



UiO • University of Oslo

Walter Scott's Gothic and Drama: *The Bride of Lammermoor* and Donizetti's *Lucia di Lammermoor*

Andrea Amado-Fernández

A Thesis Presented to the Department of Literature, AreaStudies
and European Languages

ILOS, UiO

ENG4394,

30 Credits

Supervisor: Tina Skouen

Spring 2023

Acknowledgements

First, I would like to thank my supervisor Tina Skouen who provided me guidance and great support. Thanks to her I have been able to continue with this thesis as she always found a way to guide me and motivate me. Her knowledge and experience have helped me in this experience that have taught me a lot. I feel very lucky on having been supervised by her.

Secondly, I need to thank my family and friends that even in the distance have been there for me to motivate me too. Mostly to my parents and siblings who have been supporting me and motivating me through the screen of a phone or a laptop. Seeing how difficult was for them to do so in the distance, yet they have always had faith in me and have supported me in all of my decisions.

Last but not least, I am really grateful to the person who has been always by my side and sharing this journey with me, my partner Ben. Thank you very much for supporting me from the beginning.

Table of Contents

1. Introduction	1
2. Gothic Elements in Sir Walter Scott's Works.....	5
2.2. Scott's Critical Opinions on the Gothic.....	11
3. The Gothic in <i>The Bride of Lammermoor</i>	14
3.1. Comparison with Lewis's <i>The Monk</i>	15
3.2. How the Characters Are Affected by the Supernatural	18
4. Scott's "Essay on the Drama"	23
5. How an Opera Adaptation Might Fulfil Scott's Ideas on Gothic and Drama	27
5.1. Gaetano Donizetti's <i>Lucia di Lammermoor</i>	31
5.2. The Royal Opera House Performance of <i>Lucia di Lammermoor</i> Directed by Katie Mitchell	37
6. Conclusion.....	40
7. Works Cited.....	42

1. Introduction

Walter Scott's *The Bride of Lammermoor*¹ was published in 1819 as part of a series known as the Waverly novels, due to their publication from 1814 to 1831 (Humphrey 2). It is a novel full of drama, a novel viewing political and historical events through the lens of the love story between Lucy Ashton and Edgar Ravenswood. This is also a fatal love similar to the one of *Pyramus and Thisbe* or *Romeo and Juliet* since Ravenswood promises to get revenge from Lucy's family and the couples in these stories end up dying. Mr. Ravenswood hates Lucy's father from buying the Ravenswood properties after Edgar's father was stripped from his title and thus, from his point of view stealing his heritage. Still, he falls in love with Lucy when he meets her for the first time after saving her and her father from a bull which leads him to the decision of abandoning his vengeance. Thus, Lucy represents his withdrawal of revenge against the Ashton family.

When Scott created the plot for his novel, he built on the story of the fatal marriage between Janet Dalrymple and David Dunbar of Baldoon. The story is similar to the one in *The Bride of Lammermoor*, Janet Dalrymple engaged secretly with Lord Rutherford is obliged by her family to marry another man, David Dunbar, and in the wedding's festivities when the bride and the groom retired to the nuptial chamber, the bride attempts to murder her husband, and she dies afterwards (Scott, "Introduction 1830" *Lammermoor* 2, 3, 4). Still, Scott might have been also influenced by previous novels such as Mathew Lewis' *The Monk*² (1796), Horace Walpole's *The Castle of Otranto* (1764), and, Mary Shelley's *Frankenstein* (1818). Scott gave his ideas on both *The Castle of Otranto*, and *Frankenstein*, these ideas will be used in this thesis, while *The Monk*, is my own analysis based on Scott's theories in comparison to Lewi's work.

Critics generally tend to describe Scott's novel as Gothic, an important term in Romantic literature, and that according to Gina Wisker focuses on romances that are dangerous and that might end badly (146, 147). Fiona Robertson in her book *Legitimate Stories: Scott, Gothic, and the Authorities of Fiction* (1994) dwells with Scott's texts and the conventions and strategies of the late eighteen and beginning on the nineteenth

¹ All references to this work are to *The Bride of Lammermoor*, edited by Fiona Robertson, Oxford World's Classics, 2008.

Additionally, *Lammermoor* will be used as a shortening for *The Bride of Lammermoor*.

² All references to this work are to *The Monk*, edited by Howard Anderson, Oxford UP, 1995.

centuries, a period of time when Gothic literature was mostly written. James Kerr, in his book *Fiction Against History: Scott as a Story-Teller* (1989), also analysed Scott's work and considered it a historical novel instead of a Gothic one, since he viewed Scott's version of Gothic as a response to previous Gothic novels. A more recent article "Reading Walter Scott's Dramas" by Daniel Cook analyses Scott as a dramatic author and compares how successful he was as a novel writer versus a drama author. Similarly, A.O.J. Cockshut has analysed "Cause-effect" in his book *The Achievement of Walter Scott* (1969) where he analysed this term in some of Scott's works but not in *The Bride of Lammermoor*. Scott, indeed, participated in the debates about the qualities of different genres, not least in his "Essay on the Drama" (*The Miscellaneous Prose Works of Sir Walter Scott*, Vol.4, 1837). Here, he explains what he considered to be a good drama and for that he uses examples from Greek and Roman drama as well as Aristotle's theory.

This thesis will investigate what makes *Lammermoor* appear as a Gothic novel. When compared to works such as Lewis's *The Monk* (1995), as I argue, the story told in *Lammermoor* appears more realistic. So, which elements make *Lammermoor* stand out as a Gothic novel? And how do these Gothic elements affect the plot or even the characters of Lucy and Edgar themselves? In order to answer these questions, the thesis will depend not only on earlier scholars such as Parsons and Cockshut, but also on Scott's critical opinions on the nature of the Gothic. These essays are Scott's "Introduction" to Walpole's *The Castle of Otranto*, his remarks on *Frankenstein*, and, his "Essay on the Drama". In fact, Scott's *Bride of Lammermoor* was so rich and filled with drama that it later served as inspiration for an opera adaptation by Gaetano Donizetti with a libretto by Salvatore Camarano. First performed in Naples in 1835, this popular opera has since been staged a number of times in many different places. For the purposes of this thesis, I shall focus on a particular performance at the Royal Opera House (ROH) in London in 2016. I find this performance especially relevant for discussing the Gothic characteristics of *Lammermoor* and also Scott's drama theories and analyse how these can be applied to Mitchell's opera adaptation. This specific performance was directed by Katie Mitchell and performed by Diana Damrau, Charles Castronovo, and, Ludovic Tézier among others, and was recorded and is therefore available on film as a DVD released by Warner Music Group Company. Comparing this DVD performance with Donizetti's original, I shall investigate whether the same Gothic topics from *Lammermoor* are also represented in both these adaptations. My aim here will be to bring Scott's novel and Donizetti's opera into conversation with each other and thereby to broaden the scope for literary analysis.

As part of this goal, I want to ask: what happens if one applies Scott's literary theories on Donizetti's version of *Lammermoor*? What can one learn about the Gothic by bringing the novel and opera together in light of Scott's theories?

Since *The Bride of Lammermoor* was written according to Kerr and Cockshut as a response to previous Gothic novels, Lewis' *The Monk*, will be briefly considered for the sake of comparison. Further, I shall argue that there is one element in *Lammermoor* serving to unite all its gothic features, namely, the presence of ghosts. Ghosts are the link between the past and the present since they remind the characters and readers about legends or happenings from the past, mostly if that apparition is a warning spirit. From my point of view, the character that fulfils this is Alice, who according to Coleman O Parson (75) is a sibyl, yet is she actually just a sibyl? Or is she also a warning spirit?

The main sources for this thesis will be Scott's theories in Gothic literature and drama, specifically three works, the introduction that he wrote for Horace Walpole's *The Castle of Otranto*, his remarks on *Frankenstein*, and, his "Essay on the Drama". The author's point of view is relevant as his work might reflect that same criticism and even certain adaptations of that work might reflect Scott's ideas more clearly. These texts will provide the basis for analysing the extent to which Scott's critical opinions on both Gothic literature and drama apply to *Lammermoor* and later on *Lucia di Lammermoor*. Once more, it is relevant to analyse whether Scott's own literary theories are fulfilled in his work and also to study if an opera adaptation can also fulfil Scott's theories. In addition, the thesis will draw on discussions of Scott's novel and Gothic literature found especially in Parsons' book *Witchcraft and Demonology in Scott's Fiction*, ideas to which I will add my own analysis using his work as basis. Other scholars are mentioned in this thesis, such as Fiona Robertson, James Kerr, and, A.O.J. Cockshut, yet of these, Parson is the only one that analyses the Gothic characters in Scott's works. Other authors were taken into account, yet, as it will be explained in the second chapter, they were not used for the purpose of this thesis. In addition, Scott's criticism on *Frankenstein* and drama has not been employed in Parsons' book nor any other I am aware of. Additionally, *The Monk*, is going to be compared with *Lammermoor* for understanding Scot's theories in more depth and how both works are Gothic but at the same time quite different. So, chapters 2 and 3 will be about Gothic literature while chapter 4 dwells on Scott's criticism about drama. The fifth and final chapter deals with the opera adaptation, where the main source will be Donizetti and Cammarano's libretto and to a lesser degree Donizetti's score. I shall argue

that the way in which the story of *Lammermoor* is adapted many aspects from the plot and characters are omitted, yet does this have an effect on how one might analyse the Gothic in Donizetti's work? Additionally, the DVD performance of *Lammermoor* breaks with Scott's ideals as a literary critic, in other words, it is an example of what the author considered bad drama.

Only two supernatural beings in the novel will be analysed, the Naiad and Alice's ghost. These entities are more significant when applying Scott's theories on what he considers a Gothic novel as he has argued in his introduction to *The Castle of Otranto*. The readers' opinion or feelings are to be taken into account to discern whether the supernatural in the story is credible. And, in fact, one of his main themes was to defend how Walpole's story overwhelms the reader with supernatural accounts. So, in this thesis it will be observed how the reader can be overwhelmed when ghosts appear too many times during the story, using as examples for it first *The Monk*, and the mentioned DVD performance of the opera. Likewise, Donizetti's opera adaptation *Lucia*³ attempts to combine the supernatural and the credible elements of the story. Additionally, for Scott a proper drama was a narrative where the focus was the story per se without any unnecessary distractions where the actions of the characters could be clearly understood. Undoubtedly, this is achieved in *Lucia* too, since the story is Lucia and Edgardo's forbidden love.

By acknowledging Scott's criticism on the topic of Gothic literature and drama, the topic of cause-effect or characters' own actions and consequences is clearly seen in both the opera and in Scott's novel as it will be explained. In both works, ghosts serve the purpose of foretelling accounts but the characters are the ones who determine their future by ignoring the warnings from ghosts as it will be seen in the following chapters.

³ I will refer to *Lucia di Lammermoor* when using "Lucia" in italics

2. Gothic Elements in Sir Walter Scott's Works

One of the most common features of Gothic literature that Sigmund Freud theorised about is defamiliarisation or the uncanny, *unheimlich* (Freud 124). As the word indicates the uncanny consists on making a familiar place, person, or even idea unfamiliar until the point that characters feel horror, a key point in any Gothic work. Similarly, horror is a branch of Gothic literature that focuses on loss of identity, the idea of home, displacing the familiar, loss of heritage, and, family and friends. Using the uncanny in a story makes characters vulnerable as it shakes values and certainties such as the feeling of safety in one's house or as in the case of *Lammermoor*, the loss of heritage. As Gina Wisker has explained in her work *Horror Fiction: An Introduction* many Gothic stories focus on romance, usually romances that are dangerous and might end well or might be a doomed love story. In addition, Ghost stories deal with the return of the repressed, people from the past, legends, secrets, family (Wisker 146,147).

For instance, Fiona Robertson deals with the implication of the reader in terror, her book *Legitimate Stories: Scott, Gothic, and the Authorities of Fiction* describes mostly the relationship between Scott's texts and the conventions and strategies of the late eighteenth and beginning on the nineteenth centuries. In her chapter "Gothic: Passages that Lead to Nothing. The Implicated Reader in the Drama of Terror" Robertson explains how political ideas and intellectual debate are portrayed in Gothic novels. In *The Monk* for instance, the issues of the intellectual debate are much more relevant than political ideas (Robertson 104). She also states that heroes and heroines from Gothic novels are passive characters that cannot control their situation and that undergo from a kind of rite of passage where they have to learn to leave infancy and accept the responsibilities and consequences of adult life (Robertson 107). Further, the author explains how progressively the reader started to "enjoy the spectacle of horror" (Robertson 110), and how even expectations were created on them. Although this chapter provides a deep explanation on Gothic literature and the relevance of the reader, I find that Scott's theory on the Gothic focuses more on realism and the reader's reaction on it.

James Kerr is another author that analysed Scott's works mainly as a story-teller. Kerr (3, 5) seems to differentiate between historical novel and Gothic novel, and states that Scott's version of Gothic is a response on previous Gothic novels. This author also makes reference to Scott's introduction to *The Castle of Otranto* and states that Scott's criticism on the novel is about the Gothic being used as an attraction that distracts from

the historical novel. In fact, Kerr states that Scott misread Walpole's novel but that his introduction shows Scott's own ideas about the past (Kerr 6). Even though, I agree with certain arguments that Kerr provides, in the second part of this chapter I will give my own interpretation of Scott's ideas on Gothic literature and his introduction to *The Castle of Otranto*. Scott, does indeed state that the Gothic distracts the reader from the story, yet it is not the Gothic elements per se, rather than the excessive use of supernatural events and characters.

A.O.J. Cockshut has analysed the topic of Cause-effect in *The Bride of Lammermoor*, which is precisely a theme that Scott also mentions in his introduction to *The Castle of Otranto* and in his "Essay on the Drama". This author has depicted cause-effect as "the formal principle of the realistic novel" (Cockshut 63). This one also introduces the reader to a set of a set of social assumptions, a situation, as the same time as it makes time and place definite. Further the author of the novel creates a personality for the character, and explains its background and motivations, leading the reader to reach their own conclusions (Cockshut 63). Cockshut (80) has also explained how Scott used the Gothic tradition to create his own version of Gothic in which the irrational and realism are relevant. He also has stated that when reading *Lammermoor*, the reader is distracted by the warnings of sibyls, making the supernatural elements in the story to drive focus of the reader away from social history (Cockshut 81). This is an argument I disagree with, as it will be clear from my own analysis of Scott's ideas provided bellow.

Still, the same critic has also explained how in Scott's novel psychological influences are present as he has provided the example of a tale where a Ravenswood was deprived of his possessions and how later he regained everything. So by reading this, the reader might think this to happen too and to see how Edgar regains his inheritance, yet this does not happen as other prophecies are fulfilled (Cockshut 82). Following this idea, I do believe that every action in the story has an effect, Edgar wants his revenge, yet he decides to abandon it for his love for Lucy, so the effect is that he does not retrieve his lost inheritance. Further, as it will be explained in chapter 3, there are more prophecies that are fulfilled due to the actions of certain characters. Although, Cockshut analyses more instances of *Lammermoor*, these were not relevant for the thesis, and thus, only part of his description of Cause-effect has been taken into account.

Another critic that has analysed Scott's works is Coleman O Parsons, who wrote about Scott's Waverley Novels in his book *Witchcraft and Demonology in Scott's Fiction*, so this work serves also as the basis to look upon Gothic characteristics on *Lammermoor*. Parsons wrote about several topics or features of which I will take into account: warning spirits, Sibyls, local legends, Ghosts, and, Curses, Omens, Dreams and Prophecies. Sibyls, ghosts and warning spirits are connected and even though Parsons gives examples on them, Alice's character could be allocated in these three categories.

According to Parsons the warning spirit "Hovels between ghosts and sibyls" (75), and while ghosts belong to the past along with other entities such as unappeased desires, devils, witches, magicians, poltergeists, elemental spirits, and fairies. Furthermore, the most relevant feature of the warning spirit is its predictions about the future as they tend to be second-sighted persons. This is more importantly if the seer is dead, as this character binds past, present, and, future like in the case of Alice in *Lammermoor*. She is the one who is continuously telling to Edgar to beware about the curse being fulfilled. Alice knows that the Ravenswood family is going reach its doom, she knows that the legend of the lady from the fountain denotes the decay of the family, and she warns Edgar about it.

Yet, Alice does not become a spirit or ghost until later in the novel, so instead of a warning spirit she might be a sibyl. Parsons has described them as a possible warning spirit that does not die until it is old. When the sibyl is an aged person the life experience of the character can be turned into confidence and knowledge of the future. In addition, Scott tended to portray these characters as lonely, eerie, and singular characters that did not follow dress code and acted in unexpected ways (Parsons 75, 80). From the moment Alice is presented to the reader she is referred as "Old Alice". Further, Lucy describes her in a positive way, "she is the empress of old women and queen of gossips", "seen a blind and paralytic old woman have so much acuteness of perception and dignity of manners. I assure you, she might be a countess from her language and behaviour.". Apart from this depiction, Alice is also referred as a kind of seer, "She is blind, poor old soul, but when she speaks to you, you would think she has some way of looking into your very heart.", "I am sure I often cover my face, or turn it away, for it seems as if she saw one change colour, though she has been blind these twenty years" (Scott, *Lammermoor* 45). Even later, in chapter 4 when they finally encounter her, the depiction of the woman is majestic, "Her figure was tall, commanding", "Her dress, though that of a peasant, was uncommonly clean, forming in that particular a strong contrast to most of her rank", "But

it was her expression of countenance which chiefly struck the spectator, and induced most persons to address her with a degree of deference and civility very inconsistent with the miserable state of her dwelling” (Scott, *Lammermoor* 48).

Moreover, Alice warns both Lucy and Edgar Ravenswood of each other, as the three witches do to Macbeth in Shakespeare’s play, Alice warns Lucy about Ravenswood, “No, my lord ... My warning is of another kind. You have driven matters hard with the house of Ravenswood. Believe a true tale: they are a fierce house, and there is danger in dealing with men when they become desperate” (Scott, *Lammermoor* 51-52). Alice continues to warn Lucy’s father –and her since both are meeting the old woman– by acknowledging Edgar’s intent of revenge, “I know nothing of the youth but what is honourable and open. Honourable and open, said I? I should have added, free, generous, noble. But he is still a Ravenswood, and may bide his time”, and, “There is blood of Chiesley in the veins of Ravenswood, and one drop of it were enough to fire him in the circumstances in which he is placed. I say, beware of him” (Scott, *Lammermoor* 52). Alice does likewise with Edgar Ravenswood and warns him not to continue with his love relationship with Lucy and reminding him of the Mermaid’s well, “and therefore she is to tarry by the Mermaid’s Well! Often has it been called a place fatal to the race of Ravenswood—often has it proved so; but never was it likely to verify old sayings as much as on this day.”, ““God forbid!” said Alice, solemnly; “and therefore I would have you depart these fatal bounds, where your love, as well as your hatred, threatens sure mischief, or at least disgrace, both to yourself and others...Begone from among them” (Scott, *Lammermoor* 201-202).

Regarding local legends, we have the famous Lady of the fountain. A tale that is supposed to start the decay of the Ravenswood family, as Alice states. This legend seems to anticipate the end of the love story between Lucy and Edgar, mostly since both couples meet in the same place, the fountain. Consequently, this local legend indicates that the fountain is haunted but also the reader can interpret from it that the love story is not going to end well. The legend tells the story of a Lord Ravenswood that meets a young beautiful lady in the same fountain where Edgar brings Lucy after saving her from the bull. At the Mermaid’s well they meet every Friday until the Lord Ravenswood tells father Zachary about it, and the later convinces him that the lady is in reality an evil creature. For this reason, they decide to trick her, since she always left before the vesper bell rang, they decided to ring the bell later so that she would show her real form, once this happens she

sinks into the fountain after bidding him adieu and leaves blood stained bubbles in the water. And based on the legend Scott states how everyone started to say that the fountain was a spot that is “fatal to the Ravenswood family” (Scott, *Lammermoor* 59), and that “to drink of the waters of the well, or even approach its brink, was... ominous to a descendant of that house” (Parsons 102-103). Moreover, it is this fountain where Edgar brings Lucy after saving her, where they promise to each other with the coin and where Alice’s ghost appears to Ravenswood.

Even though, this place is suggested to be haunted, Scott also provides different accounts on the legend by giving non-supernatural explanations to the legend. So some rumours were created suggesting that in reality the lady in the fountain or naiad was actually Lord Raymond’s mistress that was killed by him in an attack of jealousy and her blood mixed with the water in the fountain and thus, making the place a haunting one for the Ravenswood family as a bad memento of what an ancestor did. And others based the legend just based in old mythology (Scott, *Lammermoor* 58-59). Nevertheless, as stated before everyone thought the fountain to be a bad place or a bad omen for the Ravenswood family. The fact of this story being told when Edgar meets Lucy for the first time, and precisely in that fountain is interesting since it seems to anticipate the tragic love story that both will live. That place is even described as “fatal” afterwards when Edgar meets Lucy for the last time before she is obliged to marry another, “And having thus satisfied himself that he was taking not only a wise, but an absolutely necessary step, he took the path to the fatal fountain” (Scott, *Lammermoor* 205). As a result, once more the reader is lead to think that the place is haunted and that the legend is anticipating the doomed love story of Lucy and Edgar.

Parsons has analysed ghosts in Scott’s works too, and once again he has described them as the link to the past (115). The only ghost that appears in the novel is Alice, and precisely to Edgar Ravenswood who does not believe in witchcraft or legends, or superstitions. Once again the place where he encounters the ghost is the Mermaid’s fountain and “the Master associates its fatal reputation with the old sibyl’s warnings against any connexion with the usurping Ashton family” (Parsons 116). It is in chapter XXIII when Ravenswood meets Alice and his reaction is one of fear. Scott starts creating the horror ambient by depicting the horse’s response as he sees Ravenswood getting closer to the fountain, “His horse, which was moving slowly forward, suddenly interrupted its steady and composed pace, snorted, reared, and, though urged by the spur,

refused to proceed, as if some object of terror had suddenly presented itself” (Scott, *Lammermoor* 245). And once Edgar looks to the fountain he finds a female figure, that in the beginning he mistakes for Lucy, but then he realises her to be an old blind lady who is actually Alice. Additionally, the reader and Ravenswood can guess that it is an apparition and not the real Alice due to the portrayal of the woman:

“The singularity of her dress, which rather resembled a shroud than the garment of a living woman; the appearance of her person, larger, as it struck him, than it usually seemed to be; above all, the strange circumstance of a blind, infirm, and decrepit person being found alone [...] combined to impress him with a feeling of wonder approaching to fear.”

(Scott, *Lammermoor* 246)

Consequently, Ravenswood is reacting with fear towards the apparition, he even keeps looking at the spot waiting for Alice to reappear once she disappears between the trees. Ravenswood even remains “rooted to the ground”. Further, it is later when the reader and Ravenswood himself discover that indeed, Alice is death and what they experienced must have been her apparition. Yet as Parsons states, this incident focuses more on Alice than on the story, and the question of whether there was such a ghost is not fully addressed by Scott, since he does not give any clear information about it (Scott, *Lammermoor* 117). Further, ghosts represent the consciousness state in an easier way without having to give an entire description about the character’s mind, and Scott did this by using metaphors, repressed and doomed lives, tradition, and, psychological revelation (Parsons 121).

On Curses, omens, dreams and prophecies Parsons has addressed omens described as signs that make the reader ready to future events that are going to happen in the story, as for instance the gold coin moment the omen in *Lammermoor*. After Edgar offers to Alice a gold coin to reward her for warning him on not getting revenge from the Ashtons, and she later rejects any payment, he decides to break the coin in two as a symbol of love and promise. So, he gives the other half to Lucy when they are in the Mermaid’s well and promise to be together. This action is a bad presage since after this Lucy is deceived into marrying Bucklaw, breaking the promise with Edgar, then she dies and Edgar goes in a duel against her brother, he dies on the way as he falls into quicksand (Parsons 243). The fact that he first tries to give the coin to Alice –who is always warning them about their fatal love story– is relevant since he wants to pay her for her warnings about the future but at the same time he does not believe her, ““You drive me to madness, Alice,” said Ravenswood; “you are more silly and more superstitious than old Balderstone”

(Scott, *Lammermoor* 201), and ““I will think on what you have said, Alice,” said Ravenswood, more composedly. “I believe you mean truly and faithfully by me, but you urge the freedom of an ancient domestic somewhat too far” (Scott, *Lammermoor* 202). Therefore, the fact that he tries to give to Alice a coin that later becomes a promise with Lucy while not following the old woman’s advice is a foretelling of the fatal end.

2.2. Scott’s Critical Opinions on the Gothic

Scott’s pieces of criticism are relevant to have a better insight on Scott’s ideas about Gothic literature, and to discern whether he is faithful to his own criticism and how this could also be portrayed on adaptations of Scott’s works. For that, his writings about *Frankenstein* by Shelley, and, Walpole’s *The Castle of Otranto* will be taken into consideration. It is worth pointing out that when Scott wrote the critique about *Frankenstein*, the work was not attributed to Shelley yet, since it was anonymously published. For this reason, his discussion is based only on the book himself without any reference to the author’s background.

Scott has written his account about *Frankenstein* first, describing Romantic fiction and its relationship with the laws of nature. In Gothic literature this varies as authors tend to go beyond credibility by introducing supernatural characters and making it believable. Further, a proper Romantic novel shall awake “the marvellous” –as referred to by Scott– usually called in English literature “the sublime”. This awakening of “the marvellous” shall affect both the reader and the author when reading or writing it. The readers shall also be drawn by the descriptions of the wonders that are being described (Scott, “Article IX” *Miscellaneous* 251-252). Further, the main characters from the novel must go into an adventure that changes them completely and where they encounter the supernatural, “The hero and heroine, partakers of the supernatural character which belongs to their adventures, walk the maze of enchantment with a firm and undaunted step, and appear as much at their ease, amid the wonders around them” (Scott, “Article IX” *Miscellaneous* 251).

In addition, it is also explained how the aim of supernatural events are not only intended for evoking the sublime on the reader but also to show the possible effects of miraculous events produced in the person witnessing them, in a more philosophical point of view (Scott, “Article IX” *Miscellaneous* 251). Thus, Scott has pointed out that the aim of many supernatural events is to depict how encountering a ghost, or a witch can affect the characters, and which effects these actions might have in the continuation of the novel.

The difference between the marvellous and the effects of the marvellous are also remarked upon and Scott gives as examples *Gulliver's Travels* and *Tom Thumb*. The first one is has been described as the perfect narration where the Jonathan Swift clearly depicted Gulliver's feelings in several misfortunes he lived, while the *Tom Thumb* reference is to show how the reader is just exhausted by the description of the narration (Scott, "Article IX" *Miscellaneous* 53). When Scott applied this to *Frankenstein*, he remarked that the reader is informed from the beginning about the supernatural and so, making the reader aware from the beginning on the possible supernatural accounts. Scott also provided examples where the feelings of the characters are clearly depicted, the effects of the marvellous, and summarised the narration while commenting on it. Additionally, Scott has expressed how the author was able to inspire fear and create expectation in the reader, while at the same time a natural end for the novel was provided allowing the reader to expect more events to happen (Scott, "Article IX" *Miscellaneous* 267).

Regarding *The Castle of Otranto*, Scott wrote this introduction taking into account who the author was and included some information about Walpole's background. One of the main points is Walpole's Gothic taste in architecture and how this can also be seen in his writing (Scott in Bleiler 5). Thus, Scott has depicted Walpole's castle as an argument in favour of exaggeration, that is, the fact that Walpole's architectural taste was exaggerated meant that the use of Gothic elements in *The Castle of Otranto* are also excessive. Nevertheless, by mingling chivalry romance and "the marvellous" Walpole achieved a new genre to remerge, the Gothic (Scott in Bleiler 6). At the same time, some scholars from the period stated that Walpole's intention was to excite horror, surprise, and, to appeal readers when reading the supernatural. Yet, Scott also believed that Walpole's aim was also to portray the manners and life from feudal times in a realistic way. Once more, Scott gave relevance to accounts happening in a natural manner, in a more realistic way so that the story is more credible. And even though some supernatural happenings occur, "the marvellous" it is relevant as the reader believes it –since it is written in a natural manner– yet, at the same time the reader knows that it is unreal (Scott 8). Furthermore, Scott has explained that it is not easy to depict a realistic story of a historic novel while being also part of Gothic literature,

“It is, for instance, almost impossible to build such a modern Gothic structure as shall impress us with the feelings we have endeavoured to describe. It may be grand, or it may be gloomy; it may excite magnificent or melancholy ideas; but it must fail in bringing forth the sensation of supernatural awe, connected with halls that have echoed to the sounds of remote generations, and have been pressed by the footsteps of those who have long since passed away.”

(Scott in Bleiler 9)

As it can be interpreted in the quote, Scott made reference to “the marvellous”, yet the effect of it cannot be overwhelming and it must describe a realistic historical story. Consequently, Walpole’s aim was not an easy one to achieve and Scott’s admiration for his work can be clearly seen mostly in page 13 of his introduction where he addresses the most striking points of the novel. The various supernatural accounts in the novel happen all simultaneously and to fulfil the ancient prophecy: the doom of the house of Manfred. Further, all of these events are gradually prepared so that the reader is continuously reminded or hinted on the fatal end. Additionally, the romance is explained to be merely depending on agency and the feelings of the characters and drive by the drama (Scott in Bleiler 10-11).

3. The Gothic in *The Bride of Lammermoor*

In this chapter the theories explained in the second chapter will be employed for the sake of analysing both *The Monk* and *Lammermoor*. For that, a comparison between the ghosts and supernatural entities in both works will be made focusing on four different characters: Elvira and the bleeding nun, followed by, Alice and the naiad from the mermaid's fountain. The aim is to give a better understanding of comparison will serve for a better understanding of how both novels belong to Gothic literature yet in different ways.

The two supernatural beings in *Lammermoor* appear very briefly and at different points in the story. These characters are related to either the Ravenswood family or Ashton, and both can be considered as ghosts. Moreover, these beings are more significant if one considers Scott's theories on the Gothic novel. For instance, Scott has argued in his introduction to *The Castle of Otranto*, that the readers' opinion or feelings are relevant, that is, how they are likely to react when a supernatural account is happening. The reader's possible opinions serve for analysing whether the supernatural in the story appears credible or if on the contrary it distracts the reader from the story or main themes in the novel. And, in fact, one of his main themes was to defend how Walpole's story overwhelms the reader with supernatural accounts. Scott, indeed, avoids the excessiveness of supernatural accounts in *Lammermoor*, which also makes the story more credible according to him.

Thus, "The marvellous", and the effects of it are going to be looked at in both *The Monk*, mostly in the ghosts of Elvira and the bleeding nun, and also in Alice and the naiad in *Lammermoor*. Additionally, how the characters act when encountering these supernatural beings will be discussed. Yet, it is relevant to point out that Scott prepares the reader for the supernatural events that will occur in the novel, as it can be seen in the following quote, "We are bound to tell the tale as we have received it; and, considering the distance of the time, and propensity of those through whose mouths it has passed to the marvellous, this could not be called a Scottish story unless it manifested a tinge of Scottish superstition" (Scott, *Lammermoor* 245). As in this quote, the reader is being told about what is going to happen in the narration and "the marvellous" is built into the narrative itself. It is therefore relevant to pay close attention to "the marvellous" and its effects.

3.1. Comparison with Lewis's *The Monk*

As I have already indicated, Lewis' *The Monk* and Scott's *Lammermoor* are quite different from each other. Furthermore, these two novels were written with different backgrounds, Scott was Scottish and many of the tales and mythology in his works come from Scottish culture. Nevertheless, I find that Scott's theory on "the marvellous", and "the effect of the marvellous" can be clearly discerned by comparing these two novels. Additionally, Scott's ideas on character's natural reactions when encountering the supernatural will also be regarded in this part of the thesis.

Starting with ghosts the main difference is how many and how long these appear in the two novels. This is relevant since Scott himself has explained that overwhelming the reader with supernatural entities distracts the audience from the main focus in the story, which is clearly shown in the amount of ghost appearances in both novels. In *The Monk*, there are two ghost, the bleeding nun and Elvira, while in *Lammermoor* there two ghost or spirits, Alice and the lady in the fountain or naiad. Even though the same amount of ghosts appears in both works, in the first one the bleeding nun has a significance in Raymond de las Cisternas' story for a period of time. Yet, Elvira appears as a warning ghost briefly, and in *Lammermoor*, both spirits appear very briefly and they are extremely relevant for the end of the story. Further, the words "spirit", "Ghost", and "spectre" appear fewer times in *Lammermoor*, whereas in *The Monk*, they appear more often as seen in the table below.

	<i>Lammermoor</i>	<i>The Monk</i>
Ghost (fantasma ⁴)	2	61
Spectre(s)	5	26
Spirit(s)	57	49

Therefore, the table above shows how many times ghosts are referenced in both stories and that in *The Monk*, the reader can be overwhelmed by the excessiveness of supernatural entities and distracted from the main topic. Further, the bleeding nun is significant since it is part of Raymond and Agnes' plot, yet at the end is merely a distraction for Raymond and is an obstacle in his love story with Agnes. The spirit plot is long in Raymond's story and even though it affects him, it is only when he is able to free the spirit that he is able

⁴ In *The Bride of Lammermoor*, the word "fantasma" is referenced which can mean "ghost". (Oxford English Dictionary Online, "Phantasm", n.2 a.

to live happily with Agnes. So, when applying “the marvellous”, and “the effect of the marvellous”, one might assume that the reader will be overwhelmed with the excessiveness of the supernatural.

When Raymond meets the bleeding nun after mistaking her for Agnes, a description is given on how he reacts when seeing her, “I felt a sudden chillness spread itself over my body. I shuddered without knowing wherefore; Cold dews poured down my forehead, and my hair stood bristling with alarm” (Lewis 159). The narration continues with, “A figure entered, and drew near my Bed with solemn measured steps. With trembling apprehension, I examined this midnight Visitor. God Almighty! It was the Bleeding Nun! It was my lost Companion! (Lewis 159-160). Furthermore, “What a sight presented itself to my startled eyes! I beheld before me an animated Corse. Her countenance was long and haggard; Her cheeks and lips were bloodless; The paleness of death was spread over her features, and her eyeballs fixed steadfastly upon me were lustreless and hollow” (Lewis 160).

When reading these lines, the reader is likely to be horrified by the descriptions given of the spectre and Raymond’s feelings, an indeed what Scott called “the marvellous”, yet, also, “the effects of the marvellous” can be found in these lines. Raymond’s horror towards that apparition is quite natural, even he being frozen afterwards is a common act from humans when in fear. Yet, when looking at cause-effect –which is a term that would be analysed more in depth later on, mostly in drama– the bleeding nun does not have much effect on Raymond. It affects him by inspiring horror and fear to him due to her being a ghost but that is all. Once Raymond frees the ghost he can continue with his quest as the ghost does not determine or make a warning about his future. While in *Lammermoor* both the Naiad and Alice affect to the Ravenswood family and to Edgar. Further, even if in both novels warning spirits appear the effects that they have on the characters are different. Elvira’s ghost tries to protect her daughter and doom Ambrosio, yet, Alice reminds Edgar about his destiny, and how the Ravenswood family would come to an end. Regarding cause-effect, once more the characters are the sole agents from their actions in both novels, Ambrosio is the only responsible one of his damnation as it is his actions that cause his fatal end. In the case of Edgar, he is responsible for his actions since he is from the beginning warned that his love story with Lucy would bring his end, and still he decides to ignore Alice’s warnings and continue his relationship with Lucy.

Nevertheless, there is some similarity between both narrations and ghosts. In *The Monk*, the story of the bleeding nun serves as a kind of omen for Agnes and Raymond's love story, and the same occurs with Edgar and Lucy's romance. The bleeding nun's tale is told to Raymond about the tragic ghost that haunts the Lindenberg castle –where Agnes is in that part of the novel–, afterwards he would learn the real story, yet the similitude with Scott's novel is how once the real story is known this resembles Raymond and Agnes' romance. A love story that is impossible and preceded by a legend. Similarly, Edgar and Lucy suffer from the same, Edgar learns the legend that foretells the end of his family, in the exact same place where the legend takes place, the mermaid's well. Even though these romances are based on legends the finale of each story is different: Agnes and Raymond end up together, while Lucy and Edgar die preventing a happy ending. Furthermore, both male characters mistake the ghosts for their loved ones. Raymond believes Agnes to be the bleeding nun, Agnes agrees on dressing like the ghost to escape with him as they do not believe the myth to be true; and Edgar mistakes Alice's ghost for Lucy for a brief moment in the novel, as he also is sceptical about the supernatural.

Moreover, Lucy and Agnes both suffer from other character's actions which results in an impossible love since they cannot continue their romance with the men they are in love with. Lucy is deceived by her mother to marry Buclaw, being Lucy's mother the sole agent of Lucy's misery. Likewise, the prioress punishes Agnes for being pregnant by imprisoning her, resulting in Agnes almost dying but being saved by Raymond at the end of the novel. So, these two women are the cause for Agnes and Lucy's misery, yet the effects are different, Agnes is saved and has a happy finale, while Lucy dies. So, even if some characters cause certain characters' misery, in *Lammermoor*, the agency of the characters is much more clear since the ghosts that appear in the narration only serve as warnings and are not obstacles in the love story, only warning spirits, whereas in *The Monk*, the bleeding nun does affect to Raymond as he has to free the ghost in order to be able to go back to Agnes. Consequently, the supernatural entities in *Lammermoor* have an influence in the main characters' future but do not disrupt the love story, while in *The Monk*, the ghosts affect the characters for a limited period of time and arguably only distracts the reader from the main theme. So, Scott's ideas on Gothic literature play out differently in these works, *The Monk* being a novel similar to *The Castle of Otranto*, in contrast with *Lammermoor*, which appears written in accordance with the author's critical ideas and opinions.

3.2. How the Characters Are Affected by the Supernatural

In Parsons' analysis and Scott's ideas about Gothic literature have been explained, and these will now be applied to *Lammermoor*. In the novel there is a warning spirit, Alice, yet Parsons has also addressed the sibyl in his book (Parson 79), and Alice also fits in that role. Both characters warn other characters about misfortunes, yet sibyls die when they are old in age and become a spirit. The purpose of the present chapter will not be to decide in which category Alice fits better, instead she is going to be considered as both sibyl and warning spirit. Since Alice's role of warning the characters has already been analysed, it is now more pertinent to acknowledge how she influences Edgar and Lucy.

The first instance where Alice appears is her encounter with Edgar. As it has been stated before even when Alice is alive she is continuously reminding the characters of her warnings towards each other, that is, Lucy towards Edgar, and Edgar towards Lucy, yet both characters ignore her warnings and continue with the fatal romance. And once more, Alice, as a ghost, delivers to Edgar the warning about his house's fall. Even the author is telling the reader that a proper Scottish story shall tell a superstition in it, then the story continues with Edgar's encountering with a ghost, "His horse, which was moving slowly forward, suddenly interrupted its steady and composed pace, snorted, reared, and, though urged by the spur, refused to proceed, as if some object of terror had suddenly presented itself" (Scott, *Lammermoor* 245). This lines prepare the reader for what comes next, mostly due to the following words, "as if some object of terror had suddenly presented itself", the specific words, "some object of terror" can generate what Scott coined as "the marvellous" since the reader at this instance is probably afraid of what is going to happen later in the story. And, precisely, it turns out to be a female figure dressed in a greyish mantle who is in the same exact spot where Lucy was when hearing the myth of the naiad from Edgar himself. What leads Ravenswood to think that the feminine figure is Lucy herself and later on he discovers that the figure it is actually "old blind Alice" (Scott, *Lammermoor* 245-246).

Additionally, the reader and Ravenswood can guess that it is an apparition and not the real Alice due to the portrayal of the woman, "The singularity of her dress, which rather resembled a shroud than the garment of a living woman" (Scott, *Lammermoor* 246), not only her clothes are depicted with supernatural connotations but also her appearance, "larger, as it struck him, than it usually seemed to be" (Scott, *Lammermoor* 246). Yet, more importantly is Edgar's reaction on seeing her, as Scott depicts on page 246, fear, a

wonder that is approaching fear, that is, “the marvellous”. Still, Ravenswood is brave enough to approach Alice even though she signals him with her hand not to and retracts to be further from him when he goes towards her. Besides, Alice is continuously presented as a supernatural entity since she speaks but no sound comes from her mouth, only the movement of her speaking, yet no communication is made as there is no sound, and she disappears between the trees. More importantly, Edgar’s reaction is to yield “to the strong and terrific impression” that the Alice he encounters, or being as Scott coined, was not from the world we know, but from an unreal, supernatural one, and by thinking this: Edgar “remains rooted to the ground”. Once he is able to react, he checks the spot where Alice was and finds that no trace was left by her, as if she was not there at all, as if he did not encounter her. In addition, even Ravenswood’s horse is portrayed as an animal scared with the entire meeting, “he found his horse sweating and terrified, as if experiencing that agony of fear with which the presence of a supernatural being is supposed to agitate the brute creation” (Scott, *Lammermoor* 246). So, Scott, indeed, depicted the only instance where a ghost appears in *Lammermoor* by following “the marvellous” and the effects of it in the characters as it has been observed in these examples. Not only Ravenswood is bewildered by his coming across Alice’s ghost, but also the reader experiences similar feelings. Thus, Scott depicts what he considered Gothic literature, seen on how he uses “the marvellous” without distracting the reader from the main topic and by inspiring a horror feeling in the reader.

Yet, Alice is not the only Gothic or supernatural character appearing in *Lammermoor*, a naiad is presented briefly in the legend of the mermaid’s fountain. This legend occurs and is told precisely in the same place that Edgar brings Lucia when he saves her and her father from the bull. Once again, it is relevant to acknowledge that it is a spot that is “fatal to the Ravenswood family” (Scott, *Lammermoor* 59), and that Scott mentions Scottish legends, and Scottish tradition before starting to narrate the legendary tale. And it is precisely in this part of the story when the first supernatural account is told, and also serves as a foreshadowing of the end of Lucia and Edgar’s romance.

The local legend tells the tale of Mr Ravenswood who encounters a young lady next to the fountain and since that moment they decide to meet each other once a week. It is interesting how the lady is described and the reader is not aware that the naiad or nymph could be a supernatural character and not just a woman. The author describes her as a “beautiful young lady”, “like a second Egeria”, the charms of the Nymph’s mind” he

is obviously giving her a supernatural depiction, and the vocabulary used it is more common of a Petrarchan poem, as if the man or even the author were charmed by the lady's appearance. The reader can start to guess the supernatural features of the lady since the encounters are always at sunset or even after sunset, and always near to the fountain.

The fact that the lady sets restrictions about the intercourse with Raymond Ravenswood in the legend is not considered uncommon in the story, since women were not supposed to act freely and as they desired as it is explained by Scott himself:

“According to the ideas of the time, which did not permit a young woman to offer her sentiments on any subject of importance unless required to do so, Lucy was bound to appear ignorant of the meaning of all that had passed betwixt Alice and her father, and imputed the emotion he had observed to the fear of the wild cattle which grazed in that part of the extensive chase through which they were now walking.”

(Scott, *Lammermoor* 54)

Thus, the lady in the fountain might only be able to meet Mr Ravenswood due to certain society rules or duties, thus the restrictions in their encounters. In addition, the lovers meet only once a week, specifically of Fridays and they have to depart before the bell from the chapel next to the woods rings, which is curious since it makes the reader to wonder if there is any kind of magic involved or any specific event for the lovers to be that restricted on meeting. And it is not until Raymond Ravenswood speaks to a priest that he is acknowledged on the supernatural nature of the encounters with the anonymous lady. So, once he decides to check whether she is “a limb of the kingdom of darkness” (Scott, *Lammermoor* 58), as the priest describes her, the lady goes under a trial where the bells would ring later than usual to confirm the lady's nature. At the appointed time the lovers meet again and no change appears in the naiad when the bell does not ring on time, that is until she realises of it and “she tore herself from her lover's arms with a shriek of despair, bid him adieu for ever, and, plunging into the fountain, disappeared from his eyes” (Scott, *Lammermoor* 58). Moreover, in her descent throughout the well, as depicted in page 58, some bubbles are produced and these are crimsoned with blood, and thus showing that the lady was not an evil demon or spirit as the priest believed, yet, indeed, she was a supernatural being.

It is also important to take into account that there were some rumours created from this legend, suggesting that in reality the ghost was Raymond's mistress that was killed by him in an attack of jealousy. Another version just states that this tale is based in old mythology and thus, not being real as Scott describes in *Lammermoor* (58, 59). Nevertheless, as stated before everyone thought the fountain to be a bad place or a bad omen for the Ravenswood family (Scott, *Lammermoor* 59). The fact of this story being told when Edgardo meet Lucia for the first time, and precisely in that fountain is interesting since it seems to anticipate the tragic love story that both will live. That place is even described as "fatal" afterwards when Edgardo meets Lucia for the last time before she is obliged to marry another, "And having thus satisfied himself that he was taking not only a wise, but an absolutely necessary step, he took the path to the fatal fountain" (Scott, *Lammermoor* 205). In the quote, the narrator is telling to the reader that the fountain is haunted and that the legend is anticipating the doomed love story of Lucia and Edgardo.

Yet, more importantly "the marvellous" and its effects are perfectly portrayed in this part of the narration too. To begin with, the author is from the beginning making the reader aware of the mysterious tale that is going to be told, "Tradition, always busy, at least in Scotland, to grace with a legendary tale a spot in itself interesting, had ascribed a cause of peculiar veneration to this fountain" (Scott, *Lammermoor* 57). Further, the narrator continues explaining when and how they met and in doing so also provides a portrayal of the lady, and as stated before, the depiction of the Nymph is worth it of a Petrarchan poem since it describes the woman as an ideal one. Thus, creating a fascination for the lady, even the reader might resemblance her to the portrayal of elves in Tolkien's *The Lord of the Rings* for instance, and so, fulfilling "the marvellous" since the author is evoking powerful feelings not only in the characters but also in the audience.

This feeling is even more enhanced when Scott adds mystery to the tale, "The charms of the nymph's mind completing the conquest which her beauty had begun, and the mystery of the intrigue adding zest to both. She always appeared and disappeared close by the fountain, with which, therefore, her lover judged she had some inexplicable connexion" (Scott, *Lammermoor* 57). Therefore, when reading this part of the novel "the marvellous" is produced by the descriptions of the lady and also the mystery surrounding, yet, the effects of "the marvellous" are not that visible in this instance. Once the naiad disappears inside the fountain, Mr Ravenswood is full of remorse and regrets that his curiosity caused the death of the nymph, and he even dies in battle shortly after.

Nevertheless, to honour her he ornaments the fountain before going to battle. So, the naiad affects to Mr Ravenswood since he decided to honour her in the place they used to meet, however, the reader only knows that he loved the naiad and there is no depiction on how he acted on seeing her, and thus, the effect of “the marvellous” is not portrayed but it is implicit in the fact that he loves her. Still, what Scott referred to as cause-effect is fulfilled since Mr Ravenswood decides to ornament the fountain after his actions that caused the death of the naiad.

4. Scott's "Essay on the Drama"

Even though, *The Bride of Lammermoor* is not a drama but rather a historical novel, the love story is both tragic and dramatic. However, the main reason why I find necessary to discuss this essay on drama is because Scott's ideas especially on cause and effect mechanisms in drama can be applied to opera. This is important, given part of my goal is to show how an opera adaptation can be analysed by using literary theory. By discussing Scott's theories on drama, first in relation to his own work and then to the opera adaptation of *Lammermoor*, I aim to demonstrate that even though Scott's plot is more concise than Scott's one, the main topics are also portrayed in the opera and Scott's views on Gothic and drama are also represented in the opera. Thus, in this chapter Scott's ideas on drama will be summarized and applied to *Lammermoor*, and later on to Donizetti's *Lucia*.

Scott starts giving a definition on drama as a genre, that he adopted and extended from Dr Johnson, that states, "It is a poem of fictitious composition in dialogue, in which the action is not related but represented." (Scott, "Essay" *Miscellaneous* 315). Scott also states that it is inherent to human nature since even children imagine being fictional characters and it has been an entertainment for humans since ancient times. He even compares it to sports with the exception of stating that fine arts: poetry, music, and, painting were at service of people who used their genius on creating sublime works, that is, for Scott fine arts requires a lot of effort and a different kind of devotion than sports, being the first one more about training the mind and the second one more physical. From this statement we could interpret that he means drama to be a combination between sport –since acting is physical–, and poetry and music, which are the ones that require from genius. Parting from this, he continues on relating drama in classical Greece, which he considered it to be the regulated and polished drama. (Scott, "Essay" *Miscellaneous* 315). According to Scott, Greek drama always included music and many times there was also recitation to entertain the audience, and this type of performance developed into the better known Greek classical drama. Yet, Aeschylus and Thespis were the first to introduce more actors in the narration, dialogues and musical intervals, the scene, and, the stage (Scott, "Essay" *Miscellaneous* 316, 317). This is relevant since Scott believes classical drama should be the model of all forms of dramatic writing.

According to Scott the most remarkable change was the introduction of the chorus as a new character that sang songs in honour of Bacchus and that instead of being plain songs, these became really difficult musical pieces being more similar to the modern

orchestra. (Scott, "Essay" *Miscellaneous* 317). I consider the chorus to be equivalent to an orchestra, meaning that both give relevant pieces of information about the story with the difference that the chorus used both words and music, while the orchestra uses music that has a meaning if we were to analyse it in musical terms. Thus, depicting relevant topics from a work with music that has no words is as relevant as portraying it throughout a singing chorus. In addition, the chorus also was responsible to moralize and comment on the feelings and adventures of the characters (Scott, "Essay" *Miscellaneous* 317). Therefore, the chorus mostly served as the voice of the public rather than the agent of the story, likewise, orchestra does the same by depicting the topics, expressing the feelings of characters or even foreshadowing events. Then, the instrumentation in *Lucia* does depict the character's feelings or certain topics that are not sung or even it might foreshadow future events by the use of *leitmotifs*, yet this is not going to be analysed since it is not the aim of this thesis to analyse music.

Regarding Roman drama, they only introduced the change of the rank of the actors since their work was valued differently and actors even had fame or benefits in society (Scott, "Essay" *Miscellaneous* 338). Then, drama changed with the rise of Christian religion and Mysteries became quite popular were moralities were also told (Scott, "Essay" *Miscellaneous* 343). Eventually drama developed and new genres were created such as historical drama that consisted on recounting many years of historical happenings in two or three hours were dramatic and not real events were added to make it more appealing for the audience (Scott, "Essay" *Miscellaneous* 345, 346). This genre developed into Romantic drama where the main topic was the created story rather than the historical, yet these were set in the past. Scott expresses his admiration for this genre but at the same time states that these went far from the classical drama which he considers to be the highest drama (Scott, "Essay" *Miscellaneous* 347, 348). It is relevant to point out that Scott considered this Romantic drama as not good enough, and declared that many plays were focused on appealing the reader with violence or sex rather than the story or themes per se.

In the case of Italy, classical drama was not successful and modern Italian drama did not appeal to the audience. The plots lacked attractiveness, and drama was subordinate to opera. Scott defines it as a modification of drama that has been imported to "every civilized kingdom of Europe" (Scott, "Essay" *Miscellaneous* 351), and even countries competed on which opera singer was the best one. Scott also references Voltaire since the

later believed Italian tragic opera to be the closest imitation of classical drama since both choruses are quite similar, serving as the voice of the public or describing actions, and the recitative parallels the musical declamation of Greek classical drama (Scott, "Essay" *Miscellaneous* 352). Yet, at the same time, Voltaire preferred classical drama than opera even though he was fascinated by "the brilliant intermixture" of music, dancing, the chorus, decorations, and dressing and he believed audiences to attend more times to an opera than to the most sublime tragedy. Additionally, Scott gives his point of view in this regard, stating that no matter how sublime an opera might be the composer is only focused on the music and the dialogues and literature becomes banal and not good enough (Scott, "Essay" *Miscellaneous* 352); a statement that this thesis intends to counterpoint by using Scott's own criticism and ideas on gothic literature to demonstrate that Donizetti's opera adaptation does, indeed, fulfil Scott's ideas on Gothic and drama.

One of the most important characteristics of drama according to Scott who bases himself on Aristotle's ideas on drama is the narrative, this must contain a beginning, a middle, and an end, and these three shall be progressive, the account shall evolve until the catastrophe arrives to then being solved at the end of the tale (Scott, "Essay" *Miscellaneous* 358). In addition, Scott explains how these events that occur in a chain drive to each other to happen and he provides the example of Shakespeare's *Macbeth*. Scott expounds how the murder of Duncan leads to Banquo's one and at the end to the fall of the tyrant, events that happened independently, on their own but that in the whole are connected and make the whole of the tragic story. Moreover, according to Scott, the example of *Macbeth* goes further than Aristotle's ideas on drama, since the entire happening is due to Macbeth's ambition, and due to his actions certain events happen progressively (Scott, "Essay" *Miscellaneous* 259). Similarly, I find that in both works supernatural entities are involved and these characters serve as warning for the main characters to avoid their fatal ends. In *Macbeth*, the three weird sisters appear to Macbeth to warn him about his destiny, yet Macbeth ignores them and murders Duncan and Banquo afterwards in order to achieve the crown which also leads to his doom, similarly Edgar ignores Alice's warning and continues his romantic relationship with Lucy that ends up with the end of the Ravenswood family. Interestingly, even though supernatural entities –actually the nature of the three weird sisters is worth of research– appear in these works to warn the characters, it is the characters themselves, the ones that with their actions, that define their outcomes. Further, the best instance in *Lammermoor* is that even

though Alice warns Lucy and his father to beware Edgar Ravenswood, it is actually Lucy's mother that with her manipulations and tricks makes Lucy to marry Bucklaw resulting on Lucy trying to kill her husband and afterwards becoming ill and dying. Therefore, it can be seen how not only the plot is progressive, the actions of the characters have its consequences: cause-effect. Yet, is all of this also fulfilled in *Lucia*? Even though Alice does not appear in the opera adaptation, there is a warning spirit appearing in it, and instead of warning Edgardo it does so to Lucia. Although the ghost does not talk, Lucia makes reference to it and the myth of how that ghost died, Lucia is fearful while singing this which suggest that she is afraid that the same story might occur to her. Still, she continues her love story with Edgardo. Also, in the opera adaptation, Lucia's brother is the one that manipulates her on marrying with Arturo which results on the famous mad scene, later Lucia's death, and Edgrad's suicide. Once more, it can be seen that the characters define their futures through their actions.

Furthermore, the amount of time in which the drama occurs is also relevant since the lapse of time shall be unnoticeable for the audience, that is, if the audience is bored time seems to go slowly, yet if the drama is entertaining time appears to run faster. Further, the time in the narration itself is to be credible for the actions to be understood, if there are many gaps between the actions, or if the audience is left unaware that three years have passed between one act and another the narrative can be misunderstood. Additionally, according to Scott, if several stories are told at the same time with no correlation is deficient drama, while those different plots could be combined at the end (Scott, "Essay" *Miscellaneous* 360, 367). I consider the passing of time and too many stories to be told at the same time relevant since from my point of view the DVD opera adaptation does exactly this. By adding more scenes of the ghost and an additional ghost that does not appear in Scott's work nor in Donizetti's, the opera director distracts the audience with very many supernatural accounts, and the story seems to have no correlation. This makes the audience confused. The fact that an additional ghost is added made me wonder a lot about that character appearing in the DVD, and in some scenes I was not understanding what was happening since the singers were singing but the ghosts were doing something totally different and had no relation with the singers' lyrics or actions.

5. How an Opera Adaptation Might Fulfil Scott's Ideas on Gothic and Drama

When adapting a literary work into an opera we have to take into account several factors. The scenery and music are relevant too, so when analysing the Gothic and drama in *Lucia*, the role of the supernatural entities, cause-effect, and Scott's ideas can be also depicted in the music or the scenery. For that Gaetano Donizetti and Salvatore Cammarano's libretto and score will be the main references, apart from the 2016's DVD performance at ROH directed by Katie Mitchell. This specific performance has been chosen precisely because of the controversy that it created since it differs from the traditional representations of *Lucia*. This can be found in a BBC article called "Royal Opera House Audience Boo Violent Production of *Lucia di Lammermoor*", another article written by Fiona Maddocks, "*Lucia di Lammermoor* Review-Flawed but of Provocative Thought", and, "*Lucia di Lammermoor* review- Bloody and Convincing" by Erica Jeal. Moreover, I consider this specific performance useful for discussing the Gothic, because it has more affinities with Gothic literature such as Lewis' *The Monk* than with Scott's theories about the Gothic. This is relevant as this specific opera adaptation can be regarded as the opposite of what Scott considered Gothic and drama, while on the contrary, the traditional performance of the same opera can be considered relevant based on Scott's ideas. At the same time, while I could dwell on the differences of the traditional opera representation and Katie Mitchell's version, that is not possible within the scope of this thesis, so instead some scenes or actions from the DVD will be highlighted.

Additionally, for Scott a proper drama was an account where the focus was the story per se without any unnecessary distractions where the actions of the characters could be clearly seen. Undoubtedly, this is achieved in *Lucia* too, since the story is about Lucia and Edgardo's forbidden love. The removal of certain characters (Alice, Lucy's father and mother) helps to pinpoint the romance and also shows more clearly that every single deed in the opera is done by the characters. Therefore, I consider that no supernatural entity has intervened in it, so characters are the sole responsible ones of their actions and destiny. This view is explained by Scott in his "Essay on the Drama" where he exposes the history of this genre and explains his own view about it. By acknowledging Scott's criticism on gothic literature and drama, the topic of cause-effect or the character's own actions and consequences is clearly seen in both the opera and in Scott's novel. In the narration the Naiad from the fountain and Alice's ghost serve as reminders of Mr.

Ravenswood's doom, and Lucy's mother's actions towards her daughter lead the love story to the fatal end. In the same way, in the opera version the ghost haunts Lucia and makes her fear for her future –like Hamlet is from Banquo's ghost– yet, it is his brother's actions and her own actions that cause the dramatic end of the story. So, in both works, ghosts serve the purpose of foretelling events but the characters are the ones who determine their future by ignoring the warnings from ghosts. Further, Scott expresses in his introduction to *The Castle of Otranto* how ghosts are the tool used to show the fear of certain characters towards the real agents of the story, which in this case are the characters per se or their families.

Because this chapter focuses on both the novel by Scott and the opera adaptation, both Linda Hutcheon's and Gary Shmidgal's theories on adaptation are going to be used. As stated by Hutcheon (VXI) there are various ways to engage the audience into an adaptation, simply by addressing the most common and basic questions in any research: what, why, who, how, where and when. Thus, both works –Scott and Donizetti's– shall be regarded from all of these perspectives, but specially from the *how* as we are taking into account three works from different instances in time. It is also relevant to acknowledge that even though these three versions of Lucia's story might use the same tools –all three focus on the love story for instance–, this account is probably adapted to the society when the adaptation was produced (Hutcheon 3), and I take this to be the case of Mitchell's version of the opera. It is important to keep in mind that Mitchell's adaptation received some criticism for adding several accounts to the story, a sex scene, a pregnancy, and a miscarriage; leading critics to comment about these additions being unnecessary, while others liked this new adaptation (Jeal "Lucia di Lammermoor review-Bloody and Convincing"), (Maddocks "Lucia di Lammermoor Review-Flawed but of Provocative Thought"), ("Royal Opera House Audience Boo Violent Production of Lucia di Lammermoor"). Yet, Mitchell (Mitchell on Lucia, 1:25-5:54) has stated that her approach was distinctly feminist in that she tried to explain why Lucia behaves the way she does in the opera. Mitchell has also stated that the focus is always on Lucia and that is the reason why Lucia is always on scene. For that, she came with the idea of dividing the stage in two so that the audience would be able to witness two different sequences of events at the same time, and where Lucia will always be present on stage. Further, the time in which the story takes place is also altered so that Lucia can act in a more feminist way. Still, one could argue that Mitchell has just added some of what contemporary

audiences like to consume, as can be seen for example in TV shows such as *True Blood*, *Game of Thrones*, and, *The House of the Dragon*, which are shows that have caught people's attention due to the sex scenes, macabre fights, and so on. Further, Scott's ideas on drama can be applied to this opera in the sense of catching the audience's attention. By adding events to the story, the audience is overwhelmed since many actions are occurring at the same time on stage.

In addition, stories are over and over retold, who would deny the resemblance between Shakespeare's *Romeo and Juliet* and Puccini's *Tosca* or even the character of Aragorn from Tolkien's *The Lord of the Rings* and Virgil's *Aeneid* and his Aeneas? Once again these could be called copies or retellings as adaptations do tell a story once again but with certain changes (Hutcheon 7). Adaptations just make certain works suitable for the specific period it is made in, and operas are no exception. The issue with adapting literature into a musical performance is that, "In musical drama, the score too has to be brought to life for the audience and 'shown' in actual embodied sound; it cannot remain inert as lifeless black notes on a page" (Hutcheon 39). So, the score of an opera is as important as the libretto, as well as the performance per se since, many features might be shown in the scene and not sang. For instance, the moon in *A Midsummer Night's Dream* adapted by Benjamin Britten and Peter Pears into opera: the moon is a character merely because it appears as prop in the scene, unlike in Shakespeare's play, where the moon is one of the most crucial elements in the play. Further as stated by Weisstein in Hutcheon's book, when a character sings an aria, the audience is actually made to witness the character expressing his thought, fears, ideas, dreams (Hutcheon 60), as it will be later analysed in Lucia's famous aria "Regnava nel silenzio".

Nevertheless, Hutcheon is not the only one that addresses opera adaptations, Shmidgall also does this in his book "Literature as Opera". Shmidgall writes about one of the most relevant aspects of adapting literature into opera: doing it successfully. He provides the example of Britten's *A Midsummer Night's Dream*. According to Shmidgall, Britten was able to portray the three different realms perfectly in his opera adaptation, and this is a fact that some other authors agree with him like Mervyn Cooke in his chapter "Britten and Shakespeare: A Midsummer Night's Dream" in *The Cambridge Companion to Benjamin Britten*. According to Cooke, Britten does, indeed, use a musical movement called Ritornello to indicate when the characters are in the woods for instance, and to portray each of the different realms by adding some changes to that same Ritornello. Thus,

how the composer decides to portray the topics, characters and even scene is quite relevant, a fact that shall be taken into account in this thesis. Additionally, an opera is usually attributed to the composer, yet the librettist is as important as the music creator since these are the actual words that the singers sing (Shmidgall 5, 9).

One of the aspects that Shmidgall (10) pinpoints is that opera is related with heights, that exaggeration is part of it, it is one of the aspects that form the essence of opera. In conclusion it is a work that is continuously increasing expressive intensity that is represented with the music and manner of singing. This fact reminds me of Aristotle's theory on drama where the actions in the narrations shall follow a progressive order and also that the story should have a climax that is reached progressively. So, opera is alike in the sense that normal speech is increased until it reaches the coloratura and high notes. That is, the normal speech is the beginning, the starting point which progresses into heightened inflection/ declamation and the emotional intensity raises from the realistic until it reaches the operatic (Shmidgall 11). I consider this fact relevant also because opera singing requires plenty of air pressure and the higher the notes are the more air pressure that the singer needs. Therefore, the air—which is the basis in both speaking and singing—raises also progressively from normal speech until it reaches the coloratura and high notes. Further, *Lucia* is an opera that belongs to *bel canto*, a singing technique that focuses on high notes, on showing the beauty on singing, on appealing the audience's ear with beautiful sounds. Shmidgall (117) explains that Donizetti used to compose his music so that the heroic expression of human nature would be shown, only human feelings are portrayed in it, there are no gods or goddesses involved, only the expression of human feelings. Therefore, a relation between Shmidgall's statement on Donizetti's operas and Scott's ideas on "the marvellous" can be observed, which we will look into afterwards.

Shmidgall (133) compares Scott and Donizetti by stating that Donizetti's work focuses on the second main important characteristic of *bel canto*, the love story or as he coined "passionate love". Further, he states *bel canto* and Scott's novel are similar in the manner that both portray ideas such as, moral political, and philosophical as almost innocent (Shmidgall 135). Shmidgall continues his comparison between the two authors in "Historical romance as Opera" where he dwells very briefly on many aspects of *Lammermoor* and *Lucia* one of them being how Lucia becomes the heroine in the opera adaptation (Shmidgall 141). This is actually an idea that would be interesting to analyse more in depth, since performance critical theory from Marvin Carlson could be taken into

account, and even gender studies where the subversion of the hero to heroine role could be analysed. Yet, the comparison continues with the explanation on Lucia being the best adaptation of Lucy and how that is shown in her voice. When Lucia sings “Regnava nel silenzio” and even the famous mad scene, the way it is composed shows Scott’s depiction about silver tones in Lucy’s voice, which is portrayed with the coloratura (Shmidgall 141). Coloratura is an elaborate manner of singing that involves embellishment and it is usually sung by light agile voices specialised in that type of singing (Oxford English Dictionary online). Additionally, Shmidgall considers that Lucia’s mad scene from the opera perfectly depicts Scott’s intentions with Lucy, for that he provides the example of Lucy being in her chamber where she is filled with stupor and melancholy yet afterwards seems to recover herself and even to have come up with a resolution. In this scene Scott portrays Lucy’s mood on marrying Bucklaw, and even though this specific moment happens before she attacks him, the manner in which Lucy is portrayed is important to Shmidgall’s argument about how Lucia is very successful adaptation of Lucy. After marrying Bucklaw she ends up being ill and starts to be in a trance where her mind is not lucid at all, “a tide of recollections seemed to rush upon her, which her mind and body were alike incapable of bearing” (Scott 338). This scene is perfectly depicted in the opera adaptation due to the coloratura and high notes (Shmidgall 144). All these pieces of information from Shmidgall will be relevant to my analysis of the Gothic and drama in the next part of this chapter.

5.1. Gaetano Donizetti’s *Lucia di Lammermoor*

On analysing the Gothic and drama in the opera adaptation it is important to discern which supernatural characters appear in it. Although in the opera only one supernatural entity can be found, this character performs the same function as Alice and the Naiad in *Lammermoor* even if the entity has no name and is only briefly mentioned. Since *bel canto* focuses on the singing and secondly the romance in the story, adding a singing role for the ghost would distract the audience from the main two characteristics of this type of opera. So, there is no wonder that the ghost is only mentioned very briefly. In the libretto and score there is no indication of any ghost appearing, so each representation is different and the ghost might or might not appear. Nevertheless, by the sole mention of it, this entity is able to create horror in Lucia and Alissa –Lucia’s maid–, and even in the audience. This spirit is noticed by Lucia when they are “by a fountain in the glade” (Donizetti and Cammarano 2) and the first is describing to her maid the ghost she saw

next to the fountain since Alisa asked her on the reason for her to be staring with fear to the fountain. Both characters are waiting for Edgardo, since he and Lucia are meeting in that place. Alisa asks Lucia why she looks as if she were terrified, to which the heroine replies “That spring! Ah! I can never look at it without a shiver” (Donizetti and Cammarano 3). To continue stating that one of the Ravenswood stabbed his true love out of jealousy, then the girl sank into the fountain that now is haunted, and Lucia has seen her ghost. Since Alisa does not believe her, Lucia begins to depict the moment she met the ghost in the famous aria “Regnava nel Silenzio” from the libretto’s page 3. Lucia describes how it was a gloomy night where everything was still and only the moonlight could be seen reflected on the water of the fountain. Suddenly, she feels a sigh in the wind and she sees the spectre by the water’s edge, the ghost speaks with no sound in her voice, and invites her to come towards her. Lucia stares at her while the phantom is standing for a moment and finally disappears, then she sees the pool tinted with blood. To all of this Alisa replies “my God, this omen’s meaning is too painfully clear! Lucia, you must give up this dangerous love affair!” (Donizetti and Cammarano 3).

Therefore, the ghost in *Lucia* is a combination of the two supernatural characters in *Lammermoor* that I have discussed earlier in the thesis. The spectre resembles the naiad from the mermaid’s fountain as both share a similar story and disappear by leaving a trail of blood. Likewise, it resembles Alice due to the fact that both ghosts speak with no sound in their voices: they only move their mouths as if they were speaking but no sound emerges from them. Also, both serve as a warning to the main characters Lucia/Lucy and Edgardo/Edgar. Even though Lucia does not consider her encounter with the ghost as a warning, Alisa, her maid does, and advises her to finalise her love affair with Edgardo. Similarly, Alice acts in a similar way towards Edgar and Lucy in chapter XIX in *Lammermoor*, when she meets Edgar for the first time. Furthermore, the encounter is in the same place, the mermaid’s fountain, yet, if we check the descriptions in both the libretto and the score, the description of the landscape is dissimilar. Whereas, in the libretto it is described as a fountain in a glade of the forest, in the music score is depicted as a park that is near the castle, as it is stated in the contents’ page (Donizetti 73). Even if in both scenes the location might vary, both contain a fountain to which Lucia looks in horror, that is, the haunted place or the place where the local legend occurs. Consequently, even though the supernatural characters are altered from the original work, the described

Gothic characteristics that Parsons has explained in his book apply to the opera adaptation.

Regarding Scott's ideas on "the wonderful" and its effects these are portrayed not only by the lyrics in the opera but also in the instructions of the actions and the performance afterwards. It is necessary to acknowledge that the librettist had to follow the composer's orders on giving words to the composed music, and even the singers could also ask the librettist to change any part they did not like from the lyrics. Nevertheless, the librettist could repeat words and placed them in places where they would be emphasised. Thus, when analysing this specific scene, "Regnava nel Silenzio", it can be seen that Lucia is afraid of the ghost because Alisa mentions it, "Why do you stare about as if you were terrified?" (Donizetti and Cammarano 3). This happens when Lucia is looking at the fountain, and confesses that whenever she looks at it, she shivers. Furthermore, one can assume that when encountering the phantom, Lucia is frozen since she is just depicting the moment she met the spectre and when invited to move closer to the ghost no indication of her doing so is made. Additionally, when looking at the score we can see which words from Lucia's speech are emphasized as they are repeated or enlarged by the musical notes or several of them. On page 80 from the musical score I can observe how Lucia emphasises the "ah" with quavers, that when heard by the audience produces empathy. Also how remarking this specific word increases the expressive intensity that Shmidgall explains in his work. A similar emphasise can be observed on page 84, when Lucia sings "margine" referring to the "water's edge", which is precisely when the ghost makes her appearance. The notes go down, that is, lower, when she is singing about the edge of the water, and when she continues to relate that the spectre appears to her the notes start going up. Further, the intensity is increased and some *fermatas* or holds are added to some notes –a *fermata* is a musical symbol that indicates to the singer that the note shall be enlarged to emphasize it–. Additionally, "L'ombra mostrarsi a me", translated as "I saw her spectre" is repeated to emphasize that the phantom shows herself to Lucia (Donizetti and Cammarano 3). Another downhill of notes can be observed when Lucia sings "dileguo", "disappears", so, the musical notes go down, they make the same movement when the ghost appears and disappears. Yet, more importantly in pages 86 and 87 it can be appreciated how the emphasis is in the water being stained with blood, "E l'onda pria si limpida di sangue rosseggiò" (Donizetti and Cammarano 3). The words are not only repeated but coloratura and trills (tr) can be

observed in both pages. Therefore, Lucia is amazed by encountering the ghost as it is portrayed in the music, the emphases are placed in very specific instances showing how Lucia is both terrified but also astonished upon meeting the supernatural entity. The audience feels the same way not only because of the words the singer uses but also because of the beautiful sounds that emphasize certain words and actions.

The second instance where the spectre is mentioned is in the famous mad scene where Lucia blames the ghost as the entity who is separating her from Edgardo. This scene is composed by several musical pieces being one of the most relevant ones “Il dolce suono” (Donizetti 424). Once Lucia has married Arturo (Wickam) in the narration and murders him, she decides to join the festivities of her wedding while she is in a trance and covered in Arturo’s blood. She is wearing a nightgown and described to be ghostly pale and “gives every indication of insanity”, and after she starts singing the mentioned aria where she declaims her love for Edgardo and imagines marrying him (Donizetti and Cammarano 11). Yet, when she is describing her feeling or dreams she mentions the ghost again, “My whole being trembles . . . My footsteps falter! Let us sit together by the fountain for a while. Alas, that gloomy spectre rises to keep us apart! Alas! Alas, Edgardo! Ah! That spectre, that spectre drives us apart!” (Donizetti and Cammarano 11). While in Scott’s work none of this appears, the supernatural entities are warning spirits; in *Lucia*, the heroine seems to blame the ghost for the tragedy happening to her. When in reality Raimondo –Lucia’s brother in the opera who plays the role of Lucy’s mother in Scott’s work– obliges her to marry Arturo. Once again, it seems that Lucia is the only one that sees the spectre and who is affected by it, similar to the governess in Henry James’s *The Turn of the Screw* (1898), where it could be interpreted that she is the only one seeing the ghosts leading her to madness. Indeed, Lucia ends up being considered a mad woman and just as in Scott’s novel dies from unknown causes.

Additionally, in this mad scene there is the characteristic of a duet between Lucia and a flute –or originally a glass harmonica, yet since it is a rare instrument is substituted by a flute. Nevertheless, this is a posterior added duet, and thus, it will not be taken into account as our main sources are the libretto and score –where the duet does not appear–, yet the glass harmonica does. Nevertheless, the previous quote where Lucia addresses the ghost is depicted in musical terms too, in the chosen score from pages 426 to 431, Lucia sings that the ghost is dividing them. There is an emphasis made with the orchestra while she sings “Ohime! Edgardo! Edgardo! Ah! Il fantasma, il fantasma ne separa!” (Donizetti

428-431), which means, “That spectre, that spectre drives us apart” (Donizetti and Cammarano 11). Some of these words are repeated, yet she then continues singing and dreaming that she is marrying Edgardo. Subsequently, the ghost seems to affect Lucia more in the opera adaptation than in Scott’s novel. Additionally, “the wonderful” is present in this scene too, this is mostly portrayed by the repetitions of “il fantasma”, “the phantom”, and the instrumentation accompanying the words with *staccatos*, when isolated musical notes are played abruptly. I consider “the wonderful” to appear in that specific line since Lucia is showing fear. Yet at the same time the audience is both afraid but amazed with the wonderful sounds in that specific part. In addition, the effects of “the wonderful” go beyond, Lucia does not only react with fear, she goes mad, she is that haunted on seeing the ghost that she even places the blame of her misfortunes on the spectre, and similar to Scott’s work both of them die after hallucinating. Therefore, Scott’s assessment of opera as focusing only on the music and not the plot can be contradicted. It is a fact that many of the arguments given in this thesis involve music, yet, no knowledge of music is needed to ascertain what I have exposed about the Gothic features in the opera, these are merely observations taken from reading the libretto, and by looking at the score. Consequently, the Gothic elements in the opera adaptation fulfil Scott’s ideas as “the wonderful” certainly appears. The effects of “the wonderful” can be also found in the opera since it does not draw audience’s attention away from the main topic. The singing and performance are relevant too in the opera adaptation, yet the Gothic elements are continuously there whenever the ghost is mentioned. On the contrary, adding more dramatic actions to the story could result on distracting the reader from the gothic features and even the music as it will be analysed in Mitchell’s version of *Lucia*.

On applying Scott’s theory on drama as a genre, the progressiveness of the narration and the agency of characters shall be looked upon as well as time. In both the libretto and the score the actions are narrated in the same order. The story begins with Enrico explaining that Edgardo is his enemy –as if it were the Capulet and Montague from *Romeo and Juliet*– and how his sister does not want to marry the only person that could help him on defeating Edgardo. Then the story continues with Lucy describing to Alisa her encounter with the ghost, and, Edgardo and Lucia’s encounter where they profess their love to each other after Edgardo tells her his departure to. In the second act, Enrico shows to Lucia a supposed letter from Edgardo, where it states that he is not faithful to her anymore and Lucia being heart-broken and obliged by her brother decides

to marry Arturo. As soon as Lucia signs the marriage contract Edgardo appears as he has returned early from France and curses her for not being faithful to him. In act III, the wedding festivities continue and Lucia has killed Arturo. She appears at the party, in a trance, while she dreams on marrying Edgardo, the famous mad scene, and dies. Once Edgardo is aware of Lucia's passing he commits suicide by stabbing himself. All the actions occur progressively, there are no abrupt changes in the actions and they occur naturally. The audience can also take the story as real since the characters are not exaggerating in excessiveness. As Shmidgall (111) has explained, in operas it is very common that characters sing in an emotional way rather than rational in order to express feelings. Thus, to portray the individual soul of the character, emotional experience is more important than rational experience. The excessiveness of emotional intensity is a natural characteristic of opera and still, every action occurs progressively and in a natural manner. In addition, the characters are the sole agents of their actions, even though Lucia blames the ghost of separating her from Edgardo, she is the one who agrees to marry Arturo. Indeed, she is obliged by her brother, yet she accepts to do so due to believing that Edgardo is no longer faithful to her. Regarding Edgardo, this agency is more clear since instead of dying in quicksand as Scott's Edgar does (Scott, *Lammermoor* 347) he commits suicide once he knows Lucia is dead. Consequently, the ghost influences Lucia on believing that she and Edgardo are doomed if they should decide to be together, yet that is Alisa's interpretation of the ghost. Alisa is the one that believes the phantom to be an omen, and later in the adaptation Lucia believes so when blaming the ghost. Still, the supernatural being has no agency at all, the ghost cannot change the character's destinies. So, the characters are the only responsible ones of their actions, and not the ghost as Lucia might think. With the respect of time, this one is shortened but it is clear to the audience that time has gone by, Edgardo is not able to travel to France and back home in short time, so the audience deduces that time has passed. Regarding the performance, it lasts two hours, so certain events are a bit rushed, still, time in this opera adaptation does not disrupt the narration or confuse the audience.

5.2. The Royal Opera House Performance of *Lucia di Lammermoor* Directed by Katie Mitchell

The opera adaptation has been staged a number of times, but, as I have pointed out, there is especially one that has raised some controversy because of how it added certain events that did not take place in Scott's work nor in Donizetti's original opera. This is an aspect that shall now be analysed with regards to Scott's views of what constitutes a proper form of drama. Yet, first, I would like to look upon how the aria "Regnava nel Silenzio" is portrayed in Mitchell's version. In this specific performance (*Lucia di Lammermoor* 14:21-23:01) the ghost is already on stage when Lucia arrives to the meeting place, which instead of being represented in the fountain, is a cemetery with a small fountain. Interestingly, while the music is playing and Lucia arrives, Lucia and the ghost look at each other and start to move toward each other. Lucia offers her some flowers and the ghost decides to kiss Lucia on the lips (*Lucia di Lammermoor* 16:03) to the latter's astonishment. Lucia places the bouquet in the tomb and realises that there is blood in the fountain's water, she cleans it and then Alisa arrives. Lucia finally starts to sing the aria, (*Lucia di Lammermoor* 19:23), Diana Damrau, the soprano in this version, mimics to Alisa all the actions the ghost did when she encountered her, and at the end of the aria when she mentions the water stained in blood, both check the water to find it crystal clear. Still Lucia shows to Alisa the handkerchief with which she cleaned the blood from her hands before. Although certain actions are added in this scene, this specific stage performance indicates that Lucia is the only one able to see the ghost. In both Donizetti's version and in Scott's original work there is no sign of Edgar or Lucia being the only ones that can see the ghost.

Another thing that has been added in this performance is a sex scene between Edgardo and Lucia at the end of Act I, and as a result, Lucia gets pregnant. During the entire representation the stage is divided into two separate spaces, and as Mitchell has explained in the previously referenced interview, the aim is that the audience can see at all times what Lucia is doing. While Edgardo and Enrico are having a conversation, the audience is able to see them but also Lucia and Arturo in her bedroom. What is interesting, is that Arturo's death is shown in this opera version, while in Donizetti's adaptation it is only stated that Lucia killed him, and also in the representation Alisa helps Lucia do it (*Lucia di Lammermoor* 1:24:00- 1:34:32). Afterwards, there is the famous mad scene (*Lucia di Lammermoor* 1:35:05). While the choir is singing and telling what has happened

to the audience, Lucia is seen to be bending over in pain, blood stains her nightgown, she is suffering an abortion. Lucia decides to join where the choir is, that is the other half of the stage and the ghost appears in her bedroom while she is not there (*Lucia di Lammermoor* 1:43:00). When the music of the famous aria “Il dolce suono” begins (*Lucia di Lammermoor* 1:43:42) she is portrayed hallucinating, as the singer who portrays Edgardo appears as if he were in her imagination. The ghost is meanwhile in the other room and moves to where Lucia is, in the exact moment that she is about to sing “Ohime! Sorge il tremendo fantasma”, “Alas, the gloomy spectre rises” (Donizetti and Cammarano 11). While the ghost is basically present in there, another woman with a ghostly characterization appears (*Lucia di Lammermoor* 1:47:49). This could be Lucia’s mother since in the opera she is stated to have died recently, the sole purpose of this ghost is to give the imaginary Edgardo a wedding ring (*Lucia di Lammermoor* 1:49:25). Further the ghost from the fountain separates Lucia and Edgardo when Lucia is singing the famous duet with the flute or glass harmonica until Lucia starts to act as if she were regaining consciousness. Yet, she continues with hallucinating and seeing the ghost from the fountain and be terrorized about her. The mad scene finishes with Lucia collapsing in her bed (*Lucia di Lammermoor* 2:06:30). The next scene starts where Edgardo is supposed to commit suicide, yet since the audience is seeing the stage divided, on one side is Edgardo in the cemetery and in the other Lucia in a bathtub. She commits suicide by cutting her veins and when he discovers it –he goes to Lucia’s bathroom at one point– he commits suicide too with the same knife.

A number of actions and events have thus been added to this production of the opera, yet does it fulfil Scott’s ideas on Gothic literature and drama? There is no denying that the ghost appears more times in scene than Donizetti intended to, and a second ghost is added, so how does this portray “the marvellous” and its effects? Undoubtedly, Lucia is always portrayed as terrified against the ghost from the fountain and at the same time she is astonished by it. The same can be said about the mad scene, for whenever she sees the ghost, she is afraid of it. When watching the opera performance on DVD, the audience can clearly see Diana Damrau’s facial expressions and how she is portraying Lucia, yet when the audience is in the theatre that is not so easily seen. Nevertheless, the ghost produces the same feelings in the audience as it is introduced from the beginning even before Lucia appears in Act I and likewise in Act III during the mad scene. So the audience is prepared for what is going to happen and horror is developed as the ghost

moves throughout the scene. Notwithstanding, does the fact that this character appears more affect the audience? Is the audience distracted by it or by the added scenes in the representation? Indeed, in Lucia's mad scene the ghost distracts the audience when she is moving around the scenery, for instance I had to rewind the DVD sometimes to be sure what was happening or what were the characters saying as many actions were happening at the same time. This was specially, during the mad scene, where there were times that I was even wondering why the ghost from the fountain was in there, when Lucia is dreaming about Edgardo. Likewise, with the added actions, Arturo's death for instance took focus from what was happening in the other half of the stage. When the first action is not that relevant as it gives no new pieces of information, it is just Lucia killing Arturo, while in the other half Enrico's character is explained in more depth to the audience. It occurs similarly with the abortion and Lucia's death, the abortion part makes the audience focus mainly on Lucia's suffering, and even the soprano changed her way of singing to emphasize the abortion. Yet one of the main characteristics of *bel canto* is singing beautifully, giving relevance to beautiful sounds, and on some occasions the Soprano was distorting that to illustrate the pain of the abortion. The same happens with Lucia's death, she commits suicide when Edgardo is supposed to do so, and while Edgardo is singing the audience is horrified by Lucia's actions. Therefore, "the marvellous" and its effects are fulfilled when encountering the ghost, but it is also overused until the point that it becomes unrealistic and distracting.

Regarding drama, the plot becomes quite unreal due to the excessive use of "the marvellous", further the progression of the actions is a bit rushed. It is unknown how long Edgardo is in France for Lucia to be pregnant, thus, on this respect not much can be analysed. The actions do indeed, occur progressively, yet extremely fast, at the same time that the audience have witnessed Arturo's death they are seeing Enrico sing with the choir dragging the attention from one action to the other. Further, Arturo dies, then Lucia goes mad while she is having a miscarriage, and all of this while the ghost walks around the stage. Therefore, the progression of the actions is too abrupt and the audience is distracted by too many things happening at once. Regarding time in this specific opera adaptation it is shortened too, and the audience can deduce that time went by, still, there is no mentioning of it, and the time of the performance is similar, two hours in which the whole story has to be told.

6. Conclusion

As shown in this thesis, the Gothic elements found in Scott's novel and Donizetti's opera adaptation are similar. For that this thesis first analysed how Alice and the Naiad from the mermaid's fountain can both be considered what Parsons coined as warning spirits. These two characters do not take any agency in the story, as they merely warn the characters about a peril, and the characters are the ones who decide their fates. It was also shown that when these two supernatural entities appear "the marvellous" can be seen and the effects of it are not overwhelming for the reader. Whenever these ghosts appear the characters react with fear and in many instances they are astonished. Additionally, the reader can feel likewise, and thus, Scott's ideas on "the marvellous", its effect would be found in *Lammermoor* and *Lucia*.

To support and explain more clearly the Gothic elements found in Scott's novel, a comparison between *The Monk* and *Lammermoor* was made. The thesis argued that these novels portray Gothic elements differently. In *The Monk* many of the supernatural encounters seem to have an effect on character's destiny, whereas in *Lammermoor*, these encounters are solemnly used to warn the characters about their fatal end. Therefore, in *Lammermoor* all of the actions happening are the effect of the characters' doings. This fact is also related to drama, as Scott, who uses Aristotle's theory to explain what he considers drama as a genre, considers cause-effect to be relevant. The author has made the characters appear as the sole agents of their actions, as no gods or goddesses are involved in it. Moreover, the progression of the action in the story must also be taken into account so that the audience is not confused, and the story reaches the climax progressively. The thesis has also demonstrated that Donizetti's *Lucia* follows Scott's ideas on drama, since the characters are misled by other characters and not by supernatural entities. The libretto and musical score were analysed to examine whether the Gothic element in *Lammermoor* and Scott's ideas could be applied to them. Consequently, it was corroborated that Donizetti and Cammarano's work do indeed, portray these ideas. Additionally, "the marvellous" and its effects are shown when Lucia encounters the warning spirit in Act I and also in the famous mad scene when she mentions "Il fantasma". Furthermore, the actions occur progressively, there are no time lapses or confusing timelines and the audience is not distracted from the main actions or topics.

Additionally, this thesis has also aimed to discern whether the supernatural beings had an effect on the characters. In both *Lammermoor* and *Lucia*, it could be observed that they

do indeed have an influence on the characters, but without manipulating any action in the story, only warning them. The operatic characters are made to realise that these warning spirits were right about their fates even though it is too late for them. By contrast, the specific DVD version of the opera matched very well with Scott's ideas on what he considered a distracting drama. The actions were happening abruptly and the audience could easily be distracted from the main topics as the stage is divided into two and actions were represented simultaneously, occasionally confusing the audience. Also, "the marvellous" was met, yet the excessiveness of it resulted in the same effect: the audience attention was placed on added actions in this opera representation, taking the focus from Donizetti's original aim and thus, overwhelming the audience. Therefore, in this thesis it has been demonstrated that an opera adaptation can be studied and analysed following literature theories. Indicating that literature can also be applied to other arts, and that many literature theories or topics can be analysed in non-literature sources to expand perspectives. Regardless, this opera adaptation could also be analysed in light of gender studies. Since Kate Mitchell stated that her DVD version of *Lucia* was focused on women, and from a feminist perspective, an analysis of this opera focusing on gender studies could be interesting. Further, Marvin Carlson's theories about performance can be also analysed in Mitchell's version of *Lucia*. Carlson dedicates a chapter to "Performance and Identity" in his book *Performance: A Critical Introduction*, where he analyses the role of women and their discourse and to certain extent the subversion of traditional gender roles.

7. Works Cited

- Bleiler, Everet Franklin. "Sir Walter Scott's Introduction" *Three Gothic Novels*, Dover Publications Collections, New York, 1966, pp.3-15. Internet Archive.
archive.org/details/threegothicnovel10000blei/page/n45/mode/2up
- Carlson, Marvin. *Performance: A Critical Introduction*. 3rd ed., Routledge, 2018
- Cockshut, A.O.J. "The Literary Personality: Cause and Effect". *The Achievement of Walter Scott*. Collins, 1969, pp. 63- 89.
- "Coloratura". *Oxford English Dictionary*, oed.com, <https://www-oed-com.ezproxy.uio.no/view/Entry/36567?redirectedFrom=coloratura#eid>.
Accessed 29 Nov. 2022.
- Cooke, Mervyn. "Britten and Shakespeare: A Midsummer Night's Dream." *The Cambridge Companion to Benjamin Britten*, Cambridge UP, Cambridge, 1999, pp. 129–146.
- Cook, Daniel. "Reading Walter Scott's Dramas". *The Review of English Studies*, vol. 74, Issue 314, April 2023, pp. 340-353. Oxford Academic.
<https://academic-oup-com.ezproxy.uio.no/res/article/74/314/340/7010546?login=true>
- Donizetti, Gaetano. *Lucia di Lammermoor*. Dover Publications, 1992.
- Donizetti, Gaetano, composer; Camarano Salvatore, librettist. *Lucia di Lammermoor*. Translated by Glen Sauls, G. Schirmer, Inc, 1963.
- Freud, Sigmund. "The Uncanny". *The Uncanny*, translated by David MacLintock, Penguin Books, 2003, pp. 123-162.
- Humphrey, Richard. "Introduction." *Scott: Waverley*, Cambridge UP, Cambridge, 1993, pp. 1–4.
- Hutcheon, Linda; O'Flynn, Siobhan. "Preface". *A Theory of Adaptation*. Routledge, 2013, pp. VXi.
- "Beginning to theorize Adaptation". *A Theory of Adaptation*. Routledge, 2013, pp. 1-32.
- Jeal, Erica. "Lucia di Lammermoor review- Bloody and Convincing". *The Guardian*, 31 Oct. 2017, <https://www.theguardian.com/music/2017/oct/31/lucia-di-lammermoor-donizetti-katie-mitchell-lisette-oropesa-review-royal-opera-house>
- Kerr, James. "The Historical Novel and the Production of the Past". *Fiction Against History: Scott as a Story-Teller*. Cambridge UP, 1989, pp. 1-17.
- Lewis, Mathew. G. *The Monk*, edited by Howard Anderson, Oxford UP, 1995.

- Maddocks, Fiona. "Lucia di Lammermoor Review-Flawed but of Provocative Thought". *The Guardian*, 10 April 2016, <https://www.theguardian.com/music/2016/apr/10/lucia-di-lammermoor-review-royal-opera-katie-mitchell-diana-damrau>
- Mitchell, Katie. *Lucia di Lammermoor*. 2016. Performance by Diana Damrau, Charles Castronovo, Ludovic Tézier, The Royal Opera House, Warner Music Group Company, 2016.
- "Kate Mitchell on Lucia Di Lammermoor- "My Focus is 100% on the Female Characters"" YouTube, uploaded by Royal Opera House, 21 March 2016, <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=O7vpkZHoXRM&t=92s>
- Parsons, Coleman O. "The Waverly Novels: Influences and Critical Theory". *Witchcraft and Demonology in Scott's Fiction*, Oliver and Boyd, 1964, pp. 68-73.
- "The Waverly Novels: The Warning Spirit". *Witchcraft and Demonology in Scott's Fiction*, Oliver and Boyd, 1964, pp. 73-79.
- "The Waverly Novels: The Sibyl". *Witchcraft and Demonology in Scott's Fiction*, Oliver and Boyd, 1964, pp. 79-86.
- "The Waverly Novels: Local Legends." *Witchcraft and Demonology in Scott's Fiction*, Oliver and Boyd, 1964, pp. 95-105.
- "The Waverly Novels: Ghosts". *Witchcraft and Demonology in Scott's Fiction*, Oliver and Boyd, 1964, pp. 105-121.
- "The Waverly Novels: Witchcraft". *Witchcraft and Demonology in Scott's Fiction*, Oliver and Boyd, 1964, pp. 134-151.
- "The Waverly Novels: Curses, Omens, Dreams, and, Prophecies". *Witchcraft and Demonology in Scott's Fiction*, Oliver and Boyd, 1964, pp. 232-249.
- "The Waverly Novels: Assorted Spirits and Superstitions". *Witchcraft and Demonology in Scott's Fiction*, Oliver and Boyd, 1964, pp. 249-261.
- Robertson, Fiona. "Gothic: Passages that Lead to Nothing. The Implicated Reader in the Drama of Terror". *Legitimate Stories: Scott, Gothic, and the Authorities of Fiction*. Clarendon Press Oxford UP, 1994, pp. 101-116.
- "Royal Opera House Audience Boo Violent Production of Lucia di Lammermoor". *BBC*, 8 April 2016, <https://www.bbc.com/news/entertainment-arts-35995554>
- Shmidgall, Gary. "One. An Opening Perspective." *Literature as Opera*. Oxford UP.

1977, pp.1-28.

----- “Four. Gaetano Donizetti: Schiller, Scott, and the Blithe Spirit of Bel Canto.” *Literature as Opera*. Oxford UP. 1977, pp.111-118.

----- “Four. Gaetano Donizetti: Bel Canto and the Sir Walter Disease.” *Literature as Opera*. Oxford UP. 1977, pp.133-137.

----- “Four. Gaetano Donizetti: Historical Romance as Opera.” *Literature as Opera*. Oxford UP. 1977, pp.137-148.

Scott, Sir Walter. *The Bride of Lammermoor*, edited by Fiona Robertson, Oxford world’s classics, 2008.

-----“. “Article IX: Remarks on Frankenstein”. *The Miscellaneous Prose Works of Sir Walter Scott: Periodical Criticism Vol II*, Vol.18, Robert Cadell, Edinburgh, 1835, Internet Archive.

archive.org/details/miscellaneouspr01scotgoog/page/n264/mode/2up

-----“. “Essay on the Drama”. *The Miscellaneous Prose Works of Sir Walter Scott*, Vol.4, Baundry’s European Library, Paris, 1837, Internet Archive.

archive.org/details/miscellaneouspr64scotgoog/page/n414/mode/2up

Wisker, Gina. “Major Themes, Movements, and Issues”. *Horror Fiction: An Introduction*. The Continuum International Publishing Group, 2005, pp. 145-216.