide us with any answers to this question. Nor does it furnish us with any solid indications as to the date of authorship of the text's hypothetical constituent parts or the time when it was brought into a form close to the present one. What we may say with greater certainty is that the transmission of the text up to its presently preserved version was probably fluid, although to what degree we do not know. Much may have changed from its initial composition, from small details to larger chunks of text added or subtracted, but without additional attestation we are left largely in the dark as to the exact nature of such changes. We may thus do well to stick to what we do know, namely that someone in the

⁷ John D. Turner, *The Book of Thomas the Contender from Codex II of the Cairo Gnostic Library from Nag Hammadi (CG II,7): The Coptic Text with Translation, Introduction and Commentary* (SBLDS 23; Missoula, MT: Scholars Press, 1975), 215–39.

⁸ Cf. Hugo Lundhaug and Liv Ingeborg Lied, "Studying Snapshots: On Manuscript Culture, Textual Fluidity, and New Philology," in Snapshots of Evolving Traditions: Jewish and Christian Manuscript Culture, Textual Fluidity, and New Philology (ed. Liv Ingeborg Lied and Hugo Lundhaug; TUGAL 175; Berlin: De Gruyter, 2017), 1-19; Hugo Lundhaug, "An Illusion of Textual Stability: Textual Fluidity, New Philology, and the Nag Hammadi Codices," in Snapshots of Evolving Traditions: Jewish and Christian Manuscript Culture, Textual Fluidity, and New Philology (ed. Liv Ingeborg Lied and Hugo Lundhaug; TUGAL 175; Berlin: De Gruyter, 2017), 20-54; idem, "Textual Fluidity and Post-Nicene Rewriting in the Nag Hammadi Codices," in Nag Hammadi à 70 ans: Qu'avons- nous appris? Colloque international, Québec, Université Laval, 29-31 mai 2015 (ed. Eric Crégheur, Louis Painchaud, and Tuomas Rasimus; BCNH.É 10; Leuven: Peeters, 2019), 47-67; idem, "The Fluid Transmission of Apocrypha in Egyptian Monasteries," in Coptic Literature in Context (4th-13th cent.): Cultural Landscape, Literary Production and Manuscript Archaeology (ed. Paola Buzi; PaST Percorsi di Archeologia 5; Rome: Edizioni Quasar, 2020), 213-27; Lance Jenott, "Reading Variants in James and the Apocalypse of James: A Perspective from New Philology," in Snapshots of Evolving Traditions: Jewish and Christian Manuscript Culture, Textual Fluidity, and New Philology (ed. Liv Ingeborg Lied and Hugo Lundhaug; TUGAL 175; Berlin: De Gruyter, 2017), 55-84; Stephen Emmel, "Religious Tradition, Textual Transmission, and the Nag Hammadi Codices," in The Nag Hammadi Library After Fifty Years: Proceedings of the 1995 Society of Biblical Literature Commemoration (ed. John D. Turner and Anne McGuire; NHMS 44; Leiden: Brill, 1997), 34-43.

late fourth or early fifth century copied this Coptic text into this particular codex, presumably with the intention that someone should read it.⁹

1. Quest for Perfection

Rather than focusing on the compositional and redactional history of the text, I will instead concentrate on its likely reception in the community represented by the scribe of the codex, who after having copied the end of the *Book of Thomas*, added a colophon asking the readers to "Remember me too, my brothers, [in] your prayers" (αριπαμέσγε 20 νασνης ε[ν]νετνπροσέγχη), before adding the final blessing "Peace to the holy ones and the spiritual ones" (ε[ι]ρηνη τοις αποις μινιπρογματικός). 10 Those intended readers, who were almost certainly monks, and most likely Pachomian monks, 11 would not have been confronted with an earlier version of the text, but with the text as we have it in Codex II as its seventh and final text, with its current dialogue frame and paratextual matter, followed by the abovementioned scribal colophon, and carrying the title the *Book of Thomas*.

When we look closer at the paratextual frame of the *Book of Thomas* in Codex II we find that this title is closely followed by what may perhaps be another reference to the scribe of the codex, but which is more likely a reference to the apostle Matthias, ¹² the pseudepigraphical scribe of the dialogue between Jesus and his apostles. At the beginning of the *Book of Thomas* we are told that it was Matthias (μαθαίας) who wrote down this text, having listened to Jesus and Thomas speaking with each other. ¹³ In the line directly following the title at the end of the text, we read that "The athlete writes to the perfect ones" (παθλητής εφεξαϊ κιντέλειος). That this "athlete" is not to be equated with Thomas, despite the common designation of the text in English-language

⁹ On the date of the Nag Hammadi Codices, see now Hugo Lundhaug, "Dating and Contextualising the Nag Hammadi Codices and Their Texts: A Multi-Methodological Approach Including New Radiocarbon Evidence," in *Texts in Context: Essays on Dating and Contextualising Christian Writings of the Second and Early Third Century* (ed. Joseph Verheyden, Jens Schröter, and Tobias Nicklas; BETL 319; Leuven: Peeters, 2021), 117–42.

¹⁰ Book Thom. 145.20–23 (Layton and Turner, "Book of Thomas the Contender," 204).

¹¹ Lundhaug and Jenott, *Monastic Origins*; Lundhaug and Jenott, "Production, Distribution and Ownership of Books in the Monasteries of Upper Egypt: The Evidence of the Nag Hammadi Colophons," in *Monastic Education in Late Antiquity: The Transformation of Classical Paideia* (ed. Lillian Larsen and Samuel Rubenson; Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2018), 306–25.

¹² This character should probably be identified with the apostle who is described in Acts 1:23–26 as having taken Judas' place among the twelve.

¹³ Book Thom. 138.1–4 (Layton and Turner, "Book of Thomas the Contender," 180).

scholarship as the *Book of Thomas the Contender*,¹⁴ was already pointed out by Hans-Martin Schenke in 1975.¹⁵ That the two parts of the title should be read separately is indeed made clear by the text itself, when it states that it was Matthias who wrote down Thomas' dialogue with Jesus. It is thus Matthias who "writes to the perfect ones," and not Thomas.¹⁶ For monastic readers of the *Book of Thomas*, Matthias the athlete is also an ideal identification figure, as they listen to Jesus' ascetic teachings through him. That the entire text is written specifically to those who are perfect is also something that is made clear elsewhere in the text, where Jesus states that the reason why it is important for him to speak with his disciples is the fact that he is telling them "the teaching of the perfect ones" (Τεσβο νῶτελειος).¹⁷ And in order to become perfect, he says, they will have to "observe" (Δρεξ) these teachings.¹⁸ If they do not do so, Jesus warns, they will be called "ignorant" (Δτοβο).¹⁹ Jesus also chastises those who lack such knowledge, exclaiming: "Woe unto you, for you have not received the teaching (Τσβο)!"²⁰

¹⁴ E.g., Turner, *Book of Thomas the Contender*; idem, "The Book of Thomas the Contender (II,7): Introduction and Translation." Pages 199–207 in *The Nag Hammadi Library in English* (ed. James M. Robinson; 3rd rev. ed.; San Francisco: HarperSanFrancisco, 1990), 199–207; Layton and Turner, "Book of Thomas the Contender"; Jesse Sell, *The Knowledge of the Truth – Two Doctrines:* The Book of Thomas the Contender (*CG II,7*) and the False Teachers in the Pastoral Epistles (EUS Series 23, Theology 194; Frankfurt am Main: Lang, 1982).

¹⁵ Schenke, "Sprachliche und exegetische Probleme," 12; cf. also Paul-Hubert Poirier, "The Writings Ascribed to Thomas and the Thomas Tradition," in *The Nag Hammadi Library After Fifty Years: Proceedings of the 1995 Society of Biblical Literature Commemoration* (ed. John D. Turner and Anne McGuire; NHMS 44; Leiden: Brill, 1997), 296 n. 6, stating that this common translation of the title "is a mistranslation and should be avoided."

¹⁶ Cf. Schenke, "Sprachliche und exegetische Probleme," 11. Schenke, however, would later go on to argue that the contender in question was originally Jacob. See Schenke, "Book of Thomas," 213–28. If we simply read the text as it has been preserved, however, the contender in question must be Matthias, or possibly the scribe of this codex or an earlier codex in the chain of transmission.

¹⁷ Book Thom. 140.10–11 (Layton and Turner, "Book of Thomas the Contender," 186).

¹⁸ Book Thom. 140.11–12 (Layton and Turner, "Book of Thomas the Contender," 186); cf. 1 Tim 5:21.

¹⁹ Book Thom. 140.13 (Layton and Turner, "Book of Thomas the Contender," 186).

²⁰ Book Thom. 144.37–38 (Layton and Turner, "Book of Thomas the Contender," 202).

²¹ Book Thom. 145.18–19 (Layton and Turner, "Book of Thomas the Contender," 204).

refers to in the colophon as his "brothers" (CNHY) and "the holy ones and the spiritual ones" (ΤΟΙC ΑΓΙΟΙC ΜΙΝΙΠΙΝΕΥΜΑΤΙΚΟC), in this category.²² These are common designations used of monks in the Pachomian writings, where references to perfect monks, and to monks on their way to attaining perfection, abound.²³ As we shall see, perfection and its attainment is connected to the notion of perfect knowledge in the *Book of Thomas* and Pachomian literature alike.

2. Knowledge and Ignorance

A pervasive feature of the *Book of Thomas* is its emphasis on the necessity for the righteous Christian ascetic of acquiring knowledge in order to enable him to avoid the traps and stumbling blocks that may hinder his progress towards eternal rest in the heavenly realms. As the risen Jesus states in one of his beatitudes at the end of the text, "Blessed are you who have foreknowledge of the stumbling blocks (NCKANAANON) and who flee before the unnatural things (אַבאאסדףוסא)."²⁴ The importance of this beatitude is indicated by the fact that it recalls a statement in Jesus' opening address to Thomas, where he proclaims that Thomas has "seen what is hidden from men (πεθηπ εβολ επρρωμε), namely what they stumble against in ignorance (ετογχιχροπ εροψ εκισεσοογκ an)."25 How has Thomas gained this ability to detect what ignorant people stumble against? We are told that the key is to know the true identity of Christ, and that Thomas has acquired this by knowing himself, since, after all, he is called Jesus' brother. 26 He will also be called "he who knows himself" (πρεγσοογιε ερογ μμιν μμογ).²⁷ This is important, for we are told that "he who has known himself has also already acquired knowledge of the depth of everything" (пентачсоушич де оуаатч ачоуш он ечхісооуне апвавос йптнрч).²⁸ While it was common in the early phases of research on the Nag Hammadi texts to connect such statements on the importance of knowledge and self-knowledge to "Gnosticism," I aim to show how the treatment of knowledge in the Book of Thomas is by no means out of place in the context

²² Book Thom. 145.20–23 (Layton and Turner, "Book of Thomas the Contender," 204).

 $^{^{23}}$ SBo 3, 27, 29, 60, 79, 82, 107, 128, 134, 142, 193, 194, 199, 202, 204, 205; G^1 2, 32, 54, 98, 91, 99, 106, 118, 120, 126, 129, 136; Hors., *Test.* 20; cf. Lundhaug and Jenott, *Monastic Origins*, 185–89.

²⁴ Book Thom. 145.1–3 (Layton and Turner, "Book of Thomas the Contender," 202).

²⁵ Book Thom. 138.19–21 (Layton and Turner, "Book of Thomas the Contender," 180).

²⁶ Book Thom. 138.10. Layton and Turner, "Book of Thomas the Contender," 180, here erroneously has сеньносте, while the manuscript reads сеносте. Kuntzmann, Le Livre de Thomas, 26, and Schenke, Das Thomas-Buch, 24, both have the correct reading.

²⁷ Book Thom. 138.15–16 (Layton and Turner, "Book of Thomas the Contender," 180).

²⁸ Book Thom. 138.17–18 (Layton and Turner, "Book of Thomas the Contender," 180).

where Nag Hammadi Codex II was most likely produced and used. As we shall see, it has especially close parallels in monastic writings of the fourth and fifth centuries, making recourse to the category of "Gnosticism" unnecessary for the interpretation of the text as it appears in this codex.²⁹

According to the Bohairic *Life of Pachomius*, for instance, Apa Palamon teaches Pachomius early on in his career that getting to know oneself is at the heart of the monastic life, and he speaks to him about the time it takes "until you get to know yourself" (ωραντεκοογωνκ μπιν μποκ). ³⁰ Palamon tells Pachomius in no uncertain terms that in order to understand "the measure of the monastic life" (πωι $\bar{\kappa}$ -ματτμογναχος), he first has to go away and examine himself. ³¹ Pachomius too, in one of his letters (Letter 3), speaks of those who did not follow Joshua's commands in the Old Testament as "stupid men" (ἄνθρωποι ἄφρονες) who were ignorant of "the place of wealth and the dwelling place of wisdom," and who "called light darkness"; but most importantly, "they did not find their own heart," despite the fact that Joshua had given them "directives by which they should walk."

Jesus in the *Book of Thomas* does not suffer fools lightly, going so far as to state that "it is impossible for a wise man to dwell with a fool" (μῆσρομ ῆτεογρμῆςμτ ογως μῆογεος),³³ a statement that also serves as an answer to one of the questions posed by Thomas, namely: "Is it profitable for us, Lord, to rest ourselves amongst our own?" (ερνοιρε ναν παοθία απτον πμον εννετένουν νε)³⁴ This question, which is one that would doubtlessly have resonated with the Upper Egyptian monastic owners of Codex II, is answered by

²⁹ For general critiques of the use of "Gnosticism" as a heuristic category, see Michael A. Williams, *Rethinking "Gnosticism": An Argument for Dismantling a Dubious Category* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1996); idem, "Was There a Gnostic Religion? Strategies for a Clearer Analysis," in *Was There a Gnostic Religion?* (ed. Antti Marjanen; Publications of the Finnish Exegetical Society 87; Helsinki: Finnish Exegetical Society, 2005), 55–79; Karen L. King, *What is Gnosticism?* (Cambridge, MA: Belknap Press/Harvard University Press, 2003).

³⁰ SBo 10; Louis-Théophile Lefort, ed., *S. Pachomii Vita Bohairice Scripta* (CSCO 89, Scriptores Coptici 7; Leuven: Durbecq, 1953), 8. Armand Veilleux, a monk himself, found this to be "a beautiful expression of the aim of monastic *ascesis*" (Armand Veilleux, *Pachomian Koinonia: The Lives, Rules, and Other Writings of Saint Pachomius and His Disciples* [3 vols.; CS 45–47; Kalamazoo, MI: Cistercian Publications, 1980–82], 1:268 [SBo 10 n. 2]).

³¹ SBo 10: йтекфе нак йтекердокінадін йнок йфорп (Lefort, *Vita Bohairice Scripta*, 9).

³² Pachomius, *Letter* 3.8; cf. Num 14:6; Isa 5:20 (Hans Quecke, *Die Briefe Pachoms: Griechischer Text der Handschrift W. 145 der Chester Beatty Library* [Textus Patristici et Liturgici 2; Regensburg: Friedrich Pustet, 1975], 103; trans. Veilleux, *Pachomian Koinonia*, 3:56).

³³ Book Thom. 140.13–14 (Layton and Turner, "Book of Thomas the Contender," 186).

³⁴ Book Thom. 141.3–4 (Layton and Turner, "Book of Thomas the Contender," 190).

Jesus in the affirmative, and thus serves nicely to buttress a communal monastic lifestyle – away from common, ignorant, people, but together with other good people on their way to, or having already attained, a state of perfection.

The "teaching of the perfect ones" given by Jesus to Thomas was also intended for further distribution by the apostles and their successors through preaching. As Jesus puts it, those who seek the truth from a wise person "will provide wings (20NTN2) for himself in order to fly, fleeing from the desire (τεπιθγμιλ) that burns the spirits of men (μπιλ μπρωμε). And he will provide wings for himself, fleeing from every visible spirit (πνα κιμ ετογους εβολ)."35 By gaining true knowledge, the true Christian ascetic also comes to know the difference between the good and the bad, which is the opposite of the fool, who sees no distinction between these things.³⁶ Likewise it is said about the good monks in the tenth Sahidic *Life* that "those who shall purify their hearts greatly from every evil thought shall discern between good and evil."³⁷ The use of the imagery of acquiring wings is also notable. The true Christian ascetic will acquire wings by gaining knowledge of the truth by way of true teaching. While this imagery may recall the wings of the soul as described by Plato,³⁸ acquiring wings could be also be seen as an elegantly evocative way for the Book of Thomas to describe both the process and gains of becoming like the angels, which in this context is equal to becoming a perfect monk.³⁹ Or, as Pachomius states in the Bohairic Life, if someone is "zealous for perfection ... he will live in the purity of the angels. Then the Holy Spirit will dwell in him and sanctify him; he will go and become a monk and serve the Lord in all purity and uprightness."40

³⁵ Book Thom. 140.1–5 (Layton and Turner, "Book of Thomas the Contender," 186).

³⁶ Book Thom. 140.15–16 (Layton and Turner, "Book of Thomas the Contender," 186, 188); cf. Louis Painchaud and Jennifer Wees, "Connaître la différence entre les hommes mauvais et les bons: Le charisme de clairvoyance d'Adam et Ève à Pachôme et Théodore," in For the Children, Perfect Instruction: Studies in Honor of Hans-Martin Schenke on the Occasion of the Berliner Arbeitskreis für koptisch-gnostische Schriften's Thirtieth Year (ed. Hans-Gebhard Bethge et al.; NHMS 54; Leiden: Brill, 2002), 139–55.

³⁷ S¹⁰ 5 (Louis-Théophile Lefort, ed., *S. Pachomii Vitae Sahidice Scriptae* [CSCO 99–100, Scriptores Coptici 9–10; Leuven: Durbecq, 1952] 72–73; trans. Veilleux, *Pachomian Koinonia*, 1:455).

 $^{^{38}}$ See, e.g., D. D. McGibbon, "The Fall of the Soul in Plato's Phaedrus," CQ 14 (1964): $56{-}63.$

³⁹ See, e.g., *Historia Monachorum*, prologue 5; *Life of Onnophrios* (BL Or. 7027, 13); Karl Suso Frank, *ΑΓΓΕΛΙΚΟΣ ΒΙΟΣ: Begriffsanalytische und Begriffsgeschichtliche Untersuchung zum "engelgleichen Leben" im frühen Mönchtum* (BGAM 26; Münster: Aschendorff, 1964); Ellen Muehlberger, "Ambivalence about the Angelic Life: The Promise and Perils of an Early Christian Discourse of Asceticism," *JECS* 16 (2008): 447–78.

 $^{^{40}}$ SBo 107: еффп де он ачфанхог е†неттелюс (...) чнаффп гфч генптоүво йтенатгелос оуог тоте пп $\overline{\text{пн}}$ а ефоуав чнаффп йрнт $\overline{\text{ч}}$ йтечтоувоч оуог йтечфе нач йтеч-

In the Book of Thomas, as we have seen, self-knowledge is also closely related to knowledge of Christ. Thomas is described as Jesus' brother, and the process of getting to know oneself should ideally make the ascetic as Christlike as possible. 41 We see this aspect also in the Pachomian literature, where abbot Theodore quotes 1 Cor 11:1 in his description of the importance of Christ-likeness in the Pachomian monks' quest for eternal rest: "Be like me as I have been like Christ, which is this single manner of all the holy ones and the fathers of the Koinonia who have nobly completed their struggle and rested themselves from their sufferings by entering their place of everlasting rest."42 Like the *Book of Thomas*, Theodore presents the denial of bodily passions as an imitatio Christi. 43 And as in the Book of Thomas, Theodore also highlights the importance of knowledge, referred to by Theodore as "the perfect knowledge of the Holy Scriptures and the manner in which God taught the holy ones and the fathers of the Koinonia."44 In the Book of Thomas, Christ is also said to incorporate true knowledge: "I am the knowledge of the Truth" (anok пе псооүн йтине), as he puts it. 45 And knowledge versus ignorance is furthermore connected to metaphors of light and darkness, with Jesus being identified as the light, who shines the light that hides the darkness of ignorance. 46

The positive effects on the ascetic of gaining knowledge of the truth can also be described using botanical metaphors. The *Book of Thomas* quotes from the Book of Psalms, promising that "the wise man (πcoφoc) will be nourished by the truth (тине), and 'he will become like the tree that grows by the running water'."⁴⁷ Similarly, in Pachomius' *First Instruction* we are told that the monks should "progress like young plants" (προκοπτει ν̄οε ν̄κν̄τωσοε ν̄κρ̄ρε). ⁴⁸

ернонахос оуог йтечервшк йпос беноутоуво немнеенні нівен (Lefort, Vita Bohairice Scripta, 143; trans. Veilleux, Pachomian Koinonia, 1:154).

⁴¹ Cf. Rom 8:29.

⁴² Theodore, *Instr.* 3.6: тйтйтнүтй ерої катафе ентаїтнтфит епехс ететею інфефе йоуфт те йнетоуаав тнроу мійбеюте йткоінфиіа наї ентаудекпеуагфи евод рйоумійтеннаю серитон йнооу евод рійбеурісе рійптреувфк егоун епеуна йнтон фаснер (Louis-Théophile Lefort, ed., *Œuvres de S. Pachôme et de ses disciples* [CSCO 159, Scriptores Coptici 23; Leuven: Durbecq, 1956], 43).

⁴³ I.e., "in the distress of our bodily needs" (гыпгохгх йнатехры ыпсона), as he puts it (Theodore, *Instr.* 3.6; Lefort, Œuvres de S. Pachôme, 43).

 $^{^{44}}$ Theodore, *Instr.* 3.6: псооүн етоүох йтенеграфн етоүаав ийтынүгөв йтыпноүте падасуе йнетоуаав йгнтс иййеюте йтконионы (Lefort, *Œuvres de S. Pachôme*, 42).

⁴⁵ Book Thom. 138.13 (Layton and Turner, "Book of Thomas the Contender," 180).

⁴⁶ Book Thom. 139.18–20 (Layton and Turner, "Book of Thomas the Contender," 184).

⁴⁷ Book Thom. 140.16-18, quoting Ps 1:3 LXX (Layton and Turner, "Book of Thomas the Contender," 188).

⁴⁸ Pachomius, *Instr.* 1.55 (Lefort, Œuvres de S. Pachôme, 22).

3. Burning Passions

One of the main lessons of Jesus' teaching in the *Book of Thomas* is that it is necessary to break away from the influence of the passions of the material world. Just like the Life of Pachomius points out the dangers of having a "carnal mind" (σαρκικὸν φρόνημα), 49 and Pachomius admonishes a spiteful monk to "flee from desire (επιογμία), for that is what makes the mind dark and prevents it from knowing the mystery of God (пмүстнріон ыпноүте),"50 the Book of Thomas admonishes its readers to flee from "the desire that burns the spirits of men" (тептөүміа етрак หนิกหิล ทิ้งคุณหะ).51 The importance of staying away from the carnal is indeed a major theme in the Book of Thomas, which warns its readers in no uncertain terms against the passions of the body, described metaphorically both as a burning fire within people's bodies, as well as something that either leads people astray or restrains them from doing or thinking what is proper. Jesus utters multiple warnings against being in the grip of the burning passions, proclaiming: "Woe unto you who are in the fire that burns within you, for it is insatiable!"52 And: "Woe unto you in the grip of the burning that is in you, for it will visibly consume your flesh, and it will secretly break your souls."53

Similar use of the metaphor of burning is found in the writings of Shenoute. When describing the problems arising among the monks of the White Monastery owing to the undue influence of bodily desire, he uses the metaphor of a fire burning within an orchard, threatening to destroy it if it is not put out.⁵⁴ Shenoute talks about "an evil fire" (oykopī eq200y) burning within it and states that the trees "have desired and they have burned, and the greater part of all the trees in the orchard have withered in the burning fire that burns the trees that the fire has ruled."⁵⁵ In terms close to what we see in the *Book of Thomas*,

⁴⁹ G¹ 126 (François Halkin, *Sancti Pachomii Vitae Graecae* [Subsidia hagiographica 19; Brussels: Société des Bollandistes, 1932], 80; trans. Veilleux, *Pachomian Koinonia*, 1:386).

⁵⁰ Pachomius, *Instr*. 1.19: πωτ євоλ йтєпїθγμία, χεйτος τετεφαςρπιούς йкаке нескам єсоунпнустнріон йпноутє (Lefort, Œuvres de S. Pachôme, 6).

⁵¹ Book Thom. 140.3–4 (Layton and Turner, "Book of Thomas the Contender," 186).

⁵² Book Thom. 143.15–16: оүосі интй граї гйпкшгт стршкг граї гйтнис (Layton and Turner. "Book of Thomas the Contender." 198).

 $^{^{53}}$ Book Thom. 143.18-21: оүосі интй йтоотф йпноүг стг[й]тние жециаушы йистйсарх гйоушиг свох ауш чиапшг йистйүүхооүс гйоугшп (Layton and Turner, "Book of Thomas the Contender," 198).

⁵⁴ See Shenoute, Canon 1, MONB.YW 81-82.

⁵⁵ Shenoute, *Canon* 1, MONB.YW 81–82: αγογωφε αγω αγρωκξ αγω πεξογό κικώμη тнроу ετξιτιμά κώμη αγωμές εβολ μπώας ετχερό ετρωκξ κικώμη ενταφέχοις εροογ κοιπκωξτ (Coptic text from unpublished transcription made by Stephen Emmel. I am grateful to Emmel for sharing it with me).

where Jesus utters a "Woe unto you who are in the fire that burns within you," Shenoute exclaims: "Woe unto us all, those who have sinned among us, whether male or female, but especially woe unto this one in whom a fire has burned like a tree that a flame has come out of, and it ran like lightning, and slithered itself into storehouses and burned youths and children, like wooden branches." 57

The Book of Thomas frequently uses the metaphor of the passions as a fire burning within, and warnings against "the desire that burns the spirits of men" (τεπιθγιμα ετρωκ νιμπινα νίμηνα νίμη

⁵⁶ Book Thom. 143.15–16: оүосі https://www.etepoke.gpa" รูพิтние (Layton and Turner, "Book of Thomas the Contender," 198).

 $^{^{57}}$ Shenoute, Canon 1, MONB.XC 121–22: оүосі нан тнры нентаурнове граї йгнты сіте гооут сіте сгіне йгоуб де оуосі йпаї ентаоукфут дерб граї йгнту йос йоуфни сацеі свод йноц йсіоуфаг ацпфт йос йоусврнос ацофу сгоун сгентансіон ацоуффе йгенхрорре ингенфрире физенфрире физенфрире физенфрире физенфрире физенфрире футенфрире физенфрире фи

⁵⁸ Book Thom. 140.3–4 (Layton and Turner, "Book of Thomas the Contender," 186).

 $^{^{59}}$ Book Thom. 139.33–37: $\hat{\omega}$ псиде йпкшет етхеро граї гййсшна ййршне нйнеуаткас ецхеро граї йгнтоү йтоүшн нйф[ооү] аүш етршхг ййнелос ййршне аүш е[ттрен]еүгнт †ге аүш неүүүхн естроүпший (Layton and Turner, "Book of Thomas the Contender," 184, 186).

 $^{^{60}}$ Book Thom. 143.27–29: ететйтаре рйпкфрт аүф тетй[нер] йсюре ерепетйрнт пофё ерфтй етвеп[н]ору ет[р]йтные (Layton and Turner, "Book of Thomas the Contender," 198).

⁶¹ See Pachomius, *Instr.* 1.45–46. See also Ps-Athanasius, *On Charity and Continence*, a text that overlaps major parts of Pachomius' *First Instruction*, and which may also have a Pachomian origin, as has recently been suggested by Carolyn M. Schneider, *The Text of a Coptic Monastic Discourse*, On Love and Self-Control: *Its Story from the Fourth Century to the Twenty-First* (CS 72; Collegeville, MN: Liturgical Press, 2017). Schneider argues that the text was likely not authored by Athanasius, but by the Pachomian abbot Horsiesios. In this context is also noteworthy that Christoph Joest has similarly argued that Horsiesios may indeed have edited Pachomius' *First Instruction*. See Christoph Joest, "Horsiese als Redaktor von Pachoms Katechese 1 'An einen grollenden Mönch': Eine stilkritische Untersuchung," *JCoptS* 9 (2007): 61–94.

⁶² Pachomius, Instr. 1.45 (Lefort, Œuvres de S. Pachôme, 18).

The *Book of Thomas* argues that bodily desire, like wine, causes people to become drunk and crazy, and to do things they would not otherwise do. And like wine it causes people to see apparitions, and to regard illusions as truth: "For that which guides them, which is the fire, will give them an illusion (ΦαΝΤαCIA) of truth."⁶³ Indeed, "it will illuminate them with perishing beauty, and it will capture them in dark sweetness and seize them with fragrant pleasure. And it will make them blind with insatiable desire, and it will cook their souls."⁶⁴ Moreover, it will lead people astray, "like a bridle (ΧαλιΝοC) in the mouth" drawing them "according to its own wish."⁶⁵

But not only will the bodily passions lead people to do what they should not, but they also restrain people from doing what they should. The *Book of Thomas* describes this using the metaphor of captivity: "it has tied them with its chains, and it has bound all their members with the bitterness of the chain of the desire of these visible things that will perish and change and turn according to the flow. They have always been drawn down from heaven. Being killed, they are drawn upon all the beasts of pollution." Captivity to the bodily passions is also described with an allusion to Plato's parable of the cave: "Woe unto you, captives, for you are bound in the caves!" Thus captivity to the passions is again associated with a lack of knowledge and insufficient focus on what is truly important: "You do not think about your destruction. Neither do you think about where you are, nor have you understood that you exist in darkness and death. But you are drunk on the fire and you are [filled] with bitterness while your minds are deranged due to the burning that is within you."

 $^{^{63}}$ Book Thom. 140.20–21: петҳімоєїт гар гнтоу є[т]єпкшет пе чна \uparrow нау йоуфантасіа ймне (Layton and Turner, "Book of Thomas the Contender," 188).

 $^{^{64}}$ Book Thom. 140.22-26: чнароуосын ерооу гйоусаеве ечнате[ко] ауш чнарахмальные ймооу гйоугабе йкаке йчторпоу гйоугальные сфстоев ауш чнаау йвале грай гитепноуны йатсев ауш чнахачай йнеуфухооуе (Layton and Turner, "Book of Thomas the Contender," 188).

⁶⁵ Book Thom. 140.28–30: йөс йоүхалиос гйоүтапро сцсшк йнооү апсцоүшдэс йнии йнооү (Layton and Turner, "Book of Thomas the Contender," 188).

 $^{^{66}}$ Book Thom. 140.30–37: ачнороу гйнечалусіс ауш неунелос тнроу ачсонгоу йграї гйпсіфе йтейре йтепібунета йнаеї єтоуонг євол єтнатеко ауш єтнафіве ауш єтнапшне катапсшк йтаусокоу йтпе апітй йоуосіф нім єугштв йнооу єусшк йнооу гідййтвнооує тнроу ўпідфіг (Layton and Turner, "Book of Thomas the Contender," 188).

⁶⁷ Book Thom. 143.21–23: องุดุ [и]ผู้тถิ ที่ลเมพลมิตาดะ дететинир อูที่นิดแหม[ลเ]ดท (Layton and Turner, "Book of Thomas the Contender," 198).

 $^{^{68}}$ Book Thom. 143.24—29: тетйрноеі ан йпетйтако оүте т[є]тйрноєі ан гйнететй-<й>гнтоү оүте йп[єт]ййне жететйдооп гйпкаке мйпно[ү] алла ететйтаге гйпкшгт аүш тетй[мег] йсіде ерепетйгнт подіс ерштй єтвеп[м]оүг ет[г]йтние (Layton and Turner, "Book of Thomas the Contender," 198).

4. Struggle and Adversity

In the *Book of Thomas*, Jesus utters numerous stark warnings to those who are led by bodily desire, proclaiming "woe unto you who are in the grip of the powers of your body, for they will afflict you." Interestingly, and in a way highly similar to what we see in monastic writings, he goes on to connect this situation directly to the struggle with demons: "Woe unto you who are in the grip of the powers of the wicked demons!" These demons can be equated with the so-called "visible spirits," which the perfect ascetic, described as an angel, can escape using his wings, which, as we saw above, the ascetic gains by acquiring true knowledge. ⁷¹

Pachomius similarly talks about demons as spirits, speaking of having been attacked by them since childhood, but when, as he puts it, "I flee to God weeping and humble with fasting and nightly vigils, the enemy grows weak before me with all his spirits." Like the *Book of Thomas*, Pachomius warns against demons in the context of bodily passions, admonishing a monk he is chastising to "Guard yourself, O my son, against fornication. Do not destroy the members of Christ. Do not obey demons." Moreover, just like the *Book of Thomas*, Pachomius adds the threat of post-mortem punishment: "Remember the anguish of the punishments," and "remember the anguish of the moment when you will leave the body."

⁶⁹ Book Thom. 144.10–12: оүосі интй йтоотоу ййсҳоүсіа йпстйсома ҳєметйно гар семаейке тние (Layton and Turner, "Book of Thomas the Contender," 200). Cf. Horsiesios, Test. 25.

⁷⁰ Book Thom. 144.12–13: оүої кнтй йтоотоу ййсмергена ййданиом йпомнром (Layton and Turner, "Book of Thomas the Contender," 200). Cf., e.g., Pachomius, *Instr.* 1.30, 55; Paral. 6a, 12, 24, 39; *Ep. Am.* 21, 24; Horsiesios, *Test.* 25; SBo 102.

⁷¹ Book Thom. 140.1–5 (Layton and Turner, "Book of Thomas the Contender," 186).

 $^{^{72}}$ Pachomius, *Instr.* 1.11: еюданиют де ератų міпноуте глоуріме мілоуннста міленоуфн проекс фарепхаже роф мінаграї мінецкепнеума тироу (Lefort, *Œu-vres de S. Pachôme*, 3).

 $^{^{73}}$ Pachomius, Instr. 1.30: гарег ерок ω пафире евох гйтпориіа йпртакейнелос йпехрістос йпрс ω тй йсайданноніон (Lefort, Œuvres de S. Pachôme, 12).

⁷⁴ Pachomius, *Instr*. 1.30: арипнееуе йтанагкн ййколасис (...) арйпнееуе й†анагкн йинау етекнну евол рйссона (Lefort, *Œuvres de S. Pachôme*, 12); cf. also SBo 82. Indeed, the references to post-mortem punishments in *Book Thom*. has clear parallels in both the Pachomian literature and in later Coptic apocrypha, such as the *Investiture of the Archangel Michael*, Ps-Timothy, *On Abbaton the Angel of Death*, and Ps-Timothy, *On the Feast of the Archangel Michael*, to mention but a few. See also Christian H. Bull, "The Great Demon of the Air and the Punishment of Souls: The *Perfect Discourse* (NHC VI,8) and Hermetic and Monastic Demonologies," in *Nag Hammadi à 70 ans: Qu'avons nous appris? Colloque international, Québec, Université Laval, 2931 mai 2015* (ed. Eric Crégheur, Louis Painchaud, and Tuomas Rasimus; BCNH.É 10; Leuven: Peeters, 2019), 105–20.

This emphasis on demons goes hand in hand with imagery of struggle and fighting. The centrality of the struggle against the passions of the flesh in the monastic life is vividly described by Pachomius himself. While admitting that he is himself tormented by desire, and asking for prayers on his own behalf, he tells the monk he is castigating in his First Instruction to "be sober in everything, labor, do the work of a preacher, stand firm against temptation" (мнфє ймок глешв нім флеїсє аріпешв йпречтафеоеф гупомеіне еппірасмос) and to "complete the struggle of the monastic life" (xwk ebol minarwn พิธาหักรพองงงงง which among other things include "guarding your virginity" (εκγαρες ετεκπαρθενία) as well as "withdrawing yourself from your lack of moderation and these strange polluted voices" (ексіге ймок стекпарамстрон минеїсмн йодимо ствит). 75 This is the kind of struggle that puts the metaphor of the athlete in the Book of Thomas in its proper context. And just like the Book of Thomas makes clear that one should imitate the apostles, and ultimately Christ, we find the Pachomian Paralipomena stating that being a good ascetic athlete involves the imitation of other good Christian athletes, asserting that "the noble athlete does not see the one among (the Christians) who is defeated, but he emulates those who conquer, in order to imitate them in a good manner, worthy of the same crown."⁷⁶ It is also worthy of note, in light of the Book of Thomas' use of the designation "athlete" for the apostle Matthias, that in addition to archbishop Athanasius and Antony the Great, the Pachomian writings generally apply the term "athlete" to leaders of the Pachomian koinonia.77

A metaphor that is related to that of struggle is that of being on guard, watching against the influence of desire and demons. In the *Book of Thomas*, Jesus tells Thomas, the apostles, and ultimately the readers of the text in Codex II, to "watch and pray that you will not remain in the flesh, but that you will leave the bond of the bitterness of life, and praying, you will find rest." Likewise, Pachomius *First Instruction* abounds with reminders to his monastic readers to be watchful and on guard against various passions and evil spirits. ⁷⁹

⁷⁵ Pachomius, *Instr.* 1.61 (Lefort, Œuvres de S. Pachôme, 24).

⁷⁶ Paral. 40 (Halkin, *Sancti Pachomii Vitae Graecae*, 164; trans. Veilleux, *Pachomian Koinonia*, 2:65)

⁷⁷ See SBo 133, 134, 136, G¹ 136 (Athanasius); G¹ 12 (Palamon); G¹ 22 (Antony and Pachomius); G¹ 79 (the ancient brothers in the Pachomian *koinonia*, Cornelios, Psentaesios, Souros, Psoi, Pecos, another Pachomius, Paul, John, Paphnutius, and many others, most of whom were appointed by Pachomius as leaders and fathers of the monasteries); G¹ 84 (Titoue, housemaster of the stewards in Pbow).

 $^{^{78}}$ Book Thom. 145.8—11: росіс стетйсопс жестетнадюще ан гйтсару алла жестетнаєї євох гйтніре ійпсіце ійтепвіос аую стетйсопс тетйнасіне йоуйтон (Layton and Turner, "Book of Thomas the Contender," 204).

⁷⁹ Pachomius, *Instr.* 1.10, 13, 20, 26, 36, 41, 43, 51, 55, 61.

Metaphors of struggle can also be combined with imagery of cleansing. We see this reflected in the *Testament* of the Pachomian abbot Horsiesios, who freely adapts the letter of Jude and an extended quotation from Ephesians to make this point:

Jude says in his letter, "snatching them from the fire and hating the soiled garment of the flesh" (cf. Jude 23). Let us beware of this kind of garment and "put on instead God's armor so as to be able to resist the devil's snares. For our fight is not against flesh and blood but against principalities and powers, against the rulers of darkness, and against the spirits of wickedness in the heavens" (Eph 6:11–12).80

The metaphor of the material body and its desires as a bad garment also seems to be reflected in the *Book of Thomas*, although the passage in question is unfortunately badly damaged.⁸¹

5. Conclusion

The burning question underlying the *Book of Thomas* is thus how to quench the insatiable fire of the bodily passions and attain rest. Or, as the *Book of Thomas* puts it, "Who will rain dew of rest on you so that it will extinguish many fires from you and your burning? Who will give you the sun to shine upon you to dissolve the darkness that is in you and to hide the darkness and the defiled water?" The answer, of course, is the Savior, who provides both the blueprint of the perfect ascetic and the instructions on how to become one and live like one. And, importantly, they are also instructed to pass on the knowledge they have received, thus enabling others to reach the same state.

In the Pachomian literature we find that the abbot Theodore similarly describes the monastic life as "the life of the apostles," when he in his *Second Instruction* describes the virtues and way of life of the Pachomian *koinonia* with the following words: "[the holy] *Koinonia*, by which (God) [has shown]

⁸⁰ Horsiesios, Test. 25: Et ludas in epistula sua loquitur: Et hos quidem de igne rapientes, et odio habentes carnis commaculatam tunicam. Caueamus huiuscemodi uestimentum, et induamur potius armatura Dei, ut possimus resistere contra insidias diaboli. Non est enim nobis pugna contra carnem et sanguinem; sed aduersus principatus et potestates, aduersus rectores tenebrarum, aduersus spiritalia nequitiae in caelestibus (Amand Boon, Pachomiana Latina: Règle et épitres de S. Pachôme, épitre de S. Théodore et "Liber" de S. Orsiesius: Texte latin de S. Jérôme [Bibliothèque de la Revue d'histoire ecclésiastique 7; Leuven: Bureaux de la Revue, 1932], 126; trans. Veilleux, Pachomian Koinonia, 3:190).

⁸¹ Book Thom. 143.37–38 (Layton and Turner, "Book of Thomas the Contender," 198).

 $^{^{82}}$ Book Thom. 144.15–19: нім петнаєщоў нінтій йоўсюте нійтон декаас еснаєштій йеае йкшет свод ейтные нійпетійршке нім петнаф нінтій йпры апрые адійтные авшд свод ійпкаке стейтные аўш аешп ійпкаке нійпнооў стсооў (Layton and Turner, "Book of Thomas the Contender," 200).

forth the life [of the] apostle[s] to those who wish to [become like] them [before] the Lord of all forever."⁸³ The same Theodore also describes the goal of this life in terms very close to what we find at the end of the *Book of Thomas*, where Jesus tells the apostles that they will "reign with the king" (ρ̄ρρο μῆτιρρο) if only they "leave the toils and the passions of the body" (ει εβολ χῆτιριος μῆτιροος ῆτειτοσια). ⁸⁴ Theodore similarly points out, with a reference to Matt 19:28/Luke 22:30, that the apostles "were worthy to sit [on] the twelve glorious [thrones] and [judge the] twelve [tribes] of Israel."⁸⁵ The *Book of Thomas* in fact comes very close to describing the goal of the monastic life in the same way as it is articulated by Pachomius in his *First Instruction*: "Let us struggle, O my beloved, so that we may receive the crown that is prepared. The throne is spread out. The door of the kingdom is open. To the one who is victorious shall I give from the secret manna. If we struggle and are victorious against the passions, we shall reign forever."⁸⁶

Moreover, just like the *Book of Thomas* is a text that presents perfect teaching intended for the perfect, in order to provide ascetics with perfect knowledge enabling them to act in accordance with proper ascetic behavior, keeping watch against the desires of the flesh, Pachomian abbot Horsiesios states in his so-called *Testament*, that "you who fear the Lord, arm yourselves with chastity, that you may deserve to hear, you are not in the flesh but in the spirit. And know that perfect things are given to the perfect, and that useless things are given to the useless." 87

With all these parallels with the Pachomian literature in mind, it is not difficult to imagine how and why Pachomian monks would have been interested in copying and reading the *Book of Thomas*. At the same time it should also be pointed out that this text is by no means alone among the Nag Hammadi texts in having close affinities with Pachomian literature or other texts associated with early Egyptian monasticism, including not only such texts as the *Gospel*

 $^{^{83}}$ Theodore, Instr. 2.1: [ткої]нфина [ето] ұа[ав таї й] тачоу[ең§] пвіос [ййа] посто[лос] евол гітоотс йй[рф] не етоуеф [фф] пе гйпе[снот] йнетйнау [гар] тйпхс й[оүо] н нін фаенер (Lefort, Œuvres de S. Pachôme, 38).

⁸⁴ Book Thom. 145.12–14 (Layton and Turner, "Book of Thomas the Contender," 204).

 $^{^{85}}$ Theodore, Instr. 2.1: аүрйпара йгно[ос гі]пийтснооус [йө]ро[нос] йеооү й[секріне йт]ийтсн[ооусе йфухи] йпійх (Lefort, Œuvres de S. Pachôme, 38).

 $^{^{86}}$ Pachomius, *Instr.* 1.50: марйагфиіzе ф намерате деенеді йпеклом етсётфт пеоронос порф про йтмітеро оуфн петнадро †на† нач евох ріпнанна еонп енфанагфиіzе йтйдро енпафос тінарро фаенер (Lefort, *Œuvres de S. Pachôme*, 20).

⁸⁷ Horsiesios, Test. 20: Qui timetis Dominum armate uos castitate, ut audire mereamini: Vos autem non estis in carne, sed in spiritu. Et scitote quod perfectis perfecta tribuantur, et inanibus reddantur inania (Boon, Pachomiana Latina, 122; trans. Veilleux, Pachomian Koinonia, 3:185).

of Thomas⁸⁸ and the Exegesis on the Soul, ⁸⁹ and even the Apocryphon of John, ⁹⁰ all found in the same codex as the Book of Thomas, ⁹¹ but also such texts as the Dialogue of the Savior, ⁹² the Sentences of Sextus, and the Teachings of Silvanus, ⁹³ just to mention the tip of the iceberg. Indeed, as Christian Bull has convincingly shown, even the eclectic Nag Hammadi Codex VI as a whole, including its heavily rewritten excerpt from Plato's Republic, seems highly amenable to a monastic context. ⁹⁴

Pachomius ends his First Instruction with the following words:

Now then, my brother, make peace with your brother and pray for me, too, for I cannot do anything, but I am afflicted by my desires. But you, be sober in everything, labor, do the work of the preacher, stand firm against temptation. Complete the struggle of the monastic

⁸⁸ Melissa Harl Sellew, "Reading Jesus in the Desert: The *Gospel of Thomas* Meets the *Apophthegmata Patrum*," in *The Nag Hammadi Codices and Late Antique Egypt* (ed. Hugo Lundhaug and Lance Jenott; STAC 110; Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2018), 81–106; Kimberley A. Fowler, "Reading *Gospel of Thomas* 100 in the Fourth Century: From Roman Imperialism to Pachomian Concern over Wealth," *VC* 72 (2018): 421–46; René Falkenberg and André Gagné in this volume.

⁸⁹ Hugo Lundhaug, "Monastic Exegesis and the Female Soul in the *Exegesis on the Soul*," in *Women and Knowledge in Early Christianity* (ed. Ulla Tervahauta et al.; VCSup 144; Leiden: Brill, 2017), 221–33; Kimberley A. Fowler, "The Ascent of the Soul and the Pachomians: Interpreting the Exegesis on the Soul (NHC II,6) within a Fourth-Century Monastic Context," *Gnosis* 2 (2017): 63–93.

⁹⁰ Christian H. Bull, "Women, Angels, and Dangerous Knowledge: The Myth of the Watchers in the Apocryphon of John and Its Monastic Manuscript-Context," in *Women and Knowledge in Early Christianity* (ed. Ulla Tervahauta et al.; VCSup 144; Leiden: Brill, 2017), 75–107; and Rosland in this volume.

⁹¹ On Codex II as a whole, see Lance Jenott, "Recovering Adam's Lost Glory: Nag Hammadi Codex II in its Egyptian Monastic Environment," in *Jewish and Christian Cosmogony in Late Antiquity* (ed. Lance Jenott and Sarit Kattan Gribetz; TSAJ 155; Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2013), 222–43; Ingvild Sælid Gilhus, "Historiography as Anti-History: Reading Nag Hammadi Codex II," *ARG* 20 (2018): 77–90; Kimberley A. Fowler, "From the Apocryphon of John to Thomas the Contender: Nag Hammadi Codex II in its Fourth-Century Context," (PhD diss. University of Manchester, 2013); and Fowler in this volume.

⁹² Hugo Lundhaug, "The *Dialogue of the Savior* (NHC III,5) as a Monastic Text," in *Studia Patristica XCIII: Papers Presented at the Seventeenth International Conference on Patristic Studies Held in Oxford 2015: Volume 19: The First Two Centuries; Apocrypha and Gnostica* (ed. Markus Vinzent; StPatr 93; Leuven: Peeters, 2017), 335–46.

⁹³ Blossom Stefaniw, "Hegemony and Homecoming in the Ascetic Imagination: Sextus, Silvanus, and Monastic Instruction in Egypt," in *The Nag Hammadi Codices and Late Antique Egypt* (ed. Hugo Lundhaug and Lance Jenott; STAC 110; Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2018), 107–38.

⁹⁴ Christian H. Bull, "An Origenistic Reading of Plato in Nag Hammadi Codex VI," in Studia Patristica LXXV: Papers Presented at the Seventeenth International Conference on Patristic Studies held in Oxford 2015. Volume 1: Studia Patristica; Platonism and the Fathers; Maximus the Confessor (ed. Markus Vinzent; StPatr 75; Leuven: Peeters, 2017), 31–40; idem, "Great Demon of the Air"; and Bull in this volume.

life, being humble, being gentle, trembling at the words you have heard, guarding your virginity, and withdrawing yourself from your lack of moderation and these strange polluted voices. And do not be outside the Scriptures of the holy ones, but be firm in the faith in Christ Jesus our Lord, through whom be glory to him and his good Father and the Holy Spirit forever and ever! Amen! Bless us! (Pachomius, *Instr.* 1.61)⁹⁵

This passage shows clearly how Pachomius' advice to the "spiteful monk" comes very close to what we see in the *Book of Thomas*. Both talk about the need to be watchful and struggle against material desires, and they both highlight the importance of preaching. Moreover, Pachomius' references to the "brothers," "peace," "prayer," and "the holy ones" resonate with the colophon following the *Book of Thomas*, with its call to the readers to "remember me, too, my brothers, in your prayers. Peace to the holy ones and the spiritual ones!" ones!"

Bibliography

Boon, Amand. *Pachomiana Latina: Règle et épitres de S. Pachôme, épitre de S. Théodore et "Liber" de S. Orsiesius: Texte latin de S. Jérôme*. Bibliothèque de la Revue d'histoire ecclésiastique 7. Leuven: Bureaux de la Revue, 1932.

- Bull, Christian H. "Women, Angels, and Dangerous Knowledge: The Myth of the Watchers in the Apocryphon of John and Its Monastic Manuscript-Context." Pages 75–107 in Women and Knowledge in Early Christianity. Edited by Ulla Tervahauta, Ivan Miroshnikov, Outi Lehtipuu, and Ismo Dunderberg. Supplements to Vigiliae Christianae 144. Leiden: Brill, 2017.
- -. "An Origenistic Reading of Plato in Nag Hammadi Codex VI." Pages 31–40 in Studia Patristica LXXV: Papers Presented at the Seventeenth International Conference on Patristic Studies held in Oxford 2015. Volume 1: Studia Patristica; Platonism and the Fathers; Maximus the Confessor. Edited by Markus Vinzent. Studia Patristica 75. Leuven: Peeters, 2017.
- -. "The Great Demon of the Air and the Punishment of Souls: The Perfect Discourse (NHC VI,8) and Hermetic and Monastic Demonologies." Pages 105–20 in Nag Hammadi à 70

 $^{^{95}}$ теноу бе пасон арієірнин нйпексон ауш йтетйфіль едші дш дейфефраау ан йдшв алла фөйкну єтвенаоушф йток де инфе йнок гйгшв иін фйгісе аріпіршв йпрецтафеосіф гупонеіне єппіраснос дшк євол йпагшн йтнйтнонохос екөввіну єко йрйраф екстшт гнтоу ййфаде йтаксотноу єкгарег єтекпарфеніа ауш єксіге йнок єтекпаранетрон ийнеїсні йфіно єтвит нітйпвол ан йнеграфи йнетоуалв алла єктадрну гйтпісфс йпехрістос інсоус пендосіс паї євол гітоотф пеооу нац ийпфеішт йагафш ийпепнеўна єтоуалв фаснег йегег ганни сноу єрон (Lefort, $Euvres\ de\ S.\ Pachôme, 24$).

⁹⁶ Book Thom. 145.20–23: аршамееуе гω насину ε[ñ]нетйпросеухн є[i]рнин ток агнок мйніпнеунатікос; cf. also the colophon at the end of Codex VII (Steles Seth 127.28–32) with its call for blessings: пєїхющиє па-† міт єют пє піднре пєнтацса є сноу єрої піфт † сноу єрок піфт εпоучернин гамни (Layton and Turner, "Book of Thomas the Contender," 204).

- ans: Qu'avons nous appris? Colloque international, Québec, Université Laval, 2931 mai 2015. Edited by Eric Crégheur, Louis Painchaud, and Tuomas Rasimus. Bibliothèque copte de Nag Hammadi, Section "Études" 10. Leuven: Peeters, 2019.
- Doresse, Jean. The Secret Books of the Egyptian Gnostics: An Introduction to the Gnostic Coptic Manuscripts Discovered at Chenoboskion: With an English Translation and Critical Evaluation of the Gospel According to Thomas. Translated by Leonard Johnston. London: Hollis & Carter, 1960.
- Emmel, Stephen, "Religious Tradition, Textual Transmission, and the Nag Hammadi Codices." Pages 34–43 in *The Nag Hammadi Library After Fifty Years: Proceedings of the 1995 Society of Biblical Literature Commemoration*. Edited by John D. Turner and Anne McGuire. Nag Hammadi and Manichaean Studies 44. Leiden: Brill, 1997.
- Fowler, Kimberley A. "From the Apocryphon of John to Thomas the Contender: Nag Hammadi Codex II in its Fourth-Century Context." PhD diss. University of Manchester, 2013.
- -. "The Ascent of the Soul and the Pachomians: Interpreting the Exegesis on the Soul (NHC II,6) within a Fourth-Century Monastic Context." Gnosis: Journal of Gnostic Studies 2 (2017): 63–93.
- -. "Reading Gospel of Thomas 100 in the Fourth Century: From Roman Imperialism to Pachomian Concern over Wealth." Vigiliae Christianae 72 (2018): 421–46.
- Frank, Karl Suso. *ΑΓΓΕΛΙΚΟΣ ΒΙΟΣ: Begriffsanalytische und Begriffsgeschichtliche Untersuchung zum "engelgleichen Leben" im frühen Mönchtum.* Beiträge zur Geschichte des alten Mönchtums und des Benediktinerordens 26. Münster: Aschendorff, 1964.
- Gilhus, Ingvild Sælid. "Historiography as Anti-History: Reading Nag Hammadi Codex II." Archiv für Religionsgeschichte 20 (2018): 77–90.
- Halkin, François. Sancti Pachomii Vitae Graecae. Subsidia hagiographica 19. Brussels: Société des Bollandistes, 1932.
- Jenott, Lance. "Recovering Adam's Lost Glory: Nag Hammadi Codex II in its Egyptian Monastic Environment." Pages 222–43 in *Jewish and Christian Cosmogony in Late Antiquity*. Edited by Lance Jenott and Sarit Kattan Gribetz. Texte und Studien zum antiken Judentum 155. Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2013.
- -. "Reading Variants in James and the Apocalypse of James: A Perspective from New Philology." Pages 55–84 in Snapshots of Evolving Traditions: Jewish and Christian Manuscript Culture, Textual Fluidity, and New Philology. Edited by Liv Ingeborg Lied and Hugo Lundhaug. Texte und Untersuchungen zur Geschichte der altchristlichen Literatur 175. Berlin: De Gruyter, 2017.
- Joest, Christoph. "Horsiese als Redaktor von Pachoms Katechese 1 'An einen grollenden Mönch': Eine stilkritische Untersuchung." *Journal of Coptic Studies* 9 (2007): 61–94.
- King, Karen L. What is Gnosticism? Cambridge, MA: Belknap Press/Harvard University Press, 2003.
- Krause, Martin. "The Christianization of Gnostic Texts." Pages 187–94 in *The New Testament and Gnosis: Essays in Honour of Robert McL. Wilson*. Edited by Alastair H. B. Logan and Alexander J. M. Wedderburn. Edinburgh: T&T Clark, 1983.
- Kuntzmann, Raymond. Le Livre de Thomas (NH II,7): Texte établi et présenté. Bibliothèque Copte de Nag Hammadi, Section "Textes" 16. Québec: Les Presses de l'Université Laval, 1986.
- Layton, Bentley, ed., and John D. Turner, trans. "The Book of Thomas the Contender." Pages 2:180–205 in *Nag Hammadi Codex II*, 2–7 *Together with XIII*, 2*, *Brit. Lib. Or. 4926(1)*, and P. Oxy. 1, 654, 655. Edited by Bentley Layton. 2 Vols. Nag Hammadi Studies 20–21. Leiden: Brill, 1989.

- Lefort, Louis-Théophile. ed. S. Pachomii Vitae Sahidice Scriptae. Corpus Scriptorum Christianorum Orientalium 99–100, Scriptores Coptici 9–10. Leuven: Durbecq, 1952.
- S. Pachomii Vita Bohairice Scripta. Corpus Scriptorum Christianorum Orientalium 89, Scriptores Coptici 7. Leuven: Durbecq, 1953.
- Œuvres de S. Pachôme et de ses disciples. Corpus Scriptorum Christianorum Orientalium 159, Scriptores Coptici 23. Leuven: Durbecq, 1956.
- Lundhaug, Hugo. "An Illusion of Textual Stability: Textual Fluidity, New Philology, and the Nag Hammadi Codices." Pages 20–54 in Snapshots of Evolving Traditions: Jewish and Christian Manuscript Culture, Textual Fluidity, and New Philology. Edited by Liv Ingeborg Lied and Hugo Lundhaug. Texte und Untersuchungen zur Geschichte der altchristlichen Literatur 175. Berlin: De Gruyter, 2017.
- -. "Monastic Exegesis and the Female Soul in the Exegesis on the Soul." Pages 221–33 in Women and Knowledge in Early Christianity. Edited by Ulla Tervahauta, Ivan Miroshnikov, Outi Lehtipuu, and Ismo Dunderberg. Supplements to Vigiliae Christianae 144. Leiden: Brill, 2017.
- -. "The Dialogue of the Savior (NHC III,5) as a Monastic Text." Pages 335–46 in Studia Patristica XCIII: Papers Presented at the Seventeenth International Conference on Patristic Studies Held in Oxford 2015: Volume 19: The First Two Centuries; Apocrypha and Gnostica. Edited by Markus Vinzent. Studia Patristica 93. Leuven: Peeters, 2017.
- -. "Textual Fluidity and Post-Nicene Rewriting in the Nag Hammadi Codices." Pages 47–67 in Nag Hammadi à 70 ans: Qu'avons-nous appris? Colloque international, Québec, Université Laval, 29–31 mai 2015. Edited by Eric Crégheur, Louis Painchaud, and Tuomas Rasimus. Bibliothèque copte de Nag Hammadi, Section "Études" 10. Leuven: Peeters, 2019.
- -. "The Fluid Transmission of Apocrypha in Egyptian Monasteries." Pages 213–27 in Coptic Literature in Context (4th–13th cent.): Cultural Landscape, Literary Production and Manuscript Archaeology. Edited by Paola Buzi. PaST Percorsi di Archeologia 5. Rome: Edizioni Quasar, 2020.
- -. "Dating and Contextualising the Nag Hammadi Codices and Their Texts: A Multi-Methodological Approach Including New Radiocarbon Evidence." Pages 117–42 in Texts in Context: Essays on Dating and Contextualising Christian Writings of the Second and Early Third Century. Edited by Joseph Verheyden, Jens Schröter, and Tobias Nicklas. Bibliotheca Ephemeridum Theologicarum Lovaniensium 319. Leuven: Peeters, 2021.
- Lundhaug, Hugo, and Lance Jenott. *The Monastic Origins of the Nag Hammadi Codices*. Studien und Texte zu Antike und Christentum 97. Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2015.
- -- "Production, Distribution and Ownership of Books in the Monasteries of Upper Egypt: The Evidence of the Nag Hammadi Colophons." Pages 306–25 in *Monastic Education in Late Antiquity: The Transformation of Classical Paideia*. Edited by Lillian Larsen and Samuel Rubenson. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2018.
- Lundhaug, Hugo, and Liv Ingeborg Lied. "Studying Snapshots: On Manuscript Culture, Textual Fluidity, and New Philology." Pages 1–19 in *Snapshots of Evolving Traditions: Jewish and Christian Manuscript Culture, Textual Fluidity, and New Philology.* Edited by Liv Ingeborg Lied and Hugo Lundhaug. Texte und Untersuchungen zur Geschichte der altchristlichen Literatur 175. Berlin: De Gruyter, 2017.
- McGibbon, D. D. "The Fall of the Soul in Plato's Phaedrus," *Classical Quarterly* 14 (1964): 56–63.
- Muehlberger, Ellen. "Ambivalence about the Angelic Life: The Promise and Perils of an Early Christian Discourse of Asceticism." *Journal of Early Christian Studies* 16 (2008): 447–78.

- Painchaud, Louis, and Jennifer Wees. "Connaître la différence entre les hommes mauvais et les bons: Le charisme de clairvoyance d'Adam et Ève à Pachôme et Théodore." Pages 139–55 in For the Children, Perfect Instruction: Studies in Honor of Hans-Martin Schenke on the Occasion of the Berliner Arbeitskreis für koptisch-gnostische Schriften's Thirtieth Year. Edited by Hans-Gebhard Bethge, Stephen Emmel, Karen L. King, and Imke Schletterer. Nag Hammadi and Manichaean Studies 54. Leiden: Brill, 2002.
- Poirier, Paul-Hubert. "The Writings Ascribed to Thomas and the Thomas Tradition." Pages 295–307 in *The Nag Hammadi Library After Fifty Years: Proceedings of the 1995 Society of Biblical Literature Commemoration*. Edited by John D. Turner and Anne McGuire. Nag Hammadi and Manichaean Studies 44. Leiden: Brill, 1997.
- Quecke, Hans. Die Briefe Pachoms: Griechischer Text der Handschrift W. 145 der Chester Beatty Library. Textus Patristici et Liturgici 2. Regensburg: Pustet, 1975.
- Schenke, Hans-Martin. "Sprachliche und exegetische Probleme in den beiden letzten Schriften des Codex II von Nag Hammadi." *Orientalistische Literaturzeitung* 70 (1975): 5–13.
- -. "The Book of Thomas (NHC II,7): A Revision of a Pseudepigraphical Epistle of Jacob the Contender." Pages 213–28 in *The New Testament and Gnosis: Essays in Honour of Robert McL. Wilson.* Edited by Alastair H. B. Logan and Alexander J. M. Wedderburn. Edinburgh: T&T Clark, 1983.
- Das Thomas-Buch (Nag-Hammadi-Codex II,7): Neu herausgegeben, übersetzt und erklärt. Texte und Untersuchungen zur Geschichte der altchristlichen Literatur 138. Berlin: Akademie Verlag, 1989.
- Schneider, Carolyn M. *The Text of a Coptic Monastic Discourse, On Love and Self-Control: Its Story from the Fourth Century to the Twenty-First.* Cistercian Studies Series 72. Collegeville, MN: Liturgical Press, 2017.
- Sell, Jesse. The Knowledge of the Truth Two Doctrines: The Book of Thomas the Contender (CG II,7) and the False Teachers in the Pastoral Epistles. European University Studies, Series 23, Theology 194. Frankfurt am Main: Lang, 1982.
- Sellew, Melissa Harl. "Reading Jesus in the Desert: The Gospel of Thomas Meets the Apophthegmata Patrum." Pages 81–106 in *The Nag Hammadi Codices and Late Antique Egypt.* Edited by Hugo Lundhaug and Lance Jenott. Studien und Texte zu Antike und Christentum 110. Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2018.
- Turner, John D. The Book of Thomas the Contender from Codex II of the Cairo Gnostic Library from Nag Hammadi (CG II,7): The Coptic Text with Translation, Introduction and Commentary. Society of Biblical Literature Dissertation Series 23. Missoula, MT: Scholars Press, 1975.
- -. "The Book of Thomas the Contender (II,7): Introduction and Translation." Pages 199–207 in *The Nag Hammadi Library in English*. 3rd revised ed. Edited by James M. Robinson. San Francisco: HarperSanFrancisco, 1990.
- Veilleux, Armand. Pachomian Koinonia: The Lives, Rules, and Other Writings of Saint Pachomius and His Disciples. 3 Vols. Cistercian Studies 45–47. Kalamazoo, MI: Cistercian Publications, 1980–1982.
- Williams, Michael A. Rethinking "Gnosticism": An Argument for Dismantling a Dubious Category. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1996.
- -. "Was There a Gnostic Religion? Strategies for a Clearer Analysis." Pages 55–79 in Was There a Gnostic Religion? Edited by Antti Marjanen. Publications of the Finnish Exegetical Society 87. Helsinki: Finnish Exegetical Society, 2005.